



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 18, 2017.

Please be advised that in keeping with a directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
Richard Rene Silvin, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
Page Lee Hufty, Member	PRESENT
William J. Strawbridge, Jr., Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Weld Drake, Alternate Member	PRESENT (left at 11:47 a.m)
Anne Fairfax, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Jorge Sánchez, Alternate Member	ABSENT (excused)

Staff Members present were:

John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building

John Lindgren, Planning Administrator

Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Cooney led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE DECEMBER 21, 2016 MEETING

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the minutes of the December 21, 2016 meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Lindgren stated that proper notice was not provided for the following projects and could only be presented informally: COA-001-2017, 17 Golfview Rd and COA-002-2017, 340 Royal Poinciana Way, Suite 301. He stated these projects would be heard formally at the February 16, 2017 meeting.

Mr. Lindgren also stated that COA-057-2016, 323 Chilean Avenue was presented informally at the December 21, 2016 meeting and would also be deferred to the February 16, 2017 meeting due to lack of proper notice.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the agenda as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

Mr. Page stated that Ms. Albarran declared conflicts for the projects at 233 Clarke Avenue and 323 Chilean Avenue at the December 21, 2016 meeting and had correctly completed the 8B form in accordance with State Law.

Mr. Page also stated that Mr. Sánchez declared a conflict for the project at 100 Bradley Place at the December 21, 2016 meeting and had correctly completed the 8B form in accordance with State Law.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes)

There were no comments heard at this time.

VIII. INFORMAL REVIEW

1. **Mar-a Lago Helicopter Landing Pad**

At this time, the Commission decided to defer the discussion regarding the Mar-a Lago Helicopter Landing Pad to allow time for the professional to arrive.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to defer Mar-a Lago to the end of the Certificate of Appropriateness hearings. Motion carried with all in favor.

IX. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #057-2016

LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S) - Done 12/21/16

Address: 323 Chilean Ave.

Owner/Applicant: Ambassador Mark Gilbert

Architect: Jacqueline Albarran, Architect, PA

Project Description: Raise existing main house to achieve a 7.5' NGVD finish floor elevation and relocate it to the East and South. Raise existing guest house to achieve a 7.5'

NGVD finish floor elevation and leave in existing footprint. One and two story additions to both main house and guest house. New trellis, pool, spa, fountain and patios. Replace existing, non-original roof shingles with barrel tile. Replace all windows and doors with new wood impact.

VARIANCE INFORMATION: The applicant is proposing to lift the house to meet the FEMA requirement of 7.5 NGVD and construct a 60.26 square foot addition to create a new 2 car garage that will have a 7.28 foot west side yard setback in lieu of the 10 foot minimum required.

Please note: This item was deferred to the February 16, 2017 meeting with the Approval of the Agenda Item V.

X. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Informal Review - Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #001-2017

Address: 17 Golfview Road

Owner/Applicant: 17 Golfview Road, LLC

Architect: Jacqueline Albarran, Architect, PA

Landscape Architect: Matt Jackman/Nievera Williams Design

Project Description: New second story extension in interior courtyard. New wood impact windows and exterior doors. Replace existing clay barrel roof with same. Any additions, materials and detailings to match existing.

Informal Review to allow for proper notice.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None.

Please note: Ms. Albarran declared a conflict and left the dais at this time.

Ms. Albarran presented the proposed changes to the home. She presented a site map, existing and proposed vicinity map, photos of the existing home, proposed site plan, a history of the home, floor plans existing and proposed, existing and proposed roof plan; historic, existing and proposed elevations and indicated all changes proposed.

Mr. Jackman presented the proposed landscape and hardscape changes. He talked about the material and landscape that is being proposed and showed the Commissioners a site plan, elevations and colored renderings. He showed the Commission an existing fountain that will be demolished and a newly proposed fountain and its proposed location.

Commissioners Comments: Many Commissioners were in favor of the architectural changes. One of the Commissioners thought that there was too much landscaping on the front of the home facing the street. There was a request to see the original landscaping if a photo is available. Many of the Commissioners liked the proposed landscaping plan. There was a request to know if the bell still existed in the tower. There was a comment that the east fountain looked like it was placed in the setback. Mr. Jackman responded. There was a request for a technical drawing of the proposed fountain to be brought to the next meeting. Mr. Jackman agreed to do so. There was a suggestion to tone down the landscaping. Mr. Jackman agreed to restudy the landscaping.

