TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
9:00 a.m., WEDNESDAY, JUNE 16, 1993
AT THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I. Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 9:02 a.m. by Chairman Lillian Jane Volk.

II. Roll Call:

PRESENT: Lillian Jane Volk, Chairman
Sally Gingras, Secretary
Anne G. Metzger, Member (arrived 9:20 a.m.)
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza, Member
Leslie Divoll, Member
Arthur Silverman, Alternate Member
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney
Robert L. Moore, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
Timothy M. Frank, Planner/Projects Coordinator

ABSENT: Elise P. Mackintosh, Vice Chairman
William S. Gubelmann, Member
Wilmer J. Thomas Jr., Alternate Member
Jane R. Grace, Alternate Member

RECORDING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

Let the record show that for purposes of this meeting, Mr. Silverman voted in place of Mrs. Mackintosh.

III. Approval of the Minutes of the May 19, 1993 Meeting:

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN TO APPROVE THE MINUTES AS MAILED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVOLL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. Public Hearings:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 15-93, Miscellaneous changes
Owner/Applicant: Power-Love Associates
Address: 256 Worth Avenue
Architect: Robert L. Bell
Project Description: Request approval of new storefront doors in the arched openings at center and west end of street elevation, and in existing opening on south elevation; removal of stucco infill panel, and replacement with fixed glass with wood trim and new door.

(This matter had been deferred from the May meeting. The architect now requests removal from the agenda.)

MOTION BY MS. DIVOLL TO APPROVE REMOVAL FROM THE AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Item G. was heard next, as it was concerned with the same project site as Item A.

G. <u>Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 23-93, Miscellaneous changes</u>
Owner/Applicant: Power-Love Associates c/o Mr. Gustave Broberg
Address: 256 Worth Avenue
Architect: Mr. Gene Lawrence, The Lawrence Group
Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. New door and storefront in the northeast entryway on Worth Avenue.
2. Open the middle arch in the walkway.
3. Open the easternmost arch on the courtyard.
4. Add door in center arch of courtyard.

Mr. Jim Lucas and Mr. Gene Lawrence presented the project for changes, as listed above, to accommodate the new tenant for this space, Gianfranco Ferre. The project, in order to reflect the tenant's interior design, also includes painting the existing mahogany outer trim on all of the windows and doors. The chosen color will be a dark grey burnished color. The inner framing of the windows/doors will be changed to stainless steel. Mr. Lawrence stated the additional request to remove the Gucci signage from the building.

The Commission expressed serious reservations about painting the mahogany and introducing stainless steel on this building. Mr. Lawrence requested that the opening of the arches be approved today, and stated he would confer further with his client regarding the painting and stainless steel window treatment.

MOTION BY MS. DIVOLL TO APPROVE OPENING OF THE MASONRY ARCHES, AND REMOVING THE GUCCI SIGN, WITH THE REMAINDER OF THE PROJECT TO BE DEFERRED TO NEXT MONTH'S MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. GINGRAS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. <u>Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 18-93, Chiller housing & relocate piping; relocate lighting</u>

Owner/Applicant: Via Mizner Associates Limited Partnership
Address: 333-345 Worth Avenue
Contractor: Hill York, Mr. Jeff Phillabaum
Project Description: Request approval for housing to conceal air conditioning chiller which serves the Addison Mizner apartment; location of chilled water lines running from the chiller into the apartment and electrical service to the chiller; and alternate location of lighting for flagpoles pursuant to previous approval (March 20, 1992)

Mr. Ian Kean of Via Mizner and Mr. Jeff Phillabaum of Hill York presented this request as outlined above. The chiller enclosure will be constructed on top of the existing five feet tall elevator pit housing on the north wall of the building in question. The chiller enclosure will be twelve feet in height, with a rough stucco exterior, painted white, and a sloped spanish clay tile roof, both to match the existing. A new door, painted white, will occur on the west facade of the new enclosure for access, and a moveable ladder will be available. New electric lines and chilled water lines will run from the enclosure, under the tiled roof and will continue along the top of the existing ledge. The ledge will be extended and connect to the existing chimney, which will be used to conceal the lines into the ceiling of the apartment living room. Mr. Kean stated that an acoustical engineer had been hired to address the noise generated by the new equipment. To resolve that matter, the enclosure will have a poured concrete ceiling with sand filled block and concrete walls. Venting of the enclosure will occur under the roof area, hiding the opening, and minimizing any emitted noise. The existing deteriorated access doors on the ground level, west elevation, will likewise be replaced.

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza suggested that the roof ledge, while being extended, could be made smaller and more delicate and decorative in detail. Mr. Kean stated this would be possible.

