



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 23, 2003

TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT:

Floyd L. Wideman, Jr., Vice Chairman
Marvin Rosenberg, Member
Leslie A. Shaw, Member
Lindley M.F. Hoffman, Member
Nikita Zukov, Member (arrived at 9:02)
Morgan Dix Wheelock, Alternate Member
William J. Strawbridge Jr., Alternate Member
Leslie C. Diver, Alternate Member
John C. Randolph, Town Attorney
Robert L. Moore, Director Planning, Zoning & Building
Timothy M. Frank, Planning Administrator
Gretchen Dayton, Recording Secretary

ABSENT:

John H. Schuler, Chairman (excused)
Eric Adams, Member (excused)

Vice-Chairman Wideman presided over the meeting in Chairman Schuler's absence. Mr. Wheelock and Mr. Strawbridge were voting members, as they filled Mr. Wideman's and Mr. Adams' positions.

III PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Acting Chairman Wideman lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE MARCH 26, 2003 MEETING.

MOTION BY MR. SHAW TO APPROVE THE MINUTES.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOFFMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V SWEARING IN PERSONS TESTIFYING.

Persons testifying were sworn in at this time and periodically throughout the meeting.

VI PROJECT DEFERRALS/REMOVALS

B9-03 Addition

Applicant: Michael and Ann Small
Address: 156 East Inlet Drive
Architect: Giacomelli Architecture

Project Description: "Addition of porte cochere and a north wing. Redefinition of architectural style. Replacement of fenestration and roof."

This project was deferred from the February meeting for restudy. The architect requested deferral from the March meeting. The property owners requested deferral to the May meeting.

B15-03 New Residence (V49-02)

Applicant: Scott Derrin and Michelle Ryan
Address: 254 North County Road
Architect: The Lawrence Group Architects
Project Description: "Demolition of two, connected, one story cottages and the construction of a two-story, two bedroom and library house with a two-car garage."

Demolition was approved and the new residence was deferred for restudy at the March meeting. The architect requests deferral to the May meeting.

B24-03 New Residence

Applicant: Sandra G. Cofer
Address: 2227 Ibis Isle Road East
Architect: SGA Architects
Project Description: "Construct a new two story CBS residence with stone trim, stucco walls and flat cement tile roof."

The demolition request was approved and the new project was deferred for restudy at the March meeting. Staff recommends project deferral as revised plans were not received by the deadline date.

Note: Staff received a letter from the architect, the morning of the meeting, requesting deferral to the May meeting.

MOTION BY MR. SHAW TO DEFER PROJECT NUMBERS B9-03, B15-03 AND B24-03 TO THE MAY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOFFMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Shaw discussed the variance that was granted in conjunction with project number B15-03. He wanted to look at the application pertaining to what was granted, not necessarily what the applicant wanted. They asked for a front yard setback of 9.4 feet in lieu of the required 25 feet. He noted that nothing was indicated in the application requesting a two-story residence. Even though a set of plans were brought to the Town Council for approval, in essence those plans are non-existent from the standpoint of ARCOM's review. Nothing should be construed by the plans or the approval to indicate that they have the right to build a two-story structure 9.4 feet from the street. He remarked that the issues that ARCOM has heard lately are the rights to develop a piece of property, the impact of a property on the adjacent neighbors, and the preservation of neighborhoods. He thought that this was a prime example of what should not be permitted based on the original application. Mr. Moore explained that the applicant was not present to respond to any discussion, but it would be fine to ask staff to pass along thoughts or comments to the applicant. Mr. Wideman commented that he also planned to be strong on the same subject. His quarrel is not with the applicant; it is with the Town Council. He felt that under their guidelines, it was unfair to send the Commission a project that would be impossible to build on a postage stamp. He remarked that the Commission should have a certain standard to maintain, which is not to approve plans that would never be approved in normal circumstances, just because it was granted a variance. He recommended denying projects, and let the Town Council approve them since they create the situations. Mr. Moore reminded the Commission that their charge is to look at how the proposed project reflects on the property and the neighborhood, (not too similar, not too dissimilar.) If the Commission feels the project does not meet this

criterion, then the due process procedure for the applicant would be to appeal to the Town Council. The Town Council had different criteria they were looking at. The issue is not how the house fit into the neighborhood, but whether or not there was a hardship in order to grant the multiple variances. Mr. Shaw though there was no hardship by reorienting the lot and placing the front door on the side. The lot is smaller than the neighboring lots by only 8 feet.

