



MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
IN THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

WEDNESDAY, MAY 25, 2011, 9:00 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be “abbreviated” in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town’s website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording of the meeting by contacting Cindy Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER (9:00:13 a.m.)

Chairman Smith called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL (9:00:19 a.m.)

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman	PRESENT
Robert J. Vila, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Member	PRESENT
Henry Homes III, Member	PRESENT
Alex Hufty Griswold, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Staff members present were: John C. Randolph, Town Attorney, John Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, Paul Brazil, Director of Public Works, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE APRIL 27, 2011 MEETING (9:01:04 a.m.)

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA :** (9:01:17 a.m.)

Mr. Smith announced that if any persons were present for the 947 North Ocean Boulevard project, a deferral has been requested.

MOTION BY MR. VILA FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI. **ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY** (9:01:53 a.m.)

Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and as necessary throughout the meeting.

VII. **OTHER BUSINESS:** (9:02:06 a.m.) None

VIII. **PROJECT REVIEW** (9:02:12 a.m.)

A. **MAJOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS**

B - 013 - 2011 New Residence

Address: 221 Jamaica Lane

Applicant: Licinio Cruz

Architect: Roger Janssen of Daily Janssen Architects

Project Description: Proposed new two-story residence with 4,051 air conditioned square feet with entry gate, pool, hardscape and landscape on vacant lot at 221 Jamaica Lane; Roof: white flat cement tile; Building Color: Off-white; Trim Color: White; Shutter Color: Black-Green

Please note that this project was heard at the April meeting and was deferred for re-study.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations

Architect Roger Janssen returned to the commission with revised plans, subsequent to re-study of the project at the request of the commission. He reviewed the changes to the drawings some of which are: fenestration changes on multiple elevations; elimination of two decorative chimneys; change some shutters to Bahama shutters; add more Colonial shutters; lowered ridge of west second floor wing; removed stucco lap siding on second floor; reduced size of dormer on garage wing; lowered entry gate by 1 ft., and changed bottom of gate to transparent pickets; and, re-visited generator location, but still in same location on plans. Chuck Yanette of Parker Yanette Design Group stated that no landscape changes were made since the last meeting.

Commission comments: The changes made respond to feedback from last meeting; dormer at garage appears to be too high and close to the ridge; wonderful job; improved; perhaps move the generator; what about the drainage issues on this site?

Mr. Janssen testified that the drainage plans had been re-visited, and they were found to exceed the requirements of the Town and the South Florida Water Management District. All water will be held on the property.

Commission comments continued: Still oppose the dormers; house is maxed out and you are inserting windows in garage upper level in order to use it as a room...this is an attempt to circumvent the code...will vote against it unless you remove the dormers...the dormers do not add any aesthetic value to the project; Roger's architectural signature element is dormers, and by

removing them, you take away from his own signature; our goal is to determine the best architecture, not to presume guilt.

Mr. Lindgren read an e-mail into the record which had been forwarded to him by Tom Parker. The author of the e-mail, David Barton, expressed concern about excessive lot coverage at this project, and concerns about Town infrastructure. Tom Parker, 215 Jamaica Lane, offered his comments relative to this generator location and its manufactured spec information relative to noise, and broadly to all existing generators in the Town, especially with regard to their locations and the noise generated by them. Mr. Parker maintained that it is not appropriate to grandfather nuisance. Robin Weeks, 210 Jamaica Lane, registered her objections to the gate as she felt it was not appropriate for the neighborhood. She agreed that the dormers at the garage will lead to a usable room.

Discussion turned back to the drainage issues on Jamaica Lane. Mr. Lindgren read from a storm water analysis report provided by a civil engineer which indicated that the drainage at this site will be improved by the development of the site. Paul Brazil, Director of Public Works, testified that water may pond longer on Jamaica Lane, but it is no more subject to flooding than anywhere else in Town; that our systems handle one inch per hour, and when that is exceeded anywhere in Town for an extended period of time, there will be flooding; that water in the street is not considered as flooding; water in the garage and house is defined as flooding by the Town; that the Town's level of service is designed to keep water out of houses; that every developed site needs to retain the first 2" of water and send any excess out to the road to be collected by the storm system, so there is no impact to neighbors; and, that development on this lot will help the situation. Ms. Weeks questioned who inspects the exfiltration trenches because they often fill with leaves and deter proper drainage. Mr. Randolph advised that drainage is outside the purview of ARCOM.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED 5-2, WITH MR. SMITH AND MRS. VANNECK OPPOSED.

