TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, MAY 18, 2016.

Please be advised that in keeping with a directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
John T. Gannon, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
Page Lee Hufty, Member	PRESENT
William J. Strawbridge, Jr., Member	PRESENT
Richard Rene Silvin, Member	PRESENT
Carol N. Wyett, Alternate Member	ABSENT (excused)
Jacqueline Weld Drake, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Anne Fairfax, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Chairman Cooney noted that Ms. Drake would be voting in place of Mr. Zukov.

Staff Members present were:
John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building
John Lindgren, Planning Administrator
Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Cooney led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE APRIL 20, 2016 MEETING

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the minutes of the April 20, 2016 meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Maura Ziska, attorney for project COA-008-2016, asked for this project to be deferred until the July meeting. **Motion made by Mr. Strawbridge and seconded by Mr. Gannon to approve the deferral until July. Motion carried with all in favor.**

Mr. Page stated that the project at 101 El Brillo Way, COA-016-2016, is requesting a one month deferral to the June meeting. **A second motion was made by Mr. Gannon and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the deferral until June. Motion carried with all in favor.**

At this time, Mr. Page went on the record to indicate that Ms. Albarran did declare a conflict for the project at 233 Clarke Ave. and has correctly completed the 8B form in accordance of State Law.

A third motion was made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the amended agenda as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes)

No comments were heard at this time.

VIII. DISCUSSION ITEM

1. 102 Jungle Rd - construction update from architect regarding chimney replacement.

Jaime Torres from Fairfax and Sammons, presented a situation that was encountered during renovation at 102 Jungle Rd. Mr. Torres showed the Commission the existing site plans and elevations that were previously approved at Landmarks. He stated that a section of the wall and a chimney was found to be deteriorating and needed to be removed due to its instability. Mr. Torres also stated he asked the Town's Building Official, Bill Bucklew and Mr. Lindgren to visit the site to meet with the structural engineer. They all agreed the wall and chimney were unstable and needed to be removed. Mr. Torres stated that the chimney and wall will be rebuilt as they were previously. Mr. Lindgren told the Commissioners that Mr. Torres is here to simply update them on the situation.

IX. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #008-2016

Address: 1300 S. Ocean Blvd.
Owner/Applicant: Paul Tudor Jones II
Architect: Allan Shope
Project Description: General Building Improvements - All roofing will be replaced throughout to match existing, all exterior windows and doors will be replaced throughout to match existing but become hurricane impact-resistant, new elevator added between basement and third floor (work to be divided into 2 phases: phase 1 - 2016 & phase 2 -

2017.) Basement level - interior - various minor renovations in association with new elevator. First floor - interior - existing kitchen renovated, various other minor room renovations, existing living spaces converted to guest bedrooms and baths, existing enclosed connector between garage and house removed, replaced with more planter area, existing exterior doors relocated at guest bedroom, replacing small window at former power room, existing exterior glass doors enlarged at existing living, dining and breakfast rooms, arched area added at top-color, material and glazing pattern to match character of existing bronze & glass doors at sun room, new exterior glass doors added to existing arched openings at loggia-color, material and glazing pattern to match character of existing doors in adjacent area, new terrace added at screening room - color, material and detailing to match character of existing ocean terrace, new dining terrace added - color, material and detailing to match character of existing ocean terrace. Second floor - interior - bedroom and bath renovations, master bedroom balcony porch made deeper, existing window openings reconfigured and expanded - color, material and glazing pattern to retain character of existing windows, new hall added, bringing together disconnected areas of second floor - color, material and detailing of addition to match character of existing exterior walls, roofing and windows. Third floor - interior - bedroom and bath renovations.

At the March meeting, this project was granted a May deferral.

The Applicant's Attorney has requested a deferral until June 13, 2016.

This item was deferred with the approval of the agenda under Section V.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #010-2016

LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO SITE PLAN REIVEW W/ SPECIAL EXCEPTION AND VARIANCE(S)
Address: 224-246 Worth Ave.
Owner/Applicant: Palm V Associates Limited Partnership
Architect: Hollis Tidwell/Bridges, Marsh & Associates
Attorney: Maura Ziska
Project Description: Addition of a new elevator tower and stairs to eastern end of courtyard, with new covered second story addition on the northern façade of the courtyards southern building. Completes connection of accessible route from 2nd story apartments on Worth Avenue for the courtyard below. New landscaping, hardscaping and drainage.

At the April Meeting, motions were made by Ms. Hufty and seconded by Ms. Albarran that the implementation of the proposed lot coverage variance will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject landmarked property and the implementation of the landscape variance will cause negative architectural impacts to the subject landmarked property. Motions carried with all in favor.

