



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

9:00 a.m., FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 15, 1991

AT TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I. Call to Order: The meeting was called to order by Chairman Jane Volk at 9:00 a.m.

II. Roll Call:

PRESENT: Lillian Jane Volk, Chairman
Donald W. Curl, Vice Chairman
Elise P. Mackintosh, Secretary
William S. Gubelmann, Member
Anne G. Metzger, Member
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza, Member
Arthur Silverman, Alternate Member
Wilmer J. Thomas Jr., Alternate Member
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney
David C. Zimmerman, Assistant Building Official
Timothy M. Frank, Planner/Projects Coordinator

ABSENT: Sally Gingras, Member

RECORDING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

Let the record show that Mrs. Mackintosh arrived just after the roll was called. Let the record also show that Mrs. Metzger and Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza were not present until discussion of Item B.

III. Approval of the Minutes of the January 18, 1990 Meeting

MOTION BY DR. CURL TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS MAILED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. Public Hearings:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 2-91, Carport

Applicant: Mrs. Tauni De Lesseps

Owner: Mrs. Tauni De Lesseps

Address: 452 Worth Avenue

Architect: Mr. Steven J. Bruh

Project Description: Construction of a carport with barrel tile roof on the northeast portion of the property

Mr. Steven Bruh, Architect, presented this project for a totally detached carport on the northeast, or front of the property. The carport is needed because there is now no garage or protection for a vehicle. Construction will consist of wood rafters and beams, barrel tile roof, and four precast twisted concrete columns. Attempts will be made to match the detailing of the carport to the details of the house. The columns will be painted a deep orange/pink, and the wood trim will be taupe grey. Mr. Bruh added that very little of this carport is visible from the road.

MOTION BY DR. CURL TO APPROVE THE CARPORT AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. GUBELMANN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 3-91,
Change in exterior color
Applicant: Mrs. Robert Ballinger
Owner: Mrs. Robert Ballinger
Address: 235 Banyan Road
Project Description: Change exterior paint color from white to light peach.

Mr. Frank stated that approval of this item had actually already been granted through Staff and the Chairman, but was being brought before the Commission as a courtesy. The color requested had been brought to the Commission in other cases, and had been approved. In this case, the contractor expressed a need to proceed with the painting prior to the meeting date.

MOTION BY DR. CURL TO APPROVE THE COLOR CHANGE AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. MACKINTOSH.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 4-91,
Identification Signage
Applicant: Devonshire
Owner: W.A. Inc., d/b/a W.A. Inc. of Delaware
(Toronto Dominion Bank) c/o Merin/Hunter Property
Management
Address: 343 Worth Avenue
Project Description: Identification Signage for door and window(s)

Ms. Maggie Roach, store manager, presented renderings of the proposed signage for the door and window. The door will read "devonshire" and list its various locations. The window will read "devonshire" on the first line with "the english garden shop" on the second line. The lettering will be done in dark green. Mr. Frank stated that the signage is in keeping with the Town's sign ordinance.

MOTION BY MR. GUBELMANN TO APPROVE THE SIGNAGE AS PRESENTED WITH THE PROVISIO THAT THE SIGNAGE MUST MEET THE SIGN CODE OF THE TOWN.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 5-91, Tennis Court & Pool

Applicant: Mr. Daniel J. Mahoney Jr.

Owner: Mr. Daniel J. Mahoney Jr.

Address: 1200 South Ocean Boulevard

Project Description: Request approval to construct a 60' x 120' tennis court and 40' x 20' pool

Attorney Gustave Broberg presented this project on behalf of Mr. Mahoney, the property owner. He stated that the neither the proposed tennis court, nor the pool will be able to be seen from the street. The pool will be completely enclosed in a patio area. He commented that it is certainly appropriate for a house of this authority to have a tennis court and pool. Staff had no problem with the proposal. Mr. Broberg stated that today's approval, if given, would be for approval of the size and location of the tennis court and pool on the site. Material samples and design of both will be brought to the Commission at a later date.

Mr. Silverman questioned whether there were any residences close to the tennis court. Mr. Broberg replied that the Bath & Tennis Club is closest, but even it is quite far away. Mr. Frank added that the tennis court is restricted by the Town's Zoning Code so that at least a ten foot hedge/screening is required to surround it.

