



MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
IN THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 26, 2011, 9:00 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be “abbreviated” in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town’s website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording of the meeting by contacting Cindy Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER (8:59:03 a.m.)

II. ROLL CALL (8:59:37 a.m.)

PRESENT

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman
William J. Strawbridge, Jr., Vice Chairman
Leslie C. Diver, Member
Kenn Karakul, Member
Nikita Zukov, Member
Robert J. Vila, Member
Ann L. Vanneck, Alternate Member (voting member today)
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Alternate Member

ABSENT

Samuel M. Boykin, Member (Excused)
Martin D. Gruss, Alternate Member (Unexcused)

Staff members present were John C. Randolph, Town Attorney (present for latter part of meeting) John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE (8:59:39 a.m.)

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE DECEMBER 17, 2010 MEETING

(8:59:59 a.m.)

MOTION BY MS. DIVER FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA :

MOTION BY MS. DIVER FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

(9:00:27 a.m.) Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. OTHER BUSINESS: (9:00:44 a.m.)

VIII. PROJECT REVIEW (9:00:47 a.m.)

A. MAJOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS (9:00:50 a.m.)

B - 053 - 2010 New Single Family Residence

Address: 108 El Mirasol, Lot 7 & 8, El Mirasol

Applicant: Neeta and Anand Khubani

Architect: Roger Hansrote

Project Description: New two-story single family residence with 3 garages, 8 bedrooms, 9 baths, 2 half baths, breezeway, porte cochere and pool (13,869 square ft. air conditioned) Roof Material: Terra Cotta Barrel tile; CBS construction; Color-beige; Trim-cast stone; Shutters-beige (Rolladen)

After hearing the project at the October meeting, the project was deferred to the November meeting. At the November meeting, the project was deferred to December at the request of the attorney for the applicant. At the December meeting, there was a motion for deferral of the project based upon the members' comments made at that meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication : Several members made ex parte declarations.

Architects Roger Hansrote and Jeff Beer were present, with a model, on behalf of the project. Mr. Beer reviewed the changes which had been done since the last meeting which were meant to address the comments made at the last meeting. Some of those changes are fenestration changes to the façade and stair tower, lowering and widening the chimneys, balcony changes, and removal of the coquina from the garage façade in favor of stucco.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

**MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

[B - 060 - 2010 Aviary](#)

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION REGARDING VARIANCE

Address: 309 Worth Avenue

Applicant: Trillion Inc., Tatiana Van Zandt

Architect: The Lawrence Group

Project Description: Addition of 65.72 sq. ft. aviary to existing Trillion store

Variance: Variance for rear setback 0 ft. instead of 4.75 ft. existing and 10 ft. required and variance for lot coverage of 76.67% instead of 76.07% existing and 75% permitted

Please note that at the November meeting, there was a motion that implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject property. That motion carried 4-3. There was a second motion for deferral of the architecture to the December meeting.

At the December meeting this project was not heard. It was deferred to the January meeting at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Karakul made an ex parte declaration.

Architect Eugene Lawrence presented revised plans to make the aviary more playful.

**MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

[B - 061 - 2010 Addition](#)

Address: 1170 North Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: Jan and Tom Moloney

Architect: SKA Architects/Patrick W. Segraves

Project Description: Addition of sunroom at existing west terrace, new pool, new site walls, new roof over existing east terrace

Please note that after reviewing the project at the November meeting, the project was deferred to the December meeting. At the December meeting, the project was not heard, and was deferred to January at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Architect Pat Segraves and Landscape Architect Alan Stopek of Efflorescence presented revised plans. The project, as revised, includes, but is not limited to a new site wall, a re-do and move of an existing site wall, new lap pool in rear,

walkways, new covered loggia with awning in the rear, new terrace, with open railing, in rear with steps leading down to pool, three white awnings on the east elevation, and a re-do of the railing at the balcony. Mr. Stopek presented the preliminary landscape plan only, reviewing the proposed landscape material, including dense screening from neighbors, expanses of lawn, an alley of trees on the south side, and the hardscape aspect of moving the existing driveway a bit to the south.

Commission comments: Do more plantings on the outside of the wall, especially at the entrance...too bland as proposed; the new railing is very busy; make sure the white awnings do not yellow; the awnings on the front of the house should not hide the fascia board; the driveway, as is, is only usable if you back out onto North Ocean Boulevard, which is very dangerous; the driveway is grandfathered as is, but you are modifying it, so the existing conditions should not be perpetuated; the driveway material is noted differently on different plans.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. SMITH OPPOSED.