[B - 014 - 2011 Demolition of Guest House, Gates and Piers](#)

Address: 854 S. County Road

Applicant: Joel Kasewitz

Architect: Roger Janssen of Dailey Janssen Architects

Project Description: Demolition of existing two-story guest house (3,384 total square feet, with 2,178 air conditioned square feet); New piers and entry gates for existing residence - entry piers to be stucco over CMU and the entry gates will be iron wrapped in cedar with iron details

Please note that this project was reviewed at the April meeting. The demolition was approved with the condition that the applicant provide photos of the interior spaces and exterior of the structure. The gate was reviewed, but deferred to the May meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Roger Janssen stated that he re-visited the gate design and changed it to an open air spindle design, cypress, all painted white, now elegant and simplified.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

[B - 021 - 2011 Motorized Gate: exterior finishes; landscape/hardscape changes](#)

Address: 1090 North Lake Way

Applicant: 1090 North Lake Way LLC

Architect: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, AIA, PA

Project Description: Replace existing cast stone cladding with travertine cladding. Limited hardscape and landscape changes. New motorized vehicular gate. Additional minor exterior finish revisions.

Please note that at the April meeting there was a motion to approve the stone choices, the landscape plan, and driveway plan, but to come back for further re-study of the gate, the panel above the front door, and the inserts in the railings.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations

Thomas Kirchhoff, Architect, introduced Bill Sofield, Designer. He requested a small teak gate at the bike path, and the two panel main gate, now in grey and white (formerly one panel was blue). Mr. Sofield stated that this house design does not include draperies. As such, the applicant wishes to maintain privacy with the addition of the proposed panel and inserts at the railings. He presented two options for the large front opening: a panel floating within the opening, and, a translucent glass infill. At the railings, the stucco wall will be raised with a much smaller (not as tall) railing portion on top of the wall for privacy.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT WITH THE SOLID PANEL IN THE FRONT AND ON THE BALCONIES.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

[B - 023 - 2011 Demolition; Construction of new residence](#)

Address: 445 Antigua Lane

Applicant: 416 Brazilian Avenue LLC

Architect: Roger Janssen with Dailey Janssen Architects, P.A.

Project Description: Demolition of existing residence, pool and hardscape; Construct new Island Colonial two-story residence, guest house, pool, hardscape and landscape; Roof: Cedar Shake; Building Color: white; Trim Color: buff; Shutter Color: white

Please note that at the April meeting, there was a motion to defer the project for further study of detailing of the facades, especially the lakeside facade. There was also a motion for approval of the demolition with the usual conditions for sodding and irrigating, plus a requirement for photo documentation of the interior and exterior.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: All members, excepting Mr. Gruss, made ex parte declarations.

Roger Janssen reported that subject to last month's demolition approval, the building has been razed and the site is being cleared. Mr. Janssen stated that in revising the project, he attempted to respond to the comments made at the last meeting; and, that he has met with the neighbors immediately to the east, the Metzgers, and their architect, Gene Pandula. He proceeded to outline the changes made since the last meeting: Abandoned proposal relative to resurface of the cul de sac and creation of an island in the cul de sac; abandoned proposed front parallel parking spaces

lining the cul de sac, pulling the wall to the street; and, relocated the four air conditioning units elsewhere on the site, leaving only the generator in the original equipment yard, 30 ft. from the property line.

At this point, Mr. Randolph interjected a reminder to the ARCOM members that when declaring ex parte communications, members are to announce the fact that they had spoken with someone and also declare the subject matter of that conversation. Mr. Smith attempted to clarify the ex parte declarations on behalf of all ARCOM members.

