



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 17, 2016.

Please be advised that in keeping with a directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
John T. Gannon, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
Page Lee Hufty, Member	PRESENT
Rachel Lorentzen, Member	PRESENT (left meeting at 11:07 a.m.)
William J. Strawbridge, Jr., Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Richard Rene Silvin, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Carol N. Wyett, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Weld Drake, Alternate Member	PRESENT

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Cooney led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE JANUARY 18, 2016 MEETING

Mr. Cooney stated that he would like to amend the minutes of the January meeting.

The minutes read: After a short break, Mr. Cooney said that a matter was brought to his attention that the motion for 207 Royal Poinciana Way and 212 Sunset Ave. did not make any mention of the little alley to the west of 207 Royal Poinciana Way. Mr. Cooney reached Town Attorney, John Randolph by phone to make him aware of the need to amend the motion to include the alley. Mr. Cooney stated that Mr. Randolph was fine with reopening the motion.

The minutes should be amended to read: After a short break, Mr. Cooney said that a matter was brought to his attention that the motion for 207 Royal Poinciana Way and 212 Sunset Ave. did not make any mention of the little alley to the west of 207 Royal Poinciana Way. Mr. Cooney reached Mr. Rabideau by phone to make him aware of the need to amend the motion to include the alley. Mr. Cooney stated that Mr. Rabideau was fine with reopening the motion.

Motion made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mrs. Lorentzen to approve the minutes as amended. Motion carried with all in favor.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

A motion was made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Mr. Gannon to approve the agenda with the following deferral to the April meeting:

Designation Hearing Item 1: 125 Seagrape Circle.

Motion carried with all in favor.

A second motion was made by Mrs. Lorentzen and seconded by Ms. Hufty to approve the agenda with the withdrawal of COA-006-2015-102 Jungle Rd. as recommended by Staff. Motion carried with all in favor.

A third motion was made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Gannon to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried with all in favor.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Mrs. Roedel administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes)

Mr. Bill Bone, 322 Pendleton Lane, stated that he was not able to stay for the discussion regarding the name change for Town Hall Square Historic District, but wanted his affirmation and support on the record for the name to be changed to Town Square Historic District. He felt that Town Square Historic District would be more fitting, more appropriate and more in common usage. Mr. Cooney said that the Commission will not be taking any formal action on the name change today. Mr. Page stated that today was to be an introduction to the name change, also the Town Council has asked that the Commission solicit opinion from the Preservation Foundation and from any of the Commissioners' other contacts. Mr. Page felt that it would be more appropriate to take action next month.

Mr. Glenn Zeitz, 142 Seabreeze Ave., stated that he had four topics to discuss with the Commission. First- his landmarked home, second- himself, third- a threat to his home, and fourth- a solution. He then went into a lengthy discussion regarding his opposition to the proposed Townwide Underground Utilities Project. Mr. Alexander Ives, President of the Preservation Foundation, commented that he received a call from Jane Day regarding this issue and it speaks to some broader conversations he has had over the past month in regards to what will happen after the March 15th vote on undergrounding, if it passes. He stated that about 25% of properties will have transformers in their yards. Roughly 9-10% of Palm Beach properties are landmarked or in one of the 7 Historic Districts. Perhaps the Commission should get some guidance from the Town Council given the uniqueness of landmark properties and maybe there should be a different consideration or process for how these transformers may or may not be selected to be put on landmarked properties.

VIII. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #049-2015

Address: 360 Seaspray Ave.

Owner/Applicant: Mary Frances Turner

Architect: The Pandula Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Structure - Remove and re-frame roof structure and structure at sleeping porch. Modify existing framing or provide new framing at portions of existing structure as required by current field conditions and building code requirements. Exterior - Remove existing composite shingle roof material and replace with new composite shingle roof material. Remove existing aluminum siding and replace with new Hardie Board siding, with white painted finish. Remove existing shutters and replace with new aluminum shutters, with black painted finish. Interior - Remove all finishes fixtures and trim damaged by fire and re-install. Site - Remove existing garden pavilion, remove north motor court and replace with new layout, remove west garage driveway and replace with new layout, remove existing pool and deck and replace with

new layout. Provide new generator and new landscape plan. Note - All work is to be accomplished within the original (existing) building footprint and envelope of the building, no modifications are made to setback dimensions or building area, except for removal of garden pavilion. All horizontal and vertical dimensions of the existing structure are to be maintained while accomplishing reconstruction activities. All window and door units are to be replaced within their existing openings, unless otherwise specifically indicated.

