MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
IN THE
TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 S. COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH, FL

WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 28, 2012, 9:00 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording of the meeting by contacting Cindy Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER (9:00:08 a.m.)

Vice Chairman and Acting Chairman Nikita Zukov called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL (9:00:43 a.m.)

Robert J. Vila, Chairman	ABSENT (unexcused)
Nikita Zukov, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Member	PRESENT
Henry Homes III, Member	PRESENT
Richard Sammons, Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Alternate Member	PRESENT (voting member today)
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Staff members present: John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building; John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Architectural Commission. Town Attorney John C. Randolph was present for the majority of the meeting.

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: (9:01:05 a.m.)

After the Pledge and prior to moving to the next agenda item, Mr. Page announced that Dr. Phillips had resigned from ARCOM since he was no longer a Town of Palm Beach resident.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE OCTOBER 24, 2012 MEETING: (9:01:24 a.m.)

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA : (9:02:10 a.m.)
MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY: (9:02:24 a.m.)
Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. OTHER BUSINESS: None

VIII. PROJECT REVIEW:

A. MAJOR PROJECTS-OLD BUSINESS **(9:02:40 a.m.)**
B - 047 - 2012 Revisions to previous approval
ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Address: 160 Royal Palm Way
Applicant: 160 Royal Palm LLC (Glenn F. Straub, Manager)
Architect: Rafael A. Rodriguez
Project Description: The subject condominium hotel is currently under renovation pursuant to Town Council in May 2007. The site building has been modified from the original plan which requires approval from ARCOM. The following is a list of proposed changes to the approved plan: 1. Elimination of 2 pool structures and relocation of a pool structure 2. Elimination of mansard roof on the east elevation and addition of mansard roof on north elevation and east guest awning elevation 3. Redesign of landscaping, cabanas and pool terrace area 4. Addition of interior floor above lobby to total 1,486 of which 500 square feet is dining area 5. Addition of parapet to connect east and west stair towers 6. Addition of roof deck lounge on existing roof top of hotel 7. Addition of elevators to be shown on roof plans of function room where previously not shown 8. Elevators #2 and #5 up to roof deck 9. Third floor unit #3 exterior wall shown where previously not shown 10. Entrance stair balustrade changed to cast stone 11. Elevator penthouse #7 now shown where previously not shown 12. Front door design has been redesigned 13. Water table and rustication has been removed 14. New cast stone balustrade at function room parapet wall 15. New pergola at south dining terrace 16. New revised west elevation at function room 17. Exterior balconies extended 3?-6" beyond face of building on North, West courtyard and South courtyard elevations. Variances requested for height and overall height, parking spaces, and to allow construction to be phased

Revised Project Description: The subject condominium hotel is currently under renovation pursuant to the approval of the Town Council in May 2007. The site plan has been modified from the original plan which requires approval from the Town Council and ARCOM. The following is a list of the proposed changes to the approved plan: Elimination of two pool structures and relocation of a pool structure which includes service bar. Relocation of pool restrooms to inside of Function Room Elimination of the mansard roof on the east elevation and keep the existing mansard on the east guest wing elevation in lieu of the parapet that was previously shown on the plans and approved. Relocation of pool equipment and storage to under pool service building. Approval of landscaping, cabanas and pool terrace for the entire site. Addition of plunge pools to the pool terrace area. Addition of interior floor above lobby to total 1,486 square feet of which 500 square feet is dining area (#7 not under ARCOM jurisdiction) Addition of parapet to connect east stair tower to existing approved parapet. Addition of elevator to be shown on roof plan of Function Room roof where previously not shown. Replace solid parapet on Function Room with balustrade railing. Increase height of doors in main lobby overlooking pool deck by 3 feet. Add a breezeway from the main lobby to Function Room. Add a 7 foot tall hedge with a 42 inch rail on south side of proposed swimming pool to run length of pool deck area. Add pergola on south elevation and extