TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, JUNE 20, 2001 at 9:00 a.m.
AT THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 9:03 a.m. by Chairman Pandula.

II Roll Call:

PRESENT:
Eugene Pandula, Chairman
Ann Blades, Secretary (arrived 9:08 a.m.)
Sari M. Wilkey, Member
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza, Member
Ann Vanneck, Member
Jack Pyms, Member
Judy Hoffman, Alternate Member
Laurel Baker, Alternate Member
Veronica Close, Assistant Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
Paul W. Castro, Zoning Administrator
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney

ABSENT:
Elizabeth Dowdle, Vice Chairman (Unexcused)
Wendy Victor, Alternate Member (Unexcused)
Robert L. Moore, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
Timothy M. Frank, Planner/Projects Coordinator

RECORDING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

III Approval of the Minutes of the May 16, 2001 Meeting:
MOTION BY MRS. WILKEY FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES AS MAILED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV Administration of the Oath to all persons who wish to testify:
Mrs. Delp administered the oath to all persons who stood for swearing.

Post Office Box 2029 • 360 South County Road • Palm Beach, Florida 33480 • (561) 838-5430

V Public Hearings:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #11-2001, Driveway material change
Owner/applicant: The Mar-a-Lago Club
Address: 1100 South Ocean Boulevard
Architect: REG Architects
Project Description: Request approval of change of driveway material from loose gravel to a non-dusting surface, and other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION Mr. Pandula stated that he had spoken to Mr. Blackman by telephone.

This matter was presented by Mr. Wes Blackman, Director of Projects at the Mar-a-Lago Club, Mr. Rick Gonzalez with REG Architects and Mr. Jim Griffin, former superintendent at Mar-a-Lago (Mr. Griffin was employed at Mar-a-Lago when it was owned by Mrs. Post.) Mr. Blackman explained that the membership at the Club regards the existing loose pebble driveway as a nuisance. The loose pebbles are undesirable because they promote a great deal of dust, and are difficult to walk upon. In light of mandatory water restrictions, the only method of controlling the dust, by keeping the loose pebbles wet, is not possible.

So, as an alternative, Mr. Rick Gonzalez explained that coquina pavers will be used in the main entry drive, as well as the circular area at the guest house and the porte cochere area. The trim pieces will be 18"x 36" blocks as a border with the interior in 12"x 18" blocks in a running bond. The pavers will terminate at the east gate at South Ocean Boulevard. The service drive and north motorcourt parking area are proposed as asphalt.

Mr. Griffin testified that the driveways were originally done in pea gravel. The gravel was removed in the 50's by Mrs. Post due to similar nuisance complaints. It was replaced by asphalt at that time. The asphalt remained until 1995. At that point, the pea gravel was re-introduced. The gravel is very dusty, and labor intensive as it must be kept wet and raked.

Mrs. Vanneck commented that there should be some better solution than asphalt at this property. Mr. Blackman commented that the asphalt areas are not very visible from the Club, and other existing service drives on the site are asphalt. Mr. Pandula stated that the original proposal for today was asphalt on all the driveway surfaces. In working with Mr. Blackman and Mr. Gonzalez, however, the proposal was revised for a more finished look at the main drive and oval. Mr. Pandula felt this was a good compromise solution.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED SIMULTANEOUSLY BY MR. PYMS AND MRS. WILKEY.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1-0, WITH MRS. VANNECK OPPOSING.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness # 12-2001
Demolition of certain outbuildings & site features
Owner/Applicant: Judith M. Grubman
Address: 1102 North Ocean Boulevard
Architect: SKA Architects, Pat Seagraves
Project Description: Request approval to **remove** the following:

1. Pool pavilion (on application & plans, but called the guesthouse in the presentation)
2. Tennis Court
3. Pool
4. Patio area

And other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: Mr. Pandula stated he had spoken to Mr. Broberg several months ago, and Mrs. Vanneck stated she drove by the site.