Also present was Mr. Jeff Guiffre, a lighting designer, to discuss the illumination of the flags on the Worth Avenue facade. A previous approval would have permitted conduit to run down the north side of the Worth Avenue columns to fixtures below. In order to avoid this situation, Mr. Guiffre presented an alternative solution...wall-mounted lighting located immediately below the point of the arch on the Worth Avenue facade. The low voltage fixture, with white finish, will be 4.5" in length by a 2.875" diameter, and will employ a 75 watt bulb. The lighting has been designed to illuminate just the two flags, while avoiding any trespass lighting into other areas. One plan would be to illuminate each flag with one fixture placed to the east side of each flag. However, Mr. Guiffre suggested that each flag might be illuminated by two light fixtures, one on either side of each flag. The necessary 6"x 8" transformer will be located in the ceiling pocket of the arcade and will be painted to match.

The Commission thanked the applicant for finding an acceptable solution to the problem of air conditioning the Mizner apartment, as well as a much more acceptable solution to the illumination of the flagpoles.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA TO APPROVE THE CHILLER ENCLOSURE PROJECT AS PRESENTED WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE EXTENSION OF THE ROOF LEDGE BE MADE SMALLER, MORE DELICATE AND DECORATIVE; AND APPROVAL OF THE REVISED LOCATION OF THE FLAG LIGHTING, AND FIXTURE APPROVAL WITH THE OPTION TO USE EITHER ONE OR TWO FIXTURES FOR EACH FLAG.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVOLL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 19-93, Miscellaneous changes
Owner/Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Michael Price
Address: 450 Worth Avenue
Architect: Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. Remove existing breakfast room window, and replace with french doors with side lites.

   This opening will be similar to other existing openings on the house. It is needed to provide more light into the breakfast room and to provide a courtyard view. New decorative columns will flank the new openings. A blue tile arch will occur above the opening, matching other openings on the house.

2. Remove existing concrete pool deck and replace with Herpel stone and tile.

   Herpel stone, to match coquina in color, has been chosen for the pool area, rather than coquina, as it is not as rough. The Herpel stone will occur in groups of four surrounded by a border of small blue tiles. The paving will drop off into landscaped areas.

3. Replace existing pool coping, and add new coping and pool tile.

   The pool coping will be kept to a minimum. The applicant anticipates installing a mosaic tile over the entire pool, using the same blue tile used elsewhere at the site, but Mr. Brower stated they will return for approval on this.

4. Remove existing pavers at front entrance walkway, and add coquina pavers and tile.

   Similar to the pool paving, the coquina will occur in groups of four, with the same blue tile border surrounding the grouping. The front steps will also be re-paved in similar material.

5. Reconfigure gate and archway at entrance to pool.

   Instead of the existing door, the owners would like a solid arched wooden door, with a small square opening. This will provide welcome privacy in the pool area.

6. Remove existing concrete driveway entrance, and add coquina stone and tile.

   Again, the paving pattern proposed elsewhere will be repeated here, four coquina pavers bordered by blue tiles.

7. West courtyard: Remove existing concrete and replace with coquina stone and tile.

   Repeating pattern of four coquina pavers bordered by blue tiles.

8. Main courtyard: Remove existing terrazzo and replace with coquina stone and tile.

   Repeating pattern of four coquina pavers bordered by blue tiles.

The Commission was hesitant to approve the proposed paving pattern due to the blue tiles being used. They stated no problem with the paving pattern, itself, in either Herpel stone or coquina, but the addition of the blue tiles, bordering each group of four pavers, could either be beautiful or horrendous, in their opinion.

Mr. Brower also mentioned that a new driveway gate is proposed, but is not being requested today as a variance for same must first be obtained. The gate is made of decorative wrought iron and will actually roll up overhead and back into the attic space of the carport. The front entry gate detailing was used as a model for the driveway gate.

MOTION BY MRS. GINGRAS TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED TO INCLUDE APPROVAL OF THE PAVING PATTERN, AS REQUESTED, WITH THE REQUEST THAT THE PAVING BE DONE IN STAGES, WITH THE POOL AREA BEING COMPLETED FIRST, SO THAT THE OWNERS AND THE COMMISSION CAN REVIEW THE END PRODUCT BEFORE ANY FURTHER APPLICATION OF THE BLUE TILES IN THE PAVING PATTERN. (PLEASE NOTE: IT IS UNDERSTOOD THAT THIS MOTION APPROVES PAVING OF THE NAMED AREAS WITH EITHER COQUINA OR HERPEL STONE, AS REQUESTED, AND THAT ONLY THE APPLICATION OF THE BLUE TILES IS YET QUESTIONABLE.)