[B - 066 - 2010 Demolition and New Residence](#)

Address: 1240 North Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Matt Smith

Architect: MP Design & Architecture, Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of existing residence; New two story shingle style residence, pool, hardscape and landscape; exterior renovation to existing cabana

Mr. Smith re-stated his previously declared conflict with this project as passed the gavel to Mr. Strawbridge. (Mr. Knowles- voting member for this project.)

This project was not heard at the December meeting, but was deferred to January at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication : Several members made ex parte declarations.

Michael Perry of MP Design & Architecture first provided a demolition report relative to the existing residence. Keith Williams of Mario Nievera Design Inc. discussed the landscape materials which will remain at the site, such as large Seagrapes, a nice Banyan tree, perimeter hedging, and Travelers Palms. He noted that the majority of trees will be kept as is, or re-used.

**MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL OF THE DEMOLITION
WITH THE USUAL DEMOLITION CONDITIONS RELATED TO
SODDING AND IRRIGATING.**

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Perry discussed his design for a two-story shingle style residence featuring gambrel style roofs, hip dormers on all second floor windows, and fieldstone chimneys. Breezeways connect the main house to a garage structure on the North side and a game barn on the South side. A long lap pool (16 ft. wide x 55 ft. long) will be placed on the East side of the property. There is an existing pool cabana at the site which will be shingled. Mr. Perry reviewed the site plan, floor plans and elevations.

Keith Williams of Mario Nievera Designs presented the landscape and hardscape according to the plans. Proposed materials include: Belgian block for the main driveway in a herringbone pattern, coral, Belgian block, and limestone for the motor court and pathways, Belgian block for the service drive, limestone stairs, fieldstone retaining walls, and Ipe deck material. He also discussed the landscape material to be added to the site to create a loose tropical feel. Mr. Williams noted that no piers, walls or gates are being presented today. The applicant will return with those items. He stated that a variance is required relative to perimeter landscaping due to the specific conditions at this site.

Commission comments: So refreshing to see a non-Mediterranean design; proportion of chimneys is off; do not want to destroy views, so landscape fine as is, or with some additional; shingle style is refreshing; chimney slant is odd; windows appear too important on East elevation; detail wrong on French doors for shingle house; fluted columns are a mistake...should be simpler; a single, wide, solid front door would be better with no arch; dormers are a bit big; simplify fenestration details; circle window is too important; simpler columns for pavilion; make outdoor fireplace more rustic; this is an opportunity to relate beach cabana to house; and study the three dormers on the ocean side and make them hips. Mr. Perry defended several of his design detail choices.

Mr. Lindgren noted that the commission will need to make a recommendation to the Town Council relative to the variance requested for landscaped open space.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCE WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS TO THE SUBJECT PROPERTY.

**MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED, WITH ADJUSTMENTS AT THE CHIMNEY IN TERMS OF THE WIDTH AND STRENGTH AND THE ANGLE, AND THE ADJUSTMENTS TO THE THREE DORMERS ON THE OCEAN SIDE TAKING THEM BACK TO HIP; AND KEEPING THOSE WINDOWS LESS THEATRICAL.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION AMENDED BY MR. KARAKUL TO INCLUDE ADDING FENESTRATION TO THE BEACH CABANA, AND REVIEWING DETAILS IN GENERAL TOWARD SIMPLIFICATION.

**AMENDMENT ACCEPTED BY SECONDER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

[B - 067 - 2010 New Residence](#)

Address: 212 Nightingale Trail

Applicant: Robmar Realty, LLC

Architect: MP Design & Architecture, Inc.

Project Description: New one and two story residence, pool, landscape & hardscape

After hearing this project at the December meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the January meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Michael Perry of MP Design & Architecture, Inc. returned with revised plans showing the originally proposed 18 ft. garage door now changed to two 9 ft. doors with a column between; library window re-sized; removed lites at front door; fenestration, shutter, and column changes; and, strengthened the details on the gable ends.

**MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B. [MAJOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS](#) (10:16:55 a.m.)

Let the record show that at this point, 10:18 a.m., there was a short recess.