VII PROJECT REVIEW

A. DEFERRALS AND CONTINUATIONS - MAJOR PROJECTS

B2-03 Renovation (SE6-2003)

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Kevin McGovern
Address: 224 South Ocean Boulevard
Architect: Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: "1. New one-story, 60 s.f. kitchen addition 2. Exterior renovation to the north and east elevations. 3. New one-story garden porch addition. 4. All details and finishes to match existing."

Note: Number 1 and number 3 of the project description were added after the Notice to Property Owners were mailed.

This project was deferred from the January meeting at the architect's request. It was deferred from the February and March meetings pending Town Council action.

There was no response from the audience when this project was announced. Mr. Frank stated that the Town Council denied the variance request, and staff has not received a request for project deferral. It was agreed that this will be the last deferral for this project.

MOTION BY MR. WHELOCK TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE MAY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SHAW.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B19-03 New Beach Cabana (SE8-2003)

Applicant: Taja Realty Trust
Address: 101 Seminole Avenue
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects
Project Description: "Construction of a one-story beach cabana ."

This project was deferred from the April meeting at the architect's request.

There were no ex-parte communications disclosed regarding this project.

Architect Harold Smith presented the 200 s.f. beach cabana which received approvals from the Town Council and the Department of Environmental Protection. The cabana's location was determined by the D.E.P. limitations and the coastal construction control line. Groups of cocoanut palms will frame the property and the balance of the site will be sodded with zoysa grass. The cabana will correspond to the main residence by having a 4/12 pitch roof with barrel tile and cast stone columns between the arched doors. Simpler Doric capitals will be used on the columns because the building is smaller. Mr. Smith responded to a comment that a transom bar was missing above two doors on the east elevation because the beam height is only 8 feet which would create a tight situation. It was suggested making the two doors square at the top to alleviate the problem. Doric columns were thought to be out of scale for the size of the building.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT WITH THE PROVISIONS TO SQUARE OFF THE DOORS AND REMOVE THE DORIC COLUMNS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOFFMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. NEW BUSINESS - MAJOR PROJECTS

B27-03 Addition

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Spencer Lavan
Address: 286 Orange Grove Road
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects
Project Description: "A second floor addition to an existing one-story residence."

There were no ex-parte communications disclosed regarding this project.

Architect Harold Smith presented revisions of a ranch style home to change it into a Bermuda/island style. The existing footprint will not change with the exception of the balcony overhang. Jalousie windows will be updated to impact resistant windows, and

shutters will be added for decoration. The existing Christmas palms and traveler palms will remain at the rear of the property. He offered to add more traveler palms to completely screen the second floor from the neighbors. Mr. Smith agreed to add hinges to the new shutters to match the shutters on the first floor.

Mr. Wideman commented that the architect did a nice job, but felt it was also a clear definition of a “pop-top.”

**MOTION BY MR. HOFFMAN TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B28-03 Guest House

Applicant:	Maryanne T. Barry
Address:	160 Woodbridge Road
Architect:	Dailey & Partners Architects
Project Description:	“Elimination of two one-story cabana buildings and relocation of pool - new one-story guest house (1732 s.f.), new landscaping and hardscaping, revisions to previously approved landscaping and hardscaping.”

This project was originally advertised for 152 Woodbridge Road (B17-03). Demolition of the single family home was approved, and the new project was deferred for restudy at the March meeting. A Unity of Title has been applied for 152 and 160 Woodbridge Road. Therefore, the architect was asked to re-advertise the project with a new project description.

Mr. Wideman, Mr. Shaw, Mr. Zukov, and Mr. Wheelock announced that they had plans faxed to them, but did not meet with the architect.

Architect Roger Janssen stated that the project was re-advertised because two properties will be tied together with a Unity of Title. Rather than propose a single family residence on a single lot, the project will be a guest house for the property at 160 Woodbridge Road. He noted that the initial approval for the main house included two small, one-story cabana buildings. Because the property next door was purchased to build a guest house, they decided to delete the plans for the two cabanas. (Note: The cabana buildings have had permits issued, but have not been built). The plans for the guest house were revised to replace the middle section, which had a Regency style flat roof, with a 4/12 pitch roof with barrel tile roofing material. He also presented the preliminary landscape plan which incorporated the existing mature trees at the street. Salvage brick pavers will be laid in a herringbone pattern for the driveway, and pathways will be made of broken coquina.

It was agreed that the landscape architect should make the presentation as it was understood to be the final landscape plan. Some of the Commissioner's thought that the revised rendition appeared heavier, even though all of the roof forms matched. It was suggested to reduce the size of the cast stone surrounds around the doors and lower the roof to reduce the mass of the middle section of the building. Other Commissioner's felt the architectural portion of the project was fine as presented. They did agree that the hedge along the west property line ended abruptly at the street. It was thought that by adding a tree may remedy the situation.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED WITH THE PROVISION TO INTRODUCE A TREE AT THE END OF THE BUSH. (HEDGE AT THE WEST PROPERTY LINE)

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WHEELOCK.