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Brower, before leaving, thanked the Commission for working with Smith Architectural Group on renovations to Concha Marina, 102 Jungle Road, for which they had just received the Historic Trust Award.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 20-93, Signage
Owner: Mr. Franklin Frank
Applicant: Scotti's Wines & Liquors
Address: 365 South County Road, Units #4 & #5
Project Description: Request approval for identification signage to read "SCOTTI LIQUORS" in black lettering on the facade of the building.

Mr. Steven Keidaish presented this request to repeat the 333 South County Road signage on the Chilean Avenue facade of the new location in the Palm Beach Historic Inn Building. The signage is consistent with other signage appearing on that building.

MOTION BY MS. DIVOLL TO APPROVE THE SIGNAGE AS REQUESTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 21-93, Interior courtyard revisions
Owner/Applicant: Flagler Museum
Address: Whitehall Way
Architect: Robert L. Bell
Project Description: Request approval for changes to interior courtyard area as follows:

Mr. Robert Bell and Mr. Charles Simmons presented this request for the interior courtyard. Mr. Simmons had drafted a letter to Mr. Frank relative to the current problems with this particular courtyard, and Mr. Frank read same into the record. There was some question as to whether this courtyard should be under the jurisdiction of the LPC. Since the entire property is landmarked, Mr. Moore stated that the courtyard is indeed under the LPC's jurisdiction.

1. Remove existing courtyard pavers and planting.
2. Repair underground drainage system.
3. Revise stair at east side of courtyard.
   Stair will now come out straight into the courtyard.
4. Revised layout with new paver materials and planting areas, similar to original.
   Four "triangular" planting areas will occur around the center fountain. Also four large rectangular planting areas will occur at the edge of the courtyard - two on the east perimeter and two on the west perimeter. All planting areas will be bordered by a raised concrete curb. The cross-shaped walkway will be done in concrete pavers, and the walkway, at its north and south ends,

will be flush as it meets the next surface. In each of the four quadrants of the courtyard, a new paved area will occur. The existing 1920's Mexican tiles are planned for re-use in these areas, but if they are not re-usable, another material will be chosen, probably an earth tone with brick accent, or possibly, all brick in a specific pattern.

MOTION BY MS. DIVOLL TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS PRESENTED WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT IF THE OLD MEXICAN TILES ARE NOT SUITABLE FOR RE-USE, THE APPLICANT WILL RETURN TO THE COMMISSION FOR REVIEW OF AN ALTERNATE MATERIAL TO PAVE THE FOUR QUADRANTS OF THE COURTYARD.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

F. <u>Application for Certificate of Appropriateness No. 22-93, Relocate dumpster pad/equipment</u>
Owner/Application: Bath & Tennis Club
Address: 1170 South Ocean Boulevard
Architect: Mr. Robert L. Bell
Project Description: Request approval for relocation of existing dumpster pad & equipment, with fence and landscape site screening, to a location approximately 125' west of existing location. (Slab will cover approximately 364 square feet, and will be set back 20 feet from west property line.)

Mr. Bell stated that a variance had already been obtained for the relocation of the existing dumpster pad & equipment. The relocation had been prompted by complaints from tennis court users relative to the odor emanating from the dumpster. As stated above, the dumpster will be enclosed with screening and landscaping. There are two advantages to moving the dumpster/pad/equipment, i.e., it will actually be further away from the street than it was previously, and the relocation makes utilization of the dumpster easier.

Mr. Moore added that it was a condition of the Town Council approval that the service area of the Bath & Tennis Club, thought to be aesthetically objectionable, would be addressed for improvement. Mr. Bragg, of the Bath & Tennis Club, present in the audience, stated that the club would abide by this condition and improve the service area.

★ MOTION FOR APPROVAL BY MRS. GINGRAS. SECONDED BY MRS. METZGER. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. <u>Other Business</u>

A. Conceptual approval regarding request from Southern Bell to purchase easement at the North Fire Station.

Mr. James Bowser, Town Engineer, addressed the Commission. This request is to install a 2' wide, 7' long, 5.5' high equipment cabinet upon a 8' x 10' slab on the North Fire Station property instead of the Wells Road parkway. An existing cabinet, on a 4'x 5', slab has reached capacity and a new cabinet is needed to expand capacity and provide for future fiber optic cabling in the area. As it was felt that the Wells Road parkway location would have too great a visual impact on Wells Road, the alternate location was proposed upon the North Fire Station property. This could be accomplished through the purchase of a 9' x 15' easement from the Town. Town Staff has reviewed this request and favors placing the cabinet on the North Fire Station property. Landscaping, to be installed by Southern Bell, will surround the equipment, and will be maintained by the Town. Landscaping will be installed to the specifications of the Department of Public Works.

MOTION BY MS. DIVOLL FOR CONCEPTUAL APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT, PENDING PROPER LEGAL ADVERTISEMENT.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

* * * *

Mr. Frank, for informational purposes, reported that 2" grey strips of tread roughening material will be placed on the exterior steps of the Town's Police Station at 345 South County Road in an effort to prevent slipping conditions. This has been requested by the Town's Risk Manager, the Department of Public Works, and the Police Department.

