

MINUTES
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
9:00 a.m., WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 16, 1998
AT THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I. Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Chairman Jeffery W. Smith.

II. Roll Call:

PRESENT: Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman
Eugene Pandula, Vice Chairman
Lindley M. F. Hoffman, Secretary
Arthur Silverman, Member
Elizabeth Shields, Member
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza, Member - arrived 9:01 a.m.
Nikita Zukov, Alternate Member - arrived 9:04 a.m.
Ann Lilja, Alternate Member
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney
Timothy M. Frank, Planner/Projects Coordinator

ABSENT: Sari M. Wilkey, Member (Excused due to family emergency)
Leighton Rosenthal (Unexcused)

RECORDING SECRETARY: Gretchen Dayton
TRANSCRIBING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

III. Approval of the Minutes of the August 19, 1998 Meeting

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES AS MAILED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. PANDULA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. Administration of the Oath to all persons who wish to testify:
Ms. Dayton administered the oath to all those present who wished to testify today.

V. Public Hearings:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #18-98, (deferred from April, May, June & July)
Covered walkway, demolition, Fountain, Courtyard, Property Wall
Owner: E.W. Cook Trustee and Chalet Restaurants Inc.
Applicant: Chase Manhattan Private Banking, N.A.
Address: 205 Royal Palm Way, incorporating 221 Royal Palm Way
Architect: The Lawrence Group
Project Description: Request approval of the following remaining items:

1. Signage
2. Other associated changes as presented

Please note that architect requested deferral of signage to the September meeting.

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Previously approved items at the April, May, and June meetings

1. Construct a covered walkway between existing buildings at 205 and 221 Royal Palm Way
2. Demolish a portion of the first floor at 221 Royal Palm Way and change exterior of building to Mediterranean style.
3. Construct new fountain and exterior court
4. Construct new north boundary wall

Mr. Eugene Lawrence, Project Architect, presented the request for signage, the last remaining item for the bank project. The existing tower signage will be removed and replaced with a smaller building identification sign in black raised lettering to read: "CHASE MANHATTAN PRIVATE BANK BUILDING." Also along Royal Palm Way, signage will be placed under the pediment to read: "Chase Manhattan Plaza." "Chase Manhattan Private Bank" will appear on the renovated former Nando's building. On South County Road at the south corner, the word "CHASE" will appear just above the floor level. The South County Road entrance doors will read "Chase" (centered) and "Chase Manhattan Private Bank" on the windows all in gold leaf. One additional sign will occur on Royal Palm Way at the south entrance door showing the street address in polished brass above a polished brass logo and then the word "CHASE" under that in polished brass, all on a textured brass background. All building signage will be done in black except that which has been specified otherwise.

MOTION BY MR. PANDULA TO APPROVE THE SIGNAGE AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #24-98, (deferred from June & July meeting)

Doors/windows, pool, terraces, driveway & gates

Owner/Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Robert Miller

Address: 105 Clarendon Avenue

Architect: SKA Architect & Planner

(Voting Conflict previously declared by Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza)

Project Description: Request approval of the following remaining items:

1. New gates
2. Other associated changes as presented

Please note that the architect requested deferral of the remaining items to the September meeting.

Previously approved items from the June meeting:

1. Revision of previously approved courtyard door and family room windows/doors
2. New pool and garden terraces
3. New driveway

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza re-stated her Conflict of Interest with respect to this matter, as she is the architect of record for this project. Mr. Ray Wall of Newlands Design Group gave the presentation. The driveway, in cast stone pavers, had been previously approved. The applicant would like to amend that approval by placing 2" -3" strips

of grass between the pavers. Assorted landscape materials will be added around the driveway including two seagrape trees, several cocoanut palms as well as other palm varieties, along with pots and accent plants. The existing Australian pine hedge will remain. Mr. Wall assured the LPC that the date palms near the house would lean out from the house so that the heads will not touch the house.

At the last meeting, the LPC asked that the gates be re-studied as it was felt they were too wide. The new design reverses the design of an iron gate found on the interior, with a scallop top and 4' fixed panels on either side of a 17' opening section of gate. The gates will be placed between double pilasters.

