TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 20, 2018.

Please be advised that in keeping with a directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
Richard Rene Silvin, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
Page Lee Hufty, Member	PRESENT
Patrick Segraves, Member	PRESENT
John T. Gannon, Member	PRESENT
Kim Coleman, Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Weld Drake, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Sue Patterson, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Anne Metzger, Alternate Member	ABSENT (excused)

Staff Members present were:
John Lindgren, Planning Administrator
Josh Martin, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building
Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator
Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission
John Randolph, Town Attorney
Emily Stillings, Preservation Consultant for the Town of Palm Beach
Janet Murphy, Preservation Consultant for the Town of Palm Beach

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Cooney led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE JULY 18, 2018 MEETING

Motion made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Ms. Albarran to approve the minutes of the July 18, 2018 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Cooney requested to withdraw the following project from the agenda: COA-002-2018, 323 Chilean Ave.

Motion made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Mr. Gannon to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried unanimously.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes):

Amanda Skier, Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach introduced Aimee Sunny, the new Director of Education at the Preservation Foundation.

Mr. Cooney congratulated Ms. Coleman on her promotion to a regular member position by appointment at the last Town Council meeting. He also congratulated Anne Metzger, who was appointed as an alternate member.

VIII. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #031-2018
   Address: 130 Brazilian Ave.
   Owner/Applicant: David and Zoya Soane
   Professional: Jason Drobot/Brasseur & Drobot Architects P.A.
   Project Description: Project consists of hardscape renovations including: removal of the existing concrete driveway and brick entrance walkway, the addition of a new brick driveway and entrance walkway to the northwest and west of the existing residence, the addition of a new concrete driveway to the southwest of the existing residence, the addition of a metal rolling gate and a 4 ft. high site wall at the northern property line, and the addition of a metal rolling gate and a 4 ft. high site wall on the west side of the existing residence. The project also consists of renovations to the existing guest house including: removal of an existing arched parapet wall and restoration of the original parapet wall on the north elevation, removal of an existing round window on the north elevation, replacement of various doors and windows on the west and south elevations, an additional window to be an additional window to be installed on the south elevation, and removal of existing windows on the south elevation with a French door addition and step in its place. The project also consists of the removal of an existing metal rail located on the north elevation of the main residence.

   A motion carried at the July meeting to defer the project to the August 20, 2018 meeting.

   Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Messrs. Cooney, Segraves and Ms. Albarran.

Jeffrey Brasseur, Brasseur & Drobot Architects P.A., presented the proposed architectural changes to the residence.

Andres Paradelo, Paradelo Burgess Design Studio, presented the proposed landscape plans for the residence.

Ms. Coleman expressed concern about the proposed vehicular gate design. Ms. Coleman asked for clarification on the round window. Mr. Brasseur explained that the round window would remain as is.

Mr. Silvin asked Mr. Lindgren about zoning requirements for the vehicular gates. Mr. Lindgren responded.

Ms. Hufty asked Mr. Lindgren about zoning requirements for the wall on the property line. Mr. Lindgren responded.

Mr. Silvin asked about the proposed material for the garage doors. Mr. Brasseur stated that they were existing and would remain. Mr. Silvin asked about the materials of the existing garage doors. Mr. Brasseur responded.

Ms. Hufty agreed with Ms. Coleman about the proposed vehicular gate design and thought the gates were charmless and aggressive. Mr. Brasseur stated the owner stated they would forego the vehicular gate at the front of the property but wanted to keep the interior gate for privacy.

Ms. Hufty expressed concern about the amount of Liriope proposed. Mr. Williams responded.

Mr. Patterson agreed with Mr. Silvin about his assessment of the garage doors. She recommended softening the front vehicular gate. Mr. Brasseur responded and stated he would revisit the gate design.

A short discussion ensued about the front vehicular gate. Mr. Brasseur discussed the reasons that his clients had requested a front gate. The commissioners suggested using a chain in lieu of a gate. Mr. Lindgren stated that using a chain was not allowable by Code.

Mr. Castro stated that chains across driveways were not permitted by Code and has never been approved by any Commission.

A short discussion ensued about the driveway gate.

Mr. Segraves stated that he was in favor of the interior gate but was not in favor of a vehicular gate.

Motion made by Mr. Segraves and seconded by Ms. Albarran to approve the project as presented with the exception of the front vehicular gate. Motion carried unanimously.

2. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #033-2018
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE - Done 7/18/18
Address: 120 El Brillo Way
Owner/Applicant: Margaretta Taylor
Professional: Harold Smith/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc.
Project Description: Addition of an exterior stair to the southeast corner of the main house. Partial replacement of windows and exterior doors.

A motion carried at the July meeting that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject landmark property.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Segraves and Ms. Albarran.

