



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 21, 2000 at 9:00 a.m.

AT THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chairman Eugene Pandula.

II Roll Call:

PRESENT: Eugene Pandula, Chairman
Elizabeth Dowdle, Vice Chairman
Ann Blades, Secretary
Sari M. Wilkey, Member
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza, Member
Ann Vanneck, Member (arrived 9:02 a.m.)
Nikita Zukov, Alternate Member
Judy Hoffman, Alternate Member
Laurel Baker, Alternate Member
Clay Brooker, Seated for Town Attorney
Veronica Close, Assistant Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
Timothy M. Frank, Planner/Projects Coordinator

ABSENT: Jack Pyms, Alternate Member (Unexcused)
Robert L. Moore, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building

RECORDING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

III Approval of the Minutes of the May 17, 2000 Meeting:

MOTION BY MRS. BLADES FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES AS MAILED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV Administration of the Oath to all persons who wish to testify:
Mrs. Delp administered the oath to all persons who were present and wished to testify today.

V Public Hearings:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness # 17-2000,
Landscape, hardscape, fenestration changes

Owner/Applicant: Merrilyn Bardes

Address: 196 Banyan Road

Architect: Brower Architectural Associates

Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. Removal of existing tennis court, gazebo, spa, pool & decking
2. New Swimming pool, fountain and deck
3. Fenestration changes on east elevation south wing
4. Landscape/hardscape
5. Any other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Architect Raphael Saladrigas of Brower Architectural Associates stated that this owner intends to apply for tax abatement relative to this project. Mr. Saladrigas requested deferral of the change out of the french door on the east elevation. The bulk of the project was presented by Mario Nievera, Landscape Architect. In the rear of the property, the tennis court, gazebo and a very small swimming pool will be removed. A new pool, 44' x 18" (white marcite and blue tiles) will replace the existing pool, and will be placed at the original level of the finished grade, which is 3' lower than the existing tennis court. The new pool will not be visible from the house due to a 6' grade difference. Stairs will cascade down to the pool and pool terrace. The removal of the tennis court and gazebo will provide more garden area, a preference of the owner. A fountain will be re-introduced at the upper courtyard. A breakfast room terrace will be created, as well as a retaining wall along the south side of the property. Cast stone paving will be used accented by colored stone banding and hand painted Portuguese blue tiles.

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza commented that she had worked at this house previously, and the tennis court, pool, etc. are not original to the house.

MOTION BY MRS. DOWDLE FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION FOR DEFERRAL OF THE FENESTRATION CHANGE TO THE JULY MEETING..

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness # 18-2000.

Addition, restoration, landscape/hardscape

Owner/Applicant: Matthew and Helene Lorentzen

Address: 250 Sanford Avenue

Architect: Brower Architectural Associates

Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. Partial restoration of first and second floors
2. Covered balcony addition to second floor
3. Addition to existing cabana
4. New swimming pool and deck
5. General reconfiguration of landscape and hardscape, including reconfiguration of the driveway
6. Any other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Architects Ken Brower and Raphael Saladrigas of Brower Architectural Associates presented this request for the Lorentzens, the new property owners, who want to maintain and restore the residence at 250 Sanford Avenue. **The Lorentzens will apply for tax abatement on this project.** The architects are studying the original drawings in an effort to restore the building, while making it more liveable by today's standards. The master bedroom will be expanded out onto an existing second floor loggia, with the addition of a small balcony. The project also includes hardscape items, a new pool in the rear and changes to the existing cabana. Mr. Brower mentioned they will try to re-create, along the front of the property, the strong rhythm of palm trees already evident on Sanford Avenue. There is a landmarked ironwood tree in the rear which will be preserved undisturbed.

Raphael Saladrigas continued the presentation reviewing the elevations. Two additions are included in the project: addition to the cabana; and addition of cantilevered porch on the rear of the house. The ground floor plan remains the same except for the addition of the cabana. The second floor plan reflects the new cantilevered porch or balcony. The front elevation is essentially the same. French doors will replace sliding glass doors on the existing porch on the rear. The ironwork on the balcony will match ironwork on the front of the house. Some site walls will be moved, and the bricks will be re-used in the addition. The roof pitch will change in the rear. As for the driveway, a straight driveway is planned, rather than circular, to allow for more landscaping. Herringbone brick has been suggested as the driveway material, but a final determination has not been made yet.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION DIED FOR LACK OF A SECOND.

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza asked the architect to place shutters on the new openings to match the existing openings, and they agreed to do so.

