MINUTES
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
IN THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH, FLORIDA

WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 21, 2011, 9:30 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording (CD) of the meeting by contacting Cynthia M. Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER:(9:31:46 a.m.)
Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL:(9:31:49 a.m.)

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
William P. Feldkamp, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
William O. Cooley, Member	PRESENT
Dudley L. Moore, Jr., Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
William J. Strawbridge Jr., Member	PRESENT
Leslie Diver, Member	PRESENT
D Imogene Willis, Alternate Member (arrived just after Roll Call)	PRESENT
Wallace Rogers, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Rachel Lorentzen, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Staff members present were John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, Jane S. Day, Ph.D., Staff Historic Preservation Consultant, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. Attorney John Randolph was absent.

III. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 17, 2011 MEETING:(9:31:58 a.m.)
MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
Mr. Page read Mr. Moore's Voting Conflict form from the August 17, 2011 meeting into the record.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY:(9:33:39 a.m.)
Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time.

V. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes)(9:33:41 a.m.) None

VI. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:(9:33:54 a.m.)

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VII. INFORMAL PRESENTATION: FLAGLER MEMORIAL BRIDGE REPLACEMENT PROJECT(9:39:15 a.m.)

(Note: Chairman Cooney elected to postpone this presentation to allow the following two hearings for 930 South Ocean Boulevard. After that, this bridge presentation commenced.)

PRESENTATION BY: Keith T. Krieger, P.E., Kimley-Horn and Associates Inc., Thomas P. Piotrowski, AIA, H2L2 Architects, John M. Sakoian, H2L2 Architects, Ryan C. Hamrick, P.E., PCL Civil Constructors, Inc.

Mr. Krieger reviewed the history related to the development of this project up to this point. He indicated that the planning for this project has been ongoing for several years and they look forward to approval from the LPC at the October meeting.

Mr. Cooley questioned whether there had been a Certificate of Appropriateness application to tear down the existing bridge. Mr. Page responded that the bridge had been heard informally several years ago by the LPC, and then again last month, without anything specific to demolition, but the necessity to tear down the bridge can be folded into the larger project for the new bridge. Chairman Cooney stated that it has long been understood by the Town and FDOT that there are significant structural problems with the existing bridge which have resulted in this application for bridge replacement. The LPC has always wanted to be involved in the aesthetic review of a new bridge. Mr. Cooley stressed the importance of following the ordinance with regard to the Application for Certificate of Appropriateness relative to the bridge. Chairman Cooney responded that the legalities of the issue can be researched prior to the meeting next month. Mr. Krieger noted that rehab of the existing bridge had been considered, but replacement was the preferred option at the State level.

Mr. Piotrowski's opening comments attempted to respond to the comments made at last month's meeting. He indicated, however, that the RFP restricts certain design elements like the height of the access house, concrete finishes, and roof tiles. Other changes which had been suggested by the commission last month have been implemented, according to Mr. Piotrowski. He and Mr. Sakoian presented options for light fixtures, options for a color palette and door treatments for the tender's house.

Mr. Strawbridge, still dissatisfied with the design and the restrictions of the RFP, suggested a workshop with a subset of the commission to arrive at a better design. Others cautioned that trying to change the RFP at this point would cause extreme delays. Some members commented that the bridge design is simply too modern and not appropriate for Palm Beach. Commission members were unanimous in their disapproval of the access house, as presented, and offered their preferences and suggestions relative to the access and tender's houses, lights, roof tiles, brackets, tender's house door, materials and other design elements. The design team was amenable to working with the commission to revise the design to implement several of the commission's suggestions.

There was some discussion as to whether the bridge was actually landmarked or not. Robert Moore, former Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, testified the bridges and vistas were landmarked so the LPC could retain control and thereby be part of the aesthetic review process for changes to the bridges. He encouraged the commission to advocate for barrel tile roofs on the bridge buildings. Laurie Volk made comments relative to the history of the bridge, and submitted 69 pages of historical records into the record. She encouraged the commission to adhere to the ordinance. Anita Seltzer, Cocoanut Row, offered her comments regarding the Lake Trail as it relates to the bridge.

