



**TOWN OF PALM BEACH
PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING
DEPARTMENT**

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, JULY 17, 2019.**

Please be advised that in keeping with a directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
Richard Rene Silvin, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
Patrick Segraves, Member	PRESENT
John T. Gannon, Member	PRESENT
Kim Coleman, Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Sue Patterson, Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Anne Metzger, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Marcia M. Cini, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Fernando Wong, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Please note: Mses. Metzger and Cini voted in the absence of Mses. Coleman and Patterson.

Staff Members present were:

John Lindgren, Planning Administrator
Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission
Emily Stillings, Preservation Consultant for the Town of Palm Beach
Janet Murphy, Preservation Consultant for the Town of Palm Beach

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Cooney led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE JUNE 19, 2019 MEETING

Motion made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Ms. Albarran to approve the minutes of the June 19, 2019 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Lindgren requested the withdrawal of project COA-041-2019, 241 Seaview Avenue from the agenda.

Motion made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Mr. Gannon to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried unanimously.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes):

Mr. Silvin commended the Memorial Fountain's maintenance and stated that the fountain looks cleaner. Many other Commissioners agreed. Mr. Silvin inquired if any plantings would be added to the four basins at the front of the fountain. Mr. Lindgren stated he would speak with Public Works to determine the plan for the four basins.

Ms. Cini asked about the status of the property at 323 Chilean Avenue. Mr. Silvin inquired about this property as well and the motion that was made at the last meeting to place the property under deterioration by neglect.

VIII. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #041-2018

***LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S)* - Done 9/21/18**

Address: 241 Seaview Avenue

Owner/Applicant: Palm Beach Day Academy, Inc.

Professional: Nievera Williams Design

Project Description: Addition of paved parking lot, landscape improvements and drainage improvements.

Project History:

October 2018 – Deferred to the November meeting at the request of the attorney.

November 2018 – Deferred to the December meeting at the request of the attorney.

December 2018 – Deferred to the January meeting at the request of the Staff.

January 2019 – Deferred to the February meeting at the request of the Staff.

February 2019 – Deferred to the April meeting at the request of the Attorney.

April 2019 – Deferred to the May meeting at the request of the Attorney.

Please note: This item was withdrawn at the Approval of the Agenda, Item V.

2. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #020-2019

Address: 822 S. County Rd.

Owner/Applicant: John D. Idol

Professional: Mario Nievera/Nievera Williams Design

Project Description: Revisions to the previous Landmarks submittal, COA-010-2019, including proposed landscape, driveway alignment, and pool terraces (north and south).

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mses. Albarran and Metzger.

Mr. Nievera presented the proposed modifications to the property's landscape and hardscape. Mr. Nievera also presented alternate renderings on the overhead projector.

Mr. Silvin inquired if the dock was shown to scale. Mr. Nievera confirmed it was drawn to scale. Mr. Silvin asked if there was a gate proposed for the dock. Mr. Nievera stated that a gate was not proposed.

Ms. Albarran inquired about the plans for the Gumbo Limbo trees on the site. Mr. Nievera responded.

Mr. Segraves inquired about the existing location of the driveway. Mr. Nievera explained the existing conditions of the entry to the property.

Ms. Albarran inquired about the vehicular gate. Mr. Nievera stated that the gate had already been approved.

Ms. Metzger was in favor of the proposed design.

Mr. Cooney asked for public comment. There were no comments heard at this time.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented.

Mr. Wong stated he was in favor of the design. However, he questioned the placement and proximity of one of the palm trees adjacent to the sidewalk. Mr. Nievera responded and further explained the design of the palm trees.

Motion carried unanimously.

3. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #021-2019

Address: 236 & 238 Phipps Plaza

Owner/Applicant: Phipps Plaza Properties Partners LLC

Professional: Keith Spina/Glidden Spina + Partners

Project Description: The scope of work includes a rehabilitation of two existing townhomes at 236 Phipps Plaza and 238 Phipps Plaza. The rehabilitation includes removing and replacing exterior windows, exterior doors, exterior railings, gutters, downspouts, terra cotta tile roofing, and exterior light fixtures. All previously painted pecky cypress architectural elements will be stripped of paint and restored to the original finish. All existing historical features such as cast stone columns, entry surrounds, corbels, lintels, and railings are to remain as existing. The scope also includes demolition of interior walls, doors, plumbing fixtures, and interior stairs while keeping interior historical features such as, exposed pecky cypress, recessed mosaic sinks and shelving, and fireplaces as existing to remain. The function of the building will remain as a town home. Further, the scope includes rehabilitation of the landscape and hardscape of the front yard, side yards, and interior courtyard. *****Please note: this is a tax abatement project. *****

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Spina presented the proposed architectural modifications for the two townhomes.

Mr. Silvín inquired about the division of the apartments in the buildings. Mr. Spina explained the design of the different apartments.

Mr. Spina stated the proposed material for the windows would be the CGI Estate Series windows.

Mr. Segraves inquired about the proposed colors for the buildings. Mr. Spina presented the proposed colors to the Commission.

Mr. Segraves asked about the exterior stair to be enclosed and the roof over the stairs. Mr. Spina presented an alternate drawing of the exterior stair and roof on the overhead projector. Mr. Segraves stated he was a bit concerned for the perceived bulkiness as well as the front façade of the enclosed stair. Mr. Segraves suggested adding more interest to the front façade.

Ms. Albarrán suggested using the originally proposed roof with a section removed above the stairs. Mr. Spina stated he could study the suggestion.

Mr. Cooney inquired about the second floor windows and asked if the professional found any historic photographs of the original windows. Mr. Spina stated he did try to find photos but would do some more research. Mr. Segraves recommended using casement windows as a replacement.

Mr. Cooney recommended that the professional change the glass to clear rather than the low energy proposed. Mr. Spina agreed to make the change.

Ms. Albarran asked to see the balcony design on the front façade. Mr. Spina showed the design of the balcony. Ms. Albarran suggested that the pickets align with the large rafter tails below. Mr. Spina agreed.

Mr. Gannon commended the revitalization of the area.

Mr. Wong inquired about the location of the downspouts. Mr. Segraves stated he was going to ask about the proposed locations as well. Mr. Spina responded.

Mr. Nievera presented the proposed modifications for the property's landscape and hardscape.

Mr. Cooney asked about the buffer between the JP Morgan building and the townhomes. Mr. Nievera explained the design.

Mr. Cooney inquired about the elimination of the fountain in the courtyard. Mr. Nievera stated he did not see the need for the fountain and added that there were other fountains proposed for the project.

Ms. Metzger asked about the wires overhead and asked Mr. Spina if he knew when the utility wires would be buried. Mr. Spina stated that some of the wires would be buried initially.

Mr. Silvin complimented the changes and thought they would enhance the area.

Mr. Spina presented the construction-screening plan to the Commissioners.

Mr. Wong expressed concern for the palms proposed underneath the balcony, north façade, due to the limitation in space. He asked if something else could be planted or questioned if they could be eliminated altogether. Mr. Nievera stated he could reconsider the palms.

Mr. Segraves stated he was in favor of how the palms soften the buildings. Mr. Gannon agreed. Mr. Segraves wondered if more space could be gained by removing some of the pavement.

Ms. Stillings expressed concern for the design of the enclosed staircase and balcony and thought it could use some restudy. Ms. Stillings recommended mimicking the first floor windows on the second floor. Ms. Stillings stated that the remainder of the changes proposed was in keeping with the Secretary of Interior's guidelines.

Mr. Cooney asked for public comment.

Amanda Skier, Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach, spoke in favor of the project and stated they have historical photos that they would be happy to share with the professional.

A discussion ensued about a possible motion.

Motion made by Mr. Segraves and seconded by Ms. Albarran to defer the project for one month, to the August 21, 2019 meeting, to allow the professional to address the comments from the Commission. Motion carried unanimously.

Please note: A short break was taken at 10:46 a.m. The meeting resumed at 11:02 a.m.

4. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #022-2019
Address: 264 & 270 S. County Rd.
Owner/Applicant: Carriage House Properties Partners LLC
Professional: Glidden Spina + Partners
Project Description: The scope of work includes a rehabilitation of two existing commercial structures at 264 South County Road and 270 South County Road. The rehabilitation includes removing and replacing exterior windows, exterior doors, gutters, downspouts, terra cotta tile roofing, and exterior light fixtures. All previously painted pecky cypress architectural elements will be stripped of paint and restore. All existing historical features such as cast stone columns, entry surrounds, corbels, lintels, terracotta soffit, coquina banding and pecky cypress wood craved beams are to remain as existing. The scope also includes demolition of interior walls, doors, and plumbing fixtures while keeping interior historical features such as, exposed pecky cypress and hand painted tiles, as existing to remain. Further, the scope includes rehabilitation of the landscape and hardscape of the front yard, side yards, and interior courtyard. *****Please note: this is a tax abatement project.***

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Spina presented the architectural modifications proposed for the two commercial structures.

Mr. Silvin discussed the undergrounding timeline. Mr. Spina showed the Commission the area proposed that would be underground with the renovation of the project.

Ms. Albarran asked the professional to fix the left window placement on the second floor on plan PH.9. Mr. Spina stated he would fix the drawing.

Mr. Silvin implored the professional to having a working clock on the building. Mr. Spina agreed.

Ms. Metzger inquired if any parking spaces would be eliminated in the JP Morgan parking lot. Mr. Spina stated that only the landscaping would be changed.

Mr. Gannon stated that the cleaning of the coquina, the changing of the front door and the removal of the awnings would lighten the building.

Mr. Silvin spoke in favor of the two arched windows on the 264 building.

Mr. Segraves asked about the design of the proposed awnings. Mr. Spina spoke about the details of the awnings.

Mr. Cooney asked the professional to research old drawings of the buildings, particularly to match the design details on the windows. Mr. Cooney also discussed the ability to match the existing coquina during the replacement and restoration.

Mr. Cooney expressed concern about the water and weatherproofing of the building. Mr. Spina responded and stated he did not believe waterproofing would be an issue.

Mr. Cooney discussed the material proposed for the windows and inquired if some of the original windows at 264 could be restored. A short discussion ensued regarding the use of steel windows on the building.

Mr. Nievera presented the proposed modifications for the property's landscape and hardscape.

Mr. Cooney was in favor of the entrance and the courtyard plantings but expressed concern for the espalier on the coquina facades.

Mr. Segraves agreed with Mr. Cooney and suggested to eliminate the espalier at the start of the project with the idea to revisit the plantings later. Mr. Nievera agreed.

Mr. Silvin thought that lighting would be very important for ambiance. Mr. Nievera agreed.

The Commission discussed the wall connection between the two buildings.

Mr. Wong complimented the project. He suggested adding Bougainvillea to the north façade of 270. Mr. Nievera agreed.

Ms. Albarran provided a vendor suggestion for the window material for the windows on the 270 building.

Mr. Cooney inquired about the fireplace in the 264 building. A discussion ensued about the fireplace. Mr. Spina stated he would rather not keep the existing fireplace in the 264 building.

Mr. Cooney asked about the proposed trash locations. Mr. Spina responded. A discussion ensued about the trash and workflow of the kitchen.

Mr. Cooney requested the professional not to install any sconces at the front door of the 264 building. Mr. Spina stated that there were no sconces proposed.

Ms. Cini clarified that clear glass would be used for the windows as opposed to low energy. Mr. Spina stated he would use clear glass.

Ms. Stillings stated she would prefer the steel windows on the 264 building and was not in favor of the proposed espalier of rubber plants on the coquina. Ms. Stillings did not have a strong objection to the removal of the fireplace. Ms. Stillings stated that the remainder of the changes proposed was in keeping with the Secretary of Interior's guidelines.

Mr. Cooney asked for public comment.

Amanda Skier, Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach, spoke about the removal of the fireplace and thought it warranted more discussion. Mr. Spina stated he could relocate the mantle.

Mr. Silvin asked if relocation of the fireplace was possible. Mr. Spina stated it would be possible. Many of the Commissioners stated they would like to see the fireplace relocated.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented with the following caveats: the use of steel windows on the 264 building, the use of La Finestra windows on all other areas, the deletion of any espalier on the coquina at 264, to hide the wall between 264 and 270 with landscaping, and to return to the August 21, 2019 meeting with photographs and the relocation of the fireplace in the 264 building. Motion carried unanimously.

IX. DISCUSSION ITEM

1. Discussion of potential properties to consider for Landmark Designation.

Ms. Murphy presented the following properties to consider for future landmark designation: 167 Clarendon Drive, 242 Jungle Road, 686 Island Drive, 225 South County Road, 150 Australian Avenue, 232 Cocoanut Road, 400 Seaspray Avenue, 230

Seaspray Avenue, 300 Seabreeze Avenue, 306 Seabreeze Avenue and 300 Clarke Avenue. The consultants answered the Commissioners questions about the homes proposed.

Mr. Cooney stated that the Town's purchasing department has begun the process for the Historic Site Surveys to be completed.

Mr. Cooney called for Public Comment.

Marsha Fick, 230 Seaspray Avenue, expressed concern for the potential landmarking of her home. Messrs. Silvin and Cooney addressed the concerns of Ms. Fick.

Mr. and Mrs. Tylander, 225 S. County Road, discussed their concerns with the potential landmarking of their home. A short discussion ensued. Mr. Silvin addressed a question that Mrs. Tylander raised relating to the financial effect that landmarking would have on their home.

A short discussion ensued about the zoning on the Sea Streets as well as the benefits of Landmarking.

Aimee Sunny, Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach, complimented the Tylanders and Ms. Fick for attending the Landmark meeting and learning about the Landmark process. Mr. Silvin recommended adding an invitation for homeowners to attend a meeting when an under consideration letter is sent.

Ms. Sunny also spoke about the work of the two interns at The Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach.

Anne Pepper, 333 Seaspray Avenue, stated that there were 11 homes for sale on Seaspray Avenue and expressed concern for the potential for demolition.

The Commission decided to consider the proposed homes over the next month and would vote in August to place them under consideration.

X. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING, ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR.

Mr. Lindgren stated that Ms. Albarran declared a conflict for the Certificate of Appropriateness for 323 Chilean Avenue at the June 19, 2019 meeting and had correctly completed the 8B form in accordance with State Law.

Mr. Lindgren stated that the Commission would reconvene at Town Hall at 3 p.m. for the site visit tour. Mr. Lindgren asked that all members arrive between 2:30 p.m. and 3 p.m.

Mr. Cooney reminded everyone that the tour was a public meeting and added that the public was invited. Mr. Cooney also stated that the Sunshine Law would still apply since the tour was a public meeting.

A short discussion ensued about the tour.

Mr. Silvin reviewed the items relating to Landmarks that were heard at the July Town Council meeting.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 1:04 p.m. without the benefit of a motion. Motion carried unanimously.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, August 21, 2019 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Edward A. Cooney", with a long, sweeping horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Edward Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

kmc