Mrs. Day noted that this property is a Wyeth design, and is currently "under consideration" for landmark designation.

The architects stated that they will return with details of materials, landscape and hardscape. They did, however, ask for approval of the pool in the back yard. There is no pool at the site now. **The Commission agreed that the concept of the pool was approved as to location, but the applicant must return with materials.**

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT, BUT RETURN WITH LANDSCAPE, POOL, DRIVEWAY, HARDSCAPE AND MATERIALS. APPROVAL IS GIVEN WITH THE PROVISIO THAT SHUTTERS ARE ADDED TO THE UNSHUTTERED OPENINGS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. DOWDLE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The Commission authorized the contractor to proceed with digging the pool subsequent, of course, to obtaining the correct permits.

- C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #19-00,
 Fenestration changes
 Owner/Applicant: Power-Love Associates
 Address: 256 Worth Avenue (north side of inner courtyard area)
 Architect: Robert Bell
 Project Description: Request approval of the following:
1. Removal of existing aluminum framed awning windows in south wall of north building in courtyard area.
 2. New aluminum framed casement windows to be installed in existing openings.
 3. Windows at third floor to align with those at second floor
 4. New paired casement windows to be installed at second floor.
 5. Any other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION
Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza stated that she met with the architect, Mr. Bell.

Mr. Robert Bell, Architect, stated the primary reason for this project is that the property owner would like to provide some more light to a second floor tenant space. The new windows will be casements, perhaps aluminum frames in a bronze anodized finish to match the windows on the street facade. Windows will be added and changed as stated above in the Project Description. The LPC wanted a commitment from the architect that all the windows on this facade will be replaced in kind eventually. Mr. Frank commented that staff could review any future window changes.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED, WITH THE PROVISIO THAT STAFF BE ABLE TO REVIEW SUBSEQUENT WINDOW REPLACEMENTS ON THE AFFECTED FACADE TO ASSURE MATCHING, AND WITH THE PROVISIO THAT THE WINDOWS HAVE HORIZONTAL MUNTINS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #20-2000.
Raise buildings, addition, site work
Existing owner: Orator Woodward
Contract Purchaser: Laura Andre
Address: Lot 11, Vita Serena, a/k/a 181 Clarendon Avenue,
a/k/a 300 Lake Park Drive, a/k/a 11 Lake Park Drive
Architect: Everett H. Jenner
Project Description: Request approval of the following:
1. Raise existing building up to meet FEMA minimum of 7.0 NGVD
 2. Add 2nd master suite at second floor
 3. Raise and re-shape pool and add pool pavilion
 4. Raise garage building to adjust for road and site
 5. Build new roof above open air cabana bath (existing)
 6. Any other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Mr. Skip Jackman, who works in the office of Everett Jenner, Architect, and is under the supervision of Mr. Jenner presented this request in Mr. Jenner's absence. Mr. Jenner had a medical emergency today. Mr. Jackman explained that over the course of time this building has experienced a lot of water problems due to its low elevation, 3.94', and its positioning on the waterfront. The Town has agreed to raise the road, Lake Park Drive, by 1' or 1'2" in an attempt to alleviate this condition, but the house, itself, must be raised also, and will be raised to 7.0' elevation. The garage will likewise be raised, but not as high as the house. The boat basin, as well, will be raised to replicate what it used to be. The seawall will be raised to a 5' elevation. Several variances have been obtained for this project...front yard setback, lot coverage and green space. In order to raise the house, the house will either be cut into three pieces and moved out, section by section, while the new groundwork/foundation for each section is being done, or helical piers will be used so the house will not have to be cut.

The kitchen had been built on a wood joist floor, and had no ventilation. With repeated water and moisture problems over the years, the kitchen floor rotted and collapsed. As they must totally repair the first floor kitchen space, they would also like to place a second floor addition above the kitchen space. Mr. Jackman stated that the addition was designed to be compatible with the existing architecture. The addition will most likely be used for bedrooms. It will be set back only one foot from the 1st floor facade.

Another portion of the project concerns an outdoor toilet space containing a lavatory, shower and water closet. This is an open air space. The request is to add a shed type roof with the same barrel tile, the same pecky cypress wood beams and outlookers as are on the main house.

Other parts of the project are as follows. A new pool pavilion will replicate an existing outbuilding. A very large existing patio will be cut down in size to provide more green area. All awnings will be replaced as they are in disrepair.