SITE PLAN REVIEW WITH SPECIAL EXCEPTION AND VARIANCES INFORMATION: The applicant is requesting a Site Plan Review with Special Exception to make modifications and improvements to the east courtyard. Special Exception approval is required to add an overhang roof over the second floor walkway and modify the walkways and stairs and add an elevator to the second floor. The following describes the changes: 1) bring all buildings within the property up to ADA standards; 2) replacement of the covered breezeway on the south building; 3) addition of covered second story; 4) removal of existing Via staircase and addition of new courtyard stair connecting 3 different levels and 3 sides of the courtyard; 5) new elevator tower connecting all three levels; 6) updated drainage plan and landscape plan for courtyard; 7) eliminate the stairs in the covered walkway connecting the Via to Worth Avenue. The above improvements require the following variances: 1) Lot coverage for one story structures to be 77.6% in lieu of the 75.4% existing and 35% maximum allowed. 2) Lot coverage for two story structures to be 29.9% in lieu of the 26.7% existing and 35% maximum allowed. 3) Landscaped open space of 1.3% in lieu of the 3.6% existing and the 25% minimum required.

Mr. Page stated the Town Council did approve the variances as the Landmarks Commission had recommended the in April however this did not include the landscape variance.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Ms. Fairfax.

Ms. Ziska reiterated that Town Council approved the two variances for the lot coverage but the landscape open space variance was withdrawn. She stated that the proposed landscape plan is better than what is existing today. Ms. Ziska reminded the Commissioners that the applicant needs to get started on the construction since the property is located on Worth Avenue and there is a short summer month timeframe that is allowed for construction. Ms. Ziska then turned the presentation over to Hollis Tidwell. Mr. Tidwell presented the site plan and the proposed changes for the property, including the increased greenspace and details for the proposed stucco work.

Mr. Silvin inquired about the phasing of the project. Mr. Tidwell noted that their deadline for completion is November 1 and they are currently two weeks behind.

Commissioners Comments: Some Commissioners thought the height of the elevator tower would be better at a lower height while others liked the height and thought it was a focal point. Mr. Tidwell was also asked to make sure the flooding issues and drainage be addressed for the courtyard. Many did not like the faux window on the elevator tower and thought it should be removed. It was requested that the new railings be of good quality. There was a suggestion to change the bottom staircase railing to masonry. Mr. Tidwell agreed and thought it may help ground the elevator tower. Some of the Commission wanted more detail on the landscaping.

Motion made by Ms. Hufty and seconded by Mr. Gannon to approve the project as presented with the caveat to add the masonry staircase, with the deletion of the window in the elevator tower and to come back with a separate landscaping application to include details of the gutters. Motion carried with all in favor.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #011-2016
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Address: 930 S. Ocean Blvd.
Owner/Applicant: 1111 Partners LLC
Architect: Steven Roy/Roy & Posey Architects

Project Description: Removal of the existing flat shed roof, construction of a new barrel tile pitched roof to match existing. The roof beam height will be raised approx. 3'-0" from its current height. New exterior windows and entry doors will be introduced to the East elevation.

At the April meeting, a motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Ms. Hufty that the implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject landmarked property. Motion carried with all in favor.

VARIANCE INFORMATION: The applicant is proposing modifications to the existing pool cabana structure. The plan is to raise the floor of the existing bathroom within the structure approximately 1 foot. Also, the plan is to remove the existing flat roof and replace it with a pitched roof which will expand the height and overall height by 36 inches in the existing footprint. The following variances are requested in order to do the above improvements: 1) a side yard setback of 2.9 feet in lieu of the 15 foot minimum required; 2) a rear setback of seven (7) inches in lieu of the 15 foot minimum required; 3) a side yard setback of 2.3 feet in lieu of the 2.9 feet existing and the 15 foot minimum required.

Mr. Page stated that the Town Council approved the variances that the Landmarks Commission recommended in April.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None

Mr. Ziska reiterated that the variances were approved at Town Council. They are now asking for final approval for the interior cabana project.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Strawbridge to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

Marie Wackenhut, owner of the property, thanked the commission for their support for their project.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #016-2016
Address: 101 El Brillo Way
Owner/Applicant: Palm Trust
Architect: Michael J. Johnson
Project Description: Existing early to late 1920's residence to be modified as follows: 1) partial removal of existing later additions a) library at ground floor, b) master bedroom sitting room, c) tap room at ground floor, d) small wall at east terrace, e) existing garage extensions at west elevation, f) sitting room over tap room at second floor, g) removal of chimneys at guest wing, h) removal of existing wood stairs at guest wing, i) removal of existing barrel roof tiles. 2) Proposed modifications a) new ground floor loggia at east elevation, b) extension at second floor master bedroom and bath over new loggia, east elevation, c) extension of existing kitchen into west courtyard, d) addition of one story pool cabana at west elevation, e) reconfiguration of doors and windows as per drawings, f) reconfiguration of existing roof line as per drawings. New barrel clay tiles to match existing, g) reconfiguration of roof over master bedroom to hip roof.

