

**REPORT OF THE SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEETING
HELD ON FRIDAY, JANUARY 30, 2015**

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Shore Protection Board was called to order on Friday, January 30, 2015, at 1:30 p.m., in Town Council Chambers.

II. ROLL CALL

The following members were present: Chairman E. Llwyd Ecclestone, Vice Chair J. Patterson Cooper, Board Member Gerald Frank, Board Member Lee David Goldstein, Board Member Lewis Katz, and Board Member Richard Raffo, with the exception of Board Member Kane Baker, who was absent.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Ecclestone led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion to approve the agenda was made by Board Member Goldstein and seconded by Vice Chair Cooper. The motion carried 6-0, with Board Member Baker absent.

The following changes were made to the Agenda:

MOVED: Item No.'s V., Communications from Shore Protection Board Members, and VI., Communications from Citizens, were moved after Item No. VII.

Motion to approve the agenda, as amended, was made by Board Member Goldstein, and seconded by Vice Chair Cooper. The motion carried 6-0, with Board Member Baker absent.

V. COMMUNICATIONS FROM SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEMBERS

Board Member Katz spoke regarding finding an expert sand consultant to bring before the Mayor and Town Council, in order to advise the Board of the best sand to use for renourishment.

Board Member Goldstein spoke regarding working only on permissible projects per the Town Council's direction, groins are favorable to the Board, the County's South Palm Beach Groin Project becoming permissible that would set a precedent, the insistence of FDEP and BMA that the Town do one more big fill on Reach 7 next year before groins can be considered, the AIA revetment and approval of the project between Sloan's and Widener's Curve by the USACE and FDEP, and funding by the Town Council.

Board Member Raffo, spoke regarding his previous membership of the first Shore Protection Board that recommended groins, recommending the use of groins to the Town Council, and become familiar with the cost, in order to complete the project.

Board Member Frank spoke regarding asking advice from experts regarding permits for building groins, the problems caused by groins holding sand, the difficulty in the obtaining permitting, the large percentage of sand in front of all the condominiums of the supposedly failed Reach 7 project, the discouraging tearing apart of the project, and compromising will help to get the project done over the long-term.

Board Member Cooper spoke regarding his hope to have a project today, shore protection not having any right answers, being stewards and sharing beaches with others, not being able to obtain groins for Reach 8, any proposals of groins would be challenged, the importance of sand and silt size, the inability to make a recommendation without closure on the sand, not making a big effort on groins due to approval, suggesting an alternative sand source, his disappointment of Ms. Erickson's statement regarding inability to obtain an approval for a 2016 project, and clarity of the sand issue.

Chairman Ecclestone spoke regarding the fact that USACE and Woods Hole Group, two independent organizations, have reviewed the sand issue, the fact that there will never be a consensus between SOS and Staff, his strong inclinations about groins, making an effort to get a project started with small groins, including an agreement with everybody in advance.

VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS – 3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE

Connie Gasque, 167 Root Trail, displayed samples of the sand from the various reaches and Lake Worth Pier. She spoke regarding the sand that comes through the sand transfer plant, the blending of sand from Reach 3 passing the Beach Management Agreement (BMA) specifications, and her plans to have independent testing performed. Chair Ecclestone responded that at the time of the independent testing of the sand to have Mr. Weber tell her his opinion so there is no dispute on where the sand is coming from.

Erick Reickert, 3100 South Ocean Boulevard, spoke regarding the projects of the critically eroded Reach 8, the required permitting, his preference of using an earlier year than 2013 as a reference point for the beach width, the exposure of the hard bottom, and the connecting seawalls.

Bukk Carleton, 3400 S. Ocean Boulevard, spoke regarding the proposed 15-year plan, Reach 8 hurricane protection, a 25-year plan, the use of groins, Reach 8 paying 30% of the Town's taxes and receiving only 7% of the sand.

Director of Public Works Brazil provided his comments regarding the frustration of Reach 8, storm relief, the existing regulations, short and long-term projects, the 15 and 25-year plans, and the problems with the seawalls.

Richard Hunegs, 3360 S. Ocean Boulevard, requested that Karyn Erickson, be allowed to speak on behalf of the Coalition to Save Our Shores (SOS). Chair Ecclestone allowed her to speak for six minutes without any repetition.

