MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
IN THE
TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 S. COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 24, 2013, 9:00 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording of the meeting by contacting Cindy Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER: (8:59:07 a.m.)

Chairman Vila called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL: (8:59:14 a.m.)

Robert J. Vila, Chairman	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Member	PRESENT
Henry Homes III, Member	PRESENT
Richard Sammons, Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT (arrived at 9:02 a.m.)
Michael B. Small, Alternate Member	ABSENT (unexcused)

Staff members present: John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission. Town Attorney Randolph was absent.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: (8:59:34 a.m.)

IV. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH OF OFFICE TO NEW MEMBER(S): (8:59:51 a.m.)

(The Oath of Office was administered to Mr. Small at the March meeting.)

V. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE MARCH 27, 2013 MEETING: (8:59:55 a.m.)**
MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI. **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA : (9:00:05 a.m.)**
It was requested that projects B-021-2013 and B-028-2013 be heard together.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA AS AMENDED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VII. **ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY: (9:00:40 a.m.)**
Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VIII. **OTHER BUSINESS: (9:01:07 a.m.)** None

IX. **PROJECT REVIEW (9:01:08 a.m.)**

A. **MAJOR PROJECTS-OLD BUSINESS: (9:01:11 a.m.)**
B - 011 - 2013 New Residence and Extend Demo Approval
Address: 1570 North Ocean Boulevard
Applicant: Arthur George Kallop and Elizabeth Kallop
Architect: SKA Architect + Planner/Patrick W. Segraves, A.I.A.
Project Description: New two-story Classic Greek Revival style home inspired by Oak Alley Plantation in Vacherie, Louisiana. Home will be approximately 8,885 square feet including covered loggias, covered balconies and storage building. Main house will consist of living room, dining room, library, kitchen, family room, laundry room, four bedrooms, five bathrooms, two half bathrooms and a two-car garage with office above. Building color: White; Roof: Grey Brown Concrete; Trim: white; Shutters: Dark Green. Final landscape and hardscape design will also be included. Extension of demolition previously approved at April 2012 ARCOM meeting.

Please be advised that this project had been deferred to the April meeting at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Patrick W. Segraves, SKA Architect + Planner
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Don Skowron
OTHERS WHO TESTIFIED: Arthur George Kallop, Property Owner

Mr. Segraves presented the demolition report for an extension of the previous demolition approval for this 1959 structure designed by John Volk. He noted that perimeter vegetation will be retained during construction.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL FOR EXTENSION OF THE DEMOLITION (APPROVAL).
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Segraves presented the project for the new house in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He described it as a Greek Revival style home in the style of a Southern plantation home, but having Georgian and West Indies influences. Design elements include: Classical and symmetrical front facade; two-story home with two-story porches front and rear; decorative dormers; small detached storage building in the rear; fence and pilasters across front of property; and, driveway to garage in rear running along the rear perimeter of the lot.

Under commission comments: Entablature does not line up with neck of column on either side of the portico; dormers a bit oversized; nice, simple plan; columns at ends should be square pilasters; make all windows the same on the south elevation; dormers too large and too ornate; front fencing not suitable for house and out of scale; trouble with railings between the columns…do something simpler; second floor door setup is too modern; and, garage wing roof is very prominent. Mr. Segraves showed (on Elmo) a revised south elevation showing matching windows.

Mr. Skowron presented the landscape/hardscape in accordance with the submitted plans. Design elements include: Tall Fishtail Palm hedge on west and south perimeters; Clusia hedge on Arabian; Green Island Ficus; Hong Kong Orchids at corners; assortment of palm trees on site; Gardenias flanking the front door; pool with 3 sun spaces in rear surrounded by chain-link fence covered in Confederate Jasmine vine; and alley of palms in the main rear courtyard.

Under commission comments: Major problem with choice of plant materials…all of specimen beautiful trees have low salt tolerance…re-do the plan and come back; issue with fencing; scale of landscaping a little weak; choice of plant material does not give a southern Antebellum feeling. Mr. Skowron wanted it on the record that he disagreed with the commission relative to his choice of landscape material and its salt tolerance.

Commission members considered deferral of the project, which prompted more discussion. The architect requested approval of the project with the proviso that certain details be brought back to the commission. It was also suggested that shutters be added to the sides of the French doors which are above the front door. Regarding the dormers, it was noted that the dormer detail was fine, but the size of them is at issue.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR DEFERRAL.
MOTION DIED FOR LACK OF A SECOND.

Mr. Kallop stated that he has a Master of Architecture degree, and has spent a great deal of time working with Mr. Segraves on this house. He was opposed to a deferral of the project, and offered his comments justifying the design choices presented.