At the December meeting a motion carried to approve the project as presented with the addition of one vertical muntin on the 6 windows on the east elevation and on the 2 second floor windows on south elevation and that the site plan design, landscape and hardscape be deferred to the February meeting. Also, the sketch that was shown to the Commission, should be incorporated into the plan, correcting the two kitchen windows.

Mr. Lindgren announced that 360 Seaspray has requested a deferral to the March meeting.

Motion made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Gannon to defer COA #049-2015-360 Seaspray Ave. to the March meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

Mr. Lindgren also announced that there was an error in the advertising for the Certificates of Appropriateness for this month, the ad did not make it into the paper in time. Therefore, Staff would like the Commission to review these projects and give their feedback. Unfortunately, the Commission cannot take any formal action today.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #003-2016

Address: 235 Banyan Rd.

Owner/Applicant: Mr. Richard Kurtz

Architect: Michael J. Johnson/Daniel Menard

Project Description: New wood impact rated windows throughout existing structure. New addition (941 sq. ft.) at Northwest side of existing residence (one story). Existing living room windows at North elevation to become French doors. Interior modification to master bathroom and sitting room area.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Cooney.

Mr. Johnson said the owner would like to make some changes to his property. He then turned the presentation over to Daniel Menard. Mr. Menard introduced Jane Day, who gave the Commission some historical background on the house. Mr. Menard presented the project and discussed the proposed changes.

Commission Comments: It was stated by the Commission that this was a necessary addition, but it looks massive. It was also noted that the house is modestly sized but on a large lot and the scale of the arch windows with the sidelights and doors might be lending some of the large feel to the addition. The Commission was very supportive of the project and in making this a great family home.

No action was taken at this time due to lack of notice.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #004-2016

Address: 115 Via La Selva

Owner/Applicant: Jim and Selaine Nidel

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc./John Moore

Project Description: Addition of 270 sq. ft. first floor closet and addition of 100 sq. ft. second floor closet.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Albarran, Mr. Cooney and Mr. Silvin.

Mr. Moore reviewed the proposed plan and additions.

Commission Comments: The Commission thanked Mr. Moore for the revisions, and are fine with what has been done.

No action was taken at this time due to lack of notice.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #005-2016

Address: 105 Clarendon Ave.

Owner/Applicant: 105 Clarendon Rd. Revocable Trust

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc./Harold Smith

Landscape: Nievara Williams/Keith Williams

Project Description: Replacement of vehicular gates, entry gate and window grilles. Replacement of exterior lighting fixtures. Removal of existing Northwest tennis courtyard wall that is in disrepair. Proposed removal of existing well in west courtyard that is in disrepair and replacement with new fountain. Updated pool design and finish. Other associated changes.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Albarran, Mr. Cooney and Mr. Silvin

Mr. Moore presented the new gates, window grilles, lighting fixtures and the other proposed changes.

Commission Comments: The Commission had some concern with the 6 inch planks on the garage door versus an 8 inch plank. Mr. Moore will meet with Mrs. Albarran to see if she has a vendor who can provide a warranty for the 8 inch planks. It was also noted that in black line the gates appear busier then they will read in reality. Mr. Moore was also asked to restudy the window grills for simplification.

Mr. Williams walked the Commission through some of the changes that will be made to the hardscape.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt the tile for the pool and fountain was beautiful and a great addition. There was some concern regarding replacing the well with a fountain. Mr. Cooney stated that he has seen the well and it does need to be replaced. Mrs. Albarran also saw the well and agreed.

No action was taken at this time due to lack of notice.

Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #006-2015

Address: 102 Jungle Rd.

Applicant/Owner: Tomas R. Maier Revocable Trust

Architect: Fairfax, Sammons and Partners

Project Description: The property located at 102 Jungle Rd. is currently undergoing a renovation which was previously approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission (COA-046-2014).

