



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, MARCH 23, 2016

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. by Ms. Vanneck.

II. ROLL CALL

Ann L. Vanneck, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles, Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Richard Sammons, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Member	PRESENT
Robert N. Garrison, Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Member	PRESENT
Michael B. Small, Member	PRESENT
Maisie Grace, Alternate Member	PRESENT
John David Corey, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Betsy Shiverick, Alternate Member	PRESENT

For the Record, Ms. Grace will be voting in Mr. Knowles absence.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Vice Chairman Vanneck led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Ms. Vanneck congratulated Mr. Ives and Mr. Small for becoming regular members of the Commission. She welcomed Mr. Corey and Ms. Shiverick as new alternate members of the Commission. She welcomed Mrs. Churney as the new board secretary.

John Lindgren, Planning Administrator stated Ms. Grace would be voting today in Mr. Knowles's absence. He also stated the need to establish the seniority between alternate members John David Corey and Betsy Shiverick. Mr. Corey's name was drawn to be the more senior alternate member.

Ms. Vanneck opened the floor for nominations of Chairman. **Mr. Ives nominated Mr. Sammons for Chairman. As there were no other nominations for chair, Mr. Sammons was elected as Chairman with all in favor.**

Mr. Sammons opened the floor for nominations for Vice Chairman. **Mr. Garrison nominated Ms. Vanneck for Vice Chairman and was seconded by Ms. Grace. Motion carried with all in favor.**

V. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE FEBRUARY 24, 2016 MEETING**

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the minutes of the February 24, 2016 meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

VI. **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

The following changes were made to the agenda:

The applicant for project A-001-2016 152 Dolphin Rd. has withdrawn their application. This item was removed from the agenda. The applicant for project B-122-2015, 201 Debra Lane requested a deferral to the April meeting.

Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried with all in favor.

VII. **ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY**

Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VIII. **PROJECT REVIEW**

A. MAJOR PROJECTS-OLD BUSINESS

B-118-2015 Demolition and New Residence

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 222 Seaspray Ave.

Applicant: Denise and Robert Bendickson

Architect: Roger Hansrote

Project Description: Demolition of existing 2 story residence and carriage house.

Construction of new 2 story British Colonial residence. The new residence will have a white stucco finish. The street view reveals an arched entry portico with pediment and brown shutters, doors and windows. The hip roof will have a flat white cement tile treatment.

At the November meeting a motion carried to defer the variances, architecture and landscaping to the January meeting. At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting at the request of the owner's attorney. At the February meeting, the motion carried to defer to the March meeting at the architect's request. Applicant is requesting a deferral until the April meeting. Please note: this is the third applicant request for deferral.

Please note – Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison to defer this item to the end of the meeting to allow the applicant time to arrive for his presentation. Motion carried with all in favor.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Ms. Vanneck and Ms. Grace both stated they received a recent invitation from the architect to visit the site but did not respond.

Mr. Hansrote addressed the commission and stated he wanted to have an opportunity for the Commission members to visit the site and provide feedback.

Commission Comments: Ms. Vanneck stated she did visit the site in September 2015. The Commission felt they gave clear direction when they were initially presented with the project. Mr. Garrison felt that perhaps the change in the zoning for the Sea streets would be beneficial for this project.

Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator indicated it could be several months before the new zoning would be in effect for the Sea streets. He also indicated the home that is rebuilt on the site has to be similar in architecture to what was demolished.

Motion made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison to deny the deferral request and asked for it to be removed from the agenda. Motion carried 5-2 with Messrs. Gruss and Sammons opposed.

B-122-2015 New Residence

Address: 201 Debra Lane

Applicant: 201 Debra Lane, LLC

Architect: Dailey Janssen Architects/ Roger P. Janssen

Attorney: Tim Hanlon

Project Description: Construction of a new two story residence, pool, landscape and hardscape.

At the December meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the January meeting for restudy. At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting for restudy. At the February meeting, a motion carried to defer to the March meeting for further study.