MOTION BY DR. CURL TO APPROVE THIS PROJECT AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. GUBELMANN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Randolph clarified that since 6 members and 2 alternate members were present, Mr. Silverman would participate in the voting. Mr. Thomas would not be permitted to vote.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 6-91, Identification Signage

Applicant: Worth Avenue Sundry c/o Mr. Stephen Y. Reinus

Owner: Maus & Hoffman

Address: 312D Worth Avenue

Project Description: Request approval of identification signage for window; and request approval for portable sign

Mr. Frank reported that the Town's Code Enforcement Officers discovered a sandwich board sign at this location which is

prohibited by the Code, and hangers for a hanging sign which is not yet in place. Staff has already given approval for the requested hanging sign, as it is just a message change, providing the lettering style is in character. Additionally, there is white window lettering which requires approval. This signage is already in place, and photos were passed showing the signage as it exists.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA TO APPROVE THE SIGNAGE AS SUBMITTED, EXCEPTING THE SANDWICH BOARD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

F. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 7-91,
Miscellaneous Changes

Applicant: Mr. Richard Limehouse/Mr. William & Mrs. Tracy
E. Hall

Owner: Mr. Richard Limehouse/Mr. William & Mrs. Tracy
E. Hall

Address: 269 Park Avenue

Project Description: Request approval to upgrade exterior by removing deteriorated shingles and resurfacing with stucco, per original exterior; possibly replace jalousie windows and door with windows, same or similar to those in 1923 photo; repair awnings on 2nd & 3rd stories, and replace 1st floor aluminum awnings with awning similar to or matching 2nd & 3rd story style; revise entrance to be in keeping with 1923 photo; repeat gable of roofline.

Mrs. Tracy Hall, property owner, presented the project for restoration of this home almost exactly to its original condition. She distributed a series of photos showing the house as it exists, and as it existed in 1923. Mr. Frank pointed out that this property is scheduled for a Designation Hearing at today's meeting. He stated that at the time the Designation Report was written, it was believed that the existing wood siding was original to the house, and as such, would make the home landmark worthy as a shingle style house. Since that time, it has been determined that the original home had a stucco finish. As such, Staff has changed its recommendation regarding this property. Staff is now recommending that this property not be landmarked as it is not "a unique shingle style" house, as had been stated in the Designation Report.

Mr. Frank added that all of the requested items in this application for Certificate of Appropriateness are either restorative or upgrades of the existing. Without further discussion, the following motion was made.

MOTION BY MRS. MACKINTOSH TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

G. (Please note that Item #G will be discussed later in the agenda, as Mr. Hoffman had not yet arrived.)

H. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 9-91, Awning

Applicant: Mr. H.B. Howard

Owner: Mr. H. B. Howard

Address: 151 Grace Trail

Contractor: American Awning Company

Project Description: Recover existing faded terra cotta awning with a buff colored awning with terra-cotta trim.

Michael Lehning, of American Awning Company, presented the project to recover a very deteriorated terra-cotta awning with a buff colored awning with terra-cotta trim in a vinyl material. He explained that this material will be much more durable than the existing material, and the buff coloring will be much cooler, and will better match the exterior of the structure.

MOTION BY MRS. METZGER TO APPROVE THE AWNING AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. Designation Hearings

Please note that lengthy legal descriptions are available within the Designation Reports for the following properties.

Item 1: 91 Middle Road

OWNER: Mr. William L. Hanley

Mrs. Volk: The first item is 91 Middle Road. Owner is actually Mrs. William L. Hanley. Mr. Hanley died recently. That will be postponed. We have a letter from the estate of Mr. Hanley asking for a postponement until the March meeting.

Mr. Randolph: We need a motion.

Mrs. Volk: Oh, we need a motion for the postponement? May I have a motion for that postponement?

MOTION BY MRS. MACKINTOSH THAT LANDMARKING CONSIDERATION OF 91 MIDDLE ROAD BE DEFERRED TO THE MARCH MEETING, WITH THE PROVISIO THAT THE OWNER RECOGNIZES HE IS WAIVING HIS RIGHT BY ORDINANCE REQUIRING THE COMMISSION TO ACT WITHIN 30 DAYS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mrs. Volk: This will come up at the March meeting.