Mr. Smith stated the Town Council approved the zoning requests at the August meeting. He presented the proposed architectural changes to the residence. Mr. Smith also presented a window and door replacement that had been approved over a year ago.

Mr. Smith raised an issue that he had encountered with the 2017 Building Code relating to energy efficiency. Mr. Cooney stated that the landmarked project was exempt from that section of the Code and provided the reasons for the exemption.

Mr. Smith further explained his plan for the window and door replacement.

Mr. Segraves stated he was in favor of the stair design. He also stated he would be in favor of extending an approval for all of the windows and door replacements.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented as well as additionally allowing the future window and door replacements to be administratively approved as long as the replacement material is the same. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Cooney opposed.

3. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #034-2018
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S) - Done 7/18/18
Address: 101 Four Arts Plaza

Owner/Applicant: Society of the Four Arts, Inc.
Professional: Bryan Donahue/Insite Studio, Inc.
Project Description: The applicant is seeking Landmarks Preservation Commission approval to make changes to the Landmarked property with the addition of the "Eve's Apple Sculpture". The sculpture is the work of Edwina Sandys and captures the moment in the Bible when Eve has taken a bite from The Tree of Knowledge and offers Adam the apple. The sculpture will be installed on the north side of the Hulitar Sculpture Garden and will stand 14'2" tall including a 2'6" base.

A motion carried at the July meeting that implementation of the proposed special exception with site plan review and variance will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject landmark property.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None.

Mr. Donahue stated the Town Council approved the zoning requests at the August meeting. He presented the proposed sculpture installed at the Four Arts.

Ms. Hufty expressed her frustration that that the Four Arts did not get approval prior to installation. She also asked for confirmation that the base would be removed with the sculpture at the end of its tenure.

Kenny Lewis, Conkling & Lewis Construction, Inc. confirmed it would be removed with the sculpture.

Motion made by Mr. Segraves and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

4. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #036-2018
Address: 238 Worth Ave.
Owner/Applicant: Palm V Associates Limited Partnership/Burton Handelsman
Professional: Roger Hansrote/Architectural Consultants Inc.
Project Description: Replace existing aluminum door and transom with wood door and transom on exterior wall at the south end of the via and install new display window adjacent to replaced door. Install pecky cypress trim on all existing and new display windows facing the via.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None

Richard Leja, Architectural Consultants Inc., presented the proposed architectural change for the commercial space.

Mr. Cooney asked if the changes would continue to the storefront. Mr. Leja stated that they would not unless a new tenant made the same changes.

Ms. Albarran inquired about the trim around the windows. Mr. Leja responded.

Mr. Cooney asked how the grade change transition would be executed for the new accessible door. Mr. Leja responded.

Ms. Albarran asked if a grade change was necessary since the door was existing. Mr. Leja responded.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Ms. Coleman to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

Please note: A short break was taken at 10:30 a.m. The meeting resumed at 10:43 a.m.

Mr. Cooney welcomed Josh Martin as the new Director of the Planning, Zoning and Building department.

5. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #037-2018
Address: 356 S. County Rd.
Owner/Applicant: Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach Inc.
Professional: Gerard Beekman/Gramatan Corporation
Project Description: Replacement of cracked cast concrete fountain with a new carved limestone fountain. Replacement of decorative flower pots that are too small to sustain vegetation with decorative finials that complement the new fountain. Replace the tile in the two water troughs and make the spigots water spouts. Update the vegetation plan while maintaining all hardscape, walls, pergolas & benches.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Cooney.

Amanda Skier, Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach, introduced the restoration project for the Earl E. T. Smith Memorial Park and provided some history about the park.

Mr. Beekman presented the architectural and landscape changes proposed for the park.

Mr. Cooney noted that some of the landscape had been removed on the north end of the park. He added that there was an administrative approval given to allow some of the landscape to grow in the summer months.

Mr. Silvin was in favor of the proposed changes. Mr. Silvin addressed the state of the existing fountains as well as the standing water currently in the fountains. Mr. Silvin thought the pineapple finial on the top of the fountain was too small. He also liked the planters that were proposed for removal. Ms. Skier responded to the maintenance issues with the fountains.

Ms. Hufty asked Mr. Beekman to make sure there was plenty of shade by installing shade trees. She was supportive of the changes and agreed with Mr. Silvin that the pineapple finial was too small.

Ms. Coleman agreed with Mr. Silvin that the pineapple finial was too small.

Mr. Gannon was in favor of the project and expressed appreciation for the donor.

Mr. Cooney was in favor of the project but expressed concern about the relocation of the equipment and its proposed proximity to the benches. Mr. Beekman responded. There was a short discussion about the proposed location of the equipment.

Mr. Cooney asked about the proposed tile. Mr. Beekman responded.

Ms. Coleman asked about the proposed materials. Mr. Beekman presented a few proposed material samples. A short discussion ensued about the material choices.