MOTION BY MS. DIVER THAT THE LPC HAS GIVEN ITS COMMENTS; THE APPLICANT IS ASKED TO RETURN NEXT MONTH, BUT DURING THE INTERIM, WE WOULD LIKE FOR THE APPLICANT TO GET IN TOUCH WITH THE CHAIRMAN AND THE OTHER COMMISSION MEMBERS BETWEEN NOW AND NEXT MONTH.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. COOLEY.

Under discussion, members requested more details on the pilasters, railing options, landscaping, integrations of the flagpole, the Eagle and the Flagler statue, and retaining walls.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Let the record show that the Chairman called for a short recess at 11:30 a.m. The meeting reconvened at 11:38 a.m. with Item C below.

VIII. PUBLIC HEARINGS: (9:34:39 a.m.)

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #026-2011
Window/Doors & Landscape/Hardscape
Owner/Applicant: 1111 Partners LLC
Address: 930 South Ocean Boulevard
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc., Jonathan Moore
Project Description: Replace existing window and door units in conservatory and reworking of landscape and hardscape. Other associated changes as presented

Please note that at the August meeting there was a motion for approval of the windows/doors as presented. There was a second motion for approval of the landscape, but asking them to return with a full drawing of the alternate opening on the hardscape on the wall facing east, and a tweaked version of the original as well.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Jonathan Moore, Smith and Moore Architects

Mr. Moore presented revised drawings (previously 3 square openings) for the wall facing east, now showing a central arch with metal gate in the middle with two smaller metal grated openings on either side.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. [Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #028-2011]
Restoration/reconstruction/addition/landscape/hardscape
Owner/Applicant: 1111 Partners LLC
Address: 930 S. Ocean Boulevard
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc., Jonathan C. Moore
Project Description: Request approval for restoration, reconstruction, addition to historic structure, and landscape/hardscape which is further described as: Raise existing pool cabana structure 3 feet; add 124 sq. ft. to east side of cabana and rework landscape and hardscape. Other associated changes as presented.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Same as declared above in "A".
Mr. Moore indicated that the variance requested for this project has been approved. No changes were made to the plans since last month's informal review.

MOTION BY MS. DIVER FOR APPROVAL "AS IS" (as presented).
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. FELDKAMP.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #024-2011
Restoration/Reconstruction/Demolition/Landscape/Hardscape/Color change
Owner/Applicant: Society of the Four Arts
Address: 240 Cocoanut Row and the parking lot parcel to the west of 240 Cocoanut Row, that parking lot parcel being part of the Four Arts Plaza
Architect: Glidden Spina & Partners, Keith Spina
Project Description: Request approval for restoration, reconstruction, interior and exterior demolition, and landscape hardscape which is further described as: The proposed changes to the old school property include: (i) the demolition of a non-contributing building on the south side of the property; (ii) conversion of the old gymnatorium into a new 256 seat theatre; (iii) the construction of a new courtyard and reception area on the north side of the building; (iv) the addition of a demonstration kitchen and adult art, lecture, and other cultural activities within the existing classrooms of the old school; and (v) the addition of a visiting artists residence in the building to accommodate visiting artists. Proposed improvements to site include a new driveway and drop-off along the south side of the old school building so that vehicles can enter the site directly from Cocoanut Row. This driveway will have a new courtyard connected to the existing Four Arts sculpture garden to the south. The existing parking area on the west side of the site will be improved with new landscaped areas, new paving and new drainage. The existing emergency generator enclosure will be enlarged for a new AC chiller and a new 80 KW emergency generator. Other associated changes as presented.

Mr. Moore re-stated his conflict of interest with regard to this project and the next project as he is a Trustee of the Society of the Four Arts and a member of the Finance Committee.

This project had been reviewed informally last month. Chairman Cooney stated that this project has received approval for the necessary variances.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Cooney

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Keith Spina, Glidden Spina & Partners
Harry Elson, Design Architect
Morgan Wheelock, Landscape Architect

Mr. Spina stated that the muntins have been revised from 9 over 9 to 6 over 6, and other than that, the presentation is unchanged since last month. There was some further discussion, both pro and con, relative to the rear, modern entry element with canopy and the geometry in this entrance area.