MR. STRAWBRIDGE OPPOSED.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1.

B29-03 New Residence

Applicant: Mockingbird L.L.C.
Address: 233 Mockingbird Trail
Contractor: Complete Property Management / Architect: Stephan A. Yeckes
Project Description: "New residence, Mediterranean style. Two-story design with great room, side opening two-car garage."

Mr. Zukov said he met with the developer.

Mr. Frank read a letter from Ann B. Copeland, 232 Mockingbird Trail, addressing the issue of allowing large homes to be built on small lots. Mr. Strawbridge suggested forwarding the letter to the Zoning Commission and the Town Council. Mr. Wideman remarked that the discussion at the beginning of the meeting had a strong bearing on this issue, and possibly the word is getting to both the Town Council and the Zoning Commission.

Architect Stephan Yeckes indicated that the new residence will have a footprint of 100 s.f. larger than what was previously on the lot. To be sensitive to the neighbors, the second floor will be approximately ½ of the size of the first floor. Also, the two-car garage was located at the rear of the lot. The house will be a light Mediterranean style with Spanish tile roofing, salmon color stucco, and pecky cypress outlookers and trellis. Mr. Yeckes presented a photo board of the houses on the street, but did not have an in-line streetscape drawing. He commented that a large hedge along the front of the property will remain during construction.

After discussion, Mr. Yeckes agreed to eliminate a window on the second floor, east elevation, if it will invade the neighbor's privacy. Mr. Hoffman remarked that the rusticated areas above the arches on the first floor, and over the windows in the stair tower, were not in keeping with the architecture of the rest of the house. Mr. Shaw perceived the tower as over bearing, the window on the second floor as very large, and the rustication as heavy. Mr. Zukov noticed, when he met with the architect, that the details gave the house a lot of warmth. Dr. Rosenberg favored the project and stated that it fits the neighborhood. Mr. Wheelock commented that the columns supporting the arches in the front, were too delicate for the span. The parking court may be too small to drive a car directly into the garage. The preliminary landscaping plan was not convincing in terms of the trees that are intended to screen the second story from the neighbors. Mr. Strawbridge believed that if the project were simplified, it would fit in with the neighborhood. Ms. Diver thought the front door could be made more important as it appeared narrow in comparison to the windows. Mr. Wideman suggested eliminating the top portion of the chimney to eliminate the appearance of a tower.

MOTION BY MR. WHEELOCK TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE MAY MEETING FOR RESTUDY IN TERMS OF THE COMMENTS THAT WERE SAID TODAY, IN PARTICULAR, SIMPLIFICATION, TO ADDRESS THE TOWER, COLUMNS, AND AUTOMOBILE ACCESS TO THE GARAGE, WHICH MAY REQUIRE REDESIGN OF THE FLOOR PLAN, AND SHOW HOW TREES WILL BE PLACED ON BOTH SIDES OF THE PROPERTY FOR SCREENING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SHAW.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B30-03 Pool House

Applicant:	William and Katherine Rayner
Address:	215 Coral Lane and 216 Emerald Lane
Architect:	Peter Marino Architect
Project Description:	"Pool house (accessory structure) and swimming pool; materials include stucco at building walls, barrel tile roof, lime stone columns and building trim."

There were no ex-parte communications relating to this project.

Architect George Restreppo said the owner's plan to combine this lot with their property in order to build a 3,000 s.f. pool house. The building materials included green glazed barrel roofing material, salmon color stucco walls, and buff color carved stone.

Landscape Architect John Lang indicated that the site has 15 feet tall ficus hedges making

the property almost invisible from the road.

Mr. Hoffman questioned the height of the one-story building. Mr. Frank acknowledged that it is taller than what the code allows, but the project could be approved with the provision that it will meet the code. Mr. Hoffman also commented that the scale of this project is quite different from the two-story homes on either side. The glossy green roof tile may be very striking, but again, is quite different from what is next door. Some of the windows appear large with the Venetian over panels, and the building has large surfaces of blank walls. Mr. Zukov remarked that this project had no relationship to the main house. He reminded the architect that every house is analyzed without landscaping. Mr. Moore assured the Commission that staff would make sure the project meets the one-story criterum. Mr. Shaw did not object to the style of the house, but objected to the height, the proportion, and thought that it needed to be completely redesigned. Mr. Wheelock noticed that the site plan indicated site walls, gates, and off-street parking, (excluding a garage), Mr. Strawbridge liked the idea of the project, but not the size. Mr. Wideman thought this project was totally dissimilar to anything on the street because it had a commercial appearance, and would not be viewed as house from the street.

