MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
IN THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 23, 2011, 9:00 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording of the meeting by contacting Cindy Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER:

Chairman Smith called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL (8:59:41 a.m.)

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	PRESENT
Robert J. Vila, Member	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Member	PRESENT
Henry Homes III, Member	PRESENT
Alex Hufty Griswold, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Staff members present were John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission. Town Attorney John Randolph was absent.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE (9:00:04 a.m.)

IV. ELECTION OF OFFICERS (9:00:25 a.m.)

Chairman Smith welcomed the new members of the Architectural Commission, Messrs. Homes, Griswold, and Ives.

Chairman Smith called for nominations for Chairman and Vice Chairman.

Mrs. Vanneck nominated Mr. Smith to continue as Chairman. Mr. Karakul seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations for Chairman. Mrs. Vanneck nominated Mr. Vila as Vice Chairman. Mr. Karakul seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations for Vice Chairman. Mr. Smith and Mr. Vila were elected Chairman and Vice Chairman, respectively, by unanimous ballot.

V. ADMINISTRATION OF OATH OF OFFICE:

Mrs. Delp administered the Oath of Office to the three new members, Messrs. Homes, Griswold and Ives.

VI. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE FEBRUARY 23, 2011 MEETING (9:03:36 a.m.)

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VII. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA : (9:03:50 a.m.)

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VIII. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY (9:04:16 a.m.)

Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and as necessary throughout the meeting.

IX. OTHER BUSINESS: (9:04:18 a.m.) None

X. PROJECT REVIEW (9:04:22 a.m.)

A. MAJOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS **(9:04:24 a.m.)** None

B. MAJOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS **(9:04:26 a.m.)**

B - 012 - 2011 New Gate Entry
Address: 410 North Lake Way
Applicant: Bray Childrens Trust
Architect: Mario Nievera Design Inc.
Project Description: Proposed new gate entry and associated hardscape/planting changes

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Keith Williams with Mario Nievera Design Inc. provided the presentation for landscape/hardscape and gates according to the submitted plans. Some elements of the plan include, but are not limited to: main entrance off North Lake Way: existing circular motor court with a large Ficus tree in the center; replace grey gravel in the motor court with light beige gravel; replace metal edging holding the gravel in place by Belgian block; Belgian block at the driveway apron; new driveway gate and two pedestrian gates; Existing Ficus hedges at the north and south sides; remove wood walkway and pathway, and replace with Dominican coral; retain existing pool; remove Mexican tile in several locations and replace with Dominican coral; move Areca Palms at driveway off to

the side; clean up the property removing unnecessary vegetation; beef up landscaping on north and south perimeters; and, bougainvillea on the cedar columns at the pool pergola.

After speaking with a few members prior to the meeting, the gate design has been revised to be a natural cedar wood gate with open pickets on top, vertical rails, and an opaque bottom.

Mrs. Vanneck called attention to the southwest most Seagrape which has been badly pruned over the years. Mr. Williams indicated that they plan to supplement that Seagrape with additional Seagrape.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 015 - 2011 Landscape/Hardscape
Address: 1191 North Lake Way
Applicant: Malcolm McCluskey
Architect: Morgan Wheelock Inc.
Project Description: Proposed landscape and hardscape, with new entry drive/motor court and 20 ft. x 40 ft. pool with pool deck

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Zukov made an ex parte declaration.

Adam Mills of Morgan Wheelock Inc. gave the landscape/hardscape presentation. Elements of the plan include, but are not limited to: Two large existing Black Olive trees; one large existing Seagrape; one large existing Royal Palm; two entry drives off North Lake Way; entry drives and motor court with a 3' wide brick border; motor court in loose chatahoochee; four large Majul Palms centered on the front door; Foxtails and Italian Cypress in the front; New 20'x40' pool with Dominican keystone coping, pool deck, and loggia paving; perimeter screening with Ficus, Traveler Palms, and Clusia hedge; and, purple Bougainvillea on the garage façade.

Commission comments: Unfortunate removal of specimen tree by others; dip in the front hedge…why?; Majuls too close together; Foxtails are too close to the house; Italian Cypress are difficult to grow in Palm Beach…Podocarpus is a better choice; and, Dombeya in front will not get sufficient light; the height of the trees in the front, in relation to the scale of the house, seems weak…could be more attractive with additional height.