Ms. Albarran discussed the colors to be used on the home.

Ms. Fairfax asked about the proposed location for the mechanical equipment. Ms. Albarran stated she would return to the Commission with that information but they would like to put it in the northwest corner.

Please note: This project will be heard formally at the February 16, 2017 meeting.

B. Informal Review - Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #002-2017

Address: 340 Royal Poinciana Way, Suite 301

Owner/Applicant: RPP Palm Beach Property, LP, a DE Limited Partnership

Architect: Keith Spina/Glidden Spina + Partners

Project Description: Hermès of Paris requests that in order to best activate the newly renovated courtyards at The Royal Poinciana Plaza, they will focus their main entry points on the north elevation of the suite, overlooking the restored courtyards and fountains. On the south elevation, one previously approved door will be clear glazing. On the east elevation, the former point of entry will be clear glazing, and the north elevation will accommodate the new main point of entry. Hermès of Paris is excited to shift the entry to the courtyard, as it will be the most effective way to activate the store, and the courtyards, to provide guests with an exceptional customer experience, just as John Volk originally intended for the property to function.

Informal Review to allow for proper notice.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Alexandra Patterson, UP Markets, went over the history of the plaza and its renovations. Ms. Patterson told the Commissioners that Hermès has shifted their front entrance to the courtyard and introduced the Hermès design team.

Judy Yoo, Senior Construction Manager for Hermès, discussed Hermès' design process and spoke to four proposed changes: the main entry, design of the doors, mullions on the second floor and the vertical location of mullions on the ground floor main entrance.

Ms. Patterson presented the approved elevations and indicated the proposed changes.

Ms. Albarran stated she would prefer the double pane windows but would support the single pane as well. Mr. Cooney stated that he feels that he could be more flexible with the second floor windows.

Mr. Zukov stated that the windows were divided because they were operable and now that these windows will not be operable, more flexibility should be given.

Mr. Silvin expressed his concern about what will be seen in the windows. Ms. Yoo stated Hermès' intent for the window spaces. Mr. Silvin also asked for an explanation for

the heaviness shown on the base of the door. Ms. Patterson answered Mr. Silvin's question. Ms. Fairfax requested that the drawings be changed to reflect the existing condition. Ms. Yoo stated that the trim piece is an ADA requirement.

Many of the Commissioners were in favor of the changes. Ms. Hufty requested the addition of a few shade trees.

Mses. Patterson and Yoo went over the details of the windows and the shades to be used on the windows. Mr. Silvin urged Ms. Yoo to display tasteful items in the windows. Ms. Patterson stated that UP Markets reviews all window displays in great detail and reserves the right to ask a tenant to change their window display if they find that it is not up to their standards.

Please note: This project will be heard formally at the February 16, 2017 meeting.

C. **Informal Review - Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #003-2017**

LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 101 El Brillo Way

Owner/Applicant: The Palm Trust, c/o Maura Ziska Trustee

Architect: Rafael Portuondo/Portuondo Perotti Architects, Inc.

Landscape Architect: Fernando Wong/ Fernando Wong Outdoor Living Design

Project Description: Proposed improvements include demolition of existing two-story kitchen, staff and laundry portion of residence. This area will be replaced with proposed two-story kitchen, family room and guest wing as well as basement storage. The existing residence will also be remodeled in interiors. Landscape improvements are also proposed.

VARIANCE INFORMATION: The applicant is renovating a Landmarked residence which includes a proposal to add a 7,873 square foot, two story addition with a basement to the west side of the residence for a new kitchen and guest wing and a 252 square foot two story addition to the east side of the residence to enlarge the existing office/den. The following variances are being requested: 1) a rear yard setback of 8.25 feet in lieu of the 15 foot minimum required for the guest wing addition on the west side of the residence (268 square feet is encroaching in the setback); 2) a rear yard setback of 10.33 in lieu of the 15 foot minimum required for the office/den addition to the east side of the residence (70 square feet is encroaching in the setback).

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Maura Ziska, Attorney for the owner, explained the variances that they are seeking a favorable recommendation to the Town Council for the project.