Roger Janssen continued with his presentation. He noted that there are two existing drainage easements which are in the process of being reconfigured. Public Works is in agreement with the proposals and the corresponding paperwork is in process. After studying other Lake Trail homes, Mr. Janssen proceeded with a justification for the site planning of the project. The design, as stated last month, is focused upon views of the beautiful Kapok tree on the property at the south property line. He indicated that since last month, the project has been revised to effectively pull the north wing back 9 ft. from its previous location (in footprint 4 ft.); eliminated cantilevered balconies at family room wing; reduced plan area of loggia by 4 ft., narrowed the whole north wing by 3 ft., and lowered its roof; widened the guesthouse for better proportion, lowered it by 1 ft., and pulled it back 3 ft. from the setback line; eliminated balcony at center of home; change two front balconies to hip roofs; reduced total square footage by 1000 sq. ft.; reconfigured guesthouse stair and changed balcony supports; coquina surrounds and keystones re-visited and simplified; simplified main entrance to make front and rear more similar; shutters are white instead of blue; second floor glass room eliminated; fenestration changes; garage doors changed to white; revised chimney detail on north wing, and other details and changes as stated.

Chuck Yanette of Parker Yanette testified that the landscape plan has experienced only minor changes since last month: the elimination of the island in the cul de sac; elimination of parking spaces at the cul de sac; landscaped property wall relocated closer to the drive; Coconut Palms added to south property; pathway added from new parking area to fountain at front door area; and, simple, low fountain at entrance walkway set in rubble with Old Chicago brick border.

Mr. Lindgren read an e-mail into the record from Vicki Halmos in opposition to the project.

M. Timothy Hanlon, attorney for the property owner, made several comments: that no variances are necessary for this project; that the utility easement issues are being worked out with Public Works... that Public Works supports the project...and that, an application has been made for Town Council approval of the utility easement abandonment; and, that an approval today is requested conditioned upon approval of the utility abandonment application. Mr. Hanlon stated that the property owners have spent a great deal of time meeting with various Town departments, ARCOM members, and neighbors. Over seventy (70) changes have been made since the last ARCOM meeting. They have gone out of their way to make this an appealing project for the neighborhood...one that in fact replaces a neglected home with this beautiful project that meets all code requirements. He requested that ARCOM respect the constitutional rights of this property owner to develop and build this home consistent with Town code.

Architect Eugene Pandula, assisting the Metzgers, thanked Roger Janssen for meeting with them and making some corresponding changes. Mr. Pandula discussed the originally proposed changes to the cul de sac which affects the Metzger property as well; the utility easement issue (that easement also on the Metzger property); the issue of size and positioning of the building; the fact that the Metzgers, when their home is built, will face the mechanical equipment, generator, and

garage at 445 Antigua when they wish to view their own landmarked tree; that the Metzgers, when they build their home, will be limited to approximately 5,100 sq.ft. in R-B zoning, in comparison to the R-A zoning at 445 Antigua Lane which allows the size of the structure being proposed; and, that the mass of the garage can easily be reduced by lowering the ceiling height by 2-3 feet.

Susie Elson, 180 Cocoanut Row, offered comments in opposition to the size of this home in comparison to the small mass of the neighborhood.

Anne Metzger, adjacent property owner to east (vacant lot), read two letters into the record: one from Thomas Pournaras, 409 Antigua Lane, supporting “understated elegance” in Palm Beach, and supporting a compromise that would keep the beauty of Antigua Lane intact; and, a second note from Hope Gropper, 417 Antigua Lane, stating concerns about mass and size of the project. Calla Guild, 10 South Lake Trail, testified that she is less concerned with the size of the house, and more concerned about the forward (westward) positioning of the guesthouse, that will block their view and airflow. Bill Metzger, testified that he has met with the developer, the architect, various neighbors, Town PZ&B staff, the Town Public Works staff, ARCOM members, and the Mayor relative to this project. Despite the changes made since last month, Mr. Metzger still expressed concern regarding mass and size of the project; maintained that the transition between the R-A zoning to R-B zoning should be graceful; expressed concern about the relationship of this house to the view westward; expressed concern about setting precedent for maximum mass; requested that roof heights be re-defined, that there be view relief, that the garage height be lowered, and that the generator location be changed. Mr. Metzger maintained that this “spec house” continues to be driven by mass and size. He noted that the Antigua Lane neighbors might have approved of the improvements to the cul de sac, had they been consulted earlier. Lastly, he asked that the project be made to respect the character and fabric of the neighborhood.

Mr. Gruss inquired as to why Mr. Metzger refers to the “developers” and calls it a “spec house”. Mr. Metzger replied that the owners have told him that they do not intend to live in the house, but instead intend to sell it. Chairman Smith cautioned that that is not the concern of ARCOM.

Mr. Page advised that any approval should be conditioned upon satisfaction of the easement issue to the Town Council.