[B - 001 - 2011 Generator structure](#)

Address: 420 South Lake Drive

Applicant: Town of Palm Beach

Architect: Mock Roos & Associates, Bridges & Marsh

Project Description: Construction of an 805 square foot structure to house the generator and controls for the D-7 pump station

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication : None

Architect Mark Marsh of Bridges Marsh & Associates represented the Town regarding this presentation for Town infrastructure improvements. The project includes the new generator structure at the extreme south end of the park, the removal of the control building in the middle of the park, and new D-6 and D-7 underground pump stations. The new generator building will be oriented in a north/south direction. It is a 20 ft. x 35 ft. building; will have a clay barrel tile roof; will be enhanced with a trellis or pergola all the way around the building;

will be enhanced by some benches and bougainvillea on lattice; and, will be detailed to make it more of a landscape element, with much of it screened by landscape material. Frank Maroney of Environment Design Group addressed the landscape issues. During construction, approximately 9 Royal Palms will be moved, cared for, and then later replaced in their original locations.

Commission Comments: Try to add plant material, perhaps grass, around the visible grates along the walkway; concern about the amount of water being discharged by D-7 with regard to boats nearby; proposed railing too utilitarian; try to vent exhaust pipe through roof.

MOTION BY MR. STRAWBRIDGE FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED WITH THE CONDITIONS THAT THE RAILING BE CHANGED TO SOMETHING MORE APPROPRIATE, PROBABLY PICKETS, AND THAT THE VENT EXHAUST BE STUDIED.

**MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

[B - 002 - 2011 Renovation](#)

Address: 168 Seaspray Avenue

Applicant: Mario and Susan Mercurio

Architect: Laberge & Menard Inc.

Project Description: Exterior and interior renovation of existing 2 story residence and garage/guest suite structure

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication : Several members made ex parte declarations.

Architects Daniel Menard and Mike Johnson provided this presentation. Mr. Menard explained that the new owners of the property want to retain the existing house, keep the massing of the house and garage, but embellish the architecture. In addition to interior changes, the proposal would change the roof, maintain the front door, articulate the roof line by raising the parapet, change the size and configuration of the windows, and enhance the chimneys. Similar changes are planned for the garage/apt. structure. A pair of gates will eliminate the view of the garage. Garage doors will be finished in pecky cypress and the existing railing will be changed to an ornamental railing. The building stucco will be painted beige; windows will be done in light green; terra cotta accents and copper rain water leaders are proposed.

Alan Stopek of Efflorescence presented the preliminary landscape plans. A courtyard setting will be created in the front with some type of focal element, perhaps a fountain or statue, and the pool/fountain will be placed in the rear.

Mr. Lindgren read an e-mail from the neighbor at 164 Seaspray, Joan Debie, wherein that neighbor expressed her concern regarding construction debris as it relates to her property.

**MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B - 003 - 2011 Demolition and new residence

Address: 269 Pendleton Avenue

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Kelly Moore

Architect: Smith Architectural Group, Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of existing structure and construction of new one/two story residence

Chairman Smith declared a Voting Conflict with regard to this project and passed the gavel to Mr. Strawbridge. Voting Conflict form on file. (Mr. Knowles voting)

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Don Kino with Smith Architectural Group presented this request. Mr. Kino provided a demolition report for this Volk designed home. He stated that the home is in fair to moderate condition, and is not meritorious in style. All perimeter landscaping will be retained.

**MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL OF THE DEMOLITION
WITH THE TYPICAL CONDITIONS FOR DEMOLITION RELATING
TO SODDING AND IRRIGATING.**

**MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Mr. Kino stated that the new house will serve as a guesthouse to the landmarked 277 Pendleton, also owned by the Moores. He explained that the design for the new house is deliberately understated to be subordinate to the main house. After reviewing the floor plans and elevations, Mr. Kino indicated that the house will have a white concrete tile roof, with white stucco and white impact windows, decorative black shutters, and raised panel garage doors.

Jorge Sanchez of Sanchez & Maddux Landscape Architects presented a preliminary landscape plan to make the front more street friendly. Two large Seagrapes serve to tunnel the service area. Two Date Palms will be relocated. Existing hedges on both sides will remain. A garden may be created in the front along with the elimination of any front parking, but no decisions have been made in this regard as yet. He reviewed the landscape material which is contemplated for use. Soda finished Herpel tile will be used in the design.

Commission comments: The second floor terrace will be dangerous for small children; likes the restraint used in the landscaping; the landscaping is somewhere between topiary and sculpture; an improvement over what is being demolished; and the whole package is quite successful.