Mr. Lindgren brought up several code issues with the plans: the a/c units need to be pulled out of the setback; a yard waste pick up area must be provided; and, attic agreement required as conditions of approval.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT (ARCHITECTURE) IN PRINCIPAL AND YOU WILL SUBMIT TO US NEXT MONTH: 1) REVISED DORMERS; 2) REVISED RAILING; 3) PILASTERS; AND, 4) SOUTH ELEVATION….THEN, ALSO RETURNING WITH 5) THE ENTABLATURE AND COLUMN ALIGNMENT; 6) EXTERIOR DETAIL PACKAGE, CORNICE, ETC. AND, 7) 2ND FLOOR DOOR (ABOVE FRONT DOOR).

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE LANDSCAPE/HARDSCAPE EXCEPT FOR THE HONG KONG ORCHIDS WHICH CAN BE REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH SOMETHING ELSE NEXT MONTH AND A SIMPLIFICATION OF THE FENCING ALONG THE STREETSCAPE.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED 5-2, WITH MRS. VANNECK AND MR. KARAKUL OPPOSED.

B - 014 - 2013 New Residence
Address: 301 Maddock Way
Applicant: Paul L. Maddock as Trustee
Architect: Roger P. Janssen
Project Description: Construct a new two-story residence, pool and hardscape with a total of 9,139 sq. ft. of air-conditioned space. Building: White; Roof: Grey; Trim: White; Shutters: Dark Blue

Please note that this project was heard at the March meeting and was deferred for re-study of both the architecture and the landscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Roger P. Janssen, Dailey Janssen Architects
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Frank Meroney, Environment Design Group

Mr. Janssen presented revised plans pursuant to the commission's comments last month. It was suggested that the opening at the second floor level, (far right wing), be modified. Mr. Meroney listed the changes to the landscape/hardscape since last month, to include: Hedge changes, retain Ficus hedge; "beefing" up the planting along North Lake Way; front fountain re-designed; driveway material changed to grey pavers; and, other plant changes as presented. He noted, for the record, that every bit of the original historic trees will remain on site, though some will be relocated on site.

Under commission comments: Insert some plants of interest (under 30") in the undulation of the Ficus hedge; and, strengthen the landscape at the two-story section of the house along North Lake Way.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO APPROVE THE PROJECT ARCHITECTURALLY, BUT ON THE EAST SIDE OF THE FRONT FACADE, MATCH THOSE DOORS WITH THE DOORS ABOVE THE ENTRANCE AS CLOSELY AS POSSIBLE; AND THEN TO TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION SOME OF THE LANDSCAPING THAT WE DISCUSSED. (AS NOTED ABOVE).
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 018 - 2013 Demolition and New Residence
Address: 332 Eden Road
Applicant: Greg and Mardi Hayt
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc., Peter Papadopoulos
Project Description: Demolition of existing two-story residence with pool. Construction of new two-story Georgian styled home with pool. Building: Light Beige; Roof: White Flat Concrete Tile; Trim: White; Shutters: White. Final landscape and hardscape.

Please note that this project was heard at the March meeting at which time a motion carried for approval of the demolition, and a motion carried for deferral of the new house design to the April meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Zukov

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Peter Papadopoulos, Smith and Moore Architects

Mr. Papadopoulos presented revised plans in response to the comments made at last month's meeting relative to window proportions, column spacing, entry entablature and detailing, cornice and quoin size, and "busy" railings. Changes made to the landscaping include: Re-shaping of motor court, addition of 6 ft. Podocarpus hedge at certain areas; inclusion of yard waste area; and, removal of entry gate and piers. Mrs. Vanneck recalled that code requires screening of the back entrance to the garage. The architect will investigate this with staff.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. SAMMONS OPPOSED.

B - 019 - 2013 New residence
Address: 1695 North Ocean Way
Applicant: 1695 NOW, LLC
Architect: Carlos Martin Architects, Inc.
Project Description: New single family residence with appurtenances. Preliminary landscape plans. Building: White; Roof: Flat Concrete Terracotta Red; Trim: White; Shutters: Green

Please note that the project was heard at the March meeting, and a motion carried "for deferral (to the April meeting) to clear this up and present one (1) presentation" to ARCOM

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Mr. Vila and Mrs. Vanneck

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Carlos Martin, Carlos Martin Architects, Inc.
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Joe Peterson, Peterson Design Professionals
ATTORNEY PRESENT: Frank Lynch, Attorney for the property owner
OTHERS WHO TESTIFIED: Pat Carney, Property Owner

It should be noted, for the record, that the applicant brought a model of the project to the meeting. Mr. Lynch offered some introductory remarks concerning the project, explaining the Town Council approval(s) which have been secured, and noting the support of two neighbors for the project. The presentation began with a short video of the proposed project design which includes a British Colonial main house, a detached guest house, and two pools. Mr. Martin continued with his presentation in accordance to the submitted plans and as described above.

Under commission comments: No details on the plans, so difficult to comment on the architecture; the greatest defect in the design is the lack of natural light and air into the interior of the building; columns not right...columns styles and arrangement; why are the windows facing south so much larger than those facing north; disorderly fenestration on east and west facades; railings seem to be high; trouble understanding windows, muntins and lite sizes from plans; and, inconsistency of scale.

Mr. Peterson presented the preliminary landscape/hardscape plans in accordance with the submitted plans. He noted that 14 existing large Seagrapes will be relocated on site. Other design elements include: Clusia, Ficus Green Island, Coconut Palms, and, Date Palms. It was recommended that the guest house be made more mysterious with landscaping, i.e., more hidden from view.

Mr. Lindgren stated that he had received a letter from Lawrence Moens, 101 Indian Road, in support of the project.

MOTION BY MR. SAMMONS TO DEFER STATING THE INCONSISTENCY OF FENESTRATION AND SCALE, AND RE-STUDY THAT AND BRING IT BACK....ALSO THE INTERCOLUMNIATION, AND THE EAST ELEVATION OF THE GUESTHOUSE NEEDS WORK AS WELL.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.

Mr. Carney was opposed to another deferral because of the time and expense involved. He asked for a resolution today.

MOTION WITHDRAWN BY MR. SAMMONS.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL TO APPROVE THE PROJECT WITH THE FOLLOWING CHANGES: EAST ELEVATION OF THE GUESTHOUSE: CHANGE COLUMNS; WEST ELEVATION OF THE MAIN HOUSE: SECOND FLOOR WINDOW AND DOOR PROPORTION; EAST & WEST ELEVATION MAIN HOUSE: SECOND FLOOR WINDOWS-COME IN A LITTLE BIT ON THE TWO SIDES; MATCHING COLUMNS; SIMPLIFY THE WINDOWS IN THE STAIRCASE, AND TO ADD SIGNIFICANT MYSTERY IN THE LANDSCAPING AT THE GUESTHOUSE.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. ZUKOV.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. SAMMONS OPPOSED.

IT WAS CLARIFIED THAT THE APPLICANT IS TO RETURN NEXT MONTH WITH THE CHANGES.

Let the record show that there was a short recess from 10:55 a.m. to 11:08 a.m.

B - 021 - 2013 Demolition
Address: 390 North Lake Way
Applicant: 390 North Lake Way, LLC
Architect: Peterson Design Professionals
Project Description: Demolition of existing single family residence, outbuildings and appurtenances, and landscaping removal

Please note that this item was heard at the March meeting, and was deferred to the April meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Vanneck

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Joe Peterson, Peterson Design Professionals
ATTORNEY PRESENT: Frank Lynch, Attorney for the property owner

Mr. Lynch provided the demolition report for this 1941 Howard Chilton residence which has experience eight (8) renovations since its construction. He noted that per an agreement with the neighbor to the north, the existing Ficus on the north side will be retained at the current height or greater, and the Ficus on the south side will be retained only during demolition. A Fig will be relocated on site, and a specimen Buttonwood Tree will be untouched.

Mrs. Vanneck noted that the landscape plan included in the mini-set for the demolition request was in error because it includes removals which are not accurate. The landscape plan for the new construction is accurate according to Mrs. Vanneck.

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL TO ACCEPT THE PROPOSAL WITH THE LANDSCAPE REQUIREMENTS, (I.E., WITH THE TYPICAL AVEATS FOR SODDING AND IRRIGATING.)
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. **MAJOR PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS**

B - 028 - 2013 New Residence
Address: 390 North Lake Way
Applicant: 390 North Lake Way LLC
Architect: Carlos Martin
Project Description: Proposed new two-story residence. Building Color: Lt. Cream; Trim Color: White; Shutter Color: Eggplant; Roof: Flat Concrete Dark Roof

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: There was no call for ex parte communication

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Carlos Martin, Architect
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Joe Peterson, Peterson Design Professionals
ATTORNEY PRESENT: Frank Lynch, Attorney for the property owner

Mr. Lynch introduced the project for what he described as a traditional Palm Beach style blending Georgian and British Colonial styles and discussed zoning aspects of the project. He stated that they had met with the neighbor at 395 North Lake Way. That meeting resulted in an agreement to make some changes which were not shown in the plans before the commission: Change to the generator location and location of a/c units; Ficus hedge on north property line will be maintained at current height; infill Ficus hedge after a/c units are relocated; remove two existing power poles on the north property line will be removed and the utilities will be underground.

Mr. Martin presented the architecture in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above for the new two-story residence with a symmetrical front facade and garages flanking the central mass.

Under commission comments: It's a triple pile deep house in which there is no light and air in the main rooms; stair hall overly large; inconsistent intercolumniation throughout rear elevation; "a masonry box sitting on air" above the family room; illogical plan and illogical order of the plan; different scales in different areas; giant flat roof; front elevation-details of column entablature at front portico and pedestal above the entablature need revision, the over window needs revision; rear elevation-intercolumniation inconsistent, light size and scale inconsistent, issues with railing height and design; detailing of the pergolas need work.

MOTION BY MR. SAMMONS FOR DEFERRAL FOR FURTHER STUDY.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The applicant was advised that when he returns, a complete landscape presentation should be provided with all four sides. Mr. Lindgren noted that this is preliminary landscape only. The applicant was asked to look at the elevations vs. the plans because they do not match, and to reconsider the dark roof due to energy considerations.

B - 009 - 2013 Additions
ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Address: 302 Caribbean Road
Applicant: Stephen and Muffie Murray
Architect: Anthony Minichetti Architect
Project Description: New bay window addition; new garage addition with staff apartment above; new covered loggia; new pool and terrace; new side entry porch; new second floor addition over an existing covered loggia

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Mrs. Vanneck and Mr. Ives

ATTORNEY PRESENT: Maura Ziska, Attorney for the applicant
ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Anthony Minichetti, Anthony Minichetti Architect
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Dustin Mizell, Environment Design Group

Ms. Ziska discussed the requested variances for the non-conforming bay window, and for street side yard setback for the garage addition. She also explained that the owner had purchased two adjacent properties, joined them to the 302 Caribbean Road property, and demolished the homes on both lots in favor of garden area.

Mr. Minichetti presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. Design elements include: New rustication (coquina veneer) surrounding the new front door and two Bahama shuttered windows; new bay window; addition of new study for Mr. Murray; new side entry with covered porch and stoop; addition of two more bays to the existing 3 car garage; dormers at new second floor addition above garage; new proposed living loggia; Bahama shutters added at several locations.

Under commission comments: What is the point of the veneer at the entrance?; all different types of windows throughout; dormers are too large; chimney too tall; and, bay window out of scale with top heavy roof structure.

Chairman Vila asked that the commission deal with the variance issues first, prior to further comments.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCES, THE TWO OF THEM...FRONT AND SIDE, WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS TO THE SUBJECT PROPERTY.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Commission comments continued: Entry improved; improve the entablature; bay window overblown...make it more elegant; side elevation-dormers too large; bay window is way too prominent; like the stone; and, the amount of open garden is a wonderful improvement.

Dustin Mizell presented the landscape/hardscape changes in accordance with the submitted plans. He explained that the owner wants an expansive garden. All existing vegetation will be retained, while some will be relocated on site. Design elements include: Lush open lawn, dense canopy, crushed shell paths, proposed new north/south oriented pool; terraces; and, additional brick parking area.

Under commission comments: The long expanse of Ficus hedge along North Lake Way needs some type of interruption; and, suggested that the garage wing be softened with additional landscaping. Mr. Mizell noted that they will look into the hedge issue along North Lake Way, but that area is complicated with a utility easement.

The commission thanked the owners for creating huge gardens.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

<u>B - 017 - 2013 Additions</u>
Address: 1460 North Lake Way
Applicant: David Rosow and Jean Rosow
Architect: Michael J. Johnson
Project Description: Proposed attached two-story garage (with exercise room at second floor) 1156 sq. ft. footprint; relocation of existing generator

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Michael J. Johnson and Daniel Menard, La Berge and Menard

It should be noted that the applicant brought a model of the project to the meeting. Mr. Johnson made some introductory remarks and turned the presentation over to Mr. Menard who presented the project for the addition in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He explained that the Rosows recently purchased an additional strip of land to facilitate the addition and the relocation of the generator. He noted that the Town Council approved the moving of the generator. The landscape plan will be presented at a later date. Mr. Menard, in reviewing the design of the new garage, stated a deliberate attempt to make the garage building very secondary to the main house. There are dormers with shutters on the second story level of the garage. The garage doors will be painted green to match the shutters.

Mr. Ives called attention to the fact that on the landscape buffer plan, the garage is noted as detached, but it is, in fact, attached to the main house.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 022 -2013 Modifications to house and hardscape
Address: 254 Tradewind Drive
Applicant: Nancy Colhoun
Architect: Saladrigas and Cohen Architecture Inc.
Project Description: Modification of existing roof including: Removal of existing parapet, and introduction of traditional wood outlookers in the Bermuda style; alterations to covered front entry; introduction of courtyard wall, picket fence and gate, new courtyard, fountain and paving materials

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Rafael Saladrigas and Leah Cohen, Saladrigas and Cohen Architecture Inc.

