



MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
IN THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 S. COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH, FLORIDA

FRIDAY, DECEMBER 16, 2011, 9:00 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be “abbreviated” in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town’s website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording of the meeting by contacting Cindy Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER (8:59:32 a.m.)

Chairman Smith called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL:

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman	PRESENT
Robert J. Vila, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Member	PRESENT
Henry Homes III, Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT (arrived at (9:04 a.m.))
Dr. Martin Phillips, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Staff members present: John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, and Cynthia M. Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission. Town Attorney John C. Randolph was absent.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE (9:00:40 a.m.)

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE NOVEMBER 18, 2011 MEETING (9:01:00 a.m.)

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA AND MRS. VANNECK SIMULTANEOUSLY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA : (9:01:15 a.m.)**

Mr. Smith indicated that he had a request to move Item A – 032 – 2011 earlier in the agenda because of flight arrangements.

**MOTION BY MR. VILA TO MOVE ITEM A – 032- 2011 TO FIRST ON THE AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK AND MR. HOMES SIMULTANEOUSLY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

VI. **ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY (9:01:44 a.m.)**

Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and as necessary throughout the meeting.

VII. **OTHER BUSINESS:** None

VIII. **PROJECT REVIEW (9:02:00 a.m.)**

D. **MINOR PROJECTS – NEW BUSINESS:**

A - 032 - 2011 Windows/gates

Address: 2228 Ibis Isle Road West

Applicant: Kelly Klein

Architect: 1100 Architect

Project Description: Materials change to previously approved windows and gates

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Daniel Kahan, Smith and Moore Architects and David Piscuskas, 1100 Architect, New York

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Steve Dauber, Life Force Nurseries

Mr. Piscuskas stated that the previously proposed unbleached mahogany windows are now proposed in teak; the previously proposed unbleached mahogany shutters are now proposed in Old Growth Cypress; and, the horizontal slatted street gate, also to be unbleached mahogany, is now proposed in stainless painted to match the cypress. Mr. Dauber presented changes to the landscape: adding landscape; changing locations for landscape material; and replacing some plant material with other plan selections. Ficus on site will be given the required maintenance. It was noted that a painted metal gate will likewise present a maintenance issue. The applicant was cautioned to come to ARCOM for approval before effecting changes in the future.

A neighbor, Horst Petersen, was greatly concerned about the Traveler Palms which he felt are too tall and too close to his property, especially in consideration of hurricanes and the damage that these trees might cause. Mr. Dauber responded that the owner plans to take measures to ensure proper maintenance of the trees, including controlling the height of same, with an 18 ft. height maximum.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED WITH THE HOPE THAT IT IS WELL MANAGED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED 4-3, MRS. VANNECK, MESSRS. HOMES AND VILA OPPOSED.

A. [MAJOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS \(9:02:03 a.m.\)](#)

[B - 074 - 2011 Exterior Improvements](#)

Address: 2560 S. Ocean Boulevard

Applicant: 2560 S. Ocean Boulevard Condominium Association Inc.

Architect: Douglas Root Architects Inc.

Project Description: Landscaping and exterior improvements to enhance the property's aesthetic design, sense of arrival and curb appeal by adding architectural lobby design, replacing balcony rails and making landscape improvements

Please note that at the October meeting, this project was not heard, but was deferred to the November meeting. At the November meeting, the project was heard, but was deferred to the December meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Douglas Root, Douglas Root Architects Inc.

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Kelly Hults, Witkin Hults Design Group

Mr. Root reiterated the proposal's major components: the existing vertical picket railing will be replaced with lightly tinted, transparent, glass railing with a powder coat white frame; a new porte cochere and portico are planned to emphasize a new entrance to the condominium and provide a sheltered entrance; a 240 sq. ft. management office is planned adjacent to the lobby; and landscape/hardscape improvements. Kelly Hults presented additional landscape material, pool deck and cookout enhancements, and entrance piers and sign embellishments. Since last month, the porte cochere/portico new entrance has been simplified; and, taller 24 ft. Coconut Palms have replaced the originally proposed smaller plantings at the main entrance.

While most members felt the proposal improves the property, some members expressed concerns regarding the following: existing mullioned entrance door...inconsistent with the proposed changes; the porte cochere/portico entrance is too grand and does not relate to the rest of the property; the awning windows should be replaced as well; replace the existing white cement tile mansard with a parapet; not in favor of the glass mosaic tiles on the monument.

MOTION FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, WITH THE GLASS LOBBY AND REPLACING THE DOORS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED 4-3, WITH MR. VILA, MRS. VANNECK AND MR. SMITH OPPOSED.

[B - 079 - 0211 Demolition and New Residence; Guest house alterations](#)

Address: 111 El Brillo Way

Applicant: Ryan Brant

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of an existing two story residence. Construction of a new two-story residence, hardscape and landscape. Alterations to an existing one-story guest house

Please note that at the November meeting, there was a motion for approval of the demolition with the typical caveats for sodding and irrigating, and with the condition to remove all ficus that is in poor condition, and to seek other plant alternatives for replacement. There was also a motion for deferral to the December meeting (for the remainder of the project).