Ms. Hufty expressed frustration that there was no running water in the fountains in the Town. A short discussion ensued about the water in the fountains.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented, with the possibility to increase the size of the pineapple finial, to mitigate the noise of the water pumps and to create shade in the park with the trees. Motion carried unanimously.

6. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #038-2018
Address: 8 S. Lake Trail
Owner/Applicant: Robb Turner
Professional: Fernando Wong Outdoor Living Design
Project Description: New hardscape material for outdoor terrace, walkway and steps with landscape changes. *****This is a tax abatement project*****

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Cooney.

Tim Johnson, Fernando Wong Outdoor Living Design, presented the proposed hardscape material change. Mr. Johnson presented a material sample of the proposed shell stone.

There was a short discussion about the proposed shell stone in contract to Dominican coral stone.

Mr. Johnson presented a second option for the hardscape material changes.

Mr. Segraves asked about the transitions between the different materials. Mr. Johnson responded.

Mr. Cooney stated that the terraces and pool copings should be Florida coral stone rather than the Dominican coral stone. Mr. Johnson stated the reasons he would not prefer to use the coral stone on the terraces.

Ms. Coleman suggested using coral stone on the western patio of the home to remain consistent.

Mr. Cooney stated he would prefer to use coral stone on as much as the hardscape as possible.

Mr. Johnson asked if the Commission would compromise and allow the installation of coral stone on the patios that touch the home while using shell stone on the other surfaces.

A short discussion ensued about the aging and maintenance of coral stone.

Ms. Stillings reminded the Commission that this project was a tax abatement project. She reminded the Commission of the Secretary of Interior Standards that applied to the project. She recommended retaining the Florida coral stone where it was possible.

Mr. Cooney explained that Mr. Johnson wanted to introduce a change in the pool design. Mr. Johnson presented the new pool and spa design.

Some of the Commissioners were not in favor of the round spa design within the design of the pool. Mr. Segraves and Ms. Albarran made a suggestion for an alternate spa design. A short discussion ensued about the shape of the spa and retaining the original pool shape.

Mr. Johnson expressed concern that he would not be able to obtain enough Florida keystone in time to finish the project. He asked the Commission to compromise and to allow the owners to use Dominican coral stone rather than the Florida keystone.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Ms. Coleman to continue with the original coral stone, either by repairing the existing or to find matching stone, and to defer the pool and spa design to the September 21, 2018 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

7. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #039-2018
   Address: 101 El Brillo Way
   Owner/Applicant: Kim Davis
   Professional: Jose Luis Gonzalez-Perotti/Portuondo Perotti Architects

Project Description: Revision to previously approved project (previous COA-003-2017, COA-044-2017, COA-019-2018.) Proposed elimination of portion of second story at new guest wing facing west neighbor. ****This is a tax abatement project*****

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None.

Rafael Portuondo, Portuondo Perotti Architects, presented the proposed architectural modifications to the residence.

Many of the Commissioners were in favor of the changes and thought the design was a substantial improvement.

Ms. Stillings thought the proposed changes was a better fit for the historic home.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

8. Informal Review - Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #002-2018
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S) - Done 1/17/18
Address: 323 Chilean Ave.
Owner/Applicant: Ambassador Mark Gilbert
Professional: Jacqueline Albarran/SKA Architect + Planner, Inc.
Project Description: Demolition of existing deteriorated main house structure, patio and driveway (existing two story guest house to remain). Existing perimeter landscaping remains. New irrigated lawn as per code. New two story house to match previously approved but places at 8' NGVD finish floor elevation reworking some arches and roof slope as per original historic photo. Raise existing guest house to achieve an 8' NGVD finish floor elevation. Leave in existing footprint with new one story addition, trellis, pool, spa, fountain and patios as previously approved.

Project History:

- January 2018 – Presented and motion carried that the implementation of the proposed special exception, site plan review and variances would not cause negative architectural impact to the subject landmarked property.
- February 2018 – Motion carried to defer the project to the April 2018 meeting at the request of the attorney
- April 2018 – Motion carried to defer the project to the May 2018 meeting at the request of the attorney
- May 2018 – Presented and deferred to the June 2018 meeting
- June 2018 – Deferred to the July 2018 meeting at the owner's request.

- July 2018 – Presented and deferred to the August 2018 meeting to allow the architect to explore restoration rather than demolition.

Please note: This item was withdrawn at the approval of the agenda, Item V.

X. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING, ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR.

Mr. Lindgren stated that Ms. Albarran declared a conflict for her project at 323 Chilean Ave. at the July 18, 2018 meeting and had correctly completed the 8B form in accordance with State Law.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

A motion made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Mr. Segraves to adjourn the meeting at 12:11 p.m. Motion carried unanimously.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Friday, September 21, 2018 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward A Cooney

Edward Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

kmc