Mr. Smith did not like the scallop as shown. Mr. Pandula and Mr. Hoffman preferred the design panels at the bottom of the gate to those at the top. It was suggested that the fixed panels be changed from 4' to 8' in width. Re-study of the gate was requested by the LPC.

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN FOR DEFERRAL OF THE GATE DESIGN TO OCTOBER.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOFFMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MS. SHIELDS TO APPROVE THE LANDSCAPING AND DRIVEWAY CHANGE.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. LILJA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #34-98.

Miscellaneous changes

Owner/Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Louis Furlo

Address: 840 South Ocean Boulevard

Architect: Smith Architectural Group

Project Description: Request approval of the following:

5. Change paving material on existing drive
6. Other associated changes as presented

Please note that the Commission deferred consideration of the paving and lantern details to the September meeting.

Previously approved items from the June meeting:

1. Remove existing exterior shutter boxes
2. New wrought iron grills to match original
3. Add cast stone on north and east elevations to match original
4. New french doors and cast stone balcony

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Mr. Smith re-stated his previously declared Conflict of Interest with respect to this matter, and passed the gavel to Mr. Pandula. Mr. Pandula noted that the applicant requests deferral to the October agenda.

MOTION BY MR. HOFFMAN FOR DEFERRAL TO THE OCTOBER MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. SHIELDS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #31-98.

Demolition/New Construction of New Two Family Dwelling

Owner/Applicant: Casa Rosada

Address: 323 Brazilian Avenue

Architect: Smith & Moore Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Approval as follows:

1. Partial demolition and restoration of the existing embattlement wall
2. Demolition of an existing one story residence and garage
3. New construction of a two story, two family residence with pools, new driveways and landscaping
4. Other associated changes as presented

Please note that the Commission deferred this project for further study (“Keeping the L.P.C. comments in mind”) to the September meeting.

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

The architect has requested deferral to the October meeting, and as such, the following motion was made:

MOTION BY MR. PANDULA FOR DEFERRAL TO THE OCTOBER MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SILVERMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #37-98.

Construction of a New Swimming Pool

Owner/Applicant: Charlotte & William Frank

Address: 134 Seabreeze Avenue

Contractor: Hackl Pools, Inc.

Project Description: Approval as follows:

1. Construction of new pool.

Please note that the Commission heard this project on an informal basis at the August meeting.

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

This matter had been heard on an informal basis with no negative comment from the LPC. No negative comments have been delivered to the Town from the public relative to this matter either.

MOTION BY MR. SILVERMAN TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED INFORMALLY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

F. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #38-98.

Landscape Plan

Owner/Applicant: Mr. Jeffery Fisher

Address: 255 Clarke Avenue

Landscape Architect: Wheelock, Sanchez & Maddeux

Project Description: Approval as follows:

1. Approval of Landscape Plan/hardscape plan to include addition of new brick terrace, removal of the existing pool and relocation of new pool, and add several new fountains.
2. North Facade: Remove insensitive 1984 addition, tower element on northeast corner, removal of an addition of a room and roof terrace, & removal of spiral stair
3. South Facade: Remove closet addition and open original loggia

4. West Facade: Change flat roof to hip; door & window changes
5. East Facade: Remove portion of bar & install set of french doors & recess glass enclosure
6. Any other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: As follows:

Mr. Zukov: Met with Mr. Sanchez at his office

Ms. Lilja: Spoke by telephone to Mr. Sanchez

Ms. Albarran de Mendoza: Met with Mr. Sanchez at his office

Mr. Pandula: None declared

Mr. Hoffman: Met with Mr. Sanchez at his office

Ms. Shields: Was phoned, but was unable to meet with Mr. Sanchez

Mr. Silverman: Was phoned, but was unable to meet with Mr. Sanchez

The Landscape Architect, Mr. Jorge Sanchez, stated that the agenda did not reflect the architectural portion of the project. Mr. Frank read the legal ad for this project into the record which accurately reflected the full scope of the project. Therefore, the matter could proceed to be heard.