Mr. Lindgren indicated that a condition is needed that the applicant work with the Town to ensure a safe sight triangle. It was noted that the Town will not permit Podocarpus to be planted in the sight triangle as it is thought to grow too quickly and require too much maintenance. Members disagreed saying that Podocarpus grows very slowly and is one of the most appropriate materials.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK THAT GIVEN THE FACT THAT THE APPLICANT IS WORKING WITH THE TOWN ON THE SIGHT TRIANGLE, AND IS TRYING TO AMELIORATE SOME OF THE MATERIALS, THE PROJECT IS APPROVED AS PRESENTED. (Mr. Lindgren noted, in addition, that the applicant was asked to study adding some additional height to the plant material in the front, and to move the foxtails further away from the house.)
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 016 - 2011 Gates and Gate Piers
Address: 340 Polmer Park Road
Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Robert Fromer
Architect: Michael J. Johnson - Architect, P.A.
Project Description: New gate piers and driveway gates at service driveway

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mrs. Vanneck made an ex parte declaration.

Architect Michael Johnson provided the presentation for new gate piers and driveway gates at the service driveway which is located at the southwest corner of the cul de sac. Mr. Johnson stated that the Town Council, last month, had granted a special exception for this property to install gates 5 ft. from the pavement. The design shows gate piers which duplicate the existing pre-cast gate piers of the main gate, but without the decorative urns of the main gate. The service gate will mimic the design of the main gate; and, will be aluminum, painted black, with a maximum height of 6 ft., and width of 18'8". Ficus, 10 ft. in height, is proposed at the new north pier at the service drive to match the existing Ficus on the south side.

Commission Comments: The proposed gate does not look as though it has the same characteristics of the main gate…this looks more ornate and detailed; the service drive gate should be obviously subservient to the main gate; try to eliminate the center scroll-work; very busy design…simplify it; as designed, guests will be confused in trying to determine which is the main gate; the simpler, the better for this large gate on a cul de sac; and, cut down size of piers and simplify the gate.

MOTION BY MR. VILA TO APPROVE THE DESIGN WITH THE REQUEST THAT THE CENTER SCROLLING BE OMITTED FROM THE GATE ITSELF. MOTION SECONDED BY MR. GRISWOLD.

Mr. Smith noted that the main gate shows gold tipped spears at the top, and questioned whether the service gate would be similarly treated. Mr. Johnson assured him that there would be no gold tipped spears on the service gate.

MOTION CARRIED 5-2, WITH MRS. VANNECK AND MR. KARAKUL OPPOSED.

B - 017 - 2011 Landscape/Hardscape/Lighting
Address: 400 Regents Park
Applicant: Kathleen M. Price
Architect: John Lang Design Group
Project Description: New driveway, entry steps, landscape plan, lighting plan

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None declared

Landscape Architect John Lang and Attorney Brian Seymour of Gunster Yoakley provided the presentation for this project. Mr. Lang explained the landscape/hardscape plans which include, but are not limited to: Grey brick paver motor court in ashlar pattern; addition of small retaining wall and steps; simple, tailored landscape in keeping with neighborhood; four large Gumbo Limbos to anchor the motor court; Italian Cypress; Foxtails; Alexander Palms; bougainvillea at the guesthouse trellis; 30" tall Green Island Ficus and sod at the south property line due to easement constraints; and, landscape lighting with both up and down lighting. Attorney Brian

Seymour explained that at the south property line, there are actually two easements which overlap…one utility easement in favor of the Town. (Copy submitted for the record). As a result of the easements, the hedge at the south property line is limited to 30" in height. The other is a neighbor's easement to access her dock. Mr. Seymour noted that a removal agreement is required with the Town…if the Town needs to dig and remove the hedge, the owner will have to replace it.

Commission comments: The mini sets are totally illegible…be sure they are legible in the future; two new foxtails…that's an odd place for the only two palms on the property…not appropriate for the style of the house; and, Italian Cypress is difficult to grow.

Mr. Lindgren noted, relative to the easement area, that the Town has allowed plantings of greater heights in the past, but only on a case by case basis. The preference, however, is for a maximum height of 30".

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED (Mr. Lang noted that he will voluntarily remove the two Foxtail Palms.)
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 019 - 2011 Landscape/Hardscape
Address: 144 Wells Road
Applicant: Mr. Peter Cohen
Architect: Don Skowron Inc.
Project Description: Final landscape/hardscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations

Mr. Skowron presented the project with landscape plan elements including, but not limited to: 14 ft. tall Ficus hedges at perimeter; Front: 4 ft. wall with pedestrian gate and vehicular gate; West: Coconut and Areca Palms; existing tall Australian Pine hedge; South: 20'x40' pool and guesthouse with tropical landscaping; two large Bizmarkia Palms between pool and house; large expanses of lawn; and, many other plant species as outlined on the submitted plans. Moving on to the elevations, on the street side elevation (LP3), Mr. Skowron asked the commission to ignore the 6 Podocarpus shown at the street because of the landmarked Wells Road Scenic Vista which landmarked the Australian Pines in the right of way. Hardscape: Brick driveway to the east; Olympic stone; pool deck in random ashlar pattern; stone at loggia and in front of home and on walkways.

