TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 20, 2002 AT 9:00 A.M.
AT THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I **Call to Order**: Chairman Pandula called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II **Roll Call**:

PRESENT:
Eugene Pandula, Chairman
Elizabeth Dowdle, Vice Chairman
Ann Blades, Secretary
Sari Wilkey, Member
Ann Vanneck, Member
Jack Pyms, Member
Wendy Victor, Alternate Member
Mario Nievera, Alternate Member
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney
Robert L. Moore, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
Timothy M. Frank, Planning Administrator
Jane Day, Staff Preservation Consultant

ABSENT:
Judy Hoffman, Member (Excused)
Patrick Segraves, Alternate Member (Excused)

RECORDING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

III **Approval of the Minutes of the October 16, 2002 meeting**:
MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV **Administration of the Oath to all persons who wish to testify**: By Mrs. Delp

Comments by Mr. Moore and Mr. Wes Blackman relative to the Mar-a-Lago Club

Mr. Moore reminded the LPC that the Mar-a-Lago Club has a December 1, 2002 deadline to finish their work on the cabanas. They had previously obtained landscape/hardscape approval from the LPC, but those plans did not take underground utilities into consideration. As a result, plantings cannot be placed in some of the locations shown on the approved plans. Mr. Blackman assured the LPC that the landscape installations will be equal to or better than shown on the previously approved plan. He stated that the new landscape plan will be true to the intent of the one originally presented, rather than accurate to the letter. The new landscape plan will be presented to the LPC at a later date as an "as-built" plan.

Post Office Box 2029 • 360 South County Road • Palm Beach, Florida 33480 • (561) 838-5430

V **Public Hearings**:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #11-2002 (deferred from June & July, August, Sept. & Oct.) Gatehouse, landscape, hardscape, new porte cochere

Owner/Applicant: The Breakers Palm Beach Inc.

Address: 1 South County Road

Architect: Wimberly Allison Tong & Goo (WAT&G)

Peridian International Inc., Mr. Arthur Beggs

Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. Front Driveway Improvements - Reconfigure the front driveway/ parking and landscape area with landscaping and lighting improvements, and add a security gatehouse on main driveway. The parking currently located on the main driveway will be relocated to a service drive to the south.
2. Balustrade Removal: Replicate balustrade at front entrance west of Porte Cochere of the Hotel further west in order to add additional valet lanes to match existing west of front lawn
3. Ponce de Leon Porte Cochere - Add new porte cochere and covered walkways to the south entrance of the Hotel connecting it to the Beach Club with landscaping and lighting improvements.
4. Other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: None declared

Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #11-2002 - Approvals to date

Motion at the June meeting: "that the applicant re-visit the design of the gatehouse to make it less massive, approve the materials for the walkway, approval of the landscaping, approval of removal of the balustrade that is between the three arches at the front door, that another balustrade not be added as was originally contemplated, and that the porte cochere be re-visited (for its roof) even though the concept is good, and the arch in the porte cochere is acceptable." The applicant was requested to return to the July meeting with details relative to the south supplemental parking with the landscape islands.

At the July meeting, there was a motion for approval of the gatehouse design, presented as design option #2, with some thought to be given to vining the gatehouse, and if needed, underplanting the hibiscus hedge at the south parking area. Relative to the porte cochere, there was a motion for approval based upon the applicant returning next month with glass samples, details regarding the clips, materials and color of the metal elements.

At the August meeting, there was a motion for approval of the color of the glass, and the color of the metal, and approving the clips for the trellis and canopy to be the same bronze color, and requiring that the shop drawings return to the LPC showing the profiles of the metal, and the size and position of the attachments to the building.

At the August meeting, there was a motion to approve the 36" tall Flagler bollard with a metal halide lamp, diffusing part of the light that is facing the gatehouse, and approval of the interior fixtures in a verde finish with metal halide lamps as well.

At the September meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the October meeting as shop drawings were not ready.

At the October meeting, there was a motion to approve the temporary awning through June 1, 2003. There was also an approval of the new restroom building required in conjunction with the gatehouse. There was a motion for deferral of the shop drawings for the glass system to the November meeting.

Mr. Danny Miller, Director of Golf and Grounds, and Project Manager, returned to the LPC with shop drawings for the glazing system at the trellis walk. Shop drawings for the glass canopy element are not yet ready for presentation, and Mr. Miller stated that a deferral of this item is requested until the February meeting.