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

Let the record show that Mr. Karakul recused himself in keeping with the voting conflict which he filed last month. (Voting Conflict form on file.) (Mr. Gruss voting)

Mr. Page took this opportunity to read Mr. Karakul's Voting Conflict form from last month into the record as is required by the State of Florida.

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith, Smith and Moore Architects Inc.
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Cory Kissel, Land Design South

Mr. Smith outlined quite a few changes which were made to the design since last month including the roof pitch, overhangs, gates, roof line breaks, shutters, portico balcony, column changes, fenestration changes, and changing the front door to a pair of mahogany doors, just to name a few. Ms. Kissel reviewed the landscape/hardscape plans, noting that the front Ficus will be removed and replaced with Clusia. Other Ficus on the property will have aggressive maintenance.

Some members felt very strongly that this design is too dissimilar for this very important neighborhood.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KNOWLES.

MOTION FAILED 3-4, WITH MRS. VANNECK AND MESSRS. VILA, HOMES AND SMITH OPPOSED.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL TO JANUARY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. MAJOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS:

B - 081 - 2011 New Residence

Address: 217 Emerald Lane

Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Donald Gulbrandsen

Architect: MP Design & Architecture, Inc.

Project Description: New two-story residence, pool, landscape and hardscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Michael Perry, MP Design & Architecture Inc.
LANDSCAPE DESIGN BY: John Lang, Lang Design Group

Mr. Perry presented his design for this two-story residence with: circular driveway (2 entrances); two story garage in the rear; pool in the Northeast corner; recessed cranberry front door; cranberry shutters on second floor windows; curved slate roof and flat roofs over one-story portions. He

showed a photo of an existing home, the David Adler home in Lake Forest, which is the inspiration for this design. Mr. Lang presented the landscape/hardscape elements of the project pursuant to the submitted plans. He described the landscape as having a tropical feel, using the existing front and rear buffers. Existing Ficus on site will be retained as it is in good condition. A small pool occurs in the rear with a raised garden behind it.

Under comments, several members felt that the design has not achieved the look of the inspiration house and “was lost in translation.” Some members commented that this roof design is not in keeping with the neighborhood.

**MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL TO JANUARY.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.**

Dr. Klein, a neighbor at 225 Emerald Lane, spoke to the purpose of ARCOM and the protections the commission provides for the residents of Palm Beach. He read his statement into the record which lists his concerns relative to this project, especially related to his opinion that this design is out of harmony with its proposed environment and related to the inconveniences put upon neighbors when construction occurs in a neighborhood. The property owner responded that it is sincere intention to have a quality construction project which is completed in a timely fashion.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Let the record show that there was a short recess from 10:50 a.m. to 11:00 a.m.

B - 082 - 2011 Demolition and New Residence

Address: 256 Mockingbird Trail

Applicant: E. Douglas Carton

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc., Peter Papadopoulos

Project Description: Demolition of existing one-story residence; Construction of new two-story residence, final landscape and hardscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Peter Papadopoulos, Smith and Moore Architects
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Steve Parker, Parker and Yanette

Mr. Papadopoulos presented the demolition report and Mr. Parker discussed the landscape material which will be retained and/or removed. He noted that the front Ficus will remain during construction, but will be removed at the end of the job. Other Ficus on the site will be preserved. The 10 ft. tall Ficus on the South property line belongs to the neighbor and will be preserved.

Ron Jaffe, 261 Nightingale, the neighbor to the South, had written a letter to the commission which was distributed to each member. He was very concerned about the South hedge and the impact on this construction on his property...dust, debris, etc. It was determined through discussion and examination of the survey that the south fence and hedge belong to Mr. Jaffe. Mr. Papadopoulos assured Mr. Jaffe that his hedge will be maintained throughout construction and beyond.

**MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE DEMOLITION AS
PRESENTED, WITH THE TYPICAL CAVEATS FOR SODDING AND IRRIGATING,**

AND ADVISING THE APPLICANT TO BE CONCERNED ABOUT THE NEIGHBOR'S CONCERNS, AND NOTING THAT DEMOLITION IS PROHIBITED AS OF DEC. 1. MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Papadopoulos presented a simple contemporary two-story home with one-story elements pursuant to the submitted plans. The exterior will be white smooth white stucco. Mr. Parker continued with the landscape/hardscape plans pursuant to the submitted plans.

Under comments, there was a concern about blocking the view onto the Jaffe's property from the second floor balcony of this home. There was a suggestion to move the powder room window to the side and to remove the garage window. Members were mixed on their opinions relative to the contemporary design.