Item 2: 860 South Ocean Boulevard

OWNER: Mr. Steve Stavro c/o Mr. Howard F. Wood

Mrs. Volk: 860 South Ocean Boulevard. Mr. Steve Stavro c/o Mr. Howard Wood. Verifying that we have had proof of publication and proper legal service, Mr. Frank?

Mr. Frank: Yes, Ma'am, we do.

Mrs. Volk: All witnesses who are going to speak on this matter will please be sworn in.

Mrs. Delp: Do you swear or affirm that the testimony which you are about to give is the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help you God?

(Let the record show that Mr. Frank and Mr. James Sved, Staff Preservation Consultant, were sworn.)

Mrs. Volk: Let the record show that these witnesses have been duly sworn. Staff, we will hear from Mr. Sved. Oh, Mr. Frank's recommendations.

Mr. Frank: Thank you, Madame Chairman. 860 South Ocean Boulevard. The style...generally Mediterranean Revival. In your report, under Criteria for Designation, Staff has found that the subject property meets following criteria:

(a) Exemplifies or reflects the broad cultural, political, economic or social history of the nation, state, county or town.

(c) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or is a specimen inherently valuable for the study of a period, style, method of construction or use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

Also, I'd like to read into the record, at this time, a letter from Mr. Howard F. Wood from Scarborough, Ontario to myself as Planner/Projects Coordinator in regard to the Landmark Designation Hearing, 860 South Ocean Boulevard..."I act on behalf of Mr. Steve A. Stavro, and acknowledge receipt of your letter of the 11th day of January, 1991, together with the enclosures contained therein. I have had an opportunity of reviewing the Designation Report dated February 15, 1991, prepared by the Landmarks Preservation Commission, and would advise that my client supports the designation of the property as a landmark. Therefore, I shall not be attending the Public Hearing on February 15, 1991. Mr. Stavro has indicated that he would like a designation plaque for the property. I understand from our telephone conversation of yesterday that this issue has not been settled by the Town. My client has suggested that he would be prepared to purchase the plaque; at the same time placing another plaque of similar design on the property, identifying it as "Nuestro Paradiso". Should there be any changes to the Report for the Public Hearing, I would ask that you contact this writer. Thank you for your assistance in clarifying

the procedures with respect to the Hearings. Yours very truly, Howard F. Wood."

Mrs. Volk: Thank you very much, Mr. Frank.

Mr. Frank: I'll pass the presentation on now to Mr. Sved.

Mr. Sved: Thank you very much. Good morning. The building at 860 South Ocean Boulevard was originally designed and constructed by architect Julius Jacobs in 1928. By all accounts, Mr. Jacobs came to Palm Beach originally to work with an architect named Bruce Kitchell. No. Dr. Curl says that not true, but in any case, he came here in 1928 and designed this very nice house. In 1958, architect John Volk did some renovations to this property which included removal of the front decorative terrace which matches the one in the rear. It's got these cast stone, the only thing you can call them is creatures, on the back. It's a very interesting design. This house is set back rather deeply from the road compared to most of its other oceanfront neighbors. It is a masonry construction. As Mr. Frank stated, it was originally known as "Nuestro Paradiso". Later homeowners called it "Casa Allegre". As Mr. Frank stated, this building is of the Mediterranean Revival design, and you'll notice the anchoring tower at the right of both slides, the decorative cast stone work. What's very unique about this house is the barrel clay tile roof laid in almost a vault pattern and held up by the deep bracket eaves. The windows along the upper left-hand portion and right below them, are very decorative window treatments. This is a very significant piece of Palm Beach architecture. It's very visible on the ocean, and it is very worthy of your consideration today.

Mrs. Volk: Thank you, Mr. Sved. We need a motion that this Designation Report be made a part of the record.

MOTION BY MR. GUBELMANN THAT THE DESIGNATION REPORT BE MADE A PART OF THE RECORD.

MOTION SECONDED BY DR. CURL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mrs. Volk: Are there any other witnesses? Any comments?

Mr. Silverman: I have a question regarding the reference to a second plaque. I think I heard you say that they are willing to pay for one plaque, and then they're going to put up another one. I'd like to know the size and maybe something showing what it's going to look like. It could be a monstrosity.

