TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
9:00 a.m., WEDNESDAY, MAY 19, 1993
AT THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I. Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chairman Lillian Jane Volk.

II. Roll Call:

PRESENT: Lillian Jane Volk, Chairman
Elise P. Mackintosh, Vice Chairman (arrived 9:11 a.m.)
Sally Gingras, Secretary (arrived 9:01 a.m.)
Anne G. Metzger, Member
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza, Member
Leslie Divoll, Member
Arthur Silverman, Alternate Member
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney
Robert L. Moore, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
Timothy M. Frank, Planner/Projects Coordinator

ABSENT: William S. Gubelmann, Member
Wilmer J. Thomas, Jr., Alternate Member
Jane R. Grace, Alternate Member

RECORDING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

III. Approval of the Minutes of the April 21, 1993 Meeting:

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS MAILED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. METZGER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. Public Hearings:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 10-93, "Replacement awning"
Owner/Applicant: Town of Palm Beach
Address: 360 South County Road
Contractor: American Awning
Project Description: Request approval for a 15' wide by 8' projecting vinyl "replacement" awning on the third floor rooftop area. Color to match the exterior building color.

This project had been heard on an informal basis at last month's meeting. Mr. Joe Mattei, from American Awning, returned to the Commission today to put forth the formal request. Mrs. Volk reminded the Commission that the charge of the LPC was to review this project with respect to aesthetics only.

MOTION BY MRS. DIVOLL TO APPROVE THE AWNING AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. GINGRAS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 11-93, Modifications to previous approval
Owner: Mrs. George Hoyt
Applicant: Mr. Barry Hoyt
Address: 133 Banyan Road
Architect: The Pandula Architects
Project Description: Request approval for modifications to previous approval: To re-construct south site wall with new site piers and fountain facing pool pavilion; and reduce the scope of the north wing addition to include only the "utility/mechanical" room.

As this project had been presented informally last month, Mr. Pandula returned to the Commission today for the formal presentation. On the south site wall, three small piers and one large one, with a fountain facing the interior, will be added. Mrs. Volk felt that the piers were very heavy, but Mr. Pandula replied that they are the same size as those used at the entry gate. With reference to the reduction in scope of the project, due to Mrs. Hoyt's recent death, the music room, second floor loggia, breakfast terrace and north wing addition have been eliminated, leaving only the needed "utility/mechanical" room, a one story element with details to match the existing house.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA TO APPROVE THE MODIFICATIONS TO THE PREVIOUS APPROVAL, AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 12-93, Roof replacement
Owner/Applicant: Mr. Paul Maddock Jr.
Address: 561 North Lake Way
Project Description: Request approval to replace existing roof material with Celotex "Presidential" Shake Fiberglass Shingles

Mr. Lloyd McCants, the Maddock's superintendent, returned to the Commission today, subsequent to last month's informal review. He brought a sample of the selected roofing material, as stated above. This product has a 40 year limited warranty, and though it looks light grey in sample, it will appear white when installed on the roof. He explained that this particular shingle is heavier, and has more architectural detail, making it more rustic in appearance. Mrs. Metzger commented that although it would be preferable to replace the existing cedar shingles with new cedar shingles, practicality dictates that the Celotex shingle would be a fine substitute.

MOTION BY MRS. METZGER TO APPROVE THE CELOTEX ROOFING MATERIAL, AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. GINGRAS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. <u>Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 13-93, Garage, pool, fountain, spa</u>
Owner/Applicant: Mr. John A. Childs
Address: 232 Phipps Plaza
Architect: Mr. Bruce Johnston, Johnston Associates
Project Description: Request approval for the following

1. Conversion of two small staff bedrooms to garage - access driveway from West Drive
2. Addition of reflecting pool, fountain and spa in west garden

Mr. John Childs, property owner, presented this request as follows. He stated his desire to convert the existing two small staff bedrooms, utility room, and bath to a garage with access drive from West Drive, as there is currently no garage on the property. Mr. Childs felt that an on site garage would also be beneficial in that it would keep cars off Phipps Plaza. Mr. Childs showed a rendering of the garage showing an arched door with hardware, a door similar to the fire station doors. The size of the garage will be 22'x 20', and will accommodate either two small cars, or one large and one small car. An existing section of property wall and chainlink fence will be removed to allow for garage access.

At the other end of the property, there is a brick patio area. Mr. Childs proposes to remove the brick area and convert it to green space. He plans to use the square footage of the removed patio, and create a reflecting pool with sprays on each side, spa, and fountain at the end of the spa, all in the west garden. This will create a spectacular view from the living room window. The total length of the pool/spa/fountain will be approximately 20', and coral stone will be the material used. The fountain is existing and will be re-used. As the rendering of the pool/spa/fountain indicated various steps up in grade, Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza requested a height profile.
Mr. Childs stated that he will use a Spanish tile to trim the pool, but did not have the tile sample with him. The Commission complimented Mr. Childs on an excellent presentation.

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED, WITH THE CONDITION THAT WORKING DRAWINGS TO INCLUDE A HEIGHT PROFILE, AND TILE SAMPLES FOR THE POOL/SPA BE BROUGHT BACK TO THE COMMISSION AT A LATER DATE.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. GINGRAS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 14-93, Repave driveway
Owner/Applicant: Mr. Daniel J. Mahoney
Address: 1200 South Ocean Boulevard
Project Description: Request approval to re-pave existing red river rock driveway with asphalt

Attorney Gustave Broberg was present on Mr. Mahoney's behalf. He stated that the present river rock driveway has been impossible to maintain, thus the decision to re-pave with asphalt, working within the existing curbs.

MOTION BY MRS. DIVOLL TO APPROVE RE-PAVING THE DRIVEWAY WITH ASPHALT.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

F. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 15-93, Miscellaneous changes
Owner/Applicant: Power-Love Associates
Address: 256 Worth Avenue
Architect: Robert L. Bell
Project Description: Request approval of new storefront doors in the arched openings at center and west end of street elevation, and in existing opening on south elevation; removal of stucco infill panel, and replacement with fixed glass with wood trim and new door.

(Please note that the architect has requested deferral of this matter to the June meeting.)

MOTION BY MRS. DIVOLL TO DEFER THIS MATTER TO THE JUNE MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

G. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 16-93, Replace windows with doors
Owner/Applicant: Flagler Systems Inc.
Address: 1 South County Road
Architect: Gordon Mock
Project Description: Request approval to replace two windows with french doors for roof deck access from the first and sixth floors

Mr. Gordon Mock, Architect, presented a 1926 elevation of the west facade of the Breakers Hotel, where the changes will occur. These deck areas were used in the past for outdoor seating. Use of the areas will be regained with the access provided by the new doors. On the first floor level, the new french doors, in the existing opening, will replace that which was there in the 1920's. On the sixth floor level, a new concierge lounge will be created. The existing opening there will need to be widened by one foot. The Commission stated their preference for maintaining the existing opening size, rather than widening it. Mr. Mock replied that such a small opening, for doors, would be impractical for use by hotel guests. After some discussion relative to the size of the sixth floor opening, the following motion was made.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA TO APPROVE THE NEW FRENCH DOORS ON THE FIRST FLOOR LEVEL AT THE PORTE COCHERE; AND APPROVAL OF FRENCH DOORS ON THE SIXTH FLOOR LEVEL PROVIDING THAT THE WALL SPACE BETWEEN THE STUCCO BANDING OF THE FENESTRATION AT THIS LEVEL WILL MATCH THE WALL SPACE BETWEEN THE FENESTRATION AT THE LEVEL ABOVE.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. MACKINTOSH.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

H. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 17-93, Modification to previous approval
Owner/Applicant: Everglades Club
Address: 356 Worth Avenue
Architect: Mr. Ken Brower, Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: Request approval for modification to previous approval at kitchen service area: Retain 10'x8' opening, and add T&G cypress face to existing metal and fiberglass sliding door in existing opening.

