



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES

LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 18, 2002 AT 9:00 A.M.

AT THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I Call to Order: Chairman Eugene Pandula called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

II Roll Call:

PRESENT:

Eugene Pandula, Chairman
Ann Blades, Secretary (arrived at 9:04 a.m.)
Sari Wilkey, Member
Ann Vanneck, Member
Jack Pyms, Member
Judy Hoffman, Member
Wendy Victor, Alternate Member (arrived at 9:08 a.m.)
Patrick Segraves, Alternate Member
Mario Nievera, Alternate Member
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney
Robert L. Moore, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
Timothy M. Frank, Planning Administrator
Jane Day, Staff Preservation Consultant

ABSENT:

Elizabeth Dowdle, Vice Chairman (unexcused)

RECORDING SECRETARY: Cynthia M. Delp

III Approval of the Minutes of the November 20, 2002 meeting:

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV Administration of the Oath to all persons who wish to testify: By Mrs. Delp

V **Public Hearings:**

A. **Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #24-2002, (deferred from Oct. & Nov.)
Changes to residence, landscape, hardscape and replacement of pool and deck**

Owner/Applicant: Edward J. Kelly

Address: 19 Golf Road

Architect: Lee Kvarnberg

Project Description: Request approval of the following:

1. New swimming pool and deck
2. Restoration of hardscape
3. Restoration of garage door to its original location on the east facade
4. Fill in the garage door on the north facade
5. Restoration of drive to original east location with curb cut being restored to its original location on County Road and circular drive at Golf Road
6. New roof (textured flat tile)
7. New windows and exterior doors to match existing style.
8. Modification of two windowsill heights to conform to interior layout
9. Double hung window at first floor laundry to have sill raised 12" to allow for washer/dryer and second floor hall connecting master bedroom and study to have window sill lowered to match other windows on that elevation.
10. Other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Please note that the architect is requesting deferral of this project to the January meeting.

Project approvals to date for CoA#24-2002

There was a motion at the October meeting for approval of the project as presented with the proviso that the applicant returns with the roof material and the landscape/hardscape, and with the proviso that the wood columns proposed between the french doors on the south elevation are eliminated.

At the November meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the December meeting to allow for the presentation of other roof tiles and paint samples relative to the color change on the house, and deferral of the landscape to the January meeting.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JANUARY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. **Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #21-2002, (deferred from Sept. & Nov.) Addition, changes to entrance facade**

Owner: Mrs. Cathleen McFarlane-Ross

Address: 456 Worth Avenue

Architect: Smith Architectural Group Inc.

Project Description: Request approval for re-design of the existing entrance facade to include the following:

1. 42 sq. ft. 2nd story infill addition at entry.
2. Revision to existing entrance facade to be more in character with original Mizner works.
3. Relocation of guest bath window and addition of stone surround

4. Revision to railing and brackets at balcony.
5. Other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS: None declared

Let the record show that Mrs. Victor arrived during this presentation.

At the September meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the November meeting, pursuant to the architect's request. At the November meeting, another deferral was requested to the December meeting.

Architect Jeffery W. Smith presented this project. He stated that the Town Council had recently approved this project for a side yard setback variance of 12.7' instead of 15'. He passed a colored rendering of the proposal and existing photos of the site. The purpose of the project is to create a more important and grand entry to this 8,500 sq. ft. house. It was noted that the existing railing at the balcony will be replaced with new, more decorative railing in the same dimensions.

**MOTION BY MRS. WILKEY FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #26-2002, (deferred from Nov.)
Loading dock improvements

Owner/Applicant: Bath and Tennis Club

Address: 1170 South Ocean Boulevard

Architect: Brower Architectural Associates

Project Description: Request approval for improvements to loading dock area to include new hedge, pavers, wood gates, wood door, wrap fire escape with wood, aluminum railing, coach lights, and other associated changes as presented

At the November meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the December meeting.

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Mrs. Blades stated that she had spoken with Messrs. Schuler, Wideman, and the Manager, Doug Egen. Mrs. Victor stated that she had been on site and had spoken with "everybody".

No person was in attendance to present this request. Mr. Pym moved to defer this project to the end of the agenda. Mrs. Blades seconded the motion. During discussion, Mr. Moore stated that if the project is to be approved, the Town must be a co-applicant. As such, Mr. Moore suggested that this be deferred to a time certain. Mr. Frank stated that due to DOT concerns, the architect is requesting deferral to the February meeting.

MOTION AMENDED BY MR. PYMS FOR DEFERRAL TO THE FEBRUARY MEETING.

**MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #28-2002, (deferred from Nov.)

Addition

Owner/Applicant: Dudley L. and Margaret B. Moore

Address: 220 El Bravo Way

Architect: Smith Architectural Group

Project Description: Request approval to construct a two story, 525 square foot building footprint that will include additional living space, a bedroom and a bath to be used as a playroom and sleeping room

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS: None declared

At the November meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the December meeting.