Mr. Frank: What my recommendation would be is upon acceptance as a landmark, we will inform the owner that he needs a Certificate of Appropriateness for this plaque, and then it would come in front of you for design approval. I believe that he just merely and tastefully wants to place the name of the property that it is known by on the plaque, but we have to see it.

Mr. Gubelmann: We probably want it similar in design to the landmark

plaque.

Mr. Frank: I suppose so.

Mrs. Volk: We'll be in touch with that, working on that, when we decide what plaques we are going to use in the future.

Dr. Curl: Can I just do my little bit on Julius Jacobs? Because actually he arrived in 1919. Mizner brought him down to work on the Everglades Club and his name is actually on the drawings of the Everglades Club from 1918-1919. He not only did the two houses that are there together on South Ocean, that look like the same architect, but he also did a house for Mr. Warwick, the movie man. I think we have already designated that. It's on County Road and Banyan. It's the one with the strange tile work.

Mr. Sved: That's not the one that was just torn down recently?

Dr. Curl: I hope not.

Mr. Frank: No. I think I remember the one with the tile work. Yes.

Dr. Curl: But, I mean he is not an unknown architect, and I might just mention, it also says that Mrs. Drew owned the house for a while. This is Barbara Hoffstot's mother, of course.

Mrs. Volk: It was owned for many years by Mr. and Mrs. Benjamin Black. Thank you, Dr. Curl. Moving along to 220 El Bravo Way... Owner - Mr.

All: We're not finished with that one yet.

Mrs. Volk: We're not finished, are we.

DR. CURL: I'LL MOVE THAT THE PROPERTY AT 860 SOUTH OCEAN BOULEVARD BE RECOMMENDED TO THE TOWN COUNCIL FOR DESIGNATION AS A LANDMARK OF THE TOWN OF PALM BEACH, AND THAT THE CRITERIA, AS PRESENTED, BE MADE A PART OF THE RECORD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Item 3: 220 El Bravo Way
OWNER: Mr. C.S. & Mrs. Edwynna S. Walsh

Mrs. Volk: Now, moving along to 220 El Bravo Way. Owner, Mr. C.S. and Mrs. Edwynna S. Walsh. Have we verified proof of publication and proper legal service, Mr. Frank?

Mr. Frank: Yes, Ma'am. We have it.

Mrs. Volk: Will the secretary swear in all witnesses that are going to speak in regard to this property?

(Let the record show that no witnesses were present to be sworn.)

Mrs. Volk: And your recommendation, Mr. Frank.

Mr. Frank: Thank you, Madame Chairman. 220 El Bravo Way. Again, Mediterranean Revival in style. In your report, under Criteria for Designation, Staff has found that it meets the following criteria:

- (a) Exemplifies or reflects the broad cultural, political, economic or social history of the nation, state, county or town.
- (c) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or is a specimen inherently valuable for the study of a period, style, method of construction or use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.
- (d) Is representative of the notable work of a master builder, designer or architect whose individual ability has been recognized or who influenced his age.

In this case, the architect is John Volk, and the biography has been attached. Mr. Sved.

Mr. Sved: Thank you. This building, as Mr. Frank just said was designed by John Volk in 1927, and it is again a Mediterranean Revival style. One of the most striking features, as you come across this house, is the Venetian tower at left which is rather different and unique for Palm Beach. Additionally, another somewhat unique aspect of this Mediterranean Revival house is that its front facade offers the traditional cross axis plan that's common in most older American homes. In 1933, John Volk returned to this house and connected the guest quarters and garage with the main house. We've seen this many times in the past and I'd like to reiterate that Mr. Volk is one of the few architects who actually returns to the scene of his designs and adds to them and deletes from them, and creates over a period of time. In 1961, an orchid house was built on this property as well. The original name of this property, given to it by its owners, was "El Retiro" and I assume that they had planned to have retired there originally. As usual, the most notable features of Mediterranean Revival design are the heavy cast stone ornamentation above the windows, and barrel clay tile on the roof, and the accentuated front entranceway. Another interesting feature of this house is the way it is sited on the property. It is set back on both Travers Way and El Bravo Way from the front street offering a larger front yard than most of the houses in this area do afford. It is just like the house on Ocean Boulevard, very worthy of your consideration.

Mrs. Volk: Thank you, Mr. Sved. May I have a motion that this Designation Report be made a part of the record?