Mr. Janssen offered some remarks in rebuttal to statements made earlier. He noted that the living area of the home is 13,243 square feet, plus a 1000 sq. ft. garage, and open covered areas for a total of approximately 15,700 sq. ft. The main volume of the building is in the center of the lot.

Suzanne Frisbee, property owner, thanked the ARCOM members for meeting with them and providing constructive comments. She referred to Mr. Metzger’s remarks about what neighbors owe each other in terms of level of care, and displayed photographs of the Metzger’s vacant lot. With regard to the proposed garage height, Mrs. Frisbee defended the height proposed which allows for automobile collections. She noted that most lakefront homes are significantly larger than those along the streets that lead up to the lakefront. Mrs. Frisbee discussed the meetings she had with other neighbors on the street, and the results of those meetings.

David Frisbee, 439 Worth Avenue, property owner, thanked everyone for the time and effort devoted to this project. Mr. Frisbee gave high praise to the architectural skills of Mr. Janssen, and noted that he (Mr. Frisbee) has built 6 homes on the island and values good architecture. Sometimes Mr. Frisbee lives in the built home, and sometimes a family member lives in the

homes he has built. With regard to 445 Antigua Lane, Mr. Frisbee stated that it has such incredible thought and detail and again praised Mr. Janssen to the highest. Mr. Frisbee noted that the architect has not maximized the home, which could be as large as 17,400 sq. ft. Great architecture and landscaping has been prioritized in this design, with great attention to outdoor living spaces, and the design is very considerate of the Palm Beach community at large.

Executive Session Comments: Perhaps lower the garage wing to reduce the impact; the applicant has made significant strides since last month; like the simplified drawings; lakefront homes average 10,000 to 13,000 sq. ft., so the size is in line; slightly reserved on size of guesthouse; architects have done sensitive job of addressing ARCOM's concerns; this is a Lake Trail home and it must be in harmony with the lakefront; very favorable to the project...they've improved a great deal; tremendous improvement; examine lowering the garage wing; good job pulling it back and restraining; it's a lakefront property; they've done a great job and ARCOM did a great job...ARCOM suggestions were executed and now it is so much better; the guesthouse should be totally screened from the neighbor; it's a lakefront property and they have a right to build a certain size as long as it works aesthetically; it's an interesting design with great respect for the Kapok tree.

**MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, PENDING
RESOLUTION OF THE EASEMENT ISSUES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Let the record show that there was a short recess at 11:20 a.m. The meeting reconvened at 11:27 a.m.

B - 025 - 2011 Additions and Renovations

Address: 256 West Indies Drive

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Peter Hicks

Architect: Carlos A. Bonilla with Bonilla Torregroza Architecture LLC

Original Project Description: One-story garage and entry porch additions; master and guest bedroom renovations

Updated Project Description: Addition of new one story entry porch, master bedroom suite and guest bedroom suite. Extension of existing kitchen and garage and general interior renovations. Also, a new 60kw generator.

Please note that this project was on the April agenda, but was deferred to May at the applicant's request.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations. Mrs. Vanneck recused herself because of a previously declared Voting Conflict. Mr. Gruss voted in her stead.

Carlos Bonilla, Architect, and Steve Dauber, Landscape Architect, presented the request as outlined above. Mr. Smith asked Mr. Bonilla to limit his presentation to only that which can be seen from the public right of way. The front elevation evidences the new one story entry porch, and the kitchen and garage extensions, as well as some fenestration changes. Mr. Dauber presented the preliminary landscape plan only. He explained that the continuity of Royal Palm trees on this street will be maintained at this site, and one Royal Palm will be added in the west

corner. Two old black olives in the front yard will be removed. The 16kw generator is located in the back yard behind a wall with noise abatement.

Mr. Lindgren read an e-mail from David G. Ober (248 West Indies Dr.) objecting to any removal of the Royal Palm trees on the street.

Attorney Greg Kino, on behalf of his clients, the Vannecks, thanked the applicant for the re-design and for their respect of the established setbacks and rhythm of trees along the street.

MOTION BY MR. VILA FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, COMMENDING THE ARCHITECT AND THE OWNERS FOR MAKING THOSE CHANGES, WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE ROYAL PALMS BE RESTORED AS DISCUSSED BY THE VERY NICE LETTER FROM THE NEIGHBOR.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. [MAJOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS \(11:31:44 a.m.\)](#)

[B - 027 - 2011 Gate](#)

Address: 1226 North Lake Way

Applicant: Barbara J. Swanson

Architect: James Minges

Project Description: Installation of gate at service entrance constructed of pecky cypress to match existing

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Messrs. Homes and Griswold made ex parte declarations.