The applicant is requesting a deferral until June 13, 2016.

This item was deferred with the approval of the agenda under Section V.

X. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Informal Review - Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #019-2016
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S)
Address: 2 Four Arts Plaza
Owner/Applicant: Harvey E. Oyer, III, Esq.
Architect: Bryan R. Donahue/WGI, Inc.
Project Description: Reconfigure the northern parking lot to install 26 additional parking spaces (24 perpendicular and 2 parallel). There are currently 66 parking spaces located within the northern parking lot (affected area). The redesign of the northern parking lot will add 26 additional parking spaces for a total of 92 parking spaces within the northern parking lot (affected area). The Four Arts campus (west of Four Arts Plaza) will now provide 181 off-street parking spaces.

SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCES INFORMATION: The applicant is requesting a Special Exception approval with Site Plan Review to reconfigure the northing parking lot to construct 26 additional surface parking spaces (24 perpendicular, 2 parallel). There are currently 66 surface parking spaces located within the northern parking lot (affected area). The redesign of the northern lot will add 26 additional parking spaces for a total of 92 surface parking spaces within the northern parking lot (affected area). If approved, the Four Arts campus (west of Four Arts Plaza) would provide 181 permanent off-street surface parking spaces. The applicant operates a non-profit cultural use in the R-B zoning district by an existing Special Exception. The Four Arts owns and manages the Town's library and provides lectures, art viewings, concerts, films, educational classes, and live broadcasts of the Metropolitan Opera along with other cultural offerings for its members and the public. The existing fence will remain in place located along the northern property line. As proposed and shown on the revised landscape plan, new and upgraded plant, shrub, and hedge material will be planted to provide the required buffering and screening from the adjacent property owners. The following variances are being requested to redesign the north parking lot: 1. A variance to allow the landscape open space area to be reduced from the existing 29.5% to the proposed 25.5% in lieu of 55% minimum landscape open space as required by code; 2. A variance to reduce the driving isle width required for 90 degree parking spaces within the proposed redesigned northern parking lot to 24 feet in width in lieu of 25 feet in minimum width as required by code; 3. A variance to reduce the street side yard setback for the redesigned northern parking lot to seven (7) feet in lieu of thirty-five (35) foot minimum as required by code; 4. A variance to reduce the interior minimum parking area landscape open space for the redesigned northern parking lot to 5.2% in lieu of 10% minimum as required by code.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Hufty.

Mr. Donahue presented the plans to reconfigure the north parking lot. There are currently angled parking spaces with one way access but they are proposing a two way drive aisle with perpendicular parking, which will add 26 spaces. Mr. Donahue addressed the landscaping as well as the four variances for which they are seeking approval. He also presented a site plan, demolition plan and proposed landscaping and lighting plan.

Commissioners Comments: The Commissioners thought there could be more consideration to the reduction of greenspace. Some of the Commissioners felt that a few of the proposed parking spaces could become greenspace and visually break up the long stretch of parking spaces.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Gannon that the implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject landmarked property with the caveat that two parking spaces on the north and two parking spaces on the south are used for landscaping. Motion carried with all in favor.

B. Informal Review - Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #020-2016
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S)
Address: 780 S. Ocean Blvd.
Owner/Applicant: Terry Taylor
Architect: Jason P. Drobot/Brasseur & Drobot Architects, P.A.
Attorney: Peter Broberg
Project Description: The project consists of partial demolition of an existing (+/-) 500 square foot cabana structure located at the northwest corner of the beachside property. A new 500 (+/-) square foot addition shall be constructed on the east side of the existing cabana structure. Existing hardscape and landscape shall be removed to accommodate the new structure.

SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCES INFORMATION: The applicant is requesting a Special Exception with Site Plan Review to modify an existing 500 sq. ft. beach cabana with a 500 sq. ft. addition (1,000 sq. ft. total) in the Beach Area Zoning District. The following Variances are being requested in order to expand and modify the existing beach cabana: 1) to allow a front yard setback of 22.5 feet in lieu of the 35 ft minimum setback required; 2) to allow a 16.25 ft roof height in lieu of 16 ft maximum allowed, 3) to retain the existing 43 inch wall in lieu of a wall at the required height of 30 inches in the beach vista area. The vista is required to be 75%of the lot width in this case

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Ms. Albarran.

Mr. Broberg provided for the Commissioners, a description of the proposed addition and of the variances for which they are seeking approval. He then turned the presentation over to Jason Drobot. Mr. Drobot stated the history of the property and explained the proposed addition for the property. He presented the partial site plan and the existing and proposed elevations.