Attorney John Eubanks, 605 N. Olive Avenue, West Palm Beach, spoke regarding the quality and incompatibility of the grain size of the sand per Judge Meale's findings, dredging studies, and requested a chance for a comparison using all of the issues.

Thomas Warnke, 2780 Worcester Road, Lake Worth, Surfrider Foundation member, spoke

1 regarding Judge Meale's ruling, the grain size and durability of the sand, the sand display, the
2 annual recreation of dune projects using high quality material, to not put sand with a significant
3 amount of silt into the ocean, the preferred plan is 25,000 cubic yards, frequent bolstering of the
4 dune by moving sand from other parts, sea-level rise, seawalls, the ineffectiveness of the inlet by-
5 pass, and his compliments of Mr. Brazil's and Mr. Weber's work since Judge Meale's ruling.

6
7 Karyn Erickson, professional coastal engineer, and board certified diplomat in coastal engineering,
8 reported inconsistencies of the board packet recommendations of the January 22, 2015,
9 memorandum.

10
11 Director of Public Works Brazil responded to Ms. Erickson's report regarding the differences in
12 the lower cost of Ortona sand versus the recent higher costs of the local contractors, the USACE's
13 research, and the bid cost. He also responded regarding the cost differences in trucking costs, the
14 contractor's renegotiation to add \$1 per ton, the length of time it takes to permit groins, the existing,
15 reasonable level of storm protection, and plans to increase it.

16
17 Jeannie Cohen, 3400 S. Ocean Boulevard, the Atriums of Palm Beach, spoke regarding the Atriums
18 seawall having the worst damage of the entire section of Reach 8, the process, dates, cost, and
19 bringing the best consultants together to obtain the best solution for the Town.

20
21 Richard Hunegs, 3360 S. Ocean Boulevard, read a report from the earlier Shore Protection Board.

22
23 *(Clerk's Note: The following Item No. 's VII, and VIII, were taken out of order and heard before*
24 *Item No. V.)*

25
26 VII. COASTAL MANAGEMENT IN REACH 8

27 [Robert Weber, Coastal Coordinator, and H. Paul Brazil, P.E., Director of Public Works]

28
29 Coastal Coordinator Weber provided a presentation of the Reach 8 project.

30
31 VIII. SOUTHERN PALM BEACH ISLAND COMPREHENSIVE SHORELINE STABILIZATION
32 PROJECT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT (REACH 8 EIS)

33 [Robert Weber, Coastal Coordinator, and Penny Cutt, Regional Manager, Coastal Systems
34 International, Inc.]

35
36 Director of Public Works Brazil provided an overview of the project and a brief background of Ms.
37 Cutt.

38
39 Penny Cutt, Regional Manager, Coastal Systems International, Inc., provided a set of comments
40 regarding the EIS, recommended by Staff to be the official comments of the Town. Ms. Cutt
41 introduced Jordan Cheifet, coastal engineer.

42
43 Coastal Coordinator Weber spoke regarding his and the Mayor's meeting with the Surfrider
44 Foundation, shore protection, seawalls, the fact that Reach 8 community wants more than seawall
45 protection, the repetitive dunes with the BMA and state permit, beyond that was the effort of the
46 75, 000 cubic yard project, sand grain size, coarseness of material, structures, and if something
47 more was proposed, they would legally challenge it again.

48
49 Discussion ensued regarding the disallowing of certain seawalls by Florida Department of
50 Environmental Protection (FDEP).

Director of Public Works Brazil provided Staff's recommendations. He stated that the USACE has started an evaluation of the SOS project and said it wasn't warranted and stopped the evaluation, which has caused obvious concern, that the EIS is not appropriate for Staff to recommend it.

Motion was made by Board Member Goldstein, and seconded by Board Member Frank, to recommend to Town Council to approve the EIS as presented by Penny Cutt, Coastal Systems International, Inc., and recommending, if possible, to come up with a price close, in using sand from a mine in relation to the current method used, and the 75,000 cubic yards project. On call for a vote, the motion carried 6-0, with Board Member Baker absent.

IX. TOPICS FOR FUTURE SPB MEETING ON FEBRUARY 26, 2015

- Review of Sediment Budget
- Sand Bypassing at Lake Worth Inlet
- Groin Rehabilitation

X. ANY OTHER MATTERS – None

XI. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the January 30, 2015, Shore Protection Board meeting was adjourned at 4:10 p.m.

APPROVED:



E. Llwyd Ecclestone
Chairman