Architect Clement Schwab stated that most of the work will be in the rear of the house and the courtyard. There will be no changes to the street elevation except for landscaping and restoration work. The original John Volk front elevation had been filled in. This will be removed and the loggia opened up back to its original use, and the cast stone around the windows will be restored. Mr. Smith commented that this was a great improvement from what was there.

In the rear, the major change will bring back the original Volk design removing inappropriate additions including removing a tower and creating a continuous porch with one side partially enclosed. The project results in a net reduction in the CCR and the total area. Landscape area increases. There was an enclosed area at the loggia used as an interior/exterior space. They want to maintain it, but remove the storefront aluminum and replace it with a butt glass system. The glazing work was discussed and it was suggested to remove the columns and replace them after the work is done. The architect stated that the columns are original. They are likewise solid and load-bearing.

Mr. Schwab presented detail drawings of the columns showing the support system and photographs of the existing interior. It was felt that this would look like a glass box and the columns will not be visible. Mr. Pandula felt that the proposal would be a cleaner design than the existing condition. There is a flat roof connecting the main house to the garage. This will be replaced with a sloped barrel tile roof.

The LPC members did not like the “glass box” presented here placing the columns on the inside of the glass, even though this solution is cleaner than the existing condition.

MOTION BY MR. PANDULA APPROVING THE ARCHITECTURAL ASPECTS OF THE PROJECT, EXCEPTING THE EXTERIOR BUTT GLAZING SYSTEM ON THE REAR LOGGIA WHICH IS DEFERRED TO THE OCTOBER MEETING, WITH THE COMMENT THAT THE APPLICANT SHOULD EITHER CENTER THE GLASS IN THE ARCHES OR RE-STUDY FOR POSSIBLE INTERIOR MOUNTING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

In light of Mrs. Delp’s injury and absence, Mr. Frank apologized for his error on this agenda item relative to the listing of the project description, but indicated that it had been properly advertised by Mrs. Delp prior to her absence.

The landscape/hardscape portion of the project was presented by Mr. Jorge Sanchez, Landscape Architect. Mr. Sanchez stated that there are large areas of red cement on the site, especially in the front and rear. They propose

to remove all the cement in the front and to do a smaller driveway using simulated coquina. The area in the center of the driveway will be solid and the areas around it will have grass in between to soften the look of the driveway. As for the area in front of the existing wood and iron grill front door, the owners want to be able to leave the door open for cross ventilation. So, they propose to elevate the front area about 4" from the existing front floor elevation and add a small short fountain to screen the entrance from the road.

In the rear of the property, the existing swimming pool will be removed, and they will re-locate a new long reflecting pool with a runnel on the side. The new pool will be 10' x 50' and the proposal cuts back the existing wall and creates a seating area. From an existing structure on site, they will create a pergola by adding columns, taken from the main house demolition work, for re-use here. For the pergola, the existing structure's back wall will remain, as well as two windows and flooring. To the existing structure, they will be adding columns, removing an awning and adding the pergola members. Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza commented that the members of the pergola, on top, seem "skimpy." Mr. Sanchez assured Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza that the proportions of the pergola, despite the way the drawing may appear, are perfect.

As for landscaping, two weeping Pongam trees will be planted to the front of the pergola, one on either side. A small alley of thin Alexander palms, along with perennial beds and small walkways, will run the length of the pool on both sides. An existing small well will be relocated to the broken coquina courtyard on the south side of the property. The dining room loggia will have a pedestal fountain, and Mr. Sanchez presented drawings of same. Simulated coquina will be used around the pool. The pool coping is real coquina.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA FOR APPROVAL OF THE LANDSCAPE/HARDSCAPE WITH THE PROVISIO THAT THE PERGOLA IS PROPORTIONED AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

**G. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #39-98,
 Landscape Planting Material Plan**

Owner/Applicant: Kathleen Hammer & Arthur Seelbinder

Address: 210 El Brillo Way

Landscape Architect: Mario Nievera Design

Project Description: Approval as follows:

1. Approval of Landscape Planting Material Plan of previously approved plan.

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza re-stated her Conflict of Interest with respect to this item as she is the architect of record. Landscape Architect, Mario Nievera, presented the project. He stated that the hardscape elements were previously approved. The front driveway and foundation of the house are shaded by two very large banyan trees which will remain. Two existing areca palms at the house are too shaded by the banyans, so they will be transplanted to the front island to join with other assorted plantings for a natural jungle look to screen the house and driveway.