This item was deferred (per the request of the applicant) for one month to the April meeting at the beginning of the meeting with the approval of the agenda.

B-001-2016 New Residence

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 280 North County Rd.

Applicant: 280 NCR, LLC

Architect: SKA Architect + Planner/Patrick Segraves

Landscape: Steve West/Parker Yannette

Project Description: New two story classical style home to be approximately 7,100 square feet. Home will consist of 5 bedrooms, 7 bathrooms, powder room, living room, dining room, kitchen, family room, loggia, and a three car garage with guest suite above. Final landscaping will be included.

At the February meeting, a motion carried to defer to the March meeting for a restudy.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Mr. Segraves presented updated proposed plans for the new residence and noted the variances needed are now reduced since the garage has been moved to the back of the property.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt the change in the garage was a much better solution. Some felt that the classical style of the house is not in character with the more Mediterranean style homes in the neighborhood. The Commission felt a restudy on the architecture of the home would be beneficial. The Commission also suggested Mr. Segraves revisit the scale of the windows, front door and balcony and felt the design of the home was more of a mid-street design rather than a corner home design.

Mr. West presented the hardscape and landscape plans for the new residence.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners thought taller landscape on the east elevation would be appropriate. It was suggested that the use of Montgomery palms by the garage would make it less visible. There was a concern that there was no color in the landscaping.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Ms. Vanneck that the implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject property. Motion carried with all in favor.

Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison to defer this project for further study to the April meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

B-004-2016 Demolition/New Residence

Address: 608 Island Dr.

Applicant: Denis P. and Annabelle G. Coleman

Architect: Dailey Janssen Architects/Roger Janssen

Landscape: Dustin Mizell/Environment Design Group

Project Description: Demolition of existing residence and construction of a new 2 story residence, pool, hardscape and landscape.

At the February meeting, a motion carried to approve the demolition. Another motion carried to defer the new residence project to the March meeting for further study.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Jason Skinner with Dailey Janssen presented updated plans for the new residence. He indicated the main concern at the last meeting was the roof plans and they have made changes from a gable to a hip roof on the second story.

Commissioners Comments: The Commission felt that the roof changes were a big improvement. They still felt there was still some issues with the loggia and that there was some symmetry and balance problems in the design.

Mr. Mizell presented the landscape plans for the home. He indicated he added more color and texture to the plans.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners liked the changes made to the landscape plans and felt they were successful in their design.

Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Gruss to defer the project to April for further study on the architecture. Motion carried with all in favor.

B. MAJOR PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS

B-008-2016 Demolition

Address: 214-216 Sunset Ave and 219-231 Royal Poinciana Way

Applicant: T-3 Family Investments, LLC

Architect: Parker-Yannette Design Group

Attorney: Frank Lynch

Project Description: Second time extension request for demolition of all existing improvements, outbuildings and appurtenances and landscaping removal. The basis for the second request is that litigation has been filed subsequent to Town Council granting Modified Site Plan Review #13-2014 with Special Exception and Variances. The Applicant is awaiting the outcome of that litigation.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Garrison.

Mr. Lynch addressed the Commissioners and requested an extension for the project. He indicated that there is a possibility of ongoing litigation and they do not want to demolish the old residence until they know when they can begin the new construction process. He asked for a one year extension.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Small for a one year extension. Motion carried with all in favor.

B-009-2016 Demolition/New Residence

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Address: 1050 N Ocean Blvd

Applicant: E. Hunter Beebe

Architect: Roger P. Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects

Attorney: Maura Ziska

Project Description: Demolition of an existing one story single family residence, one story guest house and pool. Construction of a new, two-story residence, 2 (two) one story accessory buildings, pool, landscape and hardscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Ms. Ziska addressed the Commission and explained the variances needed by the owners to build a smaller home on a double lot.

Pat O'Connell with Dailey Janssen presented photos of the current home, guest home and hardscape at the property that is proposed to be demolished.

Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator explained the zoning codes for the district. He also explained the setback that is being requested by the owner since the plan is to build a smaller home on one lot so that the owner could have the flexibility of selling the other lot if desired.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the demolition as presented with the typical caveats for sodding and irrigation within 30 days. Motion carried with all in favor.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives that the implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject property. Motion failed 2-5 with Messrs. Garrison, Sammons and Gruss and Mes. Vanneck and Grace opposed.

Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison that the implementation of the proposed west side variance will cause negative architectural impacts to the subject property. Motion carried 4-3 with Messrs. Sammons, Small and Ives opposed.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Small that the implementation of the proposed rear variance will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject property. Motion carried 5-2 with Mr. Sammons and Ms. Grace opposed.

Mr. O'Connell presented the plans for the new residence.

Commissioners Comments: The Commissioners felt there should be more specific details in the plans. They also felt they should not make any decisions on the architecture without approved variances.

Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Ives to defer the project for further study until the April meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

A short break was taken at 10:59 a.m. The meeting reconvened at 11:13 a.m.

B-010-2016 Demolition

Address: 515 N County Rd

Applicant: David Lifson/Manager of County Road Property, LLC

Architect: Lynn Bender

Attorney: Maura Ziska

Owner's Representative: Tony Mauro/Mauro Brothers, LLC

Project Description: Request demolition of all existing structures with exception of perimeter walls, columns, fences, access gates and small portion of main entry driveway. Existing perimeter vegetation to be preserved where feasible. Remaining site vegetation shall be removed or relocated to buffers when feasible.

It was noted that Mr. Sammons recused himself from voting on this project due to a conflict; Mr. Corey would be voting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Small and Ms. Vanneck.

Mr. Mauro presented the history of the current home on the property. He requested that a small portion of the driveway remain after the demolition to allow for machinery that will be used to maintain the property.

Ms. Bender – presented the current landscaping and indicated while the interior landscaping will be removed with the demolition, the perimeter landscaping will remain.

Ms. Ziska discussed deed restriction on the hedge on the western property line and asked that the restriction be removed to allow the removal of the hedge.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt that all interior landscaping that can be salvaged should be relocated. They were against removing the hedge and felt staff and Ms. Ziska should consult with the town attorney to determine how to proceed with the deed restriction on the hedge.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Garrison to defer the project for further study on the foliage and vegetation to the April meeting. Motion failed 3-4 with Ms. Grace and Messrs. Gruss, Ives, and Corey opposed.

Motion made by Mr. Gruss and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the demolition as presented with the typical caveats for sodding and irrigation within 30 days and with a strong request to preserve as much landscape as possible and to move it to the edge of the property. Motion carried 4-3 with Mses. Vanneck and Grace and Mr. Small opposed.

B-011-2016 New Residence

***ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION
W/ SITE PLAN REVIEW***

Address: 250 Esplanade Way
Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Patrick McGowan
Architect: Patrick W. Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner
Attorney: Maura Ziska
Project Description: New two-story island-style home to be approximately 3,800 square feet. Home will consist of 4 bedrooms, 4 bathrooms, powder room, living room, dining room, kitchen, family room, loggia, and a two-car garage. Final landscaping will be included.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

John Lindgren, Planning Administrator indicated that he had received and forwarded to the Commission a few letters that came in late in opposition to the project.

Ms. Ziska this is a new conforming home on a non-conforming lot that will be heard at the Town Council meeting next month.

Mr. Segraves presented the plans for the new residence.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners did not like the design of the home and felt it lacked charm as well as it not being up to Palm Beach standards. They also did not like the garage located in the front of the home and would like to see it relocated.

Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator stated that the Town Council would like the Commission to approve the architecture for a new conforming home on a non-conforming lot before it is presented to them, especially relating to the residence's spacing and massing issues as well as being too similar or dissimilar to the neighborhood.

Anne and Bill Metzger at 277 Esplanade Way and Susan Gary at 229 Onondaga Avenue spoke in opposition to the project.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Small that the project be deferred to the April meeting for further study. Motion carried with all in favor.