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza asked Mr. Randolph if she had a conflict with this item since although she is part of SKA Architects, she is unaware of this project and it will provide no monetary gain to her personally. Mr. Randolph determined that, as such, she had no conflict.

Attorney Peter Broberg stated that to the best of his knowledge, the entire property was landmarked in 1989. In the fall of this year, a request will come forward to subdivide this lot creating a new lot with dimensions of 106.5' x 187.5', approximately 20,000 square feet. 1102 North Ocean Boulevard would then be left with 38,000 square feet. Today's request is for demolition of the pool pavilion a.k.a. guesthouse (built in 1992), tennis court , pool and patio area. Mr. Broberg stated that he has spoken to Mrs. Jane Day, Staff Preservation Consultant, and she had no objection to this demolition request. **Mr. Broberg announced that he has submitted a tax abatement application to the town and Mrs. Day**.

Mr. Pat Seagraves stated that ultimately, the main house at 1102 North Ocean Boulevard, designed by John Volk, will be completely restored and a pool constructed on the east lawn. Hearing this, Mrs. Hoffman commented that the pool would be ill-placed on the east side, especially for use during the winter. She also stated that it would be a shame to take the green space from this house as a result of a lot split. Mrs. Blades and Mrs. Vanneck agreed, stating that this proposal would change the estate character of the house to a large house on a small lot. Mr. Broberg responded that the existing house that will remain would not require any variances to sit on the lot that would remain.

Several members, in concern for the future lot split, called for more information, while others saw no problem with the demolition request put forth today. Mr. Broberg re-iterated that the guesthouse was built in 1992, was not mentioned in the Designation Report for 1102 North Ocean Boulevard, and is non-contributing to the landmark structure; likewise a tennis court in disrepair is to demolished along with the pool and patio. Veronica Close, Assistant Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, read the following staff comments from Ms. Jane Day, Staff Preservation Consultant:

"The pool pavilion dates from 1992 (John Gosman, Architect), the pool from the 1950s, and the tennis court from 1947. None of these features have much significance to the original John Volk house. Their demolition would not negatively impact the architectural integrity of the house."

Mr. Seagraves commented that the typical lot in this neighborhood is 10,000 square feet. The new lot to be created in this case will be twice that size, 20,000 square feet. Mr. Broberg stated that the new house which will be built on the new lot will be under the jurisdiction of the Landmarks Preservation Commission for review.

MOTION BY MR. PYMS TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION BASED ON THE STAFF REPORT AND THE SIZE OF THE LOTS.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.

ROLL CALL VOTE:	MR. PYMS:	Yes
	MRS. WILKEY:	Yes
	MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA:	Yes
	MRS. VANNECK:	No
	MRS. BLADES:	No
	MRS. HOFFMAN:	No
	MR. PANDULA:	Yes

MOTION CARRIES 4-3-0.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #13-2001
Facade changes
Owner: Power Love Associates
Applicant: Gucci America Inc.
Address: 256 Worth Avenue
Architect: Brower Architectural Associates
Project Description: Request approval of changes as follow:

Front Entrance Changes
1. Add metal (clad, polished Hematite) to existing cast stone door surround.
2. Back paint transom glass (putty grey) on new clear glass.
3. Add metal frame (satin Hematite) between transom and side lights
4. Add new (framed three edges, polished stainless steel) glass doors with metal door kick plates (polished stainless steel) and metal door pulls (brushed stainless steel) to new doors.

Worth Avenue Facade
1. Add metal (clad, satin Hematite) to existing wood mullion between transom and storefront window (typical of all three)
2. Back paint transom glass putty grey, (typical of all three) storefront transom windows.
3. Add sheer (cream color) curtain, pleated, 6" beyond window (2 easternmost storefronts).
4. Display window (third from east) to retain glass. Add wall approximately 6 feet beyond to create display case.
5. Add white "Mechoshade" (vertical shade) to each second floor window and door.

Gucci Via
1. Storefront same as #5 above.