On the west side, an existing ficus hedge will remain and will be supplemented by shade tolerant plant material. On the east side, shade tolerant plant material will supplement the existing schefflera. In the courtyard are four Alexander palms. In the back, there are only a few areca palms which will remain as well as the hedge between the neighbors. Various palms will be planted along the perimeter, where allowable, to screen the property from the neighbors. Smaller palms will be placed around the pool and pool walls. A colorful courtyard garden will be hand placed by Mr. Nievera with approximately 100 one to three gallon perennials, ground covers and tropical shrubs. Zoysia sod will be planted in the pool area.

MOTION BY MS SHIELDS FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. LILJA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

H. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #40-98.
Residential Property Addition

Owner/Applicant: Dr. Daniel Doctor and Dr. Judith Doctor.

Address: 3 Pelican Lane

Architect: NXG Architects

Project Description: Approval as follows:

1. Add 114.5 square foot addition to existing structure.
2. Return exterior shutters to original design.
3. Change exterior paint color
4. Remove exterior circular pool and add new pool.
5. New grade wall with railing.
6. New rear property wall with railing.
7. Replace asphalt driveway with interlocking pavers that match existing entry and parking areas.
8. Replace existing pavers with limestone finish material.
9. Add new fountain to front entry court.
10. Replace existing chain link fence at north property line with railing and solid post to match front entry post and railing design.
11. Add new trash enclosure walls at south side of building adjacent to existing driveway.
12. Add side yard privacy wall with gate to match front entry access.
13. Add new gate posts at non-vehicular access at north property line.
14. Other associated changes as presented.

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: As follows...

Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza spoke with the architect.

Mr. Silverman visited the site.

Attorney Ron Kolins and Architect Noe Guerra were present on behalf of the applicant. This house had come before the LPC when it was owned Mr. Levy, who got approval for certain of the items listed on the agenda today. The clients want to restore the property to the 1930's condition, and will enhance the property's landmark status.

Mr. Guerra stated that the house is English Colonial architecture or Caribbean Colonial architecture. He reviewed the site plan for reference. Last year, the previous owner received approval to move the kitchen from one side of the house to the other so it was close to the garage. This had received both Town Council and Landmarks Preservation Commission approval. Along with the kitchen move, other elements were approved as well...taking off Bahama shutters and replacing them with the original Colonial shutters, removal of the old pool and replacing it with a lap pool, replacing the brick paving and adding a fountain and a general plan to "spruce up" the property.

The project includes an expansion of the first floor living area at the north wing (59 sq. ft.) and on the south side, an expansion of 55 sq. ft. in the kitchen. Mr. Guerra commented that these two small expansions led to a successful architectural enhancement. Mr. Guerra reviewed the existing conditions of the house via a photographic presentation. He compared the existing floor plan to the new floor plan which tries to accommodate the needs of the clients' five children. On the kitchen side, the expansion was required for family needs and access to the second floor. The expansions are symmetrical in nature. In order to accomplish the master suite expansion, only a portion of the balcony will be taken. (The previous applicant had taken all of the balcony and walled it in.) The biggest change proposed refers to the north and south wing roofs, where they have chosen to carry the mass through to

simplify the geometry at these roof intersections.

Front elevation: Bahama shutters changed to Colonials. Corinthian white will be the exterior paint color, as well as white on the shutters, sills, mullions and woodwork. Indigo Batique or deep green will be the color for the front door.

North elevation: Partial enclosure of balcony, replace existing sliding glass doors with french doors, shutter change to Colonial shutters, keep existing columns, but change lattice railing to picket railing, restore original first floor doors, new railing wall to gain access from pool area at same level as pool bath (In lieu of building a pool cabana)

West elevation: Symmetry of two expansions, return to original garage door design, enclosure of porch with balcony

The LPC complimented the architect at this juncture for a very nice presentation and a “magnificent” design/restoration.