**MOTION BY MS. DIVER FOR APPROVAL AS SUBMITTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. ZUKOV OPPOSED.**

[B - 004 -2011 Additions](#)

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 751 Island Drive

Applicant: Richard and Patsy Johnson

Architect: Thomas Kirchhoff

Project Description: The extension of an existing family room and addition of loggias to the west elevation. The addition of an entry portico to the east elevation.

Variances: 1. Applicant is proposing to convert two patio awnings to permanent loggias, enlarge the family room, and convert the front entry awning into a permanent structure. The proposed additions will require a variance request to allow an increase in the lot coverage to 34.6% in lieu of the 27.3% existing and 30% maximum allowed in the R-B Zoning District; 2. A variance request to allow an existing boat lift to remain in the same location after the reconstruction of the seawall which is currently at 20 feet west of the U.S. Pierhead line and the Town's Bulkhead line in lieu of the 6 foot maximum allowed; 3. A variance request to allow a marginal dock to be 20 feet from the north property line in lieu of the 25 foot minimum required; and, 4. A variance request to allow a marginal dock to be 20 feet from the south property line in lieu of the 25 foot minimum required.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None declared

Architect Tom Kirchhoff explained that the impetus for the project was a failing seawall. He presented this request for changes to this home since the long-time owners would like the home to accommodate large family gatherings. He reviewed the floor plans and elevations, explaining the requested changes. Mr. Kirchhoff noted that a much smaller pool is planned along with increased landscaping.

**MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE
PROPOSED VARIANCE WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE
ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS TO THE SUBJECT PROPERTY.**

**MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Commission Comments: Nice and tasteful, except for the large window facing West...three French doors would be preferable.

It was noted that though the building will be re-painted, the building colors will match existing.

MOTION BY MS. DIVER FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, EXCEPT THAT THE THREE WINDOWS ON THE WEST ELEVATION SHOULD REMAIN.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.

Mr. Kirchhoff remarked that the client prefers the design as proposed.

MOTION FAILED 3-4, WITH MR. STRAWBRIDGE, MR. ZUKOV, MR. KARAKUL, AND MR. VILA OPPOSED.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.

MOTION CARRIED 4-3, WITH MR. SMITH, MS. DIVER AND MRS. VANNECK OPPOSED.

[B - 005 - 2011 Existing equipment in setback](#)

Address: 970 North Lake Way

Applicant: Domenica La. Falcione

Architect: The Lawrence Group

Project Description: Existing fully screened air-conditioned equipment in required setbacks

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None declared

Attorney James Brindell stated that this is an existing chilled water system on the North side of the property. Architect Eugene Lawrence indicated that the cooling tower is hedged on all four sides and is located in the Northeast corner of the property. The proposal will add a sound barrier behind the unit to reduce emitted noise.

Mr. Page reported that recently, the Building Department issued a permit to replace the cooling tower which had been in place for many years. Upon inspection, it was discovered that a variance was actually necessary for the unit in the same location. No objections have been received from any neighbors.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

[B - 006 - 2011 New Residence with final landscape/hardscape](#)

Address: 255 Nightingale Trail

Applicant: Mr. Laurence Austin

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc./Daniel Kahan

Project Description: New one and two-story French Caribbean style residence with a pool. Final landscape and hardscape included in presentation. Roof

material: Concrete shake style in cedar grey; Building: light grey with green tint;

Trim: white; shutters: N/A

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte communications.

Daniel Kahan of Smith and Moore Architects presented this project to create a home for a young family with a usable yard for children. The home has a central motor court and entry, a side loaded garage, a circular driveway, rolling gates (hidden in landscaping) used to quarter off part of the front motor court to create a secure area for children and dogs; and, future generator location on the Southeast corner of the property. The house has 4,500 sq. ft of air conditioned space and 5,400 total square footage. Mr. Kahan reviewed the site plan, floor plans and elevations. Windows will be white aluminum clad wood impact resistant windows. The front door will be painted wood with sidelites and transom.

Keith Williams of Mario Nievera Design Inc. presented the landscape and hardscape. The driveway, with two entrances, will be done in acid washed cast stone bordering tabby concrete. He reviewed the proposed plant materials, perimeter screening, and terraces. The proposal includes a long lap pool, 60 ft. long by 10 ft. wide, with spa on the west side of the pool. Another water feature is being contemplated, but that will have to return to the commission at a later date.

