

**MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION MEETING
WEDNESDAY JUNE 23, 1999
TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH**

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

PRESENT:

John H. Schuler, Chairman
Ethel Kinsella, Member
Robert Deziel, Member
Eric Adams, Member
Floyd Wideman, Alternate Member
Gilbert Messing, Alternate Member
Clay C. Brooker, Attorney
Harry Ackerman, Assistant Building Official
Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator
Timothy M. Frank, Planner/Projects Coordinator
Gretchen Dayton, Recording Secretary

ABSENT:

Sally Gingras, Vice-Chairman
Lowry M. Bell, Jr., Member
Joanna Frost-Golino, Member
Marvin Rosenberg, Alternate Member

The classification of the absences for all of the Members will be un excused.

**III. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE MAY 26, 1999
MEETING.**

Mr. Schuler asked to have "Mrs." changed to "Mr." on page 29 of the minutes.

**MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM
THE MAY 23, 1999 ARCOM MEETING.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

IV. SWEARING IN OF PERSONS TESTIFYING

Persons testifying were sworn in at this time and periodically throughout the meeting.

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Bartlett Burnap, 740 Hi-Mount Road, Ferguson, Shamamian & Rattiner, requests approval of the quoins, belt course, leaderheads & downspouts that were added to the house.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO APPROVE THE CONSENT AGENDA ITEM.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

2. Martin Atkins, 201 Monterey Road, Bob Snow, gutters, trim color and exterior flood lights.

Mr. Frank felt there were too many lights on the house and suggested that the Commission review them as a minor project.

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO APPROVE THE CONSENT AGENDA ITEM WITH THE FLOOD LIGHTS TO BE REPRESENTED IF THEY ARE DESIGNED TO LIGHT THE HOUSE OR TO EXCEED WHAT IS NORMALLY APPROVED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ADAMS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI. PROJECT REVIEW

A. DEFERRALS AND CONTINUATIONS - MAJOR PROJECTS

B5-99 Addition

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Thomas P. Turchan
Address: 211 Eden Road
Architect: SKA Architect
Project Description: Addition on first and second floors

This project was deferred from the January, February, March, April and May meetings.

There were no ex-parte communication disclosures.

Architect Jackie Albarran said the proposed project will change the existing one story brick house into a two-story stucco house with the massing in the center to be sensitive to the neighbors on either side. A few feet will be added to the one car garage enabling it to accommodate two cars.

It was stated that there was no classical architectural feeling to this project. The window surrounds have a Mediterranean feel to them and the details need to be properly proportioned.

Mr. Frank said that when a lot of details are added to a modest house sometimes the style becomes contemporary.

A letter from C.H. Heiligenstein concerning the second story windows was read into the record.

Mr. Schuler said if windows add to the architecture, they should remain rather than leaving a blank wall.

Mr. Reinhard Brandner addressed the Commission at this time.

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WIDEMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B7-99 New Residence

Applicant: Mr. Hamlin Beattie
Address: 252 Kenlyn Lane
Architect: Robert Bell
Project Description: New two-story residence.

This project was deferred from the January, February, March and April meetings.

The architect requests deferral to the July meeting.

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ADAMS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B23-99 Additions

Applicant: Neil & Kathleen Elliott
Address: 222 Miraflores Drive
Architect: La Verne E. Hoon
Project Description: Foyer, entry porch and garage additions.

This project was deferred from the April and May meetings.

No one was present to represent this project.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B24-99 New Office Building

Applicant: 179 Corporation
Address: 420 Royal Palm Way
Architect: Robert Bell
Project Description: Construction of new two-story office building of approximately 12,500 square feet with an underground parking garage.

Demolition of the existing office building was approved at the April meeting.
This project was deferred from the May meeting.
The architect requests deferral to the July meeting.

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WIDEMAN.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B26-99 New Residence

Applicant: Amigo Partnership
Address: 323 Eden Road
Architect: Thomas Kirchhoff
Project Description: New two-story single family residence.

This project was deferred from the April meeting.

Mr. Wideman and Mr. Schuler said they met with the architect.

Architect Thomas Kirchhoff passed out project information sheets to the Commission Members and introduced Landscape Architect Ray Whal.

Mrs. Kinsella said she learned that if a tree is a hardwood tree it must be transplanted

to face the same direction, but the sausage tree is softwood and may face any direction after transplanting.

Mr. Whal said the circular driveway will be gravel and the tree roots will grow underneath the driveway. He said that trees have a way of finding their way around obstacles and growing into an area.

Meredith Newton representing the Palm Beach Garden Club addressed the Commission and said the tree was better left at its present location and suggested that if the tree must be moved, to add a restriction to ensure the driveway remains gravel and that the tree will be protected during the construction.

Mr. Brandner asked to have a definite plan for the location of the tree so that he as a neighbor will know what the plans are for the proposed house.

Mr. Kirchhoff said they would like to relocate the tree to the front yard.

Mr. Whal said it will be 10 to 12 weeks before the tree is ready to be moved.

It was the consensus of the Commission to move the tree first, move it only once, to design the house around the tree, and to use a gravel driveway.

Mr. Kirchhoff said the vertical columns at the corners of the house were changed to quoins and a horizontal band was added to reduce the appearance of mass. He said the square footage and CCR were reduced for this project.

Mr. Frank said the plans in the ARCOM file reflected an incorrect CCR calculation and that corrected plans were submitted the night before the meeting which did reflect a reduction of size for the proposed project.

It was stated that some of the Commission Members felt the house was too big last month. Mr. Adams felt there was too much fenestration on the rear elevation. The minutes were reviewed from last month's meeting and it was asked why an alternate sketch showing one story elements was not a presentation option as requested.

Mr. Kirchhoff said they did not do this study as they felt the entire project would be

dramatically changed and the house would be bigger overall and massive to the street.

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ADAMS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Schuler acknowledged that a letter was received from Reinhard and Claudia Brandner regarding this project.

B28-99 Demolition and New Residence

Applicant: Mr. And Mrs. Patrick Guarini
Address: 248 Southland Road
Architect: Ames Design International
Project Description: Demolition and new one-story single family residence.

This project was deferred from the April and May meetings.

Mrs. Kinsella, Mr. Schuler, Mr. Deziel, Mr. Adams and Mr. Messing said they met with Mr. Koeppel and reviewed the plans.

Attorney Joel Koeppel addressed the Commission and said the project was revised to have a pediment with an increased pitch, the proportion of the parapet was changed and lowered, the west window was removed from the front, the scale of the quoins was revised, the driveway was centered with the landscaping on either side to provide for a symmetrical facade and the double garage doors were changed to a single garage door.

Mr. Koeppel read a favorable letter from Anthony and Ingrid Morrison into the record.

Mr. Frank read a letter from Jorge Sanchez stating the project has improved and suggested using coquina for the columns.

Architect Shane Ames said the garage door was lowered to 8', the window moldings were changed to a more classical style and the landscape area was increased to 40%.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO APPROVE THE PROJECT WITH A STIPULATION THAT THERE WILL BE A DEED RESTRICTION ON THE

HEDGING AND THAT THE PLANTING SHOULD BE AT LEAST 7 FEET TALL AT PLANTING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B29-99 New Residence

Applicant: Westrend Development, Inc.
Address: 224 Barton Avenue
Architect: Schwab, Twitty & Hanser Architectural Group
Project Description: Construction of a new two-story residence.

The demolition of the existing residence was approved at the April meeting.

This project was deferred from the May meeting.

There were no ex-parte communications.

Architect Paul Twitty presented the project. He said the style of the home is Mediterranean with a colonnade leading to the front door and a garage located at the rear of the house. He presented a sample board showing clay barrel for the roofing material, coquina accents, light-green window trim, and a light beige building color. He said the average CCR for the neighborhood is 4.7. and the project CCR is 4.25.

It was stated that the front facade looks like a town house and that it could be restudied. The Commission felt the project was 10% to 15% too large for the neighborhood, that the details have a modern feel to them rather than a traditional Mediterranean look.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING TO REVISE THE FRONT FACADE AND TO REDUCE THE

**PROJECT'S FAR AND CCR TO POSSIBLY 4.0 TO 4.1 RANGE.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ADAMS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B31-99 New Residence

Applicant: 150 Dunbar Road, Inc.
Address: 150 Dunbar Road
Architect: Thomas M. Kirchhoff
Project Description: New two-story residence

This project was deferred from the May meeting.

The architect requests deferral to the July meeting.

**MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY
MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B38-99 Addition and Style Change

Applicant: Mrs. Ruby Rinker
Address: 1840 South Ocean Blvd.
Architect: Michael J. Johnson
Project Description: Add a second story to the main residence and change the architectural style of the main house and cabana from Regency to Mediterranean Revival.

This project was deferred from the May meeting.

Mr. Wideman, said he met with the architect and reviewed the plans. Mr. Deziel said he met with the contractor and reviewed the plans. Mr. Schuler said he met with the architect and the contractor. Mrs. Kinsella said she spoke on the telephone with the architect.

Architect Michael Johnson said the roof slope over the staff area is now consistent with the roof slope of the main house. The windows on the second floor were changed to three pairs of windows with an arched center grouping which will tie in with the main

entry element below. The windbreak wall will have solid masonry walls coming from each of the buildings, it will break toward an arched colonnade structure that will have roll down shutters within the arches to break the wind.

The Commission was very pleased with the revised plan and complemented the architect for listening to their suggestions.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B39-99 Addition

Applicant: Stephen F. Brauer
Address: 131 Barton Avenue
Architect: Lindley Hoffman
Project Description: Addition of a one-story, two-car garage to existing pool house.

This project was deferred from the May meeting.

Architect Lindley Hoffman presented four alternative drawings as follows:

- A. A railing which matches the railing on the existing house.
- B. A simple stucco parapet wall with piers.
- C. A higher parapet with lattice panels that will be applied to the stucco.
- D. A mansard roof element.

The Commission thanked Mr. Hoffman for doing his homework and presenting four very credible alternatives.

MOTION BY MR. DEZIEL TO APPROVE ALTERNATE DRAWING “A” AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ADAMS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B41-99 New Residence

Applicant: Three Development Company
Address: 146 Gulfstream Road
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects
Project Description: New two-story residence.

The demolition of the existing residence was approved at the May meeting.

Mr. Wideman and Mr. Schuler said they met with the architects.

Architect Harold Smith presented the project. He said the floor area of the structure was reduced from 6,683 square feet to 6,240 square feet. The FAR was reduced from 39% to 36% and the CCR was reduced from 4.1 to 3.8. Quoins were added to the corners of the house, the fascia was revised at the gable end above the entry, the oval window was replaced with a rectangular shaped window.

It was felt that the keystones with the banding over the french doors took on a Mediterranean feeling and that the keystones could be eliminated. The Commission felt the style of the architecture needs to be more imaginative for such a high profile location and that it was too big for the site. It was felt that the front door and balcony make the house look too vertical.

MOTION BY MR. DEZIEL TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ADAMS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B42-99 New Residence

Applicant: Alan Miller
Address: 261 El Bravo Way
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects
Project Description: New two-story residence.

The demolition of the existing residence was approved at the May meeting.

Mr. Schuler and Mr. Wideman said they met with the architect.

Architect Harold Smith said the proposed project will be 12,200 square feet and the floor area will be 44.5%. The building will have a light textured stucco finish, a 4/12 pitch roof with a variegated clay barrel tile roofing material and natural finish mahogany impact resistant windows. The beam heights will be at 23' with the exception of 25' for the entry beam. The fascia bands and outlookers will be stone and the entry surround will be cast stone. The railing on the rear elevation was changed from a stone baluster to a decorative black aluminum railing.

Some of the Commission Members felt the proposed project was about 25% too big for the neighborhood.

MOTION BY MR. ADAMS TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. DEZIEL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B43-99 New Residence

Applicant:	Windsor Homes, Inc.
Address:	225 Cherry Lane
Architect:	Smith and Moore Architects
Project Description:	New one-story residence with a two-car garage and pool.

This project was deferred from the May meeting.

Mr. Wideman and Mr. Schuler said they met with the architect and Mr. Deziel said he met and received a letter from the owner.

Architect Jon Moore presented the project. He said the lot coverage was decreased from last month's presentation from 34.7% to 33.4%. The proposed building color was changed from a yellow beige to a silver beige.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.

**MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B45-99 Additions and Entrance Redesign

Applicant: Leigh Larmoyeux
Address: 259 Clarke Avenue
Architect: Randall Dubois
Project Description: Pergola and covered walkway addition, laundry room addition
and entrance facade redesign.

This project was deferred from the May meeting.
Mr. Schuler said he met with the architect.

Architect Joseph Publione presented the project and said the entry portico will be
stucco with a cast stone banding.

**MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS
PRESENTED.**

**MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WIDEMAN.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

A lunch break was called at 12:30 p.m. and the meeting was reconvened at 1:30 p.m.

B. NEW BUSINESS - MAJOR PROJECTS

B47-99 Demolition New Residence

Applicant: Tom Turner
Address: 579 North Lake Way
Architect: SKA Architect & Planner
Project Description: Demolition of existing residence and construction of a new
residence

Staff recommends deferral as the project requires site plan review.

**MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY
MEETING.**

**MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B48-99 Demolition

Applicant: George and Nancy T. Montgomery
Address: 249 Oleander Avenue
Project Description: Demolition of existing single family structure

Don Grille representing Heritage76 Contracting Corporation said the applicants live next door and they purchased the property with the intention of landscaping it.

Mr. Frank said they have the proper demolition letter and photographs in the file.

**MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO APPROVE DEMOLITION WITH THE
PROVISION TO SOD OR SEED THE VACANT LOT WITHIN 90 DAYS.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WIDEMAN.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B49-99 Relocation of Guesthouse

Applicant: Robert G. Markey, trustee
Address: 1440 South Ocean Blvd.
Architect: Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: Relocation of a guesthouse from 1415 South Ocean Boulevard to 1440 South Ocean Blvd.

Mr. Deziel previously declared a Conflict of Interest and left the meeting during the presentation.

This item was heard after item #A22-99.

Architect Jeffrey Smith said his client would like to take the existing guesthouse and move it across the street to the lake front property. He said they received approval for the demolition of the main house on this lot.

Mr. Smith was advised that a Unity of Title will have to be recorded or a garage will need to be constructed on the lake front property.

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO APPROVE THE PROJECT WITH THE PROVISION TO RECORD A UNITY OF TITLE OR CONSTRUCT A GARAGE ON THE PROPERTY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ADAMS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B50-99 New Residence

Applicant: Frank Chopin, Trustee
Address: 345 North Lake Way and
309 Wells Road
Architect: Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: Construct a new single family residence on two adjoining waterfront lots.

Staff recommends deferral as this project requires two variances.

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WIDEMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. DEFERRALS AND CONTINUATIONS - MINOR PROJECTS

A20-99 Demolition of Pillar

Applicant: William J. Condren
Address: 240 Banyan Road
Attorney: James Brindell
Project Description: Demolition of a detached lighted pillar

This project was deferred from the May meeting.

The attorney requested deferral to the July meeting.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

A22-99 Columns

Applicant: Oagle & Elan
Address: 152 Reef Road
Project Description: Change front structure columns

This project was deferred from the May meeting.

No one was present to represent this project.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO DEFER THE PROJECT TO THE JULY MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. NEW BUSINESS - MINOR PROJECTS

A23-99 Gardens

Applicant: Martin Gruss
Address: 1574 South Ocean Blvd.
Architect: Lang Design Group
Project Description: Extensive gardens, small roofed structure

There were no ex-parte communication disclosures

Landscape Architect John Lang said his client wanted only a conceptional approval of the gardens at this time. He presented a plastic grid and said that it will be placed about 4" under a section of sod creating a parking area which will be accessed through a gated opening that was previously approved on this lot. He said the mangroves will remain on the water side and the exotic plant material and a few of the mangroves will be removed from the land along the water.

MOTION BY MR. ADAMS TO ACCEPT THE CONCEPT OF A FORMAL GARDEN SUBJECT TO THE SPECIFICS BEING PRESENTED AT A LATER DATE.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Note: the contractor had been notified that certain conditions such as a Unity of Title will be necessary before any permitting will be issued for any aspect of this project.

A24-99 Modifications

Applicant:	William Pitt
Address:	320 Tangier Avenue
Architect:	Bridges, Marsh and Carmo
Project Description:	Modification of a previously approved plan.

This project was heard after item #A23-99.

Architect Craig Hollinquest presented the project. He said they propose to move the garage closer to the entry with a side setback of 17'6" which was originally 31' from the side yard. The new portico will protrude 11' from the main house rather than the 6' originally approved. The pergola will be changed into a loggia by adding a roof. The garage originally had a partial second floor for storage, but the owners wanted to have two bedrooms for staff quarters and they decided to extent the second floor the full length of the garage and raise the beam height.

MOTION BY MR. WIDEMAN TO APPROVE THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. KINSELLA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VII. OTHER BUSINESS

There was no other business to be heard at this time.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION BY MRS. KINSELLA TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 2:15 P.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. WIDEMAN.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.