Mr. Portuondo discussed the intent in the proposed design. He presented the Commission with the proposed design of the addition and the creation of the courtyard. He showed pictures of the existing staff spaces and what was proposed for the space. He showed historic drawings, existing and proposed elevations, and a roof plan. He indicated all of the proposed changes to be made. Mr. Portuondo also went over all of the proposed fenestration changes as well.

Mr. Cooney stated he was in favor of the changes and applauded the owner for being sensitive to the historic components of the home with the changes that are proposed. Mr. Cooney also stated he was unsure about the proposed oval windows on the east elevation.

Ms. Fairfax suggested to streamline the presentation for the formal hearing and asked for an existing and proposed site plan.

Many of the Commissioners were in favor of the changes.

Ms. Albarran requested a more analytical presentation.

Ms. Ziska pointed out the areas where the new proposed addition will encroach in the setbacks.

Mr. Wong presented the proposed landscape and hardscape for the project. Mr. Cooney asked for more details, plant specification and a rendered site plan to be brought for the formal presentation. He also asked for technical drawings for any fountains that are being proposed.

Mr. Strawbridge recommended that the architects contact the Four Arts to discuss how they handled their stabilized grass.

Motion made by Ms. Hufty and seconded by Mr. Silvin that the implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject landmarked property.

Kim Davis, owner of the home, provided a history of additions to the home for the Commissioners.

Motion carried with all in favor.

INFORMAL REVIEW

Mar-a-Lago Helicopter Landing Pad

Rick Gonzalez, REG Architects, submitted a letter of review from the National Trust for Historic Preservation. Mr. Gonzalez stated that the Town Council had reviewed this project. He stated that the disruption of traffic when the President-Elect comes to Town has instigated the need for the helicopter pad. He presented the proposed slab, a property survey, the overall location for the pad, the clearances needed for the helicopters, colored photos and dimensions of the aircrafts. He also stated that the pad will be sealed concrete.

Ms. Drake asked if this pad would help to improve traffic. Mr. Gonzalez stated he believes it would.

Mr. Cooney asked about the helicopter's ability to land at the White House on grass and the reasons for having a cement pad at this location. Mr. Gonzalez responded to his question.

Mr. Page stated that the Town Council did waive certain items in the Town's Code to permit the take-off and landing of the helicopter for the President's term. A condition was placed on the decision that this would be valid for up to eight years.

Alexander Ives, 237 Jamaican Lane, expressed his opinion that the Town should request a 106 review if any federal money is spent on the project. He explained the 106 review for the Commissioners.

Mr. Gonzalez stated that he did not believe a 106 review would be appropriate and stated his reasons.

Mr. Page stated an additional condition to the Town Council's decision was that the landing pad is reserved for the principal use of the President.

A short break was taken at 11:51 a.m. The meeting resumed at 12:02 p.m.

XI. DESIGNATION HEARINGS

Item 1: 228 Seaspray Ave.

Owner: Shipley, Zachary and Gergana, 228 Seaspray Land Trust

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Ms. Albarran and Mr. Cooney.

Mr. Cooney asked for confirmation that the Town had proof of publication and notice with regard to this landmark designation hearing. Ms. Churney stated that the Town does have proof of publication.

Mr. Page stated that Skip Randolph, Attorney for the Town of Palm Beach, was participating by the phone today.

Janet Murphy, MurphyStillings, LLC, testified to the architecture and history for this Mediterranean Revival style home. Ms. Murphy pointed out the design features, which included an ornate stone door surround, arched multi-light French doors with full height shutters, decorative metal work, an exterior chimney and mixed fenestration. She also spoke about the owners of the home. Ms. Murphy testified that the building meets the following criteria for designation as a landmark:

Sec. 54-161 (1) Exemplifies or reflects the broad cultural, political, economic or social history of the nation, state, county or town: and,

Sec. 54-161 (3) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or is a specimen inherently valuable of the study of a period, style, method of construction or use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the designation report be made part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor.

Pat Segraves, Architect for the owner, stated that the owner is not opposed to having their home landmarked. He also stated that the home has been under construction since July

with some renovations to the rear of the property. He also stated they would like to replace the front windows to match what is existing. He stated they would also like to remove the shutters from the front of the home and put up awnings in the rear. He expressed his concern about being able to finish the construction. There was some discussion on this topic.