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza was very concerned about the positioning of the cabana roof, feeling that it is too much of a structure and overshadows the existing decorative gate, viewed as a very important historical gate. Mr. Zukov commented that the second floor addition really takes away from the main building and would only be possibly acceptable if pushed way back. Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza felt that the addition should be separated from the rest of the house, i.e., read like an

addition, and if approved, the windows should be totally different in style or spaced the same as the existing windows. Mr. Pandula commented as such: That this proposal is "way off the mark;" the house has lost its character; the plans do not include floor plans or west and north elevations; the plans need more detail as to height, etc.; the pool area is not balanced either as to axis; this is just an attempt to gain more volume; the roof above the outside bath really "kills" the gate; "what you've done there hurts the house significantly."

Mr. Jackman was asked whether this is a tax abatement project. He replied that he did not know.

Staff recommended deferral of the project.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRANDE MENDOZA FOR DEFERRAL OF THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING, WITH THE APPLICANT TAKING NOTE OF THE CONCERNS AND RECOMMENDATIONS EXPRESSED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #21-00,

Addition, fenestration changes, pool, site changes

Owner/Applicant: Irving W. Bailey II

Address: 15 Golf Road

Architect: Botkin, Parssi & Associates Inc.

Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. Relocation of garden wall and gate to the front property line north of the Sidewalk along Golf Road. New garden wall and gate to be same color, size and proportion, and same materials.
2. Circular clear story window with conical roof to be inserted over the rotunda stairway
3. New entrance added to the south elevation from the loggia extension into the kitchen. The doorway will match the existing south elevation entrance from the loggia extension into the dining room
4. The height of the existing entrance to dining room on west side of the house will be raised to the same height/level as the existing windows along the north side of the home (in the dining room)
5. An existing window on the west side of the home (in kitchen) will be replaced by a doorway/entrance
6. Interior renovation on second floor
7. Bathroom added to second floor along the north (rear) side of home
8. Removal of south elevation arched mirrors and coquina stone ledge table
9. Change color on window trim
10. Change style of front walkway from herringbone brick to natural coquina (to match existing hardscape currently located throughout the property)
11. Change a portion of the walkway along the east side to straighten the walkway and relocate the low retaining wall to align it with the new walkway
12. Any other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Attorney Rebecca Henderson offered some opening remarks. **She stated that the property owner**

will be seeking tax abatement relative to this project.

Mr. Pandula interrupted Ms. Henderson with a question as to whether there was an architect on the project. She replied that the architect was Bob Botkin. The LPC noted that he was an engineer, not an architect. Ms. Henderson also stated that the architect is Scott Snyder who is the designer. The LPC noted that he was a decorator, not an architect. Mr. Botkin has been signing the plans. Ms. Virginia Dominisis, in the audience, stated that she is functioning as the architectural designer, that she is an architect working for Scott Snyder. As such, Ms. Henderson proceeded with the presentation. However, it was noted shortly thereafter that Ms. Dominisis is not licensed as an architect in the State of Florida, though she possesses a degree in architecture, and therefore, no licensed design professional was present. Mr. Pandula stated that the options were to permit them to present as an informal review or to defer the project. Mrs. Dowdle asked for a legal interpretation as to the procedure to follow.

Attorney Clay Brooker stated that the ordinance does not specify whether a licensed architect is required, but from his understanding, the procedure has been to have a licensed architect make the presentation. He concluded that it was up to the LPC as to how they wanted to handle this.

Ms. Veronica Close, Assistant Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, clarified that the plans submitted are sealed by an engineer, but there is no representative of that office present to make the presentation.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA TO ALLOW THE PROJECT TO BE HEARD ON AN INFORMAL BASIS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. DOWDLE.

ROLL CALL VOTE: MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA:	YES
MRS. DOWDLE:	YES
MRS. WILKEY:	NO
MRS. VANNECK:	NO
MRS. BLADES:	NO
MR. ZUKOV:	NO
MR. PANDULA:	YES

MOTION FAILS 3-4-0.

Mr. Frank called for another motion.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JULY MEETING, WITH THE REQUEST THAT MR. BOTKIN OR A LICENSED ARCHITECT PRESENTS THIS PROJECT.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mrs. Vanneck stated that the members of the LPC can be contacted on an individual basis to discuss the project.

VI Other Business:

A. Staff Comments

Veronica Close stated that staff recommends that time be taken in the October meeting to review the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the set of standards used to review tax abatement projects.

A copy of correspondence from Mr. Randolph to the Commission on Ethics relative to the presence of architects on the Landmarks Preservation Commission was distributed to the members. Mr. Brooker summarized the contents. There has been no finding to date. Mr. Frank stated that the Town Council directed that the ordinance be changed in favor of requiring that architects serve on the commission. It is coming up for second reading.

