



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 24, 2016

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

II. ROLL CALL

Robert J. Vila, Chairman	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT (arrived at 9:05 a.m.)
Richard Sammons, Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Member	PRESENT
Robert N. Garrison, Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT (arrived at 9:02 a.m.)
Michael B. Small, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Maisie Grace, Alternate Member	PRESENT

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Vila led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE JANUARY 27, 2016 MEETING

Motion made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve the minutes of the January 27, 2016 meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Motion made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve the agenda. Motion carried with all in favor.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Mrs. Roedel administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. PROJECT REVIEW

A. MAJOR PROJECTS-OLD BUSINESS

B-114-2015 New Residence

Address: 204 Via Del Mar

Applicant: Via Del Mar, LLC

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects/Peter Papadopoulos

Project Description: new two story Mediterranean Revival residence with detached pool cabana on vacant lot. Final landscape and hardscape

At the October meeting this project was deferred to the December meeting at the architect's request. At the December meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the January meeting for further study. At the January meeting a motion carried to approve the Architecture and Landscaping as presented with the caveat they come back in February with different proportions and scale for the front door and the windows above the front door.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members of the Commission.

Mr. Papadopoulos reviewed the proposed changes to the front entry.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners had some concern with the proportions of the front door. They felt the front door had a Federal architectural feel and the house is Italianate. There seems to be some fine tuning that needs to be done to the entry.

Motion made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Sammons to defer the project to the March meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 116 - 2015 Addition/Modifications

Address: 425 & 431 Chilean Ave.

Applicant: Lorraine S. Charman

Architect: SKA Architects, Patrick Segraves

On the south side, remove bedroom and 1 balcony (27 sq. ft.) and enlarge front balcony at bedroom #2 and exercise room (95 sq. ft.). On the west side, remove west garage gate and close with 6 ft. wall, remove driveway and garage door and reduce area 45 sq. ft.

Driveway area to become patio and landscaping. Curb cuts will be eliminated. Change windows in breakfast area, demolish existing pool and replace with new pool, replace and relocate windows on second floor in proposed bedroom 1, closet and bath 3. On the north side, convert family rooms to open loggia (675 sq. ft.). On the east side, remove existing pool, remove all windows on east wall of first floor. Replace and relocate windows on proposed closet. On the east side, remove existing pool, and remove all windows on east wall of first floor. Replace and relocate windows on proposed closet and add 262 sq. ft. addition to northeast corner, to enlarge living room.

At the November meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the December meeting to accommodate the notification process.

At the December meeting a motion carried to approve both the architecture and landscaping as presented with the exception of the detailing on the front doors and the piers in the front which are to be restudied and brought back to the Commission in January. At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting.

The architect has requested to defer this project to the March meeting.

Mr. Lindgren announced that he was notified by the Project Architect yesterday that they are requesting to extend the deferral to the April meeting.

Motion made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison to defer this project to the April meeting at the architect's request. Motion carried with all in favor.

B -118-2015 Demolition and New Residence

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 222 Seaspray Ave.

Applicant: Denise and Robert Bendickson

Architect: Roger Hansrote

Project Description: Demolition of existing 2 story residence and carriage house.

Construction of new 2 story British Colonial residence. The new residence will have a white stucco finish. The street view reveals an arched entry portico with pediment and brown shutters, doors and windows. The hip roof will have a flat white cement tile treatment.

At the November meeting a motion carried to defer the variances, architecture and landscaping to the January meeting. At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting at the request of the owner's attorney.

The architect has requested to defer this project to the March meeting.

Motion made by Mr. Gruss and seconded by Mr. Garrison to defer this project to the March meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

B -122-2015 New Residence

Address: 201 Debra Lane

Applicant: 201 Debra Lane, LLC

Architect: Dailey Janssen Architects/ Roger P. Janssen

Landscape: Dustin Mizell

Attorney: Tim Hanlon

Project Description: Construction of a new two story residence, pool, landscape and hardscape.

At the December meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the January meeting for restudy. At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting for restudy.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by all Commission members.

Mr. Janssen stated that based on the comments last month he revisited multiple items. He reviewed the plans, elevations and enumerated the items that were addressed.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners commended Mr. Janssen on his presentation and the revisions that were made to the house. They felt the house now has a lot of character and charm.

Mr. Mizell stated that he has addressed the Commission comments from last month regarding the pedestrian entrance. He then reviewed the proposed changes to the plan and the elevation screening.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners felt the changes to the landscape plan will work well.

There were several people from the public that spoke in opposition and support of the project. Those that spoke included: Peter Broberg, Dan Tucker, David Levitt, Petina Mika, Julie Araskog, Joel Scott, Frank Mindof, John Dotterer and Jane Lindsey.

Mr. Vila thanked everyone who spoke, for their input.

Mr. Hanlon briefly responded to the some of the issues of the opposition.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners had some concern as to whether this house is in harmony with the neighborhood and whether or not the house fits in this established area. They felt that due to the elevation requirements the house is not sensitive in its approach to the area. There are other ways to create good architecture that could enhance the area. It was noted that there is still an opportunity to design something here that doesn't come across as being stately.

Motion made by Mr. Sammons and seconded by Mr. Garrison to defer this project to the March meeting for further study. Motion carried 5-2 with Mrs. Vanneck and Mr. Knowles dissenting.

B - 002-2016 Addition

Address: 1071 North Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: Maura A. Ziska, Esq. Kochman and Ziska, PA

Architect: Lang Design Group/John Lang

Project Description: Addition of driveway gates to previously approved hardscape and landscape plans.

At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting for further study of the gates.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Mr. Lang reviewed the changes made to the gates stating they are less ornate and very simple.

Commission Comments: It was asked if the width on the gate had changed. Mr. Lang responded that it did not and the width as well as everything else has already been approved.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to approve the project as presented. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Sammons dissenting.

MAJOR-PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS:

B - 001-2016 New Residence

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 280 North County Rd.

Applicant: 280 NCR, LLC

Architect: SKA Architect + Planner/Patrick Segraves

Project Description: New two story classical style home to be approximately 7,100 square feet. Home will consist of 5 bedrooms, 7 bathrooms, powder room, living room, dining room, kitchen, family room, loggia, and a three car garage with guest suite above. Final landscaping will be included.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Mr. Segraves began by explaining the variances that would need approval. He then reviewed the plans and elevations for the new house.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners felt the garage was overpowering and should be moved away from the front door. They could not support the garage mass being on the southeast corner of the lot. There were also comments regarding the proportions of the front door. It was suggested that the details of the house be simplified.

Motion made by Mr. Karakal and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to defer the project to the March meeting for restudy. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 004-2016 Demolition/New Residence

Address: 608 Island Dr.

Applicant: Denis P. and Annabelle G. Coleman

Architect: Dailey Janssen Architects/Roger Janssen

Landscape: Dustin Mizell

Project Description: Demolition of existing residence and construction of a new 2 story residence, pool, hardscape and landscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Mr. Janssen presented the survey and demolition report.

Motion made by Mrs. Vananeck and seconded by Mr. Gruss to approve the demolition with the typical caveats to sod and irrigate within 30 days. Motion carried 4-3 with Mr. Sammons, Mr. Garrison and Mr. Vila dissenting.

Mr. Janssen reviewed the proposed plans for the new residence.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt it was a creative floor plan, however, the scale seems to be way off. It was stated that this is an incredibly prominent site, and the key to the project will be the scale and proportions. There was a comment stating that the architecture is not pleasing on the south side but the plan has a very good beginning.

Mr. Mizell presented the proposed landscape/hardscape plan.

Commission Comments: The Commission strongly urged Mr. Mizell to reconsider using bougainvillea on the bridge. The Commission also felt all the palms accentuate the height of the house and are a detraction. It was suggested that the hedge be removed.

Motion by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Karakul to defer the project to the March meeting to restudy the heights and the distances. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 005-2016 Additions/Modifications

Address: 1332 North Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: Avery PB Realty Trust - Vickie Giardina

Architect: John M. Melhourn

Landscape: Todd MacLean

Project Description: Construction of a new 3,300 square foot addition that will consist of: A guest wing and 4 car garage, aesthetic renovations to the existing residence, new windows, and detailing, new pool, hardscape and site walls.

It was noted that Mrs. Vanneck recused herself from voting on this project due to a conflict; Mr. Ives would be voting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Garrison, Mr. Small and Ms. Grace.

Mr. Melhourn reviewed the site plan, and elevations for the proposed addition and stated the project was before the Commission in May to tear down an existing three story residence that was on the neighboring property. The owner is joining the two properties together.

Mr. MacLean presented the landscape plan and reviewed the plant list.

Commission Comments: There was some confusion by the Commissioners as to access from the street to the main entry. Mr. Melhourn stated there is a terrace and stairs at the entrance; however, due to zoning issues it is a pedestrian front door. It was stated that Mr. Melhourn was doing a great job of saving and renovating the house.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Karakul to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 006-2016 Demolition

Address: 232 Coral Lane

Applicant: Sydney Roberts Shuman, Diane Roberts Slocum and Gail Roberts Ashford, as Successor Trustees of the Sydney M. Lowndes Two year Personal Residence Trust dated March 4, 2011

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc./Harold Smith

Landscape: Keith Williams

Project Description: Demolition of an existing 1 story residence, pool and hardscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Garrison

Mr. Smith reviewed the demolition report.

Mr. Williams stated that all the landscape except the pruner hedges will be removed.

Barbara Rollhaus, 242 Coral Lane, stated that she has no opposition to the demolition but she had some concerns about the demolition process. She would like to make sure whoever conducts the demolition is licensed and experienced and there will be no damage to her property. Mr. Vila stated that Staff and inspection services are very good at keeping track of the issues she is concerned about. She also stated that this is going to be massively disruptive and she is afraid she will not be able to use her backyard while the demolition is being performed. She was especially concerned with the demolition being done at the end of March. Mr. Vila said she would be surprised at how quickly a demolition is done and they are required to put screening up. Mr. Lindgren stated that the contractor is required to give notice to the neighbors before the demolition begins.

Motion by Mr. Sammons and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to approve the demolition as presented with the typical caveats to sod and irrigate within 30 days. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 007-2016 Revisions

Address: 530 South Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: 530 South Ocean Blvd., LLC c/o Gregory Young

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects/Angie Janesheski

Landscape: Keith Williams

Project Description: Revisions to a previously approved single family residence.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Vanneck and Mr. Garrison.

Ms. Janesheski presented the design modifications to the residence, which were previously approved.

Mr. Williams stated that there were no changes made to the landscape plan with the exception of the modification to the west and south terrace alignment of the main house.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Knowles to approve this project as presented. Motion carried 5-2 with Mr. Sammons and Mr. Karakul dissenting.

MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS

A - 053 - 2015 Addition/Modification

Address: 100 El Bravo Way

Applicant: Ken Tropin as Trustee of the Kenneth G. Tropin Trust

Architect: Brooks & Falotico Associates, Inc. Chuck Willette

Landscape: Scott Hyman

Project Description: Addition of office and side entry along with driveway and landscape alterations on El Bravo Way. Modifications to doors, hardscape and landscape, alterations along South Ocean Boulevard. Various additions and modifications in the courtyard and rear of the house below existing roof lines.

At the October meeting, a motion carried to defer this project to the November meeting. At the November meeting, a motion carried to approve the architecture and landscaping as presented, with the exception of the gate design and the relocation of the Venetian well head; these items were deferred to the December meeting. At the December meeting this project was deferred to the January meeting at the request of the owner's attorney. At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting at the applicant's request.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Garrison and Ms. Grace

Mr. Hyman announced that the Venetian well head has been removed from the scope and will stay in the courtyard in the current location. He then reviewed the proposed changes to the plan.

Commissioner Comments: The Commissioners were concerned with the width and location of the gate. The changes seem to bring a lot of attention to the gate, when it was previously very subtle. The Commissioners would like to see 12 ft. wide gates; there are also no engineering drawings or site triangles.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Sammons to defer this project for further study to the March meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

A - 001-2016 Modification

Address: 152 Dolphin Rd.

Applicant: Dr. Josef Huawiss

Architect: Michael J. Johnson

Project Description: New design proposal for entry door.

At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting.

The architect requested to defer this project to the March meeting.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to defer this project to the March meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

A - 007-2016 Hardscape/Landscape Improvements

Address: 662 Island Dr.

Applicant: Jeffrey Walker

Architect: Mario Nievera/Keith Williams

Project Description: Front entry hardscape and landscape improvements.

At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting for restudy and mitigation of some of the formality of the landscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Mr. Williams addressed the comments made by the Commission last month and reviewed the changes that were made to the proposed plan.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners suggested that coquina be used on the columns instead of caste stone, and add two trees at the entry. It was also suggested that lighting be added to the sides of the columns.

Motion made by Mr. Karakul and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to approve this project as presented with the caveat that coquina is used on the columns instead of caste stone. Motion carried with all in favor.

MINOR PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS

A - 008-2016 New Hardscape/Landscape

Address: 353 El Brillo Way

Applicant: 353 El Brillo Way, LLC

Architect: Parker-Yannette Design Group/Stephen Parker

Project Description: New hardscape, landscape and landscape lighting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Ms. Grace

Mr. Parker reviewed the proposed plans and plant list for the new hardscape and landscape.

Commissioner Comments: The Commissioners had some concern with the bubbler fountain in the drive and felt it would take up parking space if the owners were to entertain. Mr. Parker stated that the parking will be reduced to some extent, because there are three spaces being eliminated on the right. However, two spaces are being added in the grass parking to the left. Also, the circle drive is wide enough to park 2 cars. Mr. Parker said he did not want to add any more paving.

Motion made by Mr. Karakul and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve this project as presented. Motion carried 5-2 with Mrs. Vanneck and Mr. Sammons dissenting.

A - 009-2016 Additions

Address: 630 Island Dr.

Applicant: Dr. Steven Gottlieb

Architect: Stephen T. Parker

Project Description: Addition of light fixtures at driveway entry columns, removal of vine on courtyard walls and garden walls, hedge species change at drive island, tree species change at southwest garden.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Garrison, Mr. Vila and Ms. Grace.

Mr. Parker stated that he is presenting revisions that have already been completed.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners did not like the changes. The Commissioners reminded Mr. Parker that the process is to come to the Commission before any changes are made to an already approved plan.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Sammons to deny this project and that the project be returned to the original approved plan. Motion carried with all in favor.

A - 010-2016 Landscape/Hardscape Revisions

Address: 1900 South Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: Keith Frankel

Architect: Mario Nievera/Keith Williams

Project Description: Landscape and hardscape revisions as detailed since prior ARCOM approval of October 2013.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Garrison

Mr. Williams stated that they are proposing a change in the pool design as well as the access from the upper loggia down to the pool. He reviewed the plans and proposed changes.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners liked the changes which included coral and capstone. There was some concern regarding architectural changes to the plan. Mr. Lindgren said he would research to see if any changes were made to the architecture that were not approved.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Gruss to approve this project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

A - 011-2016 Revisions

Address: 195 Via Marina

Applicant: Jill Glazer-195 Via Marina, LLC

Architect: Mario Nievera/Keith Williams

Project Description: Revised final pool shape and layout. Final design for vehicular gates.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Mr. Williams proposed the changes to the pool design and the driveway gates. He explained that the change to the pool design was for a safety issue. The pool cannot be protected without an unsightly fence surrounding it. He proposed a rectangular pool with a cover. He then reviewed the proposed design for the gate.

Commissioner Comments: The Commissioners liked the project.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Knowles to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

Mr. Vila stated that they are often seeing people come back for revisions that have already been completed. The Commission is being consulted after the fact. He asked Staff what can be done to prevent this from happening. Mr. Lindgren answered that the Commission can deny the project. The architects are making changes to approved projects at their own risk. The Commission has every right and ability to deny the projects and require that they are changed back. Mr. Lindgren said they he will add some verbiage to his summary letter stating any changes from the approved plans must be approved by the Architectural Commission, and if changes are made you do so at your own risk.

Mr. Garrison thanked Mr. Vila and Mr. Karakul for all the time they have spent in making the Commission viable and keeping the Town the way it is. They were applauded by all present. Mr. Vila said serving on the Commission has been a wonderful experience for him and he will be paying attention. Mr. Karakul echoed Mr. Vila's sentiments.

IX. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)

X. COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Karakul to adjourn the meeting at 1:16 p.m. Motion carried with all in favor.

The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, March 23, 2016 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 S County Rd.

Respectfully Submitted,

Robert J. Vila, Chairman

ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

nar