Roger Hansrote, representing Mr. Minges, presented the gate request for a solid wood gate with hardware at the service entrance, which matches (material and hardware) an existing gate at the site. To the left of the gate, the existing landscape buffer will be maintained.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

[B - 028 -2011 Parking lot lighting](#)

Address: 2840 S. Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: Royal Saxon

Contractor: Sullivan Electric & Pump, Inc.

Project Description: Parking lot lighting changing from fluorescent light bulbs to metal halide and changing from 150 watts to 250 watts. The increase of lighting will help in security reasons.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Gary Sullivan of Sullivan Electric and Pump provided the presentation on behalf of the condominium association. The light change is being requested to provide more safety and security in the parking lot which has, at present, an extremely low light level. Mr. Sullivan showed photos of the existing and proposed fixtures. A total of nine (9) new fixtures at 250 watts each will be applied to the existing poles.

Mr. Lindgren noted that he was in receipt of a petition by 50 residents of the Royal Saxon opposing the project, and approximately 20 additional letters from Royal Saxon residents opposing the project. Mr. Lindgren read the petition into the record. This opposition group has a short presentation today. (It was noted that there are a total of 141 owners at the Royal Saxon.)

Mr. Gruss commented that the ARCOM meeting is not an appropriate venue for internal condominium disputes.

Richard Pirozzoli, Board member at the Royal Saxon, stated that if there is going to be a change, it should be a positive change, for efficient, shielded lighting. The proposed lights are not efficient and allow upward waste. The President of the condo board, Ed Shipek, was present and testified that the board approved the proposed fixture 7-1.

Mr. Smith stated that the proposed fixture is neither an improvement, nor an enhancement, and recommended that they return with a better solution that the residents agree upon.

**MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JUNE MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.**

Mr. Smith noted that if an additional deferral is needed, the applicant, at the June meeting, should be prepared to request the appropriate month to which the matter should be deferred.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

After the vote, Marianne Beyl, a resident at the Royal Saxon, asked to be heard. She objected to the proposed project and asked that the project be deferred to the November meeting. Mr. Smith advised that the applicant has been told to return with a consensus of the property owners relative to this issue.

[B - 029 - 2011 New residence](#)

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 947 North Ocean Boulevard (includes 955 N. Ocean Blvd.)

Applicant: 1200 South Ocean Boulevard, LLC

Architect: Peter Zimmerman Architects Inc.

Project Description: Proposed is a single family two story dwelling totaling 17,370 square feet with attached two car garage situated on a double lot. The British Colonial style dwelling proposed will have a light yellow stucco facade and white trim with black shutters and a red clay tile roof. The project will include a tennis court, tennis loggia, and swimming pool. A final landscape and hardscape plan will be presented by Sanchez & Maddux.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication

Variance Information: The applicant is proposing to construct a new two-story residence containing 17,370 sq. ft. on two lots on the Atlantic Ocean. The project will also include a basement (non-habitable) of 7,171 sq. ft. and a below-grade tennis loggia of 888 sq. ft. There will be a generator with a capacity of over 100kw in the basement. The applicant is requesting a point of measurement variance, a building height variance, and a front yard setback variance.

Please note that the applicant has requested deferral to the June meeting.

**MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JUNE MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. GRISWOLD.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B - 030 - 2011 Addition

Address: 614 Tarpon Way

Applicant: Violet Hill Development Ltd.

Architect: Ralph Cantin AIA

Project Description: Two-story addition on south (side) of house to match existing colors, materials and impact windows

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Messrs. Homes and Griswold made ex parte declarations.

Ralph Cantin presented this request for a simple addition of an elevator and a closet, with all materials to match the existing home.

**MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Let the record show that Mr. Vila left the meeting at 12:00 p.m. Mr. Gruss will vote in his stead.

B - 031 - 2011 Facade & entry modification

Address: 232 Garden Road

Applicant: Michael & Kyle Han

Architect: Brower Architectural Associates

Project Description: Modification of front facade gable and entry

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Messrs. Homes and Griswold made ex parte declarations.