Mr. Miller presented the glazing at the trellis to be very light with very little metal framework. The only change to this feature, different from the original presentation, is that the previously approved bronze metal elements will be done in oyster white (to match the beams) so they disappear.

MOTION BY MRS. DOWDLE FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MRS. DOWDLE TO DEFER THE BUTTERFLY GLASS CANOPY TO THE FEBRUARY MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Miller presented an additional item for the trellis walk, which was not previously presented. The Breakers is requesting approval of the installation of automatic window curtains, with an oyster white border, (to be placed on the inside of the beam) to provide protection from inclement weather. The curtains will have permanent pencil-thin guide wires to prevent the curtains from flapping. Necessary electric will be buried in the beam.

MOTION BY MRS. DOWDLE FOR APPROVAL OF THE AUTOMATIC WINDOW CURTAINS.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #13-2002, (deferred from July, Aug. Sept. & Oct.)
Additions, fenestration changes, site work changes
Owner/Applicant: Robert P. Harris
Address: 143 Clarendon Avenue
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects
Project Description: Request approval of the following

1. One-story loggia connection between the existing main residence and the existing garage/staff quarters building
2. Covered stair and one-car garage addition at the garage staff quarters
3. A new pair of french doors and roof top terrace paving at the second floor northwest guest bedroom
4. A new french door at the existing family room.
5. A pair of french doors at the kitchen
6. Site work changes: Remove existing pool and construct new pool and terrace
7. Site work changes: Add new spa and pergola, and raised terrace
8. Site work changes: Driveway reconfiguration and new privacy wall and gate
9. Any other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATION: Mr. Nievera and Mr. Pandula stated that they had met with Mr. Keir to discuss the project.

At the July meeting, there was a motion for approval of the project, with a deferral of the landscape/hardscape portions of the project. At the August meeting, there was no presentation given, just a request for deferral to the September meeting. At the September meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the October meeting since landscape/hardscape plans were not submitted.

At the October meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the November meeting, with the allowance that construction can begin on the pool at the location shown on the plans.

At last month's meeting, the LPC expressed concerns over the amount of hardscape shown on the plan. Since that time, the plans have been revised to reduce the paving by 300-400 square feet, with an accompanying increase in the amount of landscaped area. The revised plan reflects 49% open space. The slat house has also been revised, adding some horizontal beams to give height and proportion to the structure. Front columns on slat house, once three-quarter columns, have been taken to the ground, placed in indents in the surface at the spa. Vines will grow up onto the slat house. Another concern was the blank parapet wall which will now be covered with a trellised vine over its surface. Mr. Keir presented a photo of the existing wrought iron gate on the property, as requested last month. A 3"x3" blue pool tile sample was presented for use as the skim tile and up the face of the waterfall. Two different colors of coquina will be used for paving; one is a cream color to be used at the main pool patio in 24"x24" squares; and a darker color coquina will be mixed with the cream color at the spa area in a random mix of 12"x12" squares.

MOTION BY MRS. WILKEY FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. DOWDLE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #24-2002, (deferred from October)
Changes to residence, landscape, hardscape and replacement of pool and deck
Owner/Applicant: Edward J. Kelly
Address: 19 Golf Road
Architect: Lee Kvarnberg
Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. New swimming pool and deck
2. Restoration of hardscape
3. Restoration of garage door to its original location on the east facade
4. Fill in the garage door on the north facade
5. Restoration of drive to original east location with curb cut being restored to its original location on County Road and circular drive at Golf Road
6. New roof (textured flat tile)
7. New windows and exterior doors to match existing style.
8. Modification of two windowsill heights to conform to interior layout
9. Double hung window at first floor laundry to have sill raised 12" to allow for washer/dryer and second floor hall connecting master bedroom and study to have window sill lowered to match other windows on that elevation.
10. Other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS: None declared

There was a motion at the October meeting for approval of the project as presented with the proviso that the applicant returns with the roof material and the landscape/hardscape, and with the proviso that the wood columns proposed between the french doors on the south elevation are eliminated.

Mr. Lee Kvarnberg, Architect, and Mr. David Palmer, Contractor, returned to the LPC in response to last month's deferral of certain portions of this project. Mr. Kvarnberg stated a request for the deferral of the landscape portion of the project, preferably to the January meeting. DOT has not yet granted final approval for the driveway entry from South County Road, but that process should be complete by January.