This application seeks the approval for the demolition of 988 sq. ft. of building at the Southwest corner of the property, which has suffered extensive structural damage due to termites. It also seeks approval for the reconstruction of the same portion of the building, within the same existing footprint, and in the same configuration as previously approved.

Applicant has withdrawn their request. Staff recommends removal of item from the agenda.

Withdrawal approved under Approval of Agenda.

XI. DESIGNATION HEARINGS

Item 1: 125 Seagrape Circle

Owner: Colonial Groves, Inc.

At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this designation to the February meeting at the request of the owner.

The owner has requested that this designation hearing be deferred until the April 20, 2016 Landmarks Preservation Commission meeting.

Deferral of designation hearing approved under Approval of Agenda.

It was noted that Mrs. Lorentzen left the meeting at 11:07 and Mrs. Drake would be voting.

Item 2: 120 Clarke Ave.

Owner: James and Lidwina Scoroposki

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None

Ms. Stillings presented the designation report stating that the home meets Criterion 1.

Mr. Lindgren confirmed that we have proof of publication and proper legal service.

A motion was made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Gannon that the Designation Report be made a part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor.

Mr. Tim Hanlon, attorney for the owner, stated that the owners oppose the designation of this property. They believe that none of the required criteria is satisfied. They do acknowledge that the consultants, in the designation report, have identified Criterion 1, but they have not identified any historically significant features. There is no architect of record, the contractor has little or no historical significance in the Town and there is no social historical significance tied to the home. Most importantly this home has been significantly altered in the last twenty years by the owner. Mr. Hanlon then introduced his expert Mr. Rick Gonzalez. Mr. Gonzalez stated that he does a lot of historic preservation throughout the state of Florida and he takes these cases very seriously. He said that Mr. Hanlon already made a lot of the points

he was going to make but had a couple of other points. He said that in Chapter 54 of the Code of Ordinances, there are four criterions, there have been over 250 landmarks in the Town of Palm Beach and he doesn't believe there is one that only meets Criterion 1, which makes this property an exception. He felt that Criterion 1 was the vaguest of the criteria standards. He said for the record that they strongly object to this designation, and there are better opportunities in Town. Mr. Scoroposki, the home owner, stated that his family moved to Palm Beach 20 years ago and shared that he and his wife have spent those years renovating the home.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt that this home is not a good candidate for landmarking for various reasons. The house is undistinguished architecturally and Criterion 1 is exceedingly broad. The Commission felt that the owner has made the house much more charming then it was originally.

A motion was made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Gannon that 120 Clarke Ave. not be recommended to the Town Council for designation as a landmark of the Town of Palm Beach because it does not meet the criteria. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Cooney dissenting.

X. OTHER BUSINESS

Discussion of name change for "Town Hall Square Historic District" by changing name to "Town Square Historic District."

Mr. Cooney asked if anyone saw a need in having a discussion this month, when the Commission will touch base on it next month. The Commission agreed that they will take action on this next month.

XI. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR

Ms. Hufty shared that the opening for the Memorial Fountain was stunning but she feels there are some areas where we could continue to progress. She noticed there are two tables and four chairs and she believes they initially requested four on each side. She hopes that they can continue to look into the idea of putting in steps to connect the two parks. Mr. Cooney agreed that extra tables need to be put in the park.

Mr. Page responded that the Public Works Department is responsible for maintaining the park and Paul Brazil, Public Works Director, has frequently voiced his concern that he's not certain at this point how well the tables and chairs will work in the park. His concerns are how often the tables will be used and how much trash will be generated and whether the trash will be properly disposed of. The Town Council has given Mr. Brazil great latitude in terms of monitoring and determining how much furniture should be there. Mr. Page will pass on the Commissioner's concerns regarding the tables to Mr. Brazil.

Mr. Lindgren stated that 267 Atlantic Ave. was discussed informally last month and it was going to come back to the Commission today. A decision was made to administratively approve the project because of the situation the owner was facing with her funding. She was running the risk of losing the house if she could not get a Certificate of Occupancy within the banks timeframe. The Commissioners were happy to hear this and felt it was the right thing to do.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Mr. Gannon and seconded by Mrs. Drake to adjourn the meeting at 11:39 a.m.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, March 16, 2016 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Edward A. Cooney". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Edward" and last name "Cooney" clearly legible.

Edward A. Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

nar