MOTION BY MR. SHAW TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE MAY MEETING FOR RESTUDY AND TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Strawbridge stated that every rule was made to be broken and felt this project was one of them. The size is large, but the style, color and materials are good enough. Consequently, Mr. Randolph thought the architect may need additional direction. The architect was advised to restudy the size of this project, the scale of the elements, (especially the windows), and the shinny green tile roofing material.

B31-03 Demolition and Landscape

Applicant: Stanley and Roberta Bogen
Address: 1562 South Ocean Boulevard
Landscape Designer: Mario Nievrera
Project Description: "Demolish current structure. Landscape per the attached plan."

There were no ex-parte communications disclosed regarding the project.

Attorney Jackie Miller presented photographs of the home they request to demolish. The town records indicated the initial building permit was issued in 1957. The house was designed by Charles E. Toth of Delray Beach. Permits for roof replacement were issued

in 1983 and 1994 and an air-conditioning unit was replaced in 1997. The intention is to demolish the house on this lot and enhance the vista of the landmarked house behind it.

Landscape Designer Mario Nievera said the property wall and pier detail will match the existing wall to the north. Gates will lead into a meandering driveway through lawn to an existing motor court. Coconut palms and green island ficus will line South Ocean Boulevard.

MOTION BY DR. ROSENBERG TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED (WITH THE USUAL CONDITIONS TO SOD OR SEED AND IRRIGATE THE LOT WITHIN 15 DAYS).

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WHEELLOCK.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Note: The landscape designer was notified that he may have to present this proposal to the Landmarks Commission.

C. DEFERRALS AND CONTINUATIONS MINOR PROJECTS

None

D. NEW BUSINESS - MINOR PROJECTS

A14-03 Exterior Lighting

Applicant: Clarke Avenue Investments, Inc.
Address: 180 Barton Avenue
Landscape Architect: Clifford Leisinger
Project Description: "Six (6) exterior light fixtures proposed: one fixture on top of one column for total of six."

There were no ex-parte communications disclosed regarding this project.

Landscape Architect Cliff Leisinger presented elevation drawings of six existing entry piers with the proposed black light fixtures on top of each column.

Some debate took place about the width of the light fixtures.

**MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WHEELOCK.**

ROLL CALL:

MR. ZUKOV	YES
MR. WHEELOCK	YES
DR. ROSENBERG	NO
MR. SHAW	NO
MR. HOFFMAN	YES
MR. STRAWBRIDGE	NO
MR. WIDEMAN	YES

MOTION CARRIED 4-3.

A16-03 Landscape & Hardscape

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Peter Henderson
Address: 238 Plantation Road
Landscape Architect: Steven Dauber/Life Force Nurseries
Project Description: "Landscape/hardscape."

Mr. Wheelock said he visited the site.

Landscape Architect Steven Dauber described the landscape design as refined functionality. He commented that the lot was not very large and the house was quite substantial. The owner's wanted as much play area as possible for their children. A border hedge will surround the entire property. Two entry columns with lights will be set back from the road about 12 feet. Most of the planting area will be around the front entry. The driveway material will be a dark charcoal colored tumble pavers.

**MOTION BY MR. WHEELOCK TO APPROVE THE PROJECT SUBJECT TO
THE EAST HEDGE BEING INSTALLED AT SEVEN FEET HIGH.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

A17-03 Landscape

Applicant: Euro-Homes V, Inc.
Address: 412 Australian Avenue
Architect: Lang Design Group
Project Description: "Final landscape."

Mr. Wheelock said he visited the site.

Landscape Architect John Lang pointed out that little has changed from the preliminary landscaping presentation. Coconut palm trees will contribute to the screening of second floor windows and a ficus hedge will screen the first floor windows from the condominium next door. He presented an overlay drawing of the landscaping from the street view and at the front of the house.

**MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WHELOCK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

VII OTHER BUSINESS

Mr. Moore announced that a workshop meeting is planned, for new commission members and to refresh the memories of current members, regarding Conflict of Interests, Ex-parte Communications, etc.

IX ADJOURNMENT

**MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 11:11 A.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WHELOCK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

The next meeting of the Architectural Review Commission will be held on Wednesday, May 28, 2003 at 9:00 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "F. Wideman, Jr.", with a large, sweeping flourish at the end.

Floyd L. Wideman, Jr., Vice-Chairman