Ms. Cohen introduced the project with information and photographs and listed the five visible alterations to the house. These are as listed above, with one addition...the re-roof with a mitered white Bermuda concrete tile roof. Mr. Saladrigas continued with the architecture in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. Design elements include: All landscape to remain as is; hardscape changes as presented; Flemish gable at new front entry; covered opening with butterfly shutters; applique of mahogany on garage door; Fountain-Olympic stone coping with tile inside; walkway-Olympic pattern with brick border.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 023 - 2013 Extension of prior approval
Address: 657 Island Drive
Applicant: 657 Island Drive Trust - Maura Ziska, Trustee
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects Inc.
Project Description: A one year extension to a previously approved new two-story residence, and previously approved landscape and hardscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Zukov

It must be noted that Mr. Karakul has recused himself and filed a Voting Conflict form as he is the owner of the property. Mr. Gruss will vote in his stead.

ATTORNEY PRESENT: Maura Ziska, Attorney for the Applicant

Ms. Ziska explained the need for a one year extension of a previous ARCOM approval.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV APPROVING A ONE YEAR EXTENSION.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Let the record show that there was a recess for lunch from 12:30 p.m. to 1:30 p.m.

B - 024 - 2013 Demolition
Address: 270 El Bravo Way
Applicant: Mr. and Mrs. Schottenstein
Architect: Dailey Janssen Architects, Roger Janssen
Project Description: Demolition of an existing single story residence (with a second story above the garage), pool, driveway, hardscape and landscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Roger Janssen, Dailey Janssen Architects
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: John Lang, Lang Design Group

Mr. Janssen provided the demolition report for this 1952 Henry Harding designed one and two story home. Mr. Lang noted that two Banyans will be relocated if they can be saved. Six (6) existing Royal Palms will be retained. There will be an attempt to move the Sapodillas. Hedges on the north and south sides will remain. The applicant will meet with the neighbors regarding the hedge on the east side, which is not in good condition, to reach a solution maintaining privacy for all.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED WITH THE TYPICAL CAVEATS FOR SODDING AND IRRIGATING, WHICH WOULD INCLUDE THE AREA AROUND ISLAND ROAD.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 025 - 2013 Modifications to windows
Address: 389 South Lake Drive
Applicant: 389 Corporation Cooperative
Architect: James C. Paine Jr.
Project Description; Removal of precast concrete screens which extend vertically from bottom to top of existing 6 story structure. Replace master bedroom windows, previously behind screens, with new horizontal sliding impact windows to match white finish. Provide window guardrail protection at 42" A.F.F.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: James C. Paine Jr.
OTHERS WHO TESTIFIED: Paul King, Structural Engineer, with the King Structural Group, Mary Anne Reilly, President 389 Corporation Cooperative, Marjorie Toner, Past President 389 Corporation Cooperative, and Pat Doman, Resident at 389 S. Lake Drive

Mr. Paine presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He listed the reasons that the concrete screens are problematic: Steel connectors are deteriorated and eventually will not hold; significant cracking in the screens; waterproofing problems; mold

and mildew problems; impossible to reach the windows behind them, except from the interior; windows cannot be cleaned; and, views are blocked. Mr. Paine was prepared with some design alternatives. Mr. Paine commented that the majority of the Coop's Board is in favor of the project. Mr. King offered his professional comments in support of removal of the screens. It was noted, during discussion, that the roof drains have been paved over which is only making the water/mold intrusion problems worse.

Mr. Lindgren read several letters into the record from Ann Webb, Mrs. Edward Martin, E. Baxter Webb, and Vincent Lyness, all recommending denial of the project. Kenneth Pfrengle requested deferral of the project to allow time for the co-op to "get their act together".

Mary Anne Reilly and Marjorie Toner offered their comments in support of the project. Pat Doman stated that when she purchased the property three years ago, her unit also had mold problems. She had the window replaced and has had no problems since then.

Under commission comments: This is distinctive 1960's architectural style...part of the distinctive fabric of Palm Beach; would like a deferral to ask the Board to meet with the owners to achieve agreement, to address the water problems from the roof...and, come back and tell us what you want to do; achieve consensus; we want to hear from the silent majority, and later...perhaps a modification to Scheme 3, and, a request for an aesthetic improvement.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR DEFERRAL (TO MAY).
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 026 - 2013 Addition and Renovation
Address: 1260 N. Ocean Boulevard
Applicant: Marianne and Eugene Conese
Architect: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, AIA, P.A.
Project Description: Addition and renovation to garage/guest house. Landscape and hardscape changes.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Vanneck

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, Architect
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: John Lang, Lang Design Group

Mr. Kirchhoff presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He explained that the garage /guest house does not function well as it exists. Project elements: Remove fake arches; flat roof behind parapet; turn a portion into an exercise room; replace deteriorated features; and, plain garage doors. John Lang concentrated his work in the rear of the house with fruit tree gardens on either side of the garage, and flank the existing driveway with a pair of Date Palms.