Architect Raphael Saladrigas presented this project as described above. Only the street façade will be modified to enhance the Bermuda style. Proposed changes include: Eliminate belt courses, reconfigure gable roof to Flemish type; simplify window sills, reconfigure covered front entry; new smaller steps, new balcony railing design, fenestration changes, change plastic gable louver to a light; new shutters; chimney cap changes; and, wrought aluminum glass front door.

**MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B - 032 - 2011 New residence

Address: 210 Emerald Lane

Applicant: 210 Emerald Lane, LLC

Architect: Michael J. Johnson

Project Description: Construction of a 5,400 +/- sq. ft. two-story family residence. Roof: White concrete tile; Building Color: Yellow; Trim Color: White; Shutter Color: White Owner requests final approval of new home and the landscape plan.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations

Let the record show that Mr. Griswold declared a voting conflict with regard to this project as the applicant is a family member. (Voting Conflict form on file).

Mrs. Delp advised that Mr. Gruss and Mr. Knowles will be voting relative to this project.

Attorney M. Timothy Hanlon testified that the project received site plan approval from the Town Council at the March meeting, subject to seven (7) conditions set forth in a letter agreement signed by the property owner and two neighbors (Klein and Krakoff) who had originally objected to the application.

Architect Michael Johnson introduced Daniel Menard of LaBerge and Menard Architects who provided the presentation for this very symmetrical Bermuda style home with a pool in the rear. The design includes a driveway and garage on the west side of the property toward the front of the house, the main entrance on the east side of the home, open loggia to the south side facing the pool, second floor terrace at front of house, second story pushed back in two steps, shutters, quoins, wooden impact windows painted white, cement tile roof, and traditional garage doors facing west.

Alan Stopek of Efflorescence presented a preliminary landscape/hardscape plan only. Elements included at this stage of planning include: Drainage plans, driveway on west side, ten foot (10') hedges on west, south and east sides most likely in Podocarpus or Clusia, Alexander Palms, large expanse of lawn in front, Coconut Palms, underplantings, specimen Ficus, pathways, cast stone pool deck, minimal organized planting at pool area, and assorted palms and other plant species as noted on the plans.

Attorney Hanlon testified that he was just informed that the owners had met with Mrs. Krakoff yesterday and those parties have agreed to a minimum 5 ft. fence on the two sides and the rear.

Lastly, Mr. Menard presented a 3-D presentation of the proposed house.

Commission comments: Very attractive, sensitive...good garage location...likes the front terrace and the step back of second floor; excessive number of quoins; don't like design between first and second floor...looks commercial; odd that there are two French doors in garage; two French doors are hanging up in the air...not believable; whole front facade looks commercial; no sense of arrival at front door...perhaps add terrace and balustrade; address detail on niche over loggia; canopy over door on side is too high; question site data, especially in rear...looks like too much hardscape; what kind of fence; Clusia probably better than Podocarpus; garage doors probably won't be seen; front...square pilasters, in rear...columns; and, like the French doors and like the garage doors on the side.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION FAILED 3-4, WITH MR. ZUKOV, MRS. VANNECK, MR. GRUSS, AND MR. SMITH OPPOSED.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO NEXT MONTH AND ASKING THE ARCHITECT TO RETURN WITH SOME CHANGES PURSUANT TO OUR RECOMMENDATIONS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 033 - 2011 Porch modification

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 230 S. Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: John Ceriale

Architect: Jose Andrew Gonzalez, Gonzalez Architects

Project Description: Modify existing rear porch into loggia to match existing residence

Variance information: Applicant requests a lot coverage variance and a street side yard setback variance

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Griswold made an ex parte declaration

Jose Gonzalez presented this request as described above. He explained that the rear terrace had been added twenty (20) years ago, and now the owner would like a loggia in that location over the entire rear terrace.

Commission comments: You should limit the loggia to only the portion of the terrace that the existing awning covers now, and not wrap it around; if you do the smaller loggia, you may not need any variances.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK APPROVING THE LOGGIA ONLY GOING FROM THE CORNER OF THE MAIN STRUCTURE BACK.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK RECOMMENDING TO THE TOWN COUNCIL THAT THE IMPLEMENTATION OF A VARIANCE FOR LOT COVERAGE WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACT TO THE SUBJECT PROPERTY, IF NEEDED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 034 - 2011 Demolition and New residence

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 760 North Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: Palm Beach Country Club

Architect: Youchak & Youchak, Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of an existing two-story 1,500 sq. ft. house (a/k/a 851 North Lake Way) and replace with a new 5,581 sq. ft. two-story house with pool and landscaping. New house roof: Cedar Shingle; Building Color: Sage; Trim Color: White/Sage. Demolition to commence after approval and issuance of permit

Variance information: Applicant requests a front yard setback/building height plan setback variance and an angle of vision variance.

Let the record show that Mr. Gruss declared a voting conflict with regard to this project as he is a member of the Palm Beach Country Club. (Voting Conflict form on file)

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None declared

Attorney Maura Ziska made a correction to the square footage of the proposed house to be 5,100 sq. ft. (Please note that the ARCOM application filed with the Town indicated a square footage of 5, 581 sq. ft.)

Thomas Youchak, Architectural Engineer, provided a history relative to the Palm Beach Country Club and the subject house, provided a history of changes to the subject house over the years, and, provided a demolition report which assessed the structural condition of the home as one which is in a poor state of repair and needing extensive restoration.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL TO DEMOLISH THE HOUSE WITH THE CAVEAT FOR SODDING, AND PROVIDING THAT ALL THE REQUIRED PHOTOGRAPHS ARE PROVIDED FOR THE ARCHIVES.

Mr. Lindgren noted that the demolition report (with photos) provided by Mr. Youchak was excellent and a model for others to follow. Mr. Lindgren also requested a condition of approval requiring a state certified archaeologist on site during the excavation and/or demolition.

**MOTION SECONDED BY MESSRS. ZUKOV AND HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

As for the new house, it is proposed for the General Manager of the club and his family. It must be hidden from the golf course and street as much as possible using landscaping and design; it must be bound on the east side by a fairway; and, it must be designed for a family of five, with a three car garage, for two cars and a golf cart. Elements of the design include: New house is 117 ft. in length along the street; setback from street 19.5 ft. instead of 44 “ (existing house); mahogany doors, permeable pavers, cedar shake shingles, smooth siding on first floor, 4” Hardi-board octagonal siding on upper levels, dentil detailing, copper gutters and downspouts, 9 over 9 windows, and dormer windows.

Commission comments: Why not flip the house?; the house is very long and should be hidden more from the road; the existing hedge is not successful in obscuring the house from the road.

Jeff Blakely, Landscape Architect, reviewed the landscape plan. He explained that the hedge in front of the home is 9 ft. in height, and the house emerges from that. Existing Sabal Palms will be retained as well as existing golf course trees. Flowering trees and hibiscus will be utilized in the plan as well.

Commission comments continued: At 5500 square feet, you can’t call it a cottage anymore; because of the height of the structure (41 ft.) , this will be more of a presence than you think; you need to screen it more...it is very linear and the roof is very high; give us just a glimpse of the roof only; add much more landscaping...Sabal Palms do not mitigate the height; 12’ to 15’ hedges would be better, but make it more interesting than just a plain hedge; the architecture is refreshing; and, what about lowering the roof line where there is not a second story. Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator, advised that the sight triangle can be reduced to allow for more landscaping. Mr. Youchak responded that he would be happy to revisit the sight triangle.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JUNE MEETING ADVISING THE APPLICANT TO RETURN WITH THE LANDSCAPE PLAN.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.**

Robert Moore, 420 Santa Fe Road, West Palm Beach, was present on behalf of the Stambaugh family. He stated that he missed the calling for public comment on the first motion for demolition. Mr. Moore explained that the existing home was considered by the Landmarks Preservation Commission, but was not placed “under consideration” by a very narrow vote. The Stambaugh family is attempting to move the existing home as they feel it is historically significant and meets at least two criteria for landmark designation. The Stambaugh family would like to request that the Country Club, despite the motion for demolition approval, hold off on the actual demolition to afford time for the building to be moved by July. Mr. Youchak stated that the Palm Beach Country Club has been working with the Stambaughs and are open to helping them in this effort, but noted that the Country Club would like to start construction in July. Joette Stambaugh Kean affirmed Mr. Moore’s remarks on behalf of the family.

Mr. Page remarked that the Palm Beach Country Club, to date, has been very cooperative with the Stambaughs and are agreeable to the structure being moved off the site if that can be arranged, but he advised against placing any artificial constraints upon them as to when they might demolish the structure.

Edward Cooney, 495 North Lake Way, Chairman of the Landmarks Preservation Commission, stated that this building has been discussed at length at the last two meetings of the LPC. In the past month, Dr. Jane Day, Town Preservation Consultant, and Mr. Cooney have met with representatives of the Country Club and they have been very cooperative and helpful. He echoed the Stambaughs concern that the building not come down while they are scrambling to make plans to move it.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IT WAS CLARIFIED THAT THE MOTION INCLUDES DEFERRAL OF CONSIDERATION OF THE VARIANCES.

(Note: At this point, Item A-007-2011 was taken out of order due to the architect’s pending travel. Please see the account of that presentation later in the minutes.)

B - 036 - 2011 Facade modifications

****ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)****

Address: 250 Royal Palm Way

Applicant: 250 RPW LLC (Anthony Cordasco)

Architect: Keith Spina, GS&P

Project Description: Refinish the exterior facades with a combination of new stucco and architectural precast concrete, including an architectural entry feature at the northwest corner. This feature is faced with stucco, architectural precast and a curtain wall glazing system. The ground floor lobby will be refinished and will include a handicap accessible new entry to the contiguous parking garage. A portion of the parking garage will be restricted to provide 2 handicap spaces resulting in a loss of 3 existing spaces.

Variance information: Applicant requests a setback variance for the front, east street side yard, and west street side yard; a variance relative to the overall height; a variance related to the number of parking spaces in relation to the

gross leasable area; a variance relative to the height of a building identification sign; and, a variance to allow a 2 ft. wide in-ground landscape strip along the walkways.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Several members made ex parte declarations.

Architect Keith Spina stated that the owners of the building are not happy with its style and want to create more interesting architecture. The project involves shifting the main pedestrian entrance to the west side of the building, refinishing the exterior facades of the building grouping the window openings, creating an entrance from the garage directly into the building, creation of two handicap parking spaces, adding landscape strips on the north and west sides, new glass corner treatment, raised tower element with signage, and, changes to vehicular entrances. Chairman Smith thanked Mr. Spina for arriving at a great solution for this building.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCE(S) WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS ON THE SUBJECT PROPERTY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 037 - 2011 Re-approval of new residence

Address: 264 Country Club Road

Applicant: JDM Investments, LLC

Architect: Keith Spina, GS&P

Project Description: Request for re-approval to construct a new two-story single family residence with two-car garage, pool and pool area trellis structures, including hardscape and landscape as previously approved in April 2010.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None declared

Without any presentation, based upon the previous approval, the following motion was made:

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

Mr. Lindgren read a letter into the record regarding this project from Ralph Del Deo relating to landscaping at the rear.

MOTION CARRIED . (Please note that the question was not called, but no objection was voiced by any of the members related to this project.)

C. **MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS:**

D. **MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS:**

A - 006 - 2011 Dormer Windows

Address: 1089 S. Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: Leonard and Lillian Schneider

Architect: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, AIA, PA

Project Description: Addition and deletion of dormer windows visible from street

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Homes made an ex parte declaration

Thomas Kirchhoff presented this request for two new dormers on the street façade and removal of the ones which are tucked into the corners.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

A - 007 - 2011 Addition to garage

Address: 263 El Pueblo Way

Applicant: Liza Pulitzer

Architect: SKA Architect + Planner/Patrick W. Segraves

Project Description: Addition of guest room/office and bathroom at existing garage to be approximately 400 square feet

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Homes made an ex parte declaration

Architect Pat Segraves presented this request for an addition as described above with wood siding, wood shingle roof, and copper gutters, noting that all details of the addition will match the existing house.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

XI. **ADJOURNMENT: (1:57:39 p.m.)**

Without benefit of a motion, members proceeded to adjourn the meeting. As that was happening, a member of the public asked to be heard and the meeting was reconvened.

IX. **COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE) (1:58:00 p.m.)**

Dustin Mizelle from Environmental Design Group requested that an item be placed on the next ARCOM agenda relative to the recently passed ordinance relative to Australian Pine tree removal by January 1, 2012. Chairman Smith agreed to add this to the next agenda.

X. **COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT:**

XI. ADJOURNMENT: (1:58:46 p.m.)

There was unanimous support to adjourn the meeting at 2:00 p.m.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on June 22, 2011 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd Floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

cmd