

**MINUTES OF THE SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEETING
HELD ON FRIDAY, JANUARY 9, 2015**

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Shore Protection Board was called to order on Friday, January 9, 2015, at 10:05 a.m. in Town Council Chambers.

II. ROLL CALL

The following members were present: Chairman E. Llwyd Ecclestone, Vice Chair J. Patterson Cooper, Mr. Kane Baker, Mr. Lewis Katz, and Mr. Richard Raffo. Mr. Gerald Frank and Mr. Lee David Goldstein were absent.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Ecclestone led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion to approve the agenda was made by Mr. Katz and seconded by Vice Chair Cooper. The motion carried 5-0 with Mr. Frank and Mr. Goldstein absent.

V. SWEARING IN OF RE-APPOINTED MEMBERS

Mrs. Boyles administered the Oath of Office to returning Shore Protection Board Members E. Llwyd Ecclestone and Lewis Katz.

VI. ELECTION OF CHAIR FOR THE 2015 SHORE PROTECTION BOARD

Vice Chair Cooper nominated Mr. Ecclestone to remain as Chair of the Shore Protection Board. The motion was seconded by Mr. Katz and unanimously approved.

VII. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIR FOR THE 2015 SHORE PROTECTION BOARD

Mr. Baker nominated Mr. Cooper to remain as Vice Chair of the Shore Protection Board. The motion was seconded by Mr. Raffo and unanimously approved.

VIII. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE OCTOBER 23, 2014, MEETING

Motion to approve the minutes of the October 23, 2014, meeting was made by Vice Chair Cooper and seconded by Mr. Baker. The motion was unanimously approved.

**MINUTES OF THE SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEETING
HELD ON FRIDAY, JANUARY 9, 2015**

IX. COMMUNICATIONS FROM SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEMBERS

Vice Chair Cooper reported that he had received an email from Mr. Goldstein informing him that he would not be able to attend the Shore Protection Board meeting and asking that his comments be read into the record. He read Mr. Goldstein's comments regarding the Reach 8 project, the groins included in the County's project, and mitigation based on the ephemeral hard bottom. He asked the current cost of Ortona truck haul sand vs. dredged 2 ½ mil sand.

Mr. Baker stated that the beaches were doing well. He expressed disappointment that the Town Council denied the Shore Protection Board's recommendation to expand the boom on the sand transfer plant. He said that the Board would need to refocus its attention on the sand transfer plant and the groins.

X. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS - 3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE

Connie Gasque, 167 Root Trail, spoke about the importance of fixing the sand transfer plant. Paul Brazil, Director of Public Works, explained the issue with the electrical service to the plant and reported that a fix had been designed. He stated that at the February Shore Protection Board meeting staff would report on the issue of sand not coming into the plant.

Anita Pollak, 1610 North Ocean Blvd., expressed concern with the displacement of birds due to the development and construction of two docks into the Inlet. Chair Ecclestone responded that Town staff would look into the matter.

XI. CURRENT SHORELINE CONDITIONS [Robert Weber, Coastal Coordinator]

Rob Weber, Coastal Coordinator, gave a Power Point presentation on the current shoreline conditions and reported on the Mid-Town Beach renourishment and Reach 7 and Reach 8 truck haul project. He reported that seas had been very high and the dredging contractor had not been able to properly mobilize to the site. He said that the equipment was ready and waiting for the weather to calm down.

Mr. Raffo asked about the condition of the seawall at the Palm Beach Country Club. Mr. Brazil responded that the Town had received the permits, a construction manager had been hired, and work would begin in the spring. A discussion followed on the seawall.

Mr. Weber reported that Weeks Marine had brought two dredges to complete the renourishment projects and that the work should be completed much quicker.

Vice Chair Cooper asked about monitoring for the Phipps Park dune restoration and if it would be useful for determining hot spots. Mr. Weber responded that the monitoring

**MINUTES OF THE SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEETING
HELD ON FRIDAY, JANUARY 9, 2015**

would be required as part of the larger project, but annual monitoring occurs every 1,000 feet down the beach.

Vice Chair Cooper expressed concern with the current erosion and asked if the Town needed a template and a sand volume permit for the Mid-Town project. Mr. Weber responded that the Town could fill with sand as long as it stayed within the template.

XII. MID-TOWN BEACH RENOURISHMENT AND REACHES 7 AND 8 TRUCK HAUL CONSTRUCTION PROJECT UPDATES [Robert Weber, Coastal Coordinator]

(This item was discussed with the shoreline condition report.)

XIII. SOUTHERN PALM BEACH ISLAND COMPREHENSIVE SHORELINE STABILIZATION PROJECT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT (REACH 8 EIS) [Robert Weber, Coastal Coordinator, and Penny Cutt, Regional Manager, Coastal Systems International, Inc.]

Mr. Brazil reported that there were a large number of concerns raised by residents at the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (Corps) meeting regarding the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS). He further reported that the Corps received a request from Karyn Erickson, consultant for Save Our Shores (SOS) for a 30 day extension of the comment period. He recommended the Shore Protection Board direct staff to take the concerns of the residents in attendance at the meeting, as well as the concerns that were addressed during the Corps meeting, and provide written backup of those concerns, as well as offer clarification regarding any misunderstandings. He stated that the information would be presented to the Shore Protection Board at its next meeting.

Town Manager Peter Elwell explained that officially, under Federal Statutes, only the Town can request an extension. He recommended that the Shore Protection Board recommend to the Town Council that the Town officially request the 30 days of additional comment time.

Chair Ecclestone summarized that the Shore Protection Board would hear comments from the public, staff would put together a concise report and come back to the Board prior to the Town Council meeting in February to address the issues.

Lewis Crampton, 2335 South Ocean Blvd., chair of the Citizens Association and speaking on behalf of the Association, spoke regarding clarification of sand size, quality and cost; borrow versus mined sand; hard bottom impact and mitigation; promotion of structures by the County and not the Town; in support of the SOS request for a 30 day extension of the comment period; and recommended the Town apply more than 75,000 cubic yards of sand in Reach 8.

Richard Hunegs, 3360 South Ocean Blvd., speaking on behalf of SOS, endorsed Mr. Crampton's remarks, and referred to the Palm Beach Daily News article which

**MINUTES OF THE SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEETING
HELD ON FRIDAY, JANUARY 9, 2015**

1 highlighted the meeting held by Corps and the serious issues with the plan being
2 considered by the Town.

3
4 John Eubanks, 605 Olive Avenue, West Palm Beach, representing Buck Carlton,
5 addressed the Board regarding the initial application which used Ortona sand; the need
6 for a long-term proposal that meets the 25 year storm event, not just dune protection; why
7 the Town was not using upland sand and structures as the County was recommending;
8 and Karyn Erickson's issue regarding the modeling being done pre-hurricane Sandy.

9
10 Buck Carlton, 3400 South Ocean Blvd., gave a scenario of questions the Town would
11 have to answer if the plan fails and the issue goes to court.

12
13 Madelyn Greenberg, 3360 South Ocean Blvd., spoke regarding the corruption of the SOS
14 plan that was presented to the Corps, grain size, sand cost, groins, and the affect the
15 project will have on the entire Town.

16
17 Mr. Katz said the Board needs to look at grain size. He stated that Karyn Erickson has
18 experience on nourishing beaches or protecting properties on open seas. He stated that the
19 Town needs to do a project using a larger grain size to last longer. He further stated that if
20 conditions are normal and the project fails, he would like to see the Town hold the
21 engineering company, the dredging company and everyone involved in the renourishment
22 responsible.

23
24 Greg Silby, 2500 South Ocean Blvd., agreed with Mr. Crampton's comments on sand
25 size and asked why, with the contiguous Beach Management Agreement (BMA), the
26 Town was not using the same grain size and including groins as the County.

27
28 Vice Chair Cooper said he viewed shore protection as a process and not an event. He
29 stated that it was filling, monitoring and finding out what is happening. He further stated
30 that some of the discrepancies and confusion need to be addressed.

31
32 Vice Chair Cooper said that the final EIS would currently be available in June. He asked
33 if there would be unintended consequences of the 30 days extension in relation to
34 soliciting bids for the project. Mr. Brazil responded that there could potentially be
35 consequences. He spoke about the need to bid the projects as early as possible to fit in the
36 dredger's schedule and the possibility of adding an alternate line item to the Reach 7 bid
37 for a given quantity of dredged sand for Reach 8, if dredged sand is used for the project.

38
39 Town Manager Elwell stated that the Board could move ahead with Reach 7 while the
40 Reach 8 decision making continues, but the economy of scale addressing the two projects
41 together would be lost. He further stated than another alternative would be to keep the
42 two projects united buy delay them for a year, to the winter of 2016-17. He said that if the
43 decision is to keep the projects combined and delay for a year to be more confident in the
44 approach, the fact that some sand going into Reach 7 and 8 this year is important. He

**MINUTES OF THE SHORE PROTECTION BOARD MEETING
HELD ON FRIDAY, JANUARY 9, 2015**

1 agreed that the delay of 30 days to resolve the issues and be more confident of the
2 outcome was the right thing to do.

3
4 Mr. Katz expressed concern that the cost of sand continues to increase and every year and
5 if the Town delays the projects, they will cost more. Town Manager Elwell responded
6 that in general it was true, but from year to the next it was not true; it is not a straight line
7 increase.

8
9 Richard Hunegs, 3360 South Ocean Blvd., said that all the issues would be solved by
10 agreeing that the best sand ought to be used for the project and suggested the Town work
11 more closely with the County.

12
13 **Motion was made by Vice Chair Cooper and seconded by Mr. Katz to recommend**
14 **that the Town Council formally request that the Corps of Engineers grant a 30 day**
15 **extension to the comment period from January 26. The motion was unanimously**
16 **approved.**

17
18 Town Manager Elwell said that that staff would prepare the backup information, and the
19 Shore Protection Board would hold a meeting in February to offer concrete
20 recommendations to the Town Council, and Town Council would act at its February
21 meeting.

22
23 **XIV. ANY OTHER MATTERS**

24 Chair Ecclestone and the Shore Protection Board members thanked Town Manager Peter
25 Elwell on his service to the Board and wished him well on his move to Vermont.

26
27 **XV. ADJOURNMENT**

28 Chairman Ecclestone adjourned the meeting at 11:23 a.m.

29
30 APPROVED:

31
32 
33 E. Llwyd Ecclestone
34 Chairman
35
36
37