MOTION BY MR. GUBELMANN THAT THE DESIGNATION REPORT BE MADE A PART OF THE RECORD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mrs. Volk: Are there any witnesses from the public sector?
Any comments from the Commissioners?

Mr. Gubelmann: Mr. Frank, do we have any replies from the Walshs on this?

Mr. Frank: No, sir. We don't.

Mr. Thomas: What is the Staff recommendation? Are you recommending this?

Mr. Frank: Yes. We recommend approval.

Dr. Curl: I'd like to mention this, since Mrs. Volk and I were talking about this. This is really John Volk's first house in Palm Beach. This was even before the term of Volk and Maas.

Mrs. Volk: He came to Palm Beach with Mr. Craig. His firm was originally Craig, Stevens and Volk. Craig was not an architect. (Indiscernible). My husband was the architect. This was a house that he did for Mr. Craig, and later it was owned by Elmer Rich. May I have a motion for the designation recommendation?

MOTION BY DR. CURL THAT THE PROPERTY AT 220 EL BRAVO WAY BE RECOMMENDED TO TOWN COUNCIL FOR DESIGNATION AS A LANDMARK OF THE TOWN OF PALM BEACH, AND THAT THE CRITERIA, AS PRESENTED,

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. MACKINTOSH.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

G. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 8-91,
Miscellaneous Changes

Applicant: Mr. John O. Pickett

Owner: Mr. John O. Pickett

Address: 1768 South Ocean Boulevard

Architect: Mr. Lindley Hoffman

Project Description: Request approval for the addition of a two story guest wing comprising approximately 1600 square feet on each floor; associated modification of existing pool room and guest bedroom; enlarge existing bay window, and other miscellaneous changes.

Lindley Hoffman, Architect for the project, came before the Commission. Mr. Hoffman stated that he has researched the architectural history of this Fatio home. The new owner, Mr. Pickett, intends to restore the home back to its original condition, when it was owned by the Huttons. The proposed addition is similar, yet longer, than the addition which was shown on the original plans. Secondly, an existing bay window at the master bedroom will be enlarged to provide some additional space.

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza commented negatively toward the proportion of the height of the new addition, viewing the addition as squat with small windows. Mr. Hoffman commented

that architecturally speaking, Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza is correct, but the attempt was made to restructure this addition to match the original addition. There was considerable discussion regarding building the addition in the smaller scale as was presented, versus increasing the proportions to make it architecturally correct. The Commission commented that they would support adding a decorative chimney to the roofline of the addition, if the owner would desire same.

MOTION BY DR. CURL TO APPROVE THIS APPLICATION AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The Commission did note, however, that they would likewise approve lowering the sill of the windows on the addition in an attempt to achieve better proportions.

Item 4: 250 Via Bellaria
OWNER: Ms. June R. Davis

Mrs. Volk: Now, we'll move back into our Designation Hearings. 250 Via Bellaria. Owner, Ms. June R. Davis. Do you have proof of publication and proper legal service, Mr. Frank?

Mr. Frank: Yes, we do.

Mrs. Volk: Would you swear in, Cindy, all the witnesses that are going to speak on this subject.

(Let the record show that no one stood to be sworn.)

Mrs. Volk: What is the Staff's recommendation?

Mr. Frank: Thank you, Madame Chairman. Staff recommends acceptance as a landmark, and in your report under Criteria for Designation, Staff has found that this property meets the following criteria.

(b) Is identified with historic personages or with important events in national, state or local history.

(c) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or is a specimen inherently valuable for the study of a period, style, method of construction or use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

(d) Is representative of the notable work of a master builder, designer or architect whose individual ability has been recognized or who influenced his age.

In this case, it is Maurice Fatio, and the biography is attached. Mr. Sved, could you give the presentation?

Mr. Sved: Thank you. 250 Via Bellaria was designed in 1931 by

Treanor and Fatio, with additions in 1962 by Gustave Maas. The overall form of the house can be considered Mediterranean Revival, like everything else today. However, some notable features of this house...#1 is it takes from the Villa Medici form which is the long, low-slung portion in the center capped by two towers on the end. In this case, the towers or tower blocks are topped with a very low roof line with a deep overhanging bracketed eave, which is somewhat Italianite in its form. You'll notice the overall broad appearance of this house, and here are some details of it. You'll also notice the roundheaded windows, the accentuated entry that you can see just barely at left, the quoining, and as I said earlier, it's a very striking feature in this area because it's a very low roof line. This is not very predominant on these blocks. The brick in this building came from Georgia, and it's a very sturdy, stable construction material, and it is laid in the flemish bond. This house is a very interesting example of Mr. Fatio's diverse architectural talents and is very worthy of your consideration.