Under commission comments: The two new Date Palms will call attention to the garage; garage doors may be too plain; and, use trees which are not too tall or important.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR "APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, WITH CERTAIN SUGGESTIONS."
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 027 - 2013 Modification to previous approvals
Address: 160 Royal Palm Way
Applicant: 160 Royal Palm LLC
Architect: Rafael A. Rodriguez
Project Description: This application is for the removal of the stuccoed parapet wall around the perimeter of the Function Room roof area

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Messrs. Homes and Vila

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Rafael Rodriquez, Architect
OTHERS WHO TESTIFIED: Phil Maddux, Sanchez and Maddux

Mr. Zukov was concerned that an ARCOM approval might be misconstrued by the owner to allow an extension of work at the hotel beyond the stipulated deadline. Mr. Page responded that the owners have been on notice for some time that they are over their time limit, and they are being fined $2,000 per day for every day beyond February 14, 2013.

Mr. Rodriguez presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He explained that there is no longer any access to the roof; therefore, the owner requests removal of the previously approved parapet on top of the Function Room. There are no air conditioning units there either. The roof will be a built-up flat, white gravel roof.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, NOTING THAT THIS DOES NOT AFFECT THE TOWN'S RELATIONSHIP WITH THE OWNERS AND THE EXISTING LITIGATION AND FINES.

Phil Maddux of Sanchez and Maddux explained that his firm is a tenant in the building to the east of this property, and they request that the parapet remains so they do not have to look at any future equipment which may be placed up there.

MOTION AMENDED BY MR. HOMES ADDING THAT IN THE EVENT OF THE INSTALLATION OF ANY MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT ON THE ROOF, A PARAPET WALL MUST BE INSTALLED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV TO LEAVE THE PARAPET AS IS.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 029 - 2013 New Residence
Address: 119 East Inlet Drive
Applicant: Richard Cushing True LLC
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects Inc.
Project Description: Construction of a new two-story single family residence; final hardscape and landscape. Building, Trim, and Roof Colors: White; Shutters: Black. Roof: Flat concrete tile

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith, Smith and Moore Architects Inc.
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Mario Nievera, Nievera Williams Design

Mr. Smith presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He explained that the project had received site plan approval from the Town Council. He described the house as a two-story, compact "H" plan with a 1.5 story garage with small attic office above; circular vehicular drive; linear pool in east/west direction; pergola at west end of pool; cabana bath at rear of garage; in the Dutch West Indies style with Dutch gables; color change to shutters: now seafoam green, not black. Mr. Smith stated that some revised elevations were submitted yesterday, at staff's request, showing the pergola location, and Mr. Smith also corrected the order of the elevations on the plan sheets so they read sequentially. He distributed the corrected sheets to the members and they were projected on the Elmo (Sheet A.4 and A.5).

Mr. Sammons commented that the gables would be better if the "balls at the top might want to be wider, and everything expand out a bit so they are more equal in size," and, the pier in between the two garage doors is super thin...maybe if that were detailed more like a column or a pier, it would look better.

Mr. Lindgren read a letter into the record dated April 3, 2013 from the property owner of 167 East Inlet wherein he fully supports the project.

Mario Nievera presented the landscape/hardscape in accordance with the submitted plans. Design elements: Simple plan to reflect simple architecture; two entrance driveways; add Coconut Palms and Callophyllum hedge to the perimeter; Alexander Palms at 4 corners of pool; a lot of Bougainvillea for color; many salt tolerant plants, and other plant species as noted. In response to a question, Mr. Nievera stated that the landscaping planned for the sides of the house will be sufficient to provide privacy for the neighbors.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED WITH THE MINOR ALTERATIONS RECOMMENDED BY MR. SAMMONS (SEE ABOVE).
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

<u>B - 030 - 2013 New Residence.</u>
Address: 123 Via Fontana
Applicant: WALMAR, LLC (Mr. and Mrs. Walter and Mary Anne McPhail)
Architect: SKA Architect + Planner/Patrick W. Segraves, A.I.A.
Project Description: New one and two-story island contemporary style home to be approximately 7,700 square feet. Home will consist of living room, dining room, kitchen, family room, laundry room, four bedrooms, five bathrooms, one half bathroom, two offices and a four car garage. Final landscaping will also be included. Building Color: Off-white; Trim Color: White; Roof: Bronze standing seam

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Patrick W. Segraves, SKA Architect + Planner
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Don Skowron, Landscape Architect

Mr. Segraves presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He described it as basically a single story contemporary styled house with a detached 4-

car garage. Mr. Skowron continued with the landscape/hardscape stressing the owner's request for a private, jungle-like setting. Design elements: Looping driveway, spacious motor court, two beautiful Green Buttonwoods which will be saved and relocated on site; Mexican beach pebble perimeter, and other plant materials as presented.

The commission offered only positive comments regarding the project viewing it as a wonderful, refreshing house.

MOTION BY MR. ZUKOV FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Let the record show that Mr. Zukov left the meeting at 3:10 p.m.