On the plans submitted last month, there was a little piece shown at the pool deck, which was an error on the plans. That piece has now been removed. There were columns on the back of the house, between the french doors, which have since been removed from the plans, at the LPC's request. As for the paving for the pool deck and driveway, Mr. Kvarnberg presented a large sample of cast coquina. A clay tile roof sample was presented in a dark color. Mr. Kvarnberg showed a photo of the existing roof, very light tiles with a detailed edge. The dark clay tile roof presented today was in great contrast to the tile shown as the existing roof material. Mr. Palmer stated that the house was formerly white with red shutters and red roof, while the new owner is requesting a white house with black shutters and a dark, almost black, roof. Mr. Kvarnberg stated that they do not know what the original roof material was. Mrs. Day stated that she, likewise, did not know about the original roof material. She felt that the LPC should look at the texture and detailing of the roof tiles in making a decision. Mrs. Day recommended that the architect present some other roof tile options. She also stated that she could possibly contact Ms. Alex Taylor (Maurice Fatio's daughter) for information regarding the roof.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING TO ALLOW FOR THE PRESENTATION OF OTHER ROOF TILES AND PAINT SAMPLES RELATIVE TO THE COLOR CHANGE ON THE HOUSE, AND DEFERRAL OF THE LANDSCAPE TO THE JANUARY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VICTOR.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Palmer stated that they are 90% sure that DOT approval will be secured. If that is not possible, the owner will retain the front loading garage off Golf Road.

D. <u>Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #21-2002, (deferred from Sept.)</u>
<u>Addition, changes to entrance facade</u>
Owner: Mrs. Cathleen McFarlane-Ross
Address: 456 Worth Avenue
Architect: Smith Architectural Group Inc.
Project Description: Request approval for re-design of the existing entrance facade to include the following:

1. 42 sq. ft. 2nd story infill addition at entry.
2. Revision to existing entrance facade to be more in character with original Mizner works.
3. Relocation of guest bath window and addition of stone surround
4. Revision to railing and brackets at balcony.
5. Other associated changes as presented

<u>CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS.</u>

At the September meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the November meeting, pursuant to the architect's request. <u>Please be advised that the architect is requesting an additional deferral to the December meeting.</u>

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. <u>Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #26-2002,</u>
<u>Loading dock improvements</u>
Owner/Applicant: Bath and Tennis Club
Address: 1170 South Ocean Boulevard
Architect: Brower Architectural Associates
Project Description: Request approval for improvements to loading dock area to include new hedge, pavers, wood gates, wood door, wrap fire escape with wood, aluminum railing, coach lights, and other associated changes as presented

<u>CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS</u>

<u>Please be advised that the architect is requesting deferral to the December meeting.</u>

MOTION BY MRS. DOWDLE FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

F. <u>Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #27-2002,</u>
<u>Alterations and addition</u>
Owner/Applicant: Marilyn Tracy
Address: 322 Clarke Avenue
Architect: Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: Request approval for the alteration and addition to the existing detached garage with guest house above. (The first floor of the addition will include a new auto bay. The second floor of the addition will have a new guest living room, bar and closet. The second floor of the existing guest house will be renovated and will have two bedrooms with one bath each.)

<u>CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS</u>: None declared

Architect Jeffery W. Smith explained that the LPC had previously reviewed a substantial addition to this residence, and the demolition of a two story garage. Since that time, the project has been scaled down. A variance has been secured for a one car bay addition to the existing two car garage, and taking the staff quarters and turning them into a guest house, instead of building a new one. The staff area, above the garage, has been converted to two bedrooms and two bathrooms, and above the new one car garage bay, there is a living room. Mr. Smith reviewed the new floor plans and elevations. The existing metal windows will be replaced with new wood casements.