MOTION BY MR. PANDULA FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.*

*IT WAS ALSO AGREED BY THE LPC THAT THE PLANNED BLUE FRONT DOOR MAY BE CHANGED TO GREEN IF THE CLIENT DESIRES.

VI. Other Business:

A. 1998 Landmarks Preservation Celebration - Update

Mr. Frank stated that Mrs. Cook, whose home was going to be featured this year, will be out of town in November, thus making her home unavailable for the Preservation Celebration. An alternative plan would be to highlight the churches of Palm Beach, i.e., St. Edwards, Bethesda by the Sea, and the Royal Poinciana Chapel, along with using the Society of the Four Arts as a probable staging area. Mr. Frank stated that other ideas from the members would be welcomed if they are not pleased with these tentative plans. The LPC could also, on the other hand, elect not to have a Preservation Celebration this year.

Mr. Smith stated that last year someone commented that we did not have a good turn out for the event because it was held at the Flagler Museum and so many people are so familiar with the Flagler museum. The same is true of the churches, he felt. Secondly, there is no need to stage from the Society of the Four Arts as each of the churches has a nice meeting room. Ms. Jane Day, Staff Preservation Consultant, stated that the Preservation Celebration should be educational to the public and should highlight features of the Town’s Landmark program which are spectacular in comparison to other programs statewide. She stated that the public likes to see private homes, and urged the members to assist in securing a possible site. Mr. Shields commented that she would be more interested in skipping a year in favor of having a successful program, when considering time constraints for a November event. Mr. Moore stated that there is nothing requiring the LPC to hold a Preservation Celebration each year. We changed the time of year for better attendance, but the LPC is not bound to have the event even though we have a Charitable Solicitation permit. No letters soliciting funds have been mailed to date for the 98 Preservation Celebration. As for programming, Ms. Shields suggested perhaps “Large house...small house...and /or great garden” themes which would highlight some small houses, like the one on Brazilian which was saved and restored by the owner with Mrs. Albarran de Mendoza as architect. She felt such a program might encourage restoration of some of the smaller houses in town.

Mrs. Day thought Ms. Shield’s idea was a good one. She asked for the help of the members in speaking to their

friends and neighbors about possibly opening their homes. Mr. Frank stated that we have the option to move forward for this year, or to hold off, as has been suggested, for a 98/99 Preservation Celebration in light of time constraints.

Mr. Pandula, although agreeing with the comments made, supported the “rigor of having a yearly program” to lend credibility to the program. He felt we should proceed with an event this year to keep the rhythm going.

Mrs. Day supported a staging area such as the Four Arts which allows for crowd control, a reception and lecture area.

Mr. Moore stated that due to the unknown length of Mrs. Delp’s absence, the same level of staff support may not be available this year. He asked if the LPC would be happy with putting on a “lesser” event than past standards or defer this year or early next year.

Mr. Smith suggested that the discussion related to this matter be deferred to next month and asked the members to brainstorm as to what homes might be available, architects speak to clients etc. Ms. Lilja suggested that staff speak to the Garden Club which runs successful house tours each year. Mr. Moore reminded the LPC that the Garden Club charges a fee for the house tour, whereas our event is free. Mr. Silverman advocated a staging area with buses to the specific landmarked property, together with an educational program. Mr. Frank stated that the bulk of the questions he gets are related to the tax abatement issue, which would be a great topic for lecture. This is why the Cook house was such a good site, exemplifying what can be done to change a landmarked property. Mrs. Day added that the Cook house is so important because the previous owners opposed landmarking vigorously, but the Town Council supported the LPC’s recommendation and landmarked the property. The new owners, the Cooks, did an extremely sensitive restoration and saved a landmark. It was suggested that staff re-approach Mrs. Cook for a suitable time when she would be able to have her home available.

VII. Adjournment:

MOTION BY MR. PANDULA TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 11:10 A.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN DE MENDOZA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on **Wednesday, October 21, 1998**, in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd Floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach, Florida.

Respectfully submitted,

Lindley M. F. Hoffman, Secretary
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd