



MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
IN THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 S. COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH, FL

FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2011, 9:00 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be “abbreviated” in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town’s website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording of the meeting by contacting Cindy Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER:

Acting Chairman and Vice Chairman Robert Vila called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL:

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman	ABSENT (unexcused)
Robert J. Vila, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Member	PRESENT
Henry Homes III, Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Dr. Martin Phillips, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Let the record show that Mr. Gruss was a voting member today.

Staff members present: John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, and Cynthia M. Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission. Town Attorney John C. Randolph was absent.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

IV. [ADMINISTRATION OF OATH OF OFFICE - DR. MARTIN PHILLIPS](#) (9:00:39 a.m.)

Mrs. Delp administered the Oath of Office to Dr. Martin Phillips.

- V. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE OCTOBER 26, 2011 MEETING (9:02:38 a.m.)**
MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- VI. **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA : (9:03:09 a.m.)**
MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- VII. **ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY (9:03:11 a.m.)**
By Mrs. Delp
- VIII. **OTHER BUSINESS: (9:03:18 a.m.)** None
- IX. **PROJECT REVIEW (9:03:20 a.m.)**

A. **MAJOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS (9:03:24 a.m.)**

B - 071 - 2011 Demolition/Construction New Residence

Address: 1071 North Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: 1071 North Ocean Boulevard Trust dated April 19, 2011, Maura Ziska, Trustee

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of an existing two-story residence and construction of a new two-story residence and pool. Final hardscape and landscape.

Please note that at the October meeting, there was a motion for approval of the demolition of the house at 1070 North Ocean Boulevard with the typical caveats for sodding and irrigating. After hearing the new construction presentation, there was a motion for deferral to the November meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Messrs. Homes and Vila

ATTORNEY FOR THE PROJECT: Maura Ziska

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith, Architect, Smith and Moore Architects; Fred Bissinger, Design Architect

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: John Lang, Lang Design Group

Attorney Maura Ziska stated that the applicant had employed the services of a court reporter at last month's meeting to allow the applicant to review and respond to the comments made at that meeting. Today's presentation is in direct response to those comments. Architect Harold Smith listed the changes made to the plans since the October meeting.

The commission was generally pleased with the architect's response to the commission's October comments, but some members expressed concerns regarding: the use of barrel tiles on roofs of this pitch; the commercial feel of the front fountain; the difference between the architecture of the east and west facades; the appearance of the cupola; southeast elevation-elevations do not match the plans and do not match the model; windows on second floor of east elevation still do not have

the character of the front of the house; consider a different roof material; and, finials out of place and scale.

Mr. Lang presented the revised landscape/hardscape plans which he regarded as an appropriate response to the commission's October comments. Despite the revisions presented, some comments were as follows: Landscape/hardscape plans are not legible; no properties on the north end have water features on the street; and, concern regarding height of basin of front fountain.

Mr. Gruss expressed his general displeasure with the proposal and presentation. Mrs. Vanneck, because of an inconsistency in the plans, felt that the project had been rushed and was not ready for presentation this month.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Please note that after Item B-076-2011 was called and the ex parte declarations were given, Ms. Ziska asked that this project be re-considered.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK TO DEFER THIS PROJECT TO THE END OF THE
AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

B - 074 - 2011 Exterior Improvements

Address: 2560 S. Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: 2560 S. Ocean Boulevard Condominium Association Inc.

Architect: Douglas Root Architects Inc.

Project Description: Landscaping and exterior improvements to enhance the property's aesthetic design, sense of arrival and curb appeal by adding architectural lobby design, replacing balcony rails and making landscape improvements

Please note that at the October meeting, this project was not heard, but was deferred to the November meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Mrs. Vanneck and Mr. Zukov

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Douglas Root, Architect
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Kelly Hults, Witkin Hults Design Group

Mr. Root explained the proposal's major components: the existing vertical picket railing will be replaced with lightly tinted, transparent, glass railing with a silver frame (material undetermined); a new porte cochere and portico are planned to emphasize a new entrance to the condominium and provide a sheltered entrance; a 240 sq. ft. management office is planned adjacent to the lobby; and landscape/hardscape improvements. Kelly Hults presented additional landscape material, pool deck and cookout enhancements, and entrance piers and sign embellishments.

Under commission comments, concerns were expressed about the scale and design of the porte cochere, the use of all of this glass being more like Miami Beach than Palm Beach, and the scale of the landscape material against the building.

**MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL.
MOTION FAILED FOR LACK OF SECOND, BUT THEN....
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. GRUSS OPPOSED.**

B. **MAJOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS (10:05:55 a.m.)**

B - 076 - 2011 New Residence

Address: 202 Plantation Road

Applicant: Michael L. & Suzanne H. Ainslie

Architect: Dailey Janssen Architects, Roger Janssen

Project Description: Proposed new two-story residence with 5,356 air conditioned square feet with pool, hardscape, landscape and site lighting on vacant lot at 202 Plantation Road

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Roger Janssen, Dailey Janssen Architects

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Keith Williams, Mario Nievera Design Inc.

Mr. Janssen presented the one and two-story residence for this corner lot, with a front facing garage tucked into the side and set back from the front facade. The style is West Indies/Colonial with white stucco, white cement tile roof, white outlookers, solid mahogany front door with sidelites, operable black green Colonial shutters, and white Chippendale railings. Mr. Williams presented the submitted landscape plans noting that the existing Sapodilla and Adonidia Palms will be retained. The driveway material, light colored pavers, will pave the two driveway entrances. A long lap pool with spa is proposed.

**MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, WITH THE
CONDITION THAT HIGHER LANDSCAPING BE ADDED TO THE RIGHT OF THE
FRONT DOOR.**

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Ted Cooney, 495 North Lake Way, made a suggestion relative to pickets on the east site wall.

Let the record show that there was a short recess at 10:23. The meeting reconvened at 10:33 a.m.

B - 077 - 2011 Landscaping

Address: 40 Cocoanut Row

Applicant: The Breakers Palm Beach

Architect: Jon E. Schmidt & Associates Inc.

Project Description: The Breakers recently purchased the property located at 40 Cocoanut Row and desire to upgrade the landscaping to improve the aesthetic value for employees, patrons and the public. The drive-thru area within the Limits of Work will create green space of approximately 1,181 square feet with a landscape focal point. The proposed focal point adjacent to the teller drive-thru area will utilize Bismarck Palms in combination with decorative understory accents and plantings to improve the overall appearance of the property.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Knowles

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Jon Schmidt, Jon E. Schmidt & Associates Inc.

Mr. Schmidt explained that the four drive thru lanes will be reduced to one drive thru lane with a central drop off court and some pavement improvements. The driveway entrance width has been reduced from 40 ft. to 25 ft. The proposal will yield additional green space as stated above. Mr. Schmidt reviewed the new landscaping for the site, indicating that some uplighting is also proposed. The commission was very pleased with the project, and thanked the Breakers for improving the property.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MESSRS. ZUKOV AND KARAKUL SIMULTANEOUSLY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

[B - 078 - 2011 Demolition and New Construction](#)

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 221 Ocean Terrace

Applicant: Robert & Helen Ficalora

Architect: MP Design-Architecture Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of existing residence; New one and two story residence (similar to previous approval) pool, landscape and hardscape. *Variance requested for point of measurement.*

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

VARIANCE PRESENTATION BY: Attorney Maura Ziska

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Michael Perry, MP Design-Architecture Inc.

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Daryl McCann, Gregory Lombardi Design Inc.

Ms. Ziska testified that in 2009, a project for additions to this home, along with the required variances had been approved. In December of 2010, that project for additions was approved again. Because of financing issues, the owner has elected to abandon the project for additions in favor of demolition and new construction. The new home will essentially be the same home that is proposed for demolition, only with the additions (which had been previously approved) added to the new house. The point of measurement variance is requested again because of a grade change.

Michael Perry provided the demolition report for the existing residence, and Mr. McCann reviewed the landscape materials which will remain through the demolition.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE DEMOLITION, WITH THE
TYPICAL CAVEATS FOR SODDING AND IRRIGATING.
MOTION SECONDED SIMULTANEOUSLY BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Staff testified that no new letters of objection had been received relative to this project, other than the letter which had been received in 2009 objecting to the variance request at that time.

Mrs. Vanneck asked for a review of the architecture, even though the architecture had been previously approved by the commission. She commented that because the owner had not, in 2009, requested demolition, ARCOM approved the project even though there was some hesitation to do so. Mrs. Vanneck felt that since the home is being demolished now, there is an opportunity to present excellent architecture for the new home. Mr. Perry responded that this is the house that the owners want.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCE WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACT TO THE SUBJECT PROPERTY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MRS. VANNECK OPPOSED.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL OF THE ARCHITECTURE AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MRS. VANNECK OPPOSED.

[B - 079 - 2011 Demolition and New Residence; Guest house alterations](#)

Address: 111 El Brillo Way

Applicant: Ryan Brant

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of an existing two story residence. Construction of a new two-story residence, hardscape and landscape. Alterations to an existing one-story guest house.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

Let the record show that Mr. Karakul declared a voting conflict with regard to this project. (Mr. Ives now voting.) Voting Conflict form on file.

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith, Smith and Moore Architects Inc.

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Jeff Brophy, Land Design South

Mr. Smith provided the demolition report and Mr. Brophy stated that the landscaping will remain except for Sabal Palms at a few places on site. Mrs. Vanneck questioned why the plans include retaining Ficus which is in poor condition.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE DEMOLITION WITH THE TYPICAL CAVEATS FOR SODDING AND IRRIGATING, AND WITH THE CONDITION TO REMOVE ALL FICUS THAT IS IN POOR CONDITION, AND TO SEEK OTHER PLANT ALTERNATIVES FOR REPLACEMENT.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Discussion continued relative to the white fly problem related to Ficus in the Town. Ted Cooney, 495 North Lake Way, speaking on behalf of the neighbor, ARCOM member, Kenn Karakul, commented that Mr. Karakul would appreciate the maintenance of a buffer during demolition and construction at this adjacent property. It was noted that the contractor can erect a temporary buffer. Mr. Page advised that meetings are being held at the Town Council level relative to how to handle the white fly problem.

Architect Harold Smith informed that the existing pool shell will be retained, as well as the small guesthouse, which will be re-roofed and will have its windows and doors replaced. Mr. Smith described the new house as having a two-story mass with one-story wings, with attempts to achieve an Asian peaceful design that is very open to the outside. The front facing garage is positioned 85 ft. from the street and will be screened. Some house features: Exterior skin of two differing textures, heavier on the base; substantial second floor deck areas and balconies; broken pitch roof with red concrete tile roof with broom finish; mahogany trim; casement windows with transom above on first floor; painted aluminum railings; and, island type shutters on second floor front windows. Mr. Brophy continued with the landscape/hardscape: Additional clustered Coconut Palms; light colored pavers with darker bands; much focus on the front of the house and property; and, new pedestrian wrought iron and mahogany gate.

Under commission comments, there were comments, both pro and con. While some members loved the design, others commented that the architecture was not in keeping with the rest of the block; problem with roof style; rear landscaping inferior to front landscaping; and, lack of cohesion with the architecture.

**MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

[B - 080 - 2011 Demolition](#)

Address: 40 Blossom Way

Applicant: The 40 Blossom Way Trust, Maura Ziska Trustee

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc.

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of existing two-story residence, pool and shed

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL/LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith, Smith and Moore Architects, Inc.

Mr. Smith presented that demolition report for the structure, and explained the landscape material which will be retained in the course of the demolition, the large trees masses (front and rear) and all perimeter landscaping.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE DEMOLITION, WITH THE
TYPICAL CAVEATS FOR SODDING AND IRRIGATING, AND NOTING THAT
THERE CAN BE NO DEMOLITION UNTIL MARCH OF 2012.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

C. **MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS** (11:27:46 a.m.)

A - 025 - 2011 Awning & Signage

Address: 238 Worth Avenue

Applicant: Property Owner: Burton Handelsman for MacKenzie-Childs (Store Mgr: Renee Bakarian)

Architect: Jason P. Drobot, R.A.

Project Description: Addition of a fabric awning and signage

Please note that after hearing this project, it was deferred to the November meeting.

Please note that the applicant has requested another deferral.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. **MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS** (11:28:26 a.m.)

A - 027 - 2011 Generator, Site work, Additions/Renovations

Address: 210 Ridgeview Drive

Applicant: Brian and Jane Hurley

Architect: David Lawrence

Project Description: Conversion of a section of the driveway to a walled garden; replacing all windows and garage door; Adding a generator, sound enclosure and masonry screen walls; expanding family room; adding a jacuzzi; adding a porch and French doors.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: David Lawrence, David Lawrence Architecture

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Frank Marone, Environment Design Group

The walled garden will be located in front of the living room and will include a reflecting fountain with black Mexican beach rock around it. In the rear, the pool exists, but a jacuzzi and small sculpture will be added. New limestone paving and an accent band of black Mexican beach rock will be placed around the pool, along with limestone coping. The generator with 3 wall-enclosure will be placed on far northeast side of the property, and a/c units will be screened.

Under comments: Love the front, not the rear; too much paving in rear...perhaps add grass joints. Mr. Lindgren noted that this is an existing home, so changes to the rear are outside of ARCOM's purview.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

A - 029 - 2011 Security Lights

Address: 271 La Puerta Way

Applicant: David and Stephanie Long

Contractor: Castillo Electric LLC

Project Description: Install security lights (4)

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

PRESENTATION BY: Vincent Castillo, Electrical Contractor

Mr. Castillo explained that the proposal is to protect the home with motion sensitive security downlighting, 75 watts/bulb and 150 watts/location.

The commission was concerned regarding light pollution, and the fact that all lights will go on if motion is detected. A suggestion for 50 watt bulbs was made.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL (TO DECEMBER) WITH THE REQUEST THAT THE LIGHTS BE SHIELDED TO CONTROL LIGHT POLLUTION AND THAT THEIR OPERATION IS SEGREGATED SO THEY DO NOT ALL COME ON AT ONCE.

A photometric plan was recommended.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED 5-2, WITH MRS. VANNECK AND MR. GRUSS OPPOSED.

A - 030 - 2011 Awning

Address: 304 Atlantic Avenue, #4

Applicant: James M. Ireland

Architect: Bridges Marsh & Associates

Project Description: Installation of one retractable, rollout 10'x18' awning on the first floor and one 6'8"x19' retractable, rollout awning on the second floor

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

PRESENTATION BY: Attorney M. Timothy Hanlon and Mike Greene, Premier Awning

Mr. Greene explained that the color of the retractable awnings, with scalloped edge and banding, will match the color of the exterior walls. It was noted that the homeowners association has approved the project.

MOTION BY MR. GRUSS FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

At this time, the project for 1071 North Ocean Boulevard was reconsidered.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK TO RECONSIDER B-071-2011.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 071 - 2011 Demolition/Construction New Residence (Reconsidered)

Address: 1071 North Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: 1071 North Ocean Boulevard Trust dated April 19, 2011, Maura Ziska, Trustee

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of an existing two-story residence and construction of a new two-story residence and pool. Final hardscape and landscape.

Attorney Ziska addressed the previous motion for deferral of this project. She clarified that the model had not been updated, and there was no requirement to do so. The plans have been revised, but inadvertently one of the plans from last month, was still included in the set. Ms. Ziska asked that it be disregarded. As to the expressed wind load concern relative to the proposed roof tiles, Ms. Ziska stated that the owner has been advised by a prominent roofing contractor that the roof tiles can be used in this application, and the owner plans to proceed with the roof tiles as presented. Robert Moore, former Building Official for the Town, stated that the contractor must follow the manufacturer's specifications for the roof material. He advised that the owner accepts the risk related to the roof tiles, if any, and noted that wind load should not be a concern of ARCOM.

Mrs. Vanneck explained that this is a very large piece of property and a very large project with many details, so the submitted documents should be correct. Mr. Zukov reiterated his request for a full north and south elevation so the commission can make an informed decision. He also maintained that the plan and the elevation do not agree. The architect, Mr. Smith, testified that they had done the best that they could within a short time frame to revise the drawings in full, but admitted that they had provided some sketches instead of full plans.

The property owners, Danielle and Vahan Gureghian addressed the commission stating: this is their dream home and it is exactly what they want; "this is the best it's going to get"; they are not willing to make many more changes; they had last month's meeting transcribed so that all of the issues expressed could be addressed; and, they do not need any variances and believe they have moved forward in good faith.

Mr. Vila called for comments and a new motion. Some members still were not in favor of aspects of the design.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT SUBJECT TO VERIFICATION OF ACCURACY (OF THE DRAWINGS), AND NOTING THAT THE APPROVAL INCLUDES THE LANDSCAPING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KNOWLES.

MOTION CARRIED 4-3, WITH MR. ZUKOV, MRS. VANNECK AND MR. GRUSS OPPOSED.

X. **COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE) (12:25:47 a.m.)** None

XI. **COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT: (12:25:51 a.m.)**

Mr. Karakul commented that ARCOM spends a good deal of time reviewing signage requests in detail. As such, he questioned the appropriateness of the placement of large trailers with lighted flashing Click It or Ticket signs at various Town locations. Mr. Page will look into this.

Mr. Knowles brought up the subject of the membership requirements for the architects who serve on ARCOM.

Members asked staff to ensure that complete, correct, and legible presentations be submitted. Mrs. Vanneck requested full landscape elevations. Mr. Lindgren stated that he will investigate making the plans available online to the members, in a password protected system.

Dr. Phillips stated he was very pleased to become an ARCOM member.

XII. ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR ADJOURNMENT AT 12:52 P.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on Friday, December 16, 2011 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, Town Hall, 2nd floor, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

**Robert J. Vila, Acting Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION**

cmd