Ms. Murphy showed the Commission a photo of the home before the last renovation which indicated that the home did not originally have the front shutters. She stated that she would not be opposed to removing the shutters.

Mr. Lindgren stated that he would feel comfortable administratively approving fenestration changes and would discuss the changes with Mr. Cooney and the preservation consultants prior to approval.

Zachary Shipley, owner, stated his concern for obtaining approval for the future work that he has planned for his property. He also indicated he was flattered that the Commission was considering his home for Landmark status. He asked the Commission to delay the designation by a month or two.

Mr. Lindgren stated that delaying the designation would not change any approval process. There was some discussion on this issue.

Mr. Shipley stated he would draft a letter providing confirmation to the Commission that he is waiving his rights to a Landmark Designation Hearing until the April 19, 2017 meeting.

A second motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to defer the designation hearing to the April 19, 2017 meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

Item 2: 132 Clarke Ave.

Owner: John H. Gooch; Peter W. Fink Tr.; John H. Gooch Tr.; Blake W. Gooch Tr.; John H. Gooch Tr Titl Hldr

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mr. Silvin and Mses. Albarran and Hufty.

Mr. Cooney asked for confirmation that the Town had proof of publication and notice with regard to this landmark designation hearing. Ms. Churney confirmed that the Town does have proof of publication.

Janet Murphy, MurphyStillings, LLC, testified to the architecture and history for the 1957 John L. Volk residence. Ms. Murphy pointed out the design features of the British Colonial home with Jamaican inspiration for the Commissioners as well as provided a history of the home, including information on the original owners. Ms. Murphy testified that the building meets the following criteria for designation as a landmark:

Sec. 54-161 (3) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type or is a specimen inherently valuable of the study of a period, style, method of construction or use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship; and

Sec. 54-161 (4) Is representative of the notable work of a master builder, designer or architect whose individual ability has been recognized or who influenced his age.

Motion made by Mr. Silvin and second by Mr. Zukov that the designation report be made part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor.

Tim Hanlon, Attorney for the property owners, stated that the owners initially opposed the landmark designation but would now agree to the designation if the Commission would limit the landmark designation to the front façade only.

Mr. Cooney reminded Mr. Hanlon that if the Commission recommends designation for the front façade, any future changes would still need to be presented to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for approval. Mr. Hanlon stated that he and his client understood and agreed to that process.

Ms. Albarran stated her concerns about landmarking only the front façade. She indicated other elements of the home that she felt were important to the design. Mr. Cooney shared Ms. Albarran's concerns and especially felt the roof was a main element of the style.

Mr. Hanlon stated he and his client were prepared to oppose the designation by hiring an architect to testify on their behalf. He also stated that the consultants indicated that they would support a front façade designation.

Mr. Cooney discussed the importance of the roofline and maintaining some of the other significant elements.

Mr. Hanlon reminded the Commission that they would see all future changes to the home.

Mr. Silvin confirmed the landmarking process and discussed other properties with a front façade designation. There was some discussion about this issue.

Ms. Fairfax discussed landmarking certain facades of a home and the benefits of having a home landmarked.

Mr. Hanlon expressed his concern about the type of message it would send to the public if their decision to designate the entire home was overturned and then to have it returned to the Commission for a front façade designation.

Mr. Strawbridge asked about the history of landmark designations and the review of partial designations. Mr. Cooney and Mr. Lindgren answered his questions.

Mr. Cooney stated he did not want to send the wrong message to owners about landmark designation but his opinion was that the Commission should landmark this entire property. He discussed how this would be a recommendation to the Town Council, who could support, modify or overturn their decision. He provided further explanation on his opinion.

Ms. Hufty stated her reasons for concurring with Mr. Cooney.

A second motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Strawbridge that 132 Clarke Avenue be recommended to the Town Council designation as Landmark of the Town of Palm Beach based on criteria 3 and 4 in Section 54-161. Motion carried with all in favor.

XII. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR

Mr. Page discussed the open Landmarks Preservation Commission position and the upcoming term expirations.

Mr. Silvin updated his fellow Commissioners on the Town Council decisions at the January meeting regarding the homes recommended for Landmark status.

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to adjourn the meeting at 12:41 p.m. Motion carried with all in favor.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, February 16, 2017 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,



Edward A. Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

kmc