Architect Jeffery W. Smith gave the presentation. He passed aerial photos of the site. The house had undergone major renovations approximately two years ago. Mrs. Day noted, for the record, that this is an ongoing tax abatement project, and that any changes should be reviewed with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards in mind. Mr. Smith stated that the parcel at 220 El Bravo Way is approximately 290' x 160'. A variance has recently been secured for placing the addition 12.64' away from the rear property line instead of 15'. The intent of the project is to line up the wings and preserve the existing arches between the wings. The addition includes a playroom on the first floor and a bedroom/bath on the second floor. A stair tower is situated at the east end of the addition. There is a parapet and barrel tile roof on the addition.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. WILKEY.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #29-2002,

Hardscape

Owner/Applicant: Mr. Robert Miller

Address: 105 Clarendon Avenue

Architect: Newlands Design Group

Project Description: Request approval to replace stone drive with Chicago brick and replace entry from drive to interior of house, and other associated changes as presented

CALL FOR DISCLOSURE OF EXPARTE COMMUNICATIONS.

No one was present on behalf of this project.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JANUARY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI **Other Business**

Mrs. Hoffman inquired as to the status of the old Ballinger house at 1200 South Ocean Boulevard. Mr. Frank thought it would be on the January agenda with a presentation by Digby Bridges to relocate the existing landmarked house to a different area of the property. Mrs. Delp interjected, however, that Mr. Castro, Zoning Administrator, has reviewed the submission and has determined that it may require Town Council approval prior to LPC approval. Mrs. Day stated that there are other instances where landmarked homes have been moved, but it is primary that the building is sited with the same cardinal directions as it was previously. She encouraged the LPC to look at the whole site to determine the impact of the move to the structure itself, and the site as a whole, with a new structure added. Mrs. Victor asked Mrs. Day to compile some case histories of landmarked sites having additional new construction on them. At this point in time, Mr. Frank stated that staff would not be able to support moving the structure. Mrs. Day added that the site is so large, that an addition could be added to the existing structure that would dwarf the Mizner structure. She cautioned the LPC to carefully evaluate what would be the best solution to preserve the Mizner structure.

As to the Munn house, 455 North County Road, Mr. Frank stated that he and Mr. Pandula visited the site. The house is "semi-secured" in his opinion. Code Enforcement is involved in this case as well.

There was discussion relative to the Palm Beach Public School, i.e., Mrs. Vanneck's question if there is a time limit on the conceptual approval granted previously by the LPC. Mr. Randolph stated that the conceptual approval would not necessarily "start the clock." Mr. Pandula also added that the LPC conceptual approval was not endorsed by the Town Council, so there is no approval technically.

VII **Adjournment:**

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK TO ADJOURN AT 9:28 A.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. BLADES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, January 15, 2003 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,



Ann Blades, Secretary
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd

**TOWN OF PALM BEACH
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

ATTENDANCE RECORD 2002

MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11//02	12/02
Eugene Pandula	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>
Elizabeth Dowdle	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> U </u>
Sari M. Wilkey	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> E </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>
Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> (N/A- declined re-appointment) </u>									
Ann Vanneck	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> U </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>
Ann Blades	<u> P </u>	<u> U </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> E </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>
Jack Pyms	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> U </u>	<u> U </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>
Judy Hoffman	See below		<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> E </u>	<u> P </u>

ALTERNATE MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11/02	12/02
Judy Hoffman	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> (See above-appointed as regular member 3/02) </u>									
Laurel Baker	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> (resigned 5/15/02) </u>						
Wendy Victor	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> U </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> U </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>
Patrick Segraves			<u> P </u>	<u> E </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> E </u>	<u> P </u>
Mario Nievera							<u> P </u>	<u> E </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>	<u> P </u>

LEGEND: P = Present
 E = Excused
 U = Unexcused
 A = Absence Pending Classification as "excused" or "unexcused"

**TOWN OF PALM BEACH
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

RECORD OF VOTING CONFLICTS 2002

MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11/02	12/02
---------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	-------	-------	-------

Eugene Pandula	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
----------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Elizabeth Dowdle	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
------------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Sari M. Wilkey	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
----------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Jacqueline Albarran de Mendoza	<u>V2</u>	<u>VPD1</u>	(N/A - declined re-appointment)									
--------------------------------	-----------	-------------	---------------------------------	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Ann Vanneck	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
-------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Ann Blades	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Jack Pyms	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
-----------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Judy Hoffman	See below	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
--------------	-----------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

ALTERNATE MEMBERS	1/02	2/02	3/02	4/02	5/02	6/02	7/02	8/02	9/02	10/02	11/02	12/02
-------------------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	-------	-------	-------

Judy Hoffman	_____	_____	(See above -appointed as regular member 3/02)									
--------------	-------	-------	---	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Laurel Baker	_____	_____	_____	<u>V</u>	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
--------------	-------	-------	-------	----------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Wendy Victor	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
--------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

Patrick Segraves	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____	_____
------------------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

LEGEND:

V	=	One Voting Conflict during a meeting
V2	=	Two Voting Conflicts during a meeting
V3	=	Three Voting Conflicts during a meeting

VPD	=	Voting Conflict Previously Declared (This category to be used when a conflict has Been declared at a previous meeting, and the Changes being reviewed are part of an ongoing project. ONLY COUNT ORIGINAL DECLARED CONFLICT PER JCR, TOWN ATTORNEY)
-----	---	--