C. MINOR PROJECTS-OLD BUSINESS

A - 053 - 2015 Addition/Modification

Address: 100 El Bravo Way
Applicant: Ken Tropin as Trustee of the Kenneth G. Tropin Trust
Architect: Brooks & Falotico Associates, Inc./Chuck Willette
Project Description: Addition of office and side entry along with driveway and landscape alterations on El Bravo Way. Modifications to doors, hardscape and landscape, alterations along South Ocean Boulevard. Various additions and modifications in the courtyard and rear of the house below existing roof lines.

At the October meeting, a motion carried to defer this project to the November meeting. At the November meeting, a motion carried to approve the landscaping as presented, with the exception of the gate design and the relocation of the Venetian well head; these items were deferred to the December meeting. At the December meeting this project was deferred to the January meeting at the request of the owner's attorney. At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting at the applicant's request. At the February meeting, a motion carried to defer this project to the March meeting for further study.

Applicant is requesting a deferral until the April meeting. This is the applicant's third deferral request.

Scott Hyman with Gregory Lombardi Design stated they are requesting a third deferral to get the gate design approved.

Motion made by Mr. Gruss and seconded by Mr. Small to approve deferral to April. Motion carried with 5-2 with Ms. Vanneck and Mr. Ives opposed.

A-001-2016 Modification

Address: 152 Dolphin Rd.

Applicant: Dr. Josef Huawiss

Architect: Michael J. Johnson

Project Description: New design proposal for entry door.

At the January meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the February meeting. At the February meeting, a motion carried to defer to the March meeting at the architect's request.

This project was removed from the agenda at the beginning of the meeting.

A-009-2016 Additions

Address: 630 Island Dr.

Applicant: Dr. Steven Gottlieb

Architect: Stephen T. Parker

Project Description: Addition of light fixtures at driveway entry columns, removal of vine on courtyard walls and garden walls, hedge species change at drive island, tree species change at southwest garden.

At the February meeting, a motion carried to deny the project and it needed to be returned to the original approved plan.

Applicant requesting reconsideration of portions of the application.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded Mr. Small to only reconsider the substitution of trees. Motion carried with all in favor.

Mr. Parker presented the landscape plans that would substitute 12' Sea Grape trees with 12' Ligustrum trees.

Motion made by Ms. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the new landscape plans as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

D. MINOR PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS

A-012-2016

Address: 2252 Ibis Isle West

Applicant: Andrew and Gail Marks

Architect: Gramatan Corporation

Project Description: Seeking approval to widen motorcourt gates from 12'-0" to 15'-6" to allow cars to turn into entry turn-around.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Garrison, Ms. Vanneck and Mr. Ives.

Gerard Beekman with Gramatan Corporation presented the current construction of the home and demonstrated the need for a 13'6" (not 15'6" that was on application) instead of the 12' gate that was approved.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Small to approve a 13'6" gate. Motion carried with all in favor.

Mr. Beekman also presented a new gate in lieu of the more expensive gate that was originally presented and approved.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the new gate. Motion carried 5-2 with Mr. Sammons and Ms. Vanneck opposed.

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

X. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)

XI. COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

Veronica Close, Assistant Director indicated that the staff has received the required paperwork for the voting conflict last month for the project B-005-2016, 1332 N Ocean Blvd.

Ms. Close also thanked Nancy Roedel for her service as intern board secretary.

Chairman Sammons requested to move the meeting start time from 9:00 a.m. to 9:30 a.m. Mr. Sammons passed the gavel to Ms. Vanneck.

Motion made by Mr. Sammons and seconded by Ms. Grace to change the meeting time from 9:00 a.m. to 9:30 a.m. Motion failed 2-5 with Ms. Vanneck, Messrs. Small, Garrison, Gruss and Ives opposed.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Gruss to adjourn the meeting at 12:47 p.m. Motion carried with all in favor.

The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, April 27, 2016 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 S County Rd.

Respectfully Submitted,



Richard Sammons, Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

kmc