Courtyard Window
1. Storefront same as #5 above.

Other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Anthony Harrington of Brower Architectural Associates and Caesar Gutero, Gucci Manager, presented this request to upgrade the facade and storefront. The goal is to remove the displays and create trim around the entryways.

After describing the project, as stated above, the LPC comments were as follows:

1. The building will take on a modern look with the Hematite cladding of the wood.
2. The wood will be hidden by the Hematite.
3. The windows now read as a full unit. That will not be the case after back painting the transoms.
4. Questioned the use of curtains in a shopping district.
5. Suggested keeping the windows as they are, and painting a wall 4' back from the window the desired putty grey color.
6. This proposal destroys the whole look of this building

In light of the comments heard, the architect requested a deferral to the July meeting.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JULY MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #14-2001
Fenestration changes
Owner/Applicant: 455 North County Road Inc. c/o Wade Byrd
Address: 455 North County Road
Architect: In-Architecture, Inc., Anthony E. Tzamtzis, P.A.
Project Description: Request approval of the following:
1. Change the west elevation of the property (former side elevation of home) to transition use as new front elevation, and reflecting redefined room usage of openings on north wing of west elevation
2. Re-sizing and addition of second floor doors and balcony with railing.
3. Redefinition of main floor rectangular windows to become doors with the addition of a balcony and railing
4. Changes to the addition on the south elevation to incorporate more windows on first and second floors.
5. Other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION

Mr. Pandula spoke with Mr. Bill Elias on site. Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza met with the owner at her office and on the job site. Mrs. Baker met with Mr. Elias.

Mrs. Delp administered the oath to Mr. Elias, Mr. Byrd, and Mr. Tzamtzis.

Mr. Elias, one of the owners of the property, Attorney Wade Byrd, and Architect Anthony Tzamtzis presented this request as a follow-up to the original approval. Construction is well under way with the interior structural rehabilitation. During that construction, it was noted that several other changes would be beneficial. The original house faced the ocean, and that elevation is being restored. The front entrance, however, is being changed to the west elevation. As such, some fenestration changes are required on the west elevation, along with the addition of some balconies. Also, on the previously approved addition (south elevation), the applicant is requesting more windows to alleviate the mass of the building. On the south elevation, four garage doors were previously approved. The proposal is to change one of the doors to a pedestrian door (with glazing) inside an arch to match the arches of the garage doors. There was some discussion as to what type of pedestrian door would be appropriate there, or if the arch was appropriate at all, etc.

It was questioned whether the proposed changes have any impact on the tax abatement issues related to this project. Mr. Pandula stated that the appropriateness of tax abatement for this project has yet to be determined, but these particular changes would not impact it. Ms. Close read Mrs. Jane Day's staff comments relative to this issue as follows:

"Although the fenestration changes to the west facade are acceptable on one level, the threshold of architectural integrity for the project is close to being compromised as this is added to interior changes, a two story addition on the southwest corner of the building, and the addition and reorientation of the house to the new grand entrance on the west. One thing that would help the project is to realize that the original house was a very simple example of Mizner's work and the Mediterranean Revival style. The addition of so many Corinthian columns and pilasters (although there is reference to them on the west facade) should be reviewed and perhaps a less ornate solution should be specified. It is also important to realize that the Department of the Interior's standards regulate both interior and exterior space. Although the Landmarks Commission had a lengthy discussion with the applicant at its October 18, 2000 meeting, and made a number of compromises, it is clear from the record that CoA #28-2000 was granted with the "understanding that this is a standard Certificate of Appropriateness" and does not insure that the project is eligible for tax relief. Bearing that in mind, one important architectural feature that the owner should consider saving is the staircase in the main loggia. This is typical of Mizner's work and an important design feature in the room."