MOTION BY MS. DIVER FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. STRAWBRIDGE OPPOSED.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #029-2011
Landscape/Hardscape
Owner/Applicant: The Society of the Four Arts
Address: 2 Four Arts Plaza
Architect: Howarth L. Lewis, Architect, Lewis and Associates
Project Description: Relocation of four fig trees and a 1,208 square foot expansion of existing patio in the landscape island separating the main parking lot from the O?Keefe Building. Other associated changes as presented

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

Mr. Cooney stated that this project had been heard informally last month by the LPC and has received variance approval from the Town Council.

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Howarth Lewis, Architect

Mr. Lewis testified that the plans have not changed since last month.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #030-2011
Windows/Doors/Interior Demolition
Owner/Applicant: Peter and Laurie Grauer
Address: 201 El Bravo Way
Architect: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, AIA, PA
Project Description: Replace existing doors and windows. Modify some window and door openings. Interior modifications including remodeling of kitchen and baths. Other associated changes as presented

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Cooney

Let the record show that Ms. Diver left the meeting at 11:55 a.m.

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, Architect

Mr. Kirchoff stated that this project will substantially gut the home, restore it, and provide needed maintenance, replacing windows and doors, replacing the roof, and upgrading the systems, all with very little change to the exterior. There are several fenestration changes, and the roof will be changed to Alhambra tiles. Dr. Day was pleased with the restoration plans. The door on the north elevation of the garage was noted as atypical for this house. Mr. Kirchhoff will study it.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. WILLIS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

F. Certificate of Appropriateness #032-2011
Reconstruction
Owner/Applicant: Golfview Holdings LLC
Address: 9 Golfview Road
Architect: Ralph Cantin, AIA
Project Description: Request approval for reconstruction which is further described as: Create new second floor courtyard balcony over existing loggia. Remove shed roof to create balcony, re-use existing cypress beams and decking in loggia ceiling. Improve 1951 addition by removing windows over shed roof with Pella Impact clad French doors to balcony. Other associated changes as presented

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Messrs. Cooney and Feldkamp

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Ralph Cantin, Architect

Dr. Day provided some background information relative to this Wyeth design and offered her support for the project as presented by Mr. Cantin, as listed above, and pursuant to the submitted plans.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE CHANGE OF THE 42" RAILING GOING DOWN TO 36".
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. WILLIS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IX. OTHER BUSINESS:(12:08:41 a.m.)

A. Informal Review: 181 Clarendon Avenue
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Project Description: Addition of a 358 sq. ft. loggia at the west building elevation, at location where canvas awnings had previously provided covered area. The new addition will match in detailing, material selection, color, texture and scale related features of the existing structure.

Variances requested for rear yard setback and lot coverage

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

VARIANCE PRESENTATION BY: Attorney Maura Ziska
ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Eugene Pandula, The Pandula Architects

Ms. Ziska provided some history relative to the condition of this property and explained the requested variances. Mr. Pandula provided additional architectural history related to this house and presented the requested open loggia, 16 ft. x 23 ft. which will provide some covered outdoor space. In addition, the hardscape will be reduced through the removal of some paved areas. Mr. Pandula will restudy the double columns shown vs. single columns.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP THAT THE LPC RECOMMENDS TO THE TOWN COUNCIL THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCE WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS TO THE SUBJECT LANDMARKED PROPERTY.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. COOLEY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

X. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: (12:22:03 a.m.)

A discussion ensued relative to holding a special meeting to discuss the bridge. Staff advised that today's meeting could be adjourned to a time certain.

MOTION BY MR. COOLEY AT ADJOURN THIS MEETING TO OCTOBER 5, 2011 AT 9:30 A.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. ALBARRAN.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

It was clarified that if members were unable to attend the October 5th meeting, it would not negatively impact their attendance records, i.e., not count as an unexcused absence.

XI. ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned as stated above.

Please note that this meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission was continued to Wednesday, October 5, 2011 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach, Florida.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd