TOWN OF PALM BEACH
PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 21, 2019.

Please be advised that in keeping with a directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
Richard Rene Silvin, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
Patrick Segraves, Member	PRESENT
John T. Gannon, Member	PRESENT (left at 11:00 a.m.)
Kim Coleman, Member	PRESENT
Sue Patterson, Member	ABSENT (excused)
Anne Metzger, Alternate Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Marcia M. Cini, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Fernando Wong, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Please note: Ms. Cini voted in the absence of Ms. Patterson.

Staff Members present were:
John Lindgren, Planning Administrator
Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission
Josh Martin, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building
Emily Stillings, Preservation Consultant for the Town of Palm Beach
Janet Murphy, Preservation Consultant for the Town of Palm Beach

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Cooney led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE JULY 17, 2019 MEETING

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the minutes of the July 17, 2019 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Motion made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Ms. Albarran to approve the agenda as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. PRESENTATIONS

1. Gold Star Families – Proposed plaque for Memorial Park

   Lauren Berkson, Gold Star Families, showed a video about Gold Star Families. She presented a proposed plaque to be installed in Memorial Park that would honor Gold Star Families.

   Mr. Silvin thanked Ms. Berkson for her presentation and welcomed the proposal.

   Mr. Gannon stated he worked with the organization in the past and spoke very highly of them. He welcomed the proposal as well.

   Mr. Cooney asked if the plaque would be curved to fit on the wall. Mr. Lindgren stated that he researched the company that manufactured the previous plaques and confirmed it would match the others.

   Motion made by Mr. Segraves and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the plaque as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

VIII. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes):

Mr. Silvin thanked staff for the tour in July of a few of the previous and completed projects.

Mr. Silvin inquired about the status of the four basins in Memorial Park. Mr. Lindgren stated he would reach out to the Public Works Department to obtain a status for the next meeting.

Mr. Silvin inquired about the demolition of neglect of 323 Chilean Avenue.
Mr. Lindgren provided an update to the Commission of the upcoming work to be completed, specifically to the roof.

Mr. Silvin expressed a concern for the shingles sitting on the roof in the event of a storm. Mr. Lindgren discussed the steps the Town takes to secure construction sites prior to major storms. Ms. Albarran discussed the reason the shingles need to sit on the roof prior to installation.

2. Bradley Park Hotel – West Façade and Sculpture

Ned Grace, Ausmerica, stated he had been working for a Federal Tax Credit for the project and discussed the processes involved to apply and potentially receive the tax credit. He stated that the courtyard fence was an issue for the State Historic Preservation Officer. He indicated that he would be presenting the proposed modifications requested by the State Historic Preservation Officer.

Mr. Cooney asked if the project was a tax abatement project. Mr. Grace confirmed it was a tax abatement project. Mr. Cooney stated that the County would require a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the changes.

Ms. Stillings stated that the Town has always required a COA approval for tax abatement projects but was not certain that the County required it for the tax abatement application.

Mr. Segraves asked if the State looked at the Landmarks Commission's recommendation when making their decision. Mr. Cooney stated that the Federal decision outweighed the Commission's decision.

Mr. Grace further discussed the State approval process.

Ms. Coleman inquired if the initial plan was to apply for the Federal Tax Credit. Mr. Grace responded.

Ms. Stillings addressed the Secretary of Interior's Standards and the State Historic Officer's decision compared to the Landmark Commission's recommendation. She also stated that the procedure listed by the Town indicated that a tax abatement project must have a Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the project. She recommended that the changes presented should return for a formal COA approval.

Mr. Grace requested that staff allow them to continue with the permitting process for the changes. Mr. Cooney agreed and indicated it should not be a problem.

Keith Spina, GliddenSpina, presented the proposed changes for the west side of the hotel.

Mr. Cooney questioned whether the vestibule on the west façade was an original feature. Mr. Spina showed a historic photograph of the building that showed the original west façade.

Ms. Coleman asked if the clear glass was necessary. Mr. Spina responded and explained the fenestration choices.

Mr. Grace stated the west façade would need to return to the Commission, as the State Historic Preservation Officer had not reviewed it.

Ms. Coleman asked about the window boxes on the west facade.

Mr. Cooney pointed out that the awnings were remaining on the rendering and needed to be removed. Mr. Spina agreed.

Ms. Albarran asked about the windows without any muntins. Mr. Spina responded.

Mr. Spina presented the changes for the mechanical equipment on the roof. Mr. Grace further explained the design.

Mr. Cooney stated that the important change was the removal of the metal cage. Mr. Spina confirmed it would be removed.

Mr. Spina presented the white elephant sculpture proposed for the front of the hotel. He also presented the changes proposed to the courtyard.

Mr. Segraves inquired if the center gate to the pool would be used. Mr. Grace responded and stated the central sight line was important to the State Historic Officer. A discussion ensued about the courtyard.

Mr. Silvin inquired if the hedge could be raised after the approval. Mr. Grace explained with the Federal Tax Credit, any permanent element could not be changed for five years. Mr. Grace reviewed some of the elements of the project that could potentially be modified.

Ms. Cini inquired about whether the National Park Service would make any other changes. Mr. Grace responded.

Mr. Silvin spoke in favor of the proposed white elephant. Mr. Silvin inquired if rental boats, similar to the hotel in Nantucket, would be available. Mr. Grace responded.

Ms. Coleman inquired about the estimated completion date. Mr. Grace responded.

Mr. Cooney called for public comment.

Amanda Skier, Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach, spoke in favor of the project.

The consensus of the Commission was to allow the project to move forward with the knowledge that the project would return for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

IX. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #021-2019
   Address: 236 & 238 Phipps Plaza
   Owner/Applicant: Phipps Plaza Properties Partners LLC
   Professional: Glidden Spina + Partners
   Project Description: The scope of work includes a rehabilitation of two existing townhomes at 236 Phipps Plaza and 238 Phipps Plaza. The rehabilitation includes removing and replacing exterior windows, exterior doors, exterior railings, gutters, downspouts, terra cotta tile roofing, and exterior light fixtures. All previously painted pecky cypress architectural elements will be stripped of paint and restored to the original finish. All existing historical features such as cast stone columns, entry surrounds, corbels, lintels, and railings are to remain as existing. The scope also includes demolition of interior walls, doors, plumbing fixtures, and interior stairs while keeping interior historical features such as, exposed pecky cypress, recessed mosaic sinks and shelving, and fireplaces as existing to remain. The function of the building will remain as a town home. Further, the scope includes rehabilitation of the landscape and hardscape of the front yard, side yards, and interior courtyard. ****Please note: this is a tax abatement project.****

   A motion carried at the July meeting to defer the project for one month to the August 21, 2019 meeting to allow the professional to address the comments from the Commission.

   Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None.

   Keith Spina, GliddenSpina, presented the modifications proposed for the two existing townhomes.

   Ms. Albarran requested that the balustrades aligned with the rafter tails below. Mr. Spina stated that he would make sure they were aligned. Ms. Albarran requested to remove the middle window of the three in the staircase. Mr. Spina stated he would not be opposed to the removal of the middle window.

   Mr. Spina asked the Commission how they felt if the proposal was to remove the exterior staircase. There was some discussion about the potential removal of the exterior staircase.

   Ms. Stillings thought the removal of the staircase needed some restudy.

   Mr. Silvin stated he would support removing the stairs.

   Mr. Cooney and Ms. Albarran expressed concern for removing an original feature.

Mr. Segraves asked Mr. Spina if he inquired about obtaining more space in the front of the property to allow for more greenspace. Mr. Spina responded.

Jedidiah Hall, Nievera Williams Design, discussed the modifications to the landscape proposed.

Motion made by Ms. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented with the following caveats: the middle window in the staircase is removed and the professional will look at recessing the staircase a bit further and will submit the design for a staff approval to be coordinated with the Chair of the Commission. Motion carried unanimously.

Please note: Mr. Gannon left the meeting at 11:00 a.m. Mr. Wong voted in the absence of Mr. Gannon.

2. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #022-2019
Address: 264 & 270 S. County Rd.
Owner/Applicant: Carriage House Properties Partners LLC
Professional: Glidden Spina + Partners
Project Description: The scope of work includes a rehabilitation of two existing commercial structures at 264 South County Road and 270 South County Road. The rehabilitation includes removing and replacing exterior windows, exterior doors, gutters, downspouts, terra cotta tile roofing, and exterior light fixtures. All previously painted pecky cypress architectural elements will be stripped of paint and restore. All existing historical features such as cast stone columns, entry surrounds, corbels, lintels, terracotta soffit, coquina banding and pecky cypress wood craved beams are to remain as existing. The scope also includes demolition of interior walls, doors, and plumbing fixtures while keeping interior historical features such as, exposed pecky cypress and hand painted tiles, as existing to remain. Further, the scope includes rehabilitation of the landscape and hardscape of the front yard, side yards, and interior courtyard. *****Please note: this is a tax abatement project.*** **

A motion carried at the July meeting to approve the project as presented with the following caveats: the use of steel windows on the 264 building, to use La Finestra windows on all other areas, the deletion of any espalier on the 264 coquina, to hide the wall between 264 and 270 with landscaping, and to return to the August 21, 2019 meeting with photographs and the relocation of the fireplace in the 264 building.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None.

Keith Spina, GliddenSpina, presented the modifications proposed for the two commercial buildings. Mr. Spina presented window samples to the Commissioners.

A discussion ensued about steel windows and La Finestra windows.

Ms. Stillings stated she felt the windows should be steel on the 264 building, particularly since the project was a tax abatement project.

Mr. Spina provided an overview of the relocation of the fireplace.

Jedidiah Hall, Nievera Williams Design, presented the design that incorporated the fireplace mantel and discussed its purpose. He also reviewed the proposed landscape changes.

Motion made by Mr. Silvin and seconded by Ms. Coleman to approve the project as presented with the exception of the steel windows, which will return to the Commission at the September 18, 2019 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

Please note: A short break was taken at 11:06 a.m. The meeting resumed at 11:21 a.m.

3. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #018-2019
Address: 801 S. County Rd.
Owner/Applicant: The Palmeiral Revocable Trust (Maura Ziska, Trustee)
Professional: Harold Smith/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc.
Project Description: The project includes a 973 square foot addition to an existing 488 square foot beach cabana. The project includes the addition of 446 square feet of hardscape, the addition and relocation of coconut palms and the addition of low hedges.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Smith presented the proposed modifications for the beach cabana.

Jedidiah Hall, Nievera Williams Design, presented the proposed modifications for the landscape and hardscape.

Mr. Segraves was in favor of the project but wondered why the existing cabana was being salvaged. Mr. Smith responded.

Mr. Silvin asked if the were any changes to the pedestrian gate. Mr. Smith stated he did not believe any changes were proposed.

Ms. Albarran was in favor of the changes.

Mr. Cooney was fine with the size of the cabana proposed but questioned its height. Mr. Smith stated the cabana was lower than what was allowed by the Code. A short discussion ensued about the height of the cabana.

Mr. Smith stated that Ms. Patterson asked him to prepare a few street views, which he showed on the overhead projector.

Ms. Coleman inquired if any consideration was given to adding more landscaping on the west side. Mr. Smith stated he could add more plantings.

Mr. Segraves stated he felt that owner would be the only resident affected by the height. He felt that any reduction in height might negatively affect the architecture.

Mr. Smith asked if additional landscaping would be appropriate. Ms. Coleman thought that additional landscaping would be helpful.

Mr. Hall discussed the changes he would make to provide additional landscaping on the northwest side of the cabana.

The consensus of the Commission would be to soften the northwest corner of the cabana with more landscaping.

Motion made by Ms. Coleman and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented with the caveat that more landscaping is added on the west and south sides of the proposed cabana. Motion carried 6-1, with Mr. Cooney opposed.

4. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #025-2019
Address: 473 N. County Rd.
Owner/Applicant: Louwana Trust (c/o Leslie R. Evans)
Professional: Thomas M. Kirchhoff/Kirchhoff & Associates Architects
Project Description: Modifications to previously approved drawings: 1) Main House: a) Replace additional exterior doors at Dining Room. b) Modify tower bath window location. 2) Ocean Cabana: remove two existing windows. Any associated changes to above. ****Please note: this is a tax abatement project.****

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Ms. Albarran and Mr. Cooney.

Mr. Kirchhoff presented the proposed modifications to the main house and the proposed reconstruction of the existing beach cabana.

Mr. Cooney questioned if the professional would be opposed to leaving a recess where he proposed to remove an arched window. Mr. Kirchhoff stated he would agree to the change.

Mr. Kirchhoff presented two other fenestration changes.

Motion made by Mr. Segraves and seconded by Mr. Silvin to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Cooney updated the Commission on the process of hiring professionals to conduct the Historic Site Surveys in the Town.

X. DISCUSSION ITEM

1. Discussion of potential properties to consider for Landmark Designation.

Ms. Murphy presented the following properties to consider for future landmark designation: 167 Clarendon Drive, 242 Jungle Road, 686 Island Drive, 225 South County Road, 232 Cocoanut Road, 400 Seaspray Avenue, 230 Seaspray Avenue, 300 Seabreeze Avenue and 300 Clarke Avenue. The consultants answered the Commissioners questions about the homes proposed.

Mr. Cooney called for public comment.

Marsha Fick, 230 Seaspray Avenue, requested the Commission to defer placing her home under consideration as a Landmark Designation. She expressed her concerns for the designation.

Bill Tylander, 225 South County Road, expressed his concerns for placing his home under consideration as a Landmark Designation.

Mr. Segraves discussed a restoration he is completing on the Sea Streets and talked about the benefits of a Landmark Designation.

Mr. Segraves and Ms. Albarran discussed some of the allowable changes if a property is landmarked.

Mr. Segraves asked staff about the timeline of changes that could possibly affect the owners on the Sea Streets. Mr. Lindgren discussed the potential changes that staff presented to the Town Council at the August meeting.

Mr. Martin discussed the delay of the Comprehensive Code Reform discussion as well as the potential discussion of historic properties within the Town.

Mr. Cooney indicated that he felt the piecemeal approach to landmarking had failed in the Town. He suggested reintroducing a discussion of historic districts, specifically beginning with the Sea Streets. He provided his reasons that he thought this discussion was important.

Mr. Silvin asked what role the Commission could have in the discussion.

Mr. Cooney proposed to place all of the homes on Seaview Avenue, Seaspray Avenue and Seabreeze Avenue, between the Intercostal waterway and Atlantic Ocean under consideration as a Historic District.

Mr. Cooney passed the gavel and made a formal motion.

Motion made by Mr. Cooney to place all of the homes on Seaview Avenue, Seaspray Avenue and Seabreeze Avenue, between the Intercostal waterway and Atlantic Ocean under consideration as a Historic District.

Mr. Martin stated he shared Mr. Cooney's concern for the potential loss of the character on the Sea Streets. He also touched on the out of scale building that has been occurring in mid-town. He discussed how the Town's Zoning Code did not maintain Palm Beach.

Ms. Coleman thanked Mr. Martin for his efforts and agreed the character of the Town has changed.

Mr. Cooney advocated for placing the Sea Streets under consideration as a Historic District.

Ms. Coleman seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Coleman expressed concern about the maintenance of some of the properties in the Town.

Mr. Martin stated that the Town recently adopted a property maintenance ordinance. Mr. Martin also stated that the Town hired a construction site monitor to visit ongoing construction sites.

XI. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING, ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR.

Mr. Silvin reviewed the Landmark projects presented at the August 2019 Town Council Meeting.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

A motion made by Mr. Segraves and seconded by Mr. Silvin to adjourn the meeting at 12:36 p.m. Motion carried unanimously.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, September 18, 2019 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

kmc