Commission Comments: Problem with big rolling aluminum gates across the front of the house; there is insufficient space to get cars in and out of the garage; the driveway/garage configuration does not serve to achieve the goal of the Town to place cars in the garage; concern about jamb at front door; west elevation – door at outdoor shower...have an independent roof over that; too many different size windows and doors; concern about pool safety; good project.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. **MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS (11:51:12 a.m.)**

A - 010 - 2010 Roof Change

Address: 410 North Lake Way

Applicant: Bray Childrens Trust

Architect: MP Design & Architecture, Inc.

Project Description: Change existing roof material from asphalt shingle to standing seam metal. Change existing covered loggia roof to open pergola.

At the December meeting, after hearing this project, there was a motion to defer the project and urge the applicant to consider wood shake as a roof material.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Michael Perry stated that he had taken the commission's comments back to his client, but the property owner remains firm in the desire for a standing seam roof in the grey, aluminum color (16.5" from seam to seam). He presented various photos of other Palm Beach homes which have this type of roof. Mr. Perry also presented a sample of a second choice material, a metal shingle roof.

Commission Comments: There are quite a few roofs like this in the Town; this style roof is acceptable on this type of house; would not want to see an abundance of this type of roof in the Town; the only part of this house that is seen by the public is the roof; the house has a Key West feel....why not a Key West roof?; not in favor of standing seam roofs.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.

MOTION FAILED 3-4, WITH MS. DIVER, MR. KARAKUL, MRS. VANNECK, AND MR. SMITH OPPOSED.

MOTION BY MR. STRAWBRIDGE FOR DEFERRAL.

MOTION DIED FOR LACK OF A SECOND.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.

MOTION CARRIED 4-3, WITH MS. DIVER, MRS. VANNECK AND MR. SMITH OPPOSED.

D. MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS

[A - 001 - 2011 Exterior modifications](#)

Address: 396 Royal Palm Way

Applicant: Keith Spina, Glidden Spina & Partners

Architect: Keith Spina

Project Description: Remove the existing painted aluminum entry door and arched top transom window and replace with a code compliant painted aluminum entry door and transom window, including a required structural support beam which will be stucco faced to match the adjacent existing stucco; and, reconfigure the stucco faced site planter walls at the north entrance, including the addition of decorative stucco faced pilasters.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None declared

Keith Spina of Glidden Spina & Partners presented this request. First, he informed the commission that the site wall portion of the application, as stated above, is removed from consideration today. That aspect of the application will be heard at a future date.

For today's purposes the front door is the focus. Mr. Spina presented a painted wood door with lites and transoms above.

Commission comments: Simplify the front door and re-work it; this is an opportunity to make the front door better; simplify the quoins around the doors; front door is too high; an improvement over what is there; this is not an improvement...so disconnected; let the existing doors remain until you figure out something better.

**MOTION BY MR. VILA FOR DEFERRAL FOR FURTHER STUDY.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

E. **MAJOR PROJECTS - PROJECTS REMANDED TO ARCOM BY TOWN COUNCIL (12:12:33 a.m.)**

B - 070 - 2010 Exterior Modifications

Address: 150 Worth Avenue

Architect: Jerome Baumohl, AIA, NCARB

Project Description: Reconsideration of signage and architectural changes to accommodate signage

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication : All members made ex parte declarations.

Mr. Page reported that after ARCOM took action at the December meeting, the project was then reviewed by the Town Council for variance and Special Exception. The Town Council remanded the project back to ARCOM in the hope of finding an acceptable solution.

Jerome Baumohl returned today with several design options for the signage. Several of the stores signs will be placed within the existing stucco bands, requiring no architectural modification, using pin-mounted, black, matte finish letters, 9" to 10" tall. For the stores that have architectural elements and signage is being added: Vilebrequin, Christofle, and Pucci and Louis Vuitton, three design options were presented.

For Vilebrequin, Christofle, and Pucci: Option 1: 10" black matte pin mounted letters mounted at the keystone on the existing arch; Option 2: Black metal frames placed below the architecture using silver lettering; and, Option 3: Black iron frame with stone panel insert and 10" matte black pin mounted letters.

For Louis Vuitton, Option 1: Black iron frame with spokes/circle design and beam with silver lettering; Option 2: Beam, with silver lettering, across the arch sitting on top of the capitals of the archway; and Option 3: Beam , with silver lettering, and black spokes.