Mrs. Polly Earl of the Preservation Foundation stated that the question remains whether architects who serve on the commission may recuse themselves and present a project for review before the Landmarks Preservation Commission, on which they serve. She stated that the Preservation Foundation feels very strongly that the LPC needs architects to serve on the LPC who practice in the field of historic preservation, and are able to recuse themselves properly to present in front of the LPC. She and Mrs. Day commented that this subject is of great interest at the state level. She also encouraged the members to attend as many state and national meetings as possible to gain insight and offer information and expertise.

B. Casa Rosada - 323 Brazilian Avenue - Discussion

Color has become an issue for Casa Rosada. The houses are painted an apricot color, while the landmarked wall remains the original pink. The approved color for the houses was a creamy beige color. Staff approved green trim as well, to match the green trim on Town Hall. Mr. Frank will handle these issues at the time of the inspection for Certificate of Occupancy.

C. 252 El Bravo Way - Comment

Mrs. Blades stated that extensive work is being done on this property. Mr. Frank replied that the work being done is being done under staff approval. Most of the changes are taking the property back to the original and are removing items which were added inappropriately.

D. 334 El Vedado Road - Discussion

Mr. Frank stated that he has written a letter to the Meyers informing them of the conditions noted at the site, and informing them that due to the changes that were made, any tax abatement, that might otherwise have been due the property owner, may be lost. This is largely because most of the original hollow clay tile and wood frame construction has been removed and replaced.

E. Tax Abatements - LPC jurisdiction over interiors of properties?

It was clear to Mr. Pandula, in his pre-meeting review of the plans for one of today's projects, that interior changes were included in the request. Mrs. Day commented that interior review is only a consideration when tax abatement projects are involved. Mrs. Day will inquire how other municipalities within the state are handling this issue. This issue has come to light since Mrs. Day has been informed that the County Tax Assessor's office is lumping values of interior changes with values of exterior changes in determining the amount of abatement offered. Staff is re-thinking a

way to best administer this program. More information will be developed for the public. This matter will be discussed further at the October meeting.

VII Adjournment:

MOTION TO ADJOURN AT 11:10 A.M. BY MRS. DOWDLE.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on WEDNESDAY, JULY 19, 2000 in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach at 9:00 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Ann Blades, Secretary
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd

TOWN OF PALM BEACH

ATTENDANCE RECORD (2000)

MEMBERS	1/00	2/00	3/00	4/00	5/00	6/00	7/00	8/00	9/00	10/00	11/00	12/00
Jeffery W. Smith	P	P	P	***Resigned***	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Eugene Pandula	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Elizabeth Dowdle	U	P	P	P	P	P						
Sari M. Wilkey	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza	P	P	E	P	P	P						
Ann Vanneck	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Ann Blades	P	P	P	P	P	P						
Jack Pyms	see below-----			P	P	U						
ALTERNATES	1/00	2/00	3/00	4/00	5/00	6/00	7/00	8/00	9/00	10/00	11/00	12/00
Nikita Zukov	P	P	P	P	E	P						
Judy Hoffman	P	P	P	P	E	P						
Jack Pyms	P	P	P	(appt. as regular member)								
Laurel Baker	n/a	n/a	n/a	E	P	P						

LEGEND: P = Present
 E = Excused Absence
 U = Unexcused Absence
 A = Absence Pending Classification as "Excused" or "Unexcused"

TOWN OF PALM BEACH

RECORD OF VOTING CONFLICTS (2000)

MEMBERS	1/00	2/00	3/00	4/00	5/00	6/00	7/00	8/00	9/00	10/00	11/00	12/00
Jeffery W. Smith		VPD2										
Eugene Pandula	V1			V1 VPD1								
Elizabeth Dowdle												
Sari M. Wilkey												
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza												
Ann Vanneck												
Ann Blades												

ALTERNATES	1/00	2/00	3/00	4/00	5/00	6/00	7/00	8/00	9/00	10/00	11/00	12/00
Nikita Zukov												
Judy Hoffman												
Jack Pym												

LEGEND: V = One Voting Conflict during a meeting
 V2 = Two Voting Conflicts during a meeting
 V3 = Three Voting Conflicts during a meeting
 And so on...

VPD = Voting Conflict Previously Declared
 (This category to be used when a conflict has been declared at a previous meeting, and the changes being reviewed are part of an ongoing renovation project. ON COUNT ORIGIN DECLARED CONFLICT FOR ONGOING PROJECTS PER JOHN C. RANDOLPH, TOWN ATTORNEY)