Mrs. Volk: May I have a motion for the approval of the Designation Report be made a part of the record.

MOTION BY MR. GUBELMANN THAT THE DESIGNATION REPORT BE MADE A PART OF THE RECORD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mrs. Volk: Are there any witnesses from the audience who wish to speak?

(Let the record show that no one stood to be sworn.)

Mr. Frank: No correspondence has been received on this matter.

Mrs. Volk: Any comments from the Commissioners?

Dr. Curl: I want to do the entire street.

Mr. Gubelmann: To the west of this house, is there a house between it and the lake?

Mrs. Volk: Yes.

Dr. Curl: I'LL MOVE THAT THE PROPERTY AT 250 VIA BELLARIA BE RECOMMENDED TO TOWN COUNCIL FOR DESIGNATION AS A LANDMARK OF THE TOWN OF PALM BEACH, AND THAT THE CRITERIA, AS PRESENTED, BE MADE A PART OF THE RECORD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Item 5: 269 Park Avenue

OWNER: Mr. Richard Limehouse/Mr. William T. Jr. &
Mrs. Tracy E. Hall

Mrs. Volk: Now, we come to Item 5, 269 Park Avenue, Mr. Richard Limehouse/ Mr. William T. Jr. & Mrs. Tracy E. Hall. 269 is the parcel that we considered earlier. It was built around 1922. Do we have proof of publication and proper legal service, Tim?

Mr. Frank: Yes, Ma'am.

Mrs. Volk: And, would you swear in all the witnesses.

Mrs. Delp swore in Mrs. Tracy Hall using the same verbiage as was earlier stated.

Mrs. Volk: Mr. Frank, will you please give us the Staff's recommendation.

Mr. Frank: Before I read the Statement of Significance, I think a little bit of background is in order. I alluded to this earlier in the meeting, and I believe it was Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza who nominated this structure, and it was our belief at that time that there actually was a use of materials that was very unique, and we felt that this was a shingle style. But basically, it took a more Floridian form. And we thought that if such was the original construction and design, this would have been a very unique structure. However, Mrs. Hall, who was here earlier, did provide earlier photos than we had in the Town records. And we were able to determine from the photographs that actually this was built as a rather modest stucco type home. So, therefore, that is reflected in the new updated Statement of Significance and Criteria, and I'll read that into the record now. "The Landmarks Staff believes that this building does not merit designation. The structure at 269 Park Avenue does not exemplify or reflect the broad cultural, political, economic or social history of the nation, state, county or town; is not identified with historic personages or with important events in national, state or local history; does not embody distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type and is not a specimen inherently valuable for the study of a period, style, method of construction or use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship; and is not representative of the notable work of a master builder, designer or architect whose individual ability has been recognized or who influenced his age. This residence does not meet any of the criteria for designation, and should not be considered." Mr. Sved, I'd like you to show us examples of the house, so we know where we're coming from on this.

Mr. Sved: As we all know by now, the house was built in 1923. It even says so right below the old photograph at right. It is our belief from the building records that the porch in front was added in 1927, and that this building was converted into apartments in 1954. As you can see, this house takes on more of the Spanish Colonial flavor in the tradition of the Alamo, at the slide at right. The most notable feature of the structure, and it's a little bit clearer here, is the dutch gable hiding the regular A-framed pitched roof. There was a similar entry originally, and that has been lost. The shingles

were, we thought, rather unique to the house, however, they were not original, and since this is not a unique house, albeit an interesting house, we no longer feel that it is worthy of your consideration today.

Mrs. Volk: Thank you, Mr. Sved. May I have a motion that this report be made a part of the record?

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN THAT THE DESIGNATION REPORT BE MADE A PART OF THE RECORD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. METZGER.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mrs. Volk: Are there any other witnesses who wish to speak? Any comments from the Commissioners?

Dr. Curl: I just have to say that if this isn't a unique house, where are the others?