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA FOR APPROVAL OF THE CHANGES AS PRESENTED, GIVING THE APPLICANT THE OPTION TO EITHER CHOOSE THE DOOR DESIGN (AS SHOWN ON THE PROPOSED SOUTH ELEVATION), OR TO REMOVE THE ARCH, JUST LEAVING A STUCCO WALL WITH A PEDESTRIAN DOOR.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Elias invited the commission members to come to 860 South Ocean Boulevard tomorrow from Noon to 3:00 p.m. for a sneak peak at this restored landmark.

G. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #15-2001
Additions, renovation & restoration
Owner/Applicant: Mr. Robert C. Echele
Address: 424 Brazilian Avenue
Architect: Brower Architectural Group
Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. Expand kitchen south into existing sitting room.
2. Add balcony on second floor
3. Add loggia on ground floor
4. Add bay window in east wall of dining room
5. Renovate second floor master bedroom and study.
6. Other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION

Ms. Close stated that the architect has requested a deferral to the July meeting.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

H. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #16-2001
Improvements to south oceanfront wing
Owner/applicant: Breakers Palm Beach Inc.
Address: 1 South County Road
Architect: Peacock & Lewis
Project Description: Request approval of improvements to south oceanfront wing, and other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION

Ms. Close stated that staff recommends deferral of this project to the July meeting for further review of this matter.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI Other Business:

Mrs. Wilkey commented that she attended the recent meeting of the Strategic Planning Board. This board is very interested in input from the LPC and ARCOM, and as such, she encouraged LPC members to attend upcoming meetings. The members requested that they be provided a schedule of the meetings of the Strategic Planning Board.

Mrs. Wilkey also questioned why the LPC was not advised that there would be a fee associated with a property becoming a landmark. Since so many staff members were absent today, this will be discussed at next month's meeting. Several members voiced their opinion that the fee is unfair.

VII Adjournment:

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK TO ADJOURN AT 10:08 A.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PYMS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on WEDNESDAY, **JULY 18, 2001** in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach at 9:00 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann Blades

Ann Blades, Secretary
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd

TOWN OF PALM BEACH
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ATTENDANCE RECORD 2001

MEMBERS	1/01	2/01	3/01	4/01	5/01	6/01	7/01	8/01	9/01	10/01	11//01	12/01
Eugene Pandula	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Elizabeth Dowdle	P	P	P	P	P	U						
Sari M. Wilkey	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza	E	P	P	P	P	P						
Ann Vanneck	P	P	U	P	P	P						
Ann Blades	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Jack Pyms	P	P	P	P	P	P						

ALTERNATE MEMBERS	1/01	2/01	3/01	4/01	5/01	6/01	7/01	8/01	9/01	10/01	11/01	12/01
Nikita Zukov	P	Resigned										
Judy Hoffman	U	P	P	P	P	P						
Laurel Baker	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Wendy Victor			P	P	P	U						

LEGEND:

	P	=	Present
	E	=	Excused
	U	=	Unexcused
	A	=	Absence Pending Classification as "excused" or "unexcused"

TOWN OF PALM BEACH
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

RECORD OF VOTING CONFLICTS <u>2001</u>

MEMBERS	1/01	2/01	3/01	4/01	5/01	6/01	7/01	8/01	9/01	10/01	11//01	12/01
Eugene Pandula												
Elizabeth Dowdle												
Sari M. Wilkey												
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza					V							
Ann Vanneck												
Ann Blades												
Jack Pyms												

ALTERNATE MEMBERS	1/01	2/01	3/01	4/01	5/01	6/01	7/01	8/01	9/01	10/01	11/01	12/01
Nikita Zukov		Resigned										
Judy Hoffman												
Laurel Baker												

LEGEND:

V = One Voting Conflict during a meeting
V2 = Two Voting Conflicts during a meeting
V3 = Three Voting Conflicts during a meeting

VPD = Voting Conflict Previously Declared (This category to be used when a conflict has Been declared at a previous meeting, and the Changes being reviewed are part of an ongoing project. ONLY COUNT ORIGINAL DECLARED CONFLICT PER JCR, TOWN ATTORNEY)