Members discussed this issue at some length. Though some of the members still believed that none of this signage is necessary, Chairman Smith stated that the Town Council has asked ARCOM to reconsider the matter. He added that contrary to last month, when the architecture of the building was affected, some reasonable solutions have been presented today which do not change the architecture, except in the case of Louis Vuitton.

Mr. Page reminded the commission that the Town Council wants an opinion from ARCOM relative to the variances required.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK RELUCTANTLY, THOUGH WE ARE
NOT IN FAVOR OF ADDITIONAL SIGNAGE ON THIS BUILDING, A**

RECOMMENDATION FOR OPTION #1 FOR PUCCI, CHRISTOFLE AND VILEBREQUIN, AND OPTION #2 FOR LOUIS VUITTON, AND THAT THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCE WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS TO THE SUBJECT PROPERTY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.

MOTION CARRIE 6-1, WITH MR. ZUKOV OPPOSED.

Let the record show that at this point, 12:47 p.m., there was a short recess.

B - 06 - 2010 ARCOM consideration/comments regarding Mediation Report's revised plans

Address: 1100 North Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: 1100 North Ocean Boulevard Trust

Architect: The Lawrence Group Architects

Prior to hearing from either side in this matter, Town Attorney Randolph gave a lengthy explanation of why and how this matter was once again before ARCOM. In short, a mediation took place, with Mr. Randolph, Mr. Rosow and Mr. Smith participating in that process. After reviewing alternative proposals by both parties, both Mr. Rosow and Mr. Smith agreed to take the Karp's (1100 North Ocean Boulevard) alternative plan back to the Town Council, and the Town Council, in turn, approved the mediation report and remanded the matter back to ARCOM for further consideration. At the Town Council's February meeting, the Council will make a final determination regarding this matter.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Smith made an ex parte declaration.

Chairman Smith stated that each side will be given 15 minutes for their respective presentations, after which the members will go into executive session.

Attorney James Brindell, Architect Eugene Lawrence, and Landscape Architect Jeff Blakely presented a new design alternative designed completely within the zoning code. In an effort to address the issue of too much mass, the revised design eliminates the second floor over the parking garage and extends the first floor to the south. Mr. Lawrence reviewed the elevations as revised, and Mr. Blakely did likewise with respect to the landscaping. Mr. Lawrence felt the new design successfully decreases the mass and the square footage within the building. He noted that the addition, as revised, is not more seaward than in previous designs.

Attorney Paul Rampell, representing the Castles at 1095 North Ocean Boulevard, placed into the record a disc of all records from previous meetings. He called attention to the fact that the Castles and their neighbors continue to object to the proposal. Architect Thomas Kirchhoff testified to the new Karp proposal. He felt that the new design takes a step backwards, and fails in every criterion which he evaluated; that the new guesthouse lacks any positive relationship with the house; that the interior circulation is problematic; that there is lots of wasted space; and,

that the concept has a commercial quality. He added that the plans are incomplete for proper review by ARCOM. Mr. Kirchhoff presented a Photoshop image of what the Castles would see when looking north if the Karp proposal is built. Mr. Kirchhoff presented three different alternate locations (A, B & C) where the Karp's addition might be built.

Mr. Rampell focused upon the 15 feet between the properties; the sustainability of plant material within that 15 feet; 300 petitions from Town residents who oppose the Karp plans and seek the preservation of open space; the testimony of former ARCOM members who served in 1996, when the house was built; the positioning of the Karp house upon its lot; and the belief that the original spacing between the houses should be maintained.

Commission Comments – Executive Session

Questioned the accuracy of the Photoshop images presented; questioned whether placing the addition at the North end of the property, as proposed by the Castles, is feasible; the Karp's revised proposal is a huge improvement from the previous presentation, even though some additional improvements may be needed; why would anyone attempt to squeeze this addition into a space (North end) where there is no room?; the one story design is an improvement, but on the south side, it looks like a ranch house that rambled on... make it more appropriate; there is still an awkward connection from the loggia to the guest wing; the east elevation, as proposed, has a piece that hangs off at the end nearest the Castles...this could be made smaller; not comfortable approving a home that duplicates the details of a main house that we would not approve today; the reduction in mass is a big improvement and a positive change...the 1996 architecture is what it is...the addition matches the main house...landscaping is very important to the Castles; they were asked to blend the addition into the main house and they did; this is an improvement, but is there another solution...is there a better place to build what they are entitled to build?; we are not the designers of this project...we can only comment on whether this proposal is appropriate or not; have we exhausted all options to preserve sensitivity to open space; the house was originally skewed to the north because of a tennis court which is no longer there; are we not creating a precedent to say that a 15 ft. separation is not enough?; I believe in property rights...the Karp's are not asking for variances...the massing is not overwhelming...it's a good compromise by the Karp's since they could have built two stories by code...it goes with the house...it respects the neighbor... minor tweaks are needed, but I could recommend to the Town Council that they should consider this; and, (later in the meeting), there are other options which would be more friendly to the neighbors.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO FAVORABLY RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THIS PLAN TO THE TOWN COUNCIL.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SMITH (PASSED GAVEL TO STRAWBRIDGE.)