Mr. Lindgren read the Jaffe's letter into the record listing their concerns and objections relative to this project.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED WITH THE CHANGE TO THE POWDER ROOM WINDOW, AND TO REMOVE THE WINDOW IN THE GARAGE, AND TO SEVERELY "BEEF UP" THE LANDSCAPING ON THE SOUTH SIDE SO THAT FROM THAT BALCONY YOU CANNOT SEE THE NEIGHBORS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV, PROVIDED THE LANDSCAPE IS BROUGHT BACK TO THE COMMISSION NEXT MONTH.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

[B - 085 - 2011 New Residence](#)

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 108 El Mirasol

Applicant: Anand & Neeta Khubani

Architect: Douglas J. Coleman AIA

Project Description: New two-story single family residence: 6 car garage, 9 bedrooms, 10 full baths, 3 half baths. Total living square footage 13,570. Breezeway and pool. *Variances requested for front yard setback, and front yard setback/building height plane for the stair tower and front entry feature*

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

VARIANCE PRESENTATION BY: Attorney Maura Ziska

ARCHITECT PRESENT: Douglas Coleman

LANDSCAPE ARCHITECT PRESENT: Don Skowron

Let the record show that a model was brought to the meeting. Ms. Ziska explained why this project was back before ARCOM yet again...that the owner would like a larger back yard for the children, so in order to achieve that, a variance is necessary to move the house closer to the road. A second variance relates to perimeter landscaping. Architecturally, it is the same house as ARCOM had reviewed in January, but minus the porte cochere which was removed from the design.

Chairman Smith commented that the house is so large, as proposed, on a very large lot. He suggested that the house size be reduced in order to achieve a larger back yard, rather than moving the house closer to the road. Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator, addressed the code requirements as related to the variance requests.

Harvey Poppel, 110 El Mirasol, provided his qualified support of the plan, but had two concerns relative to construction inconveniences and the final landscape plan for this project.

MOTION BY MR. VILA TO RECOMMEND THE VARIANCE RELATED TO THE LANDSCAPING, AND TO RECOMMEND DENIAL OF THE VARIANCE WHICH WOULD MOVE THE HOUSE FORWARD TOWARD THE STREET.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES TO DEFER THE ARCHITECTURE TO JANUARY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. **MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS:**

[A - 025 - 2011 Awning & Signage](#)

Address: 238 Worth Avenue

Applicant: Property Owner: Burton Handelsman for MacKenzie-Childs (Store Manager: Renee Bakarian)

Architect: Jason P. Drobot, R.A.

Project Description: Addition of a fabric awning and signage

Please note that after hearing this project, it was deferred to the November meeting. At the November meeting, the project was deferred again at the request of the applicant.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

Architect Jason Drobot requested yet another deferral.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL TO JANUARY.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

[A - 029 - 2011 Security Lights](#)

Address: 271 La Puerta Way

Applicant: David and Stephanie Long

Contractor: Castillo Electric LLC

Project Description: Install security lights (4)

Please note that after hearing the project at the November meeting, there was a motion for deferral to the December meeting with the request that the lights be shielded to control light pollution and that their operation is segregated so they do not all come on at once.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Vincent Castillo, Castillo Electric

Mr. Castillo explained that these motion sensitive lights, already in place, are shielded and their operation is now segregated. With the photometric information presented, there was still some concern about light pollution. It was suggested that the wattage be reduced to 50 watts.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, WITH 50 WATT BULBS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. VILA.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

D. MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS:

A - 031 - 2011 Windows & Doors

Address: 1030 N. Lake Way

Applicant: Fischer by Glidden Spina & Partners

Architect: Glidden Spina & Partners, Keith Spina

Project Description: Single family residence window and door replacement/modification at first floor, including west facing French doors with larger "Vitrocsa" sliding glass doors

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Keith Spina, Glidden Spina & Partners

Mr. Spina presented the proposed window/door changes which will provide the homeowners a much less obstructed view of the Intracoastal from the sitting room, living room and master bedroom. It was described as, essentially, a glass wall.

Under comments, some members felt this was not an attractive architectural solution, and it may appear that the second story is supported by glass, but others noted that fine materials are being used and the area is fairly well screened from public view.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. SMITH OPPOSED.

IX. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE): None

X. COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT:

Mr. Knowles asked for the assistance of the Town with regard to construction sites and maintenance of the landscape material on those sites during construction, especially with regard to the White Fly problem. He commented that typically the contractor takes no responsibility for landscape maintenance during construction, and that is how a White Fly problem can accelerate.

Mr. Page took this opportunity to update the commission on the Town's position on the White Fly problem and the first reading of a new ordinance to address the problem. It would require any owner to remove any hedge or tree that is dead, is dying, or is severely defoliated as a public nuisance. The commission members commented that a requirement for replacement of another plant material should be

part of that ordinance. Mr. Page will discuss this issue further with the Town Attorney.

Dr. Phillips offered his sincere compliments to the Architectural Commission for their excellent efforts which have resulted in a beautiful new Publix store for Palm Beach.

Commission members expressed their displeasure with the holiday lights on the trees on Royal Palm Way and Royal Poinciana Way, recommending that the fronds be illuminated instead of so many tree trunks.

Mr. Gruss commented that he feels it is inappropriate behavior for a Town Council member to attend an ARCOM meeting as an obvious member of a presenting team for an ARCOM project.

XI. ADJOURNMENT:

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 12:30 P.M.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on January 25, 2012 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeffery W. Smith, Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

cmd