B - 031 - 2013 New beach cabana
Address: 230 S. Ocean Boulevard
Applicant: John Ceriale
Architect: Jose Andrew Gonzalez, Gonzalez Architects
Project Description: A new 196 sq. ft. beach cabana

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

Mr. Lindgren stated that this project actually requires multiple Town Council approvals. As such, he recommended that the project be deferred to the June 26, 2013 ARCOM meeting.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE JUNE ARCOM MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B - 032 - 2013 Addition
Address: 118 Seaview Avenue
Applicant: Thomas D'Agostino
Architect: B1 Architects
Project Description: Proposed 1039 sq. ft. addition to an existing single story private residence

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Gregory Bonner, B1 Architects
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Dustin Mizell, Environment Design Group

Mr. Bonner presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. For clarity and in contrast to the description above, the project, as shown in the presentation materials includes: New two-car garage, new bedroom, new laundry, new enclosed hallway, expand bath, convert existing one-car garage to pool loggia, and modify landscape and hardscape. Dustin Mizell stated that any landscape/hardscape changes are only in response to the architectural changes, and none are visible from the street. A minimal amount of existing landscape will be removed, but landscaping will also be added as part of the project. There will be a reduction in the amount of gravel at the driveway to create an internal courtyard with a fountain feature.

Under commission comments: The garage has the highest eave of the whole house, and should be lower.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL WITH THE CAVEAT THAT THE EAVE ON THE NEW GARAGE BE LOWERED TO SAME AS OR BELOW THE ADJACENT EAVE BY PERHAPS AS MUCH AS A FOOT.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. **MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS:** None

D. MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS:

A - 012 - 2013 Remodel with landscape/hardscape revisions
Address: 401 Seaview Avenue
Applicant: Gary Pohrer
Architect: KTA Architects
Project Description: An existing one-story CMU residence shall receive: new windows and doors, a new cedar shingle roof, stucco finish and painted wood shutters; minor hardscape/landscape revisions. Shutter color: Pale Blue

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Kevin Asbacher, KTA Architects
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Dustin Mizell, Environment Design Group

Mr. Asbacher presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. In addition to the above description, an existing carport will be enclosed to create a one bay garage (114 sq. ft. addition), and a laundry room will be added. The Chattahoochee driveway will be re-shaped. Mr. Mizell stated that the owner wants to clean up the site. Existing landscaping will be re-organized and supplemented by additional landscape material. The result will be a clean, simple plan with some accents.

Mrs. Vanneck suggested that proposed landscape material which is on the removal list be removed from the plan.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED, WITH MRS. VANNECK'S SUGGESTION.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. SAMMONS.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

A - 013 - 2013 Landscape/Hardscape
Address: 254 Tangier Avenue
Applicant: John and Gianna Copeland
Architect: Gregory Lombardi Design
Project Description: Landscape and Hardscape improvements including: New entry walk and gate with piers and gas lighting; removal of one driveway curb cut; relocation of second driveway curb cut; new side gate/arbor; increased planted area at front of house; decorative garden fence at side garden; and door at living room (not visible from street).

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Vanneck

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Parker Ranspach, Gregory Lombardi Design

Mr. Ranspach presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He stated that the goals of the project are to decrease the amount of hardscape, improve the entry sequence and improve the landscape which is also to include a kitchen garden.

Under comments, Mr. Lindgren stated that an original proposed arbor and trellis were removed due to code issues.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

There was also a comment about the gas lanterns as presented...that they were awkward in the way they were hanging. The applicant was asked to return with the driveway gate and the lanterns.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL WITHOUT THE LANTERNS AND GATES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

A - 014 - 2013 Exterior Modifications
Address: 233 Barton Avenue
Applicant: William C. Haney
Architect: Mesa Architecture, Stephen Roy
Project Description: Exterior modifications to include window and door replacement, and copper roof over existing bay windows

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Vanneck

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Stephen Roy, Mesa Architecture

Mr. Roy presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. Design elements include: Replace windows and doors; remove balcony over bay window and add copper roof, fenestration changes; change louvered shutters to panel shutters; add aluminum lattice around front door for vines; add two French doors on west side; modify covered porch in rear; and, assorted other changes as described. The color scheme is white and teal.

MOTION BY MR. SAMMONS FOR APPROVAL, BUT THE CANTILEVER IS EXCESSIVE. REDUCE IT BY ONE FOOT.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

X. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE): None

XI. **COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT:**

Mr. Page reported that the issue of conflicts of interest was reviewed by the Town's ORS Committee. The ORS agreed that the existing regulations are too stringent, (3 conflicts = removal from the commission). They will propose that 4 conflicts are acceptable, but 5 conflicts will mean removal from the commission. This recommendation will be reviewed by the Town Council.

XII. **ADJOURNMENT:**

MOTION BY MR. HOMES TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 3:44 P.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on Wednesday, May 22, 2013 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach, Florida.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert J. Vila, Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

cmd

FORM 8B MEMORANDUM OF VOTING CONFLICT FOR COUNTY, MUNICIPAL, AND OTHER LOCAL PUBLIC OFFICERS

LAST NAME—FIRST NAME—MIDDLE NAME KARAKUL KONN	NAME OF BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY, OR COMMITTEE ARCOM
MAILING ADDRESS 4 EL BRAVO WAY	THE BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY OR COMMITTEE ON WHICH I SERVE IS A UNIT OF: ☐ CITY ☐ COUNTY ☑ OTHER LOCAL AGENCY TOWN
CITY PALM BEACH COUNTY FL	NAME OF POLITICAL SUBDIVISION: TOWN OF PALM BEACH
DATE ON WHICH VOTE OCCURRED 4/24/13	MY POSITION IS: ☐ ELECTIVE ☑ APPOINTIVE

WHO MUST FILE FORM 8B

This form is for use by any person serving at the county, city, or other local level of government on an appointed or elected board, council, commission, authority, or committee. It applies equally to members of advisory and non-advisory bodies who are presented with a voting conflict of interest under Section 112.3143, Florida Statutes.

Your responsibilities under the law when faced with voting on a measure in which you have a conflict of interest will vary greatly depending on whether you hold an elective or appointive position. For this reason, please pay close attention to the instructions on this form before completing the reverse side and filing the form.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 112.3143, FLORIDA STATUTES

A person holding elective or appointive county, municipal, or other local public office MUST ABSTAIN from voting on a measure which inures to his or her special private gain or loss. Each elected or appointed local officer also is prohibited from knowingly voting on a measure which inures to the special gain or loss of a principal (other than a government agency) by whom he or she is retained (including the parent organization or subsidiary of a corporate principal by which he or she is retained); to the special private gain or loss of a relative; or to the special private gain or loss of a business associate. Commissioners of community redevelopment agencies under Sec. 163.356 or 163.357, F.S., and officers of independent special tax districts elected on a one-acre, one-vote basis are not prohibited from voting in that capacity.

For purposes of this law, a "relative" includes only the officer's father, mother, son, daughter, husband, wife, brother, sister, father-in-law, mother-in-law, son-in-law, and daughter-in-law. A "business associate" means any person or entity engaged in or carrying on a business enterprise with the officer as a partner, joint venturer, coowner of property, or corporate shareholder (where the shares of the corporation are not listed on any national or regional stock exchange).

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

ELECTED OFFICERS:

In addition to abstaining from voting in the situations described above, you must disclose the conflict:

PRIOR TO THE VOTE BEING TAKEN by publicly stating to the assembly the nature of your interest in the measure on which you are abstaining from voting; *and*

WITHIN 15 DAYS AFTER THE VOTE OCCURS by completing and filing this form with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who should incorporate the form in the minutes.

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

APPOINTED OFFICERS:

Although you must abstain from voting in the situations described above, you otherwise may participate in these matters. However, you must disclose the nature of the conflict before making any attempt to influence the decision, whether orally or in writing and whether made by you or at your direction.

IF YOU INTEND TO MAKE ANY ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION PRIOR TO THE MEETING AT WHICH THE VOTE WILL BE TAKEN:

- You must complete and file this form (before making any attempt to influence the decision) with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who will incorporate the form in the minutes. (Continued on other side)

APPOINTED OFFICERS (continued)

- A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the agency.
- The form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

IF YOU MAKE NO ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION EXCEPT BY DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING:

- You must disclose orally the nature of your conflict in the measure before participating.
- You must complete the form and file it within 15 days after the vote occurs with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who must incorporate the form in the minutes. A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the agency, and the form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed.

DISCLOSURE OF LOCAL OFFICER'S INTEREST

I, KEVIN KARAKUL, hereby disclose that on 4/24, 2013:

(a) A measure came or will come before my agency which (check one)

☑ inured to my special private gain or loss;

___ inured to the special gain or loss of my business associate, _____;

___ inured to the special gain or loss of my relative, _____;

___ inured to the special gain or loss of _____, by whom I am retained; or

___ inured to the special gain or loss of _____, which is the parent organization or subsidiary of a principal which has retained me.

(b) The measure before my agency and the nature of my conflicting interest in the measure is as follows:

B-023-2013 657 ISLAND my own private home

4/29/13
Date Filed

Signature

NOTICE: UNDER PROVISIONS OF FLORIDA STATUTES §112.317, A FAILURE TO MAKE ANY REQUIRED DISCLOSURE CONSTITUTES GROUNDS FOR AND MAY BE PUNISHED BY ONE OR MORE OF THE FOLLOWING: IMPEACHMENT, REMOVAL OR SUSPENSION FROM OFFICE OR EMPLOYMENT, DEMOTION, REDUCTION IN SALARY, REPRIMAND, OR A CIVIL PENALTY NOT TO EXCEED $10,000.