Commission comments: The plant legend is so small, it cannot be read; you mentioned Dombeya and there is no Dombeya on the plans (Mr. Skowron noted that the Dombeya are shown as Copper Leafs on the plans.); the 6 Sylvestris Palms in the front are overkill; this landscape looks totally different than anything else on the street; question the use of bamboo because it is messy for the neighbor as well; 2 of the Sylvestris Palms could be eliminated; and, removing 2 of the Sylvestris may not even solve the problem.

Mr. Skowron presented previously unsubmitted details of the gate design (on ELMO) indicating that this is the design which is being proposed. These gates (driveway and pedestrian) are aluminum. The driveway gate has Chippendale detailing. Both gates are flanked by stucco gate piers. Mr. Smith commented that the gate piers on both gates are too high and out of proportion with the gates. Mr. Skowron responded that they can be reduced in height.

Mr. Lindgren added that per the Town Engineer, there are concerns with the Podocarpus included in the safe sight triangle. So, a condition would be appreciated that the applicant will work with the Town relative to the sight triangle.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE GATE PIERS BE LOWERED BY AT LEAST A FOOT. MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED 4-3, WITH MR. VILA, MR. SMITH, AND MRS. VANNECK OPPOSED.

B - 020 - 2011 Elevation Changes
Address: 265 Sunset Avenue
Applicant: Publix Supermarkets Inc.
Architect: Fisher and Associates, LLC
Project Description: Revisions to previously approved elevations

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations

Daniel Kahan of Smith and Moore Architects provided the presentation. He was accompanied by Harold Smith of Smith and Moore Architects, Brian Fisher of Fisher and Associates, Architects, and other members of the Publix design team, including Maura Ziska, Attorney representing Publix. He explained that there are basically three areas of change: 1) roof plan change relative to location of the penthouse which houses equipment; 2) lighting of the arcades; and, 3) changes to the loading area. As for the roof plan, the penthouse has been shifted to the east and will have a hipped roof all the way around, together with raising the roof eave height by one foot. Other changes include, but are not limited to: North elevation: move exit door two feet; West elevation: at the north end of arcade, install hanging lights only in every other bay; South elevation: add one additional hanging light at east end of arcade; Loading area: change gate and gate pier configuration and add louvered panel at generator room; East facade: add louvered panel at smaller generator; and, add two porthole openings for generator exhaust.

Commission comments: West elevation: good to reduce number of lights on the north part of the arcade, but why then is there a light in every bay on the south part of the arcade; biggest issue is with stucco lines everywhere on the building which were not shown previously and were not discussed today…too commercial in appearance…expansion joints should not be visible…we want a Palm Beach look, not a Target look…other larger buildings in Palm Beach do not have these control joints…cracks in a stucco building are to be expected, and they can be treated with certain paints to make them disappear.

Mr. Lindgren stated that the requirement for expansion joints is dependent on the code requirement for backing material. If it is wood, expansion joints are required; if masonry, not required.

Commission comments continued: South elevation: two lights in east part of arcade and no lights in west part of arcade; delete those two lights and replace with step lights in the stairs.

Mr. Fisher agreed that he will try to eliminate the expansion joints wherever possible.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT, BUT RETURN NEXT MONTH WITH DRAWINGS WHICH SHOW WHAT HAS BEEN TAKEN OUT.

Because the applicant was concerned about the project delays this would cause:

MOTION AMENDED BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, AND REMOVE AS MANY EXPANSION JOINTS AS POSSIBLE, (with the understanding that the revised drawings are subject to review by Mr. Smith and staff relative to the expansion joints) AND REMOVE THE TWO LIGHTS ON THE SOUTH ELEVATION IN FAVOR OF STEP LIGHTS INSTEAD.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS **(10:35:00 a.m.)**

A - 002 -2011 Front door changes
Address: 116 Gulfstream Road
Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Robert Wood
Architect: SKA Architect + Planner, Patrick W. Segraves
Project Description: Remove existing copper canopy over front door and change front door surround with Classical entry

Please note that this project was heard at the February meeting and was deferred with a recommendation that the architect consider restoring or re-creating the design that is already there.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Zukov made an ex parte declaration.

Architect Pat Seagraves presented the revised drawings for changes to the front door area. The door/surround has been lowered by 1.5 feet and it has been simplified in general. The commission was very happy with the revised plans.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS **(10:38:30 a.m.)** None

XI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE) (10:38:39 a.m.)

None

XII. COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT: (10:38:43 a.m.)

Mr. Knowles wondered about the wind requirements for gates, especially solid ones. Mr. Lindgren responded that when projects are submitted for permit, plan reviewers ensure that wind requirements are met.

Mr. Ives commented that the mini-sets must be legible in order for them to be useful. Mr. Smith stated that without a legible mini-set, the application is incomplete.

XIII. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>:

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK TO ADJOURN AT 10:40 A.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on Wednesday, April 27, 2011 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach, Florida.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

cmd