MOTION BY MRS. WILKEY TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. DOWDLE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

G. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #28-2002, Addition
Owner/Applicant: Dudley L. and Margaret B. Moore
Address: 220 El Bravo Way
Architect: Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: Request approval to construct a two story, 525 square foot building footprint that will include additional living space, a bedroom and a bath to be used as a playroom and sleeping room

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Please be advised that the architect has requested deferral to the December meeting, as this project requires Town Council approval prior to LPC review.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. DOWDLE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI **Other Business**

A. Informal Review: 350 South County Road, #105, Truffies, Inc.
Awning changes

Mr. Frank offered some history relative to the awnings at this building. When the awnings for the Galaxy Grille were approved, they were approved as straight awnings with open ends. The rest of the awnings on the building were to follow suit. This informal request, however, is for the storefront at the south end of the building which is inundated with bright sunlight all day long. As such, the tenant, Truffies, is requesting that the straight awnings have closed ends to keep more sun out. Truffies is further requesting that there be a curved awning at the entry, following the sculptured relief in the arch. Mr. Alan Kessler, the proprietor of Truffies, addressed the LPC re-stating his need for these awnings. It was noted that the color of the awnings match the original.
The LPC directed staff to allow the awnings, as requested, on a staff approval basis.

B. Date change for February 2003 Landmarks Preservation Commission meeting

Mr. Moore stated that the Town Council, due to a conflict in dates, has requested that the LPC meeting date for February 2003 be changed. After discussion, it was decided that **the February 2003 meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 18, 2003,** one day earlier than the regular meeting day.

C. Meeting with Palm Beach County School Board

It was noted that the meeting which had been scheduled for later today with the Palm Beach County School Board has been cancelled. The item will be heard as part of the regular Town Council agenda for December 10, 2002.

D. Other Matters

Mrs. Vanneck reported that major electrical work is being done at the Everglades Club shops along Worth Avenue. It was noted that this is an FP&L job employing a 1' diameter pipe. Mr. Moore stated that staff would look into this matter with Mr. Dusey, Director of Public Works.

*****

Mrs. Dowdle inquired as to the status of the Fed Ex boxes at the Post Office. Mr. Randolph stated that Mr. Bradford, Assistant Town Manager, has written a letter to the Post Office. No response has been received to date.

*****

Since the School Board meeting has been postponed and the west building at the Palm Beach Public School has not been sold, Mrs. Blades inquired whether the previous conceptual approval of the LPC could be made null and void. Mr. Randolph responded that we do not yet know the fate of the west building. As such, no action should be taken by the LPC at this time.

VII **Adjournment**:

The Landmarks Preservation Commission adjourned at 9:55 a.m. without benefit of a motion.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on **WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 18, 2002** at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Hall, 360 South County Road, 2nd Floor, Town Council Chambers.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann Blades

Ann Blades, Secretary
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd

WN OF PALM BEACH
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

ATTENDANCE RECORD 2002

MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11//02	12/02
Eugene Pandula	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
Elizabeth Dowdle	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
Sari M. Wilkey	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza	P	P	(N/A- declined re-appointment)									
Ann Vanneck	P	P	P	P	U	P	P	P	P	P	P	
Ann Blades	P	U	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	
Jack Pyms	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	U	U	P	P	
Judy Hoffman	See below		P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	

ALTERNATE MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11/02	12/02
Judy Hoffman	P	P	(See above-appointed as regular member 3/02)									
Laurel Baker	P	P	P	P	P	(resigned 5/15/02)						
Wendy Victor	P	P	P	P	P	U	P	U	P	P	P	
Patrick Segraves			P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	
Mario Nievera							P	E	P	P	P	

LEGEND:

P	=	Present
E	=	Excused
U	=	Unexcused
A	=	Absence Pending Classification as “excused” or “unexcused”

TOWN OF PALM BEACH
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

RECORD OF VOTING CONFLICTS 2002

MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11//02	12/02
Eugene Pandula												
Elizabeth Dowdle												
Sari M. Wilkey												
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza	V2	VPD1	(N/A - declined re-appointment)									
Ann Vanneck												
Ann Blades												
Jack Pyms												
Judy Hoffman	See below											

ALTERNATE MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11/02	12/02
Judy Hoffman			(See above -appointed as regular member 3/02)									
Laurel Baker				V								
Wendy Victor												
Patrick Segraves												

LEGEND:

V	=	One Voting Conflict during a meeting
V2	=	Two Voting Conflicts during a meeting
V3	=	Three Voting Conflicts during a meeting
VPD	=	Voting Conflict Previously Declared (This category to be used when a conflict has Been declared at a previous meeting, and the Changes being reviewed are part of an ongoing project. ONLY COUNT ORIGINALDECLARED CONFLICT PER JCR, TOWN ATTORNEY)