* * * *

B. Review of Preservation Plan

Staff had distributed copies of the Preservation Plan to the Commission two months ago for their review and discussion today. Dr. Sandra Norman, of Research Atlantica, addressed the Commission requesting any corrections and/or suggestions relative to the document, prior to its presentation to the Town Council. In reviewing the document, discussion occurred regarding the following topics:

<u>LPC Ordinance change relative to residency of Commissioners:</u> Mr. Randolph stated that the LPC Ordinance has not yet been changed, therefore, it would be inappropriate to change the ordinance verbiage in the Preservation Plan at this time. Mr. Frank echoed the same, as he stated that the Preservation Plan, as written, should reflect only the current condition of the LPC Ordinance. Mr. Moore stated that the LPC Ordinance currently provides for all LPC Commissioners, except one, to be Town Residents. This has allowed for certain individuals, non-Town residents, who had preferred expertise relative to landmarking, to serve on the Commission. The first of these was Judge Knott, then Dr. Donald Curl, and now Leslie Divoll. Recently, the Town Council, in trying to standardize the Town's Commissions, made a recommendation to create a draft ordinance requiring that all Commission members on all Town Boards, except the Code Enforcement Board and the Building Board of Adjustments and Appeals which are governed by State statutes, be Town

Residents. With respect to Ms. Divoll, a non-Town resident who is currently seated on the LPC, there would be no effect on her current term. The ordinance change, however, if placed into effect, would effect any subsequent term she would desire to serve. As there was some disagreement among the Commissioners as to whether the residency requirement should be added to the LPC Ordinance, Mrs. Volk asked interested Commissioners to attend the July Town Council meeting, at which time the first reading of the draft ordinance will occur.

Archaeological Sites

This section was felt to be a very important component of the Preservation Plan. It identifies eleven known sites on the island, and stresses the importance of archaeological investigation prior to commencement of any digging on construction sites.

Ad Valorem Tax Relief

Mr. Frank had just attended a meeting of the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation in Tarpon Springs, where consultants, The Clarion Group, had presented a model ordinance, relative to ad valorem tax relief, which they had drafted for the City of Orlando. A county-wide ordinance would be needed in addition to a Town of Palm Beach initiative, since most of the ad valorem taxes are assessed by the County. In previous discussions relative to this topic, the Commission believed that in approving restorations/renovations where such tax relief would be applicable, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards would have to be followed as to the appropriateness of the restoration/renovation. Mr. Frank learned at this conference, however, that local ordinances may supersede the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Mrs. Volk gave her comments on various sections of the Preservation Plan during this discussion. Commissioners are to forward any suggestions and/or corrections to Mr. Frank or Mrs. Day as soon as possible in preparation for the presentation of document to the Town Council.

Discussion relative to Conflict of Interest-new Town regulations

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza brought up the matter of the new Town regulation that a given Commissioner can rightfully file a maximum of ten (10) Conflicts of Interest per year, but if more than ten occur, the Commissioner can be subject to removal from the Commission. Mr. Randolph clarified that this would be based on a calendar year commencing January 1, 1994. A Conflict of Interest exists, according to State statutes, when a Commissioner would experience some financial gain or loss as a result of service on a given Commission.

C. 1993/94 Designation Season

Mrs. Jane Day, of Research Atlantica, discussed the upcoming Designation Season, and specifically, the method of choice in selection of structures suitable for designation. She stated that of the 178 currently designated as landmarks, well over 50% were built between the years from 1920-1929. Also, most were Mediterranean Revival structures, and most were designed by Mizner. Now, the structures built between 1937-1943, approximately 114 in number, are eligible as possible inventory for designation. Presently, there are 928 properties listed in the Florida Master Site Files, but not all of these properties are eligible for designation. There are 35 of these, deemed eligible for landmarking by previous consultants, but not processed for designation. Mrs. Day would like to study these for the upcoming season, along with a review of the 114 structures built between 1937 and 1943. She would then bring her recommendations for designation to the September LPC meeting.

Mr. Moore reminded the Commission that the LPC is advisory to the Town Council. Although any Commissioner can nominate any building in Town for possible designation, and although more persons may be interested in having their property landmarked due to the ad valorem tax relief issue, the Town Council wants to hear presentations with substance that provide pure justification for landmarking structures. The Town Council, according to Mr. Moore, only wants to review the "very best" examples of architecture for possible landmark designation.

VI. Adjournment

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 11:37 A.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be heard on WEDNESDAY, JULY 21, 1993 at 9:00 a.m., in the TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH.

cmd