Chairman Cooney asked for more explanation of the variances. Mr. Broberg provided more detail on the variances to the Commissioners. Mr. Lindgren also provided some clarification on the variances. There was some discussion regarding the variance in relationship to the existing wall.

Commissioners Comments: The Commissioners liked the addition and thought it was well done. Many members thought the wall should be left at its original height, especially since this property is a landmarked property.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Gannon that the implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject landmarked property. Motion carried with all in favor.

For the record, a short break was taken at 11:03 a.m. The meeting resumed at 11:21 a.m.

XI. DISCUSSION

1. Presentation of potential properties to consider for landmarking.

Emily Stillings and Janet Murphy from Murphy Stillings, LLC distributed a list of potential properties (exhibit 1) that they have complied to be considered for landmarking. Ms. Murphy said they have done some initial research on all of these properties and looked at microfiche for all of the properties as well. As each address was mentioned, the consultants provided minimal information about the property. Following the presentation, the Commissioners were asked to vote on the properties they thought should be placed under consideration. After the voting took place, the following properties were placed under consideration:

201 El Brillo Way (7 votes)
130 Chilean Avenue (6 votes)
125 Australian Avenue (7 votes)
228 Seaspray Avenue (8 votes)
434 Seaspray Avenue (8 votes)
109 Seabreeze Avenue (6 votes)
335 Seabreeze Avenue (6 votes)
132 Clarke Avenue (7 votes)
218 Barton Avenue (7 votes)
222 Everglade Avenue (7 votes)
210 Dunbar Road (8 votes)

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to place the eleven properties (listed above) under consideration for landmark designation. Motion carried with all in favor.

XII. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR:

Mr. Silvin commented on how impressed he was at the last Town Council meeting in regards to the decision they made to uphold the LPC's recommendation to landmark the house at 125 Seagrape Circle. He also complimented Ms. Murphy and Ms. Stillings and gave a synopsis of this particular Town Council case to the other Commissioners that did not attend the meeting. He reminded the Commissioners to be very mindful of the comments they make during the landmarking process as it could be used in the future by an attorney. A discussion about the landmarking process ensued.

Chairman Cooney discussed the possibility of holding future workshops for the Commissioners. Mr. Page added that specimen trees and landscaping could possibly be included as a topic in the future workshops.

Mr. Page reminded the Commissioners that the June meeting date was changed due to a conflict. The new meeting date will be Monday, June 13th.

Chairman Cooney asked about the addition of the tables and chairs at the Memorial Park. Mr. Page stated he would inquire about the status of the tables and chairs.

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to adjourn the meeting at 12:42 p.m.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Monday, June 13, 2016 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward A. Cooney

Edward A. Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

kmc

EXHIBIT 1

ADDRESS	STYLE	DATE	ARCHITECT
250 Algoma Rd	Colonial Revival	1937	Treanor & Fatio
343 El Brillo Way	Mediterranean Rev	1926	Builder-Pierson & Sons
201 El Brillo Way	Mediterranean Rev	1925	Marion Sims Wyeth
534 Island Drive	Neo-Classical Rev	1957	Henry Harding
28 Middle Rd	Mediterranean Rev	1926	Marion Sims Wyeth
130 Chilean Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1928	John Volk
141 Chilean Ave	Bungalow	c. 1910	Unknown
230 Chilean Ave	Am. Four Square	c. 1910	Unknown
234 Chilean Ave	Am. Four Square	c. 1910	Unknown
125 Australian Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1924	Unknown, Additions by Wyeth
455 Australian Ave	Moderne	1948	Howard Chilton
230 S. Ocean Blvd	Shingle	c. 1919	Unknown
228 Seaspray Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1926	City Builders
255 Seaspray Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1933	Wyeth & King
415 Seaspray Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1930	EB Walton
434 Seaspray Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1924	William B Eckler
109 Seabreeze Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1925	William B Eckler
147 Seabreeze Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1925	Unknown
300 Seabreeze Ave	Bungalow	c. 1910	Unknown
335 Seabreeze Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1925	William B Eckler
124 Clarke Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1925	Builder-Charles Rice
132 Clarke Ave	British Colonial Rev	1957	John Volk
220 Clarke Ave	Spanish Colonial Rev	1925	EB Walton
218 Barton Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1924	William B Eckler
315 Barton Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1924	EB Walton
311 Pendleton Ln	Monterey	1938	John Volk
315 Pendleton Ln	Georgian Rev	1939	John Volk
222 Everglade Ave	Mediterranean Rev	1927	Builder – RC Warner
210 Dunbar Rd	Mediterranean Rev	1930	Julius Jacobs
475 N. County Rd	Monterey	1937	Treanor & Fatio