Mr. Ken Brower, from Smith Architectural Group, presented this request for modification to a previous approval which is now proposed to make the dumpster area more efficient. So, instead of the original proposal, (a blank wall with a vented top and a man door), the modification would retain the existing sliding door or replace same with a new sliding door, and cover same door with tongue and groove cypress facing. This will enhance the appearance of the door, while retaining the function provided by the door. The practical application of the door allows a pick up truck to back up to the door for loading of trash receptacles, rather than having to bring the receptacles through the man door, located nearby, and then load them on the truck. Mr. Brower added that the changes in this area of the Everglades Club are just a temporary solution until they undertake a total renovation of the kitchen in the years to come.

Mr. Moore referred to this matter as a "thorny issue for Town administration", as the Everglades Club compactor was approved with conditions, and the Club has not abided by these conditions. Mr. Moore asked that the LPC, in making any approvals of this matter, stipulate that all conditions previously set forth shall be adhered to. Mrs. Divoll suggested that part of the problem, leaving the door open, could be solved by installing a self-closing device on the door.

MOTION BY MRS. DIVOLL TO APPROVE THE MODIFICATION AS

PRESENTED, USING EITHER THE EXISTING DOOR OR A NEW DOOR WITH A CLOSING ASSISTED TRACK; AND MAKING THE REQUEST THAT THE EVERGLADES CLUB FOLLOWS THROUGH WITH ALL CONDITIONS PREVIOUSLY SET FORTH.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. Other Business

Mrs. Volk reminded the Commissioners to review the Preservation Plan which was distributed at last month's meeting, in preparation for discussion at the June meeting.

* * *

Mr. Frank stated that Mrs. Jane Day will be prepared, at next month's meeting, to discuss a plan for new sites eligible for designation in the 1993/1994 Designation Season.

* * *

Mrs. Volk stated that she was very gratified at the attendance and generous contributions to the Preservation Celebration which had been held on Friday, May 14, 1993. The event was a tremendous success. She added that next year, the Florida Trust will have its meeting in Palm Beach County, and we will try to coordinate our Preservation Celebration with it. Mr. Moore commented that the success of the Preservation Celebration was "plus to the Town", and he thanked the Palm Beach Daily News for its favorable coverage of the event.

* * *

Mr. Moore stated that as more and more homes are landmarked, Staff's responsibility increases regarding inspection of these properties to be sure they are being maintained, and not being allowed to fall into "demolition by neglect" category. However, in light of current workloads and even tighter budget constraints, the hiring of additional consultants becomes questionable. So, unless a task is federally or state mandated, no additional employees will be able to be hired. Mr. Moore stated that currently, landmarked properties are only inspected in response to permits or complaints. These properties should, however, be inspected at regular intervals, perhaps annually, or every five years, or at some other agreeable interval. The LPC Ordinance does include the "demolition by neglect" provision, which authorizes Town funds to be used to undertake essential improvements to a landmarked property to avoid any further deterioration of the property. With the making of these repairs, the Town would lien the property for the funds expended.

Mr. Moore suggested that since current staff has been unable to make routine inspections of these properties, the Commission might consider having previous commissioners, who have proper letters of introduction, or current commissioners, with a similar letter, inspect the landmarked properties.

The Commissioners reacted unfavorably to the idea of routine inspections of landmarked properties, no matter who would perform them. They felt that landmarked property owners would highly resent the inspection as invasive and an intrusion, and such a program would shine an unfavorable light on landmarking. Commissioners also felt that if a landmarked home was in a state of deterioration, it would be noticed by the Town anyway. Mr. Moore responded, however, that staff must see that inspections are performed on these properties.

Mrs. Volk asked Mr. Randolph's opinion of the matter. He responded that he has a problem with the Commission delegating the authority to inspect to an individual member who would be operating on the Commission's behalf, and recommended that such a policy be discussed further at staff level.

* * *

Mr. Moore reminded the Commissioners that on Town Council meeting days, the parking on the east side of Town Hall is reserved for the Mayor and Town Council only.

VI. Adjournment

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 10:16 A.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be heard on WEDNESDAY, JUNE 16, 1993 at 9:00 a.m., in the TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH.

Respectfully submitted,

Sally Gingras
Sally Gingras
Secretary

cmd

88.9
90.7
93.9
94.3
94.9
98.7