Mrs. Mackintosh: It's very interesting.

Mrs. Volk: May we have a motion that this not be recommended to the Town Council?

MOTION BY DR. CURL THAT THE PROPERTY AT 269 PARK AVENUE NOT BE RECOMMENDED TO TOWN COUNCIL FOR DESIGNATION AS A LANDMARK OF THE TOWN OF PALM BEACH, AND THAT THE CRITERIA, AS PRESENTED, AND THE PRESENTATION BE MADE A PART OF THE RECORD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. MACKINTOSH.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Let the record show that Mr. Gubelmann left the meeting before discussion of "Other Business".

VI. Other Business

A. Election of Officers

The Nominating Committee prepared a slate of officers as follows:

Jane Volk: President
Elise P. Mackintosh: Vice President
Sally Gingras: Secretary

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN TO APPROVE THE SLATE OF OFFICERS AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. THOMAS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Status Report - Landmark Plaque Committee - Mr. Silverman

Please note that the Landmark Plaque Committee met on Thursday, February 14, 1991 in the Conference Room of the Planning, Zoning and Building Department, and the Minutes of that meeting are attached to these Minutes.

Mr. Silverman thanked all of those who participated in the Plaque Committee, as well as Mr. Frank, Mr. Sved, and Mr. Martins. Mr. Silverman referenced a newspaper article in today's Palm Beach Daily News regarding the plaques, and took exception to a part of it which indicated that the plaque is being revised for aesthetic reasons. In actuality, the problem with the existing landmark plaque is that it is too small to be seen.

Mr. Silverman noted that it must yet be determined whether the Town or the property owner will bear the expense of the plaques.

The Committee had narrowed the choices down to an 8" oval, a 7" rectangle, and a 7.5" rectangle. All of these are bronze castings, are clean and neat, and are very visible. After some discussion, the Commission seemed to prefer the oval plaque over the rectangle, but wanted the letters of the words moved closer together to create a larger space between the words.

There was a show of hands for the oval plaque versus the rectangular plaque. The oval was preferred - 5 to 2.

MOTION BY MRS. MACKINTOSH TO APPROVE THE 8" OVAL PLAQUE, WITH THE PROVISIO THAT THE LETTERS BE MOVED CLOSER TOGETHER, THEREBY CREATING A LARGER SPACE BETWEEN THE WORDS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. THOMAS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Status Report - Mizner Memorial Fountain

Mr. Frank stated that as the Town is the owner of the Mizner Memorial Fountain, the Town Council was consulted on February 12, 1991 at its regular meeting about the various fountain proposals. Some Town Council members seemed to prefer a true restoration, i.e., a natural pond, but Staff presented the inherent problems with this option. The Town Council approved Scenario #3-Renovation, 1991, except for the color and tile selection. The approval was necessary so that the Town could proceed with the bidding process.

The color of the tile was in question. The Council seemed to lean to a single color for the tile, as opposed to a decorative tile with multiple colors. If a single color tile is used, it will probably be either navy or white. If navy is used, the pool will appear as a reflecting pool, whereas,

if white tile is used, the pool will take on the look of a swimming pool.

Mrs. Metzger stated that she met with Mrs. Summers of the Garden Club, and although the landscaping has not yet been approved, it was very attractive.

The Commission had its own discussion regarding the tile selection, which prompted the following motion:

MOTION BY MRS. METZGER THAT THE LANDMARK COMMISSION IS UNENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT THE MULTI-COLORED TILES, AND RECOMMENDS TO THE TOWN COUNCIL THAT THE NAVY BLUE TILES BE APPROVED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. Commission Appointments

Mr. Frank reported that at the February 12, 1991 Town Council meeting, the following Commissioners were appointed:

Jane Grace: Alternate Member
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza: Member - 1st term
Leslie Divoll: Member - 1st term

The Commission thanked Dr. Curl for his many years of excellent service to the Landmarks Preservation Commission and to landmarking efforts in the Town.

VII. Adjournment

MOTION TO ADJOURN BY MR. SILVERMAN AT 10:32 A.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. METZGER.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Friday, March 15, 1991 at 9:00 a.m. in the TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, TOWN HALL, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH.

Respectfully submitted,

Elise P. Mackintosh

Elise P. Mackintosh
Vice Chairman and former
Secretary

cmd