UPON MR. VILA'S SUGGESTION, MOTION AMENDED BY MR. ZUKOV TO ADD THE REQUIREMENT THAT THE APPLICANT RETURNS TO ARCOM WITH ADDITIONAL LANDSCAPE PLANNING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA. (MR. SMITH TAKES GAVEL BACK.)

MOTION FAILED 3-4, WITH MR. STRAWBRIDGE, MS. DIVER, MR. KARAKUL AND MRS. VANNECK OPPOSED.

MOTION BY MS. DIVER THAT THE APPLICANT COME BACK TO PROPOSE A DIFFERENT LOCATION FOR THE ADDITION AND SHOW US THE POSSIBILITIES FOR A DIFFERENT LOCATION ON THE SITE FOR THE ADDITION.

MOTION DIED FOR LACK OF A SECOND.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL THAT ARCOM DOES NOT STRONGLY RECOMMEND THIS AS THE BEST ALTERNATIVE FOR THE TOWN COUNCIL.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED 4-3, WITH MR. ZUKOV, MR. VILA, AND MR. SMITH OPPOSED.

Mrs. Vanneck clarified that her objection was on the basis of architecture as drawn as she felt it could be approved.

IX. **COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)**

X. **COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT: (1:34:38 a.m.)**

Staff update relative to November 2011 ARCOM meeting: Mr. Page reported that there is a meeting date conflict for the month of November because of a previously scheduled meeting for November 18th by another board/commission. After review of this issue, ARCOM will be able to continue to meet on Friday, November 18, 2011, but will have to conclude its meeting by approximately 1:15 p.m. to 1:30 p.m. so that the Chambers will be available for another meeting at 2:00 p.m.

Ordinance #35-10: Mr. Page discussed the recently passed ordinance addressing member absences from the Architectural Commission meetings. Absences are excused for illness, a death in the family, religious holidays and requirements of legal process. Mr. Page specifically referenced the following new language: *"The member shall notify the Director of Planning, Zoning & Building in writing of the board member's intended*

absence at least seven (7) business days prior to the regularly scheduled meeting. Failure to do so, absent an emergency which prevents timely notice, will cause the absence to be unexcused.”

Items for Commission Feedback:

Requirement for at least two architects, who are licensed in the State of Florida, to serve on ARCOM: Mr. Page asked the members how important it is that the architects be licensed in the State of Florida. While some members felt that Florida licensure was very important, others did not. After discussion, in a show of hands five (5) of the members agreed that Florida licensure should be required.

Major/Minor Projects and Staff Approvals: Veronica Close, Assistant Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, distributed some sample language, which has never been codified, relative to the separation and definition of Major and Minor Projects, and relative to the practice of staff approvals for those issues which are so minor in nature that it is staff's opinion that they do not have to appear on an ARCOM agenda.

Let the record show that Ms. Diver left the meeting at 2:04 p.m.

Let the record show that Mr. Zukov left the meeting at 2:08 p.m.

Let the record show that Mr. Strawbridge left the meeting at 2:12 p.m.

The members expressed some reservation about an overabundance of staff approvals being granted. Mr. Lindgren explained his rationale for giving staff approvals and/or for forwarding projects to ARCOM for review. After discussion, members agreed to continue with the current standing practice of allowing staff approvals according to the guidelines expressed by Mr. Lindgren. Ms. Close clarified with the commission that they had no problem to a reference, within the code, to administrative or staff approvals. She added that staff will return to the commission in the future with a listing of the types of improvements which may be suitable for staff approval. One of the members cautioned, however, that the listing should be more broad, rather than specific, in order for staff to be able to work with it.

XI. ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK TO ADJOURN AT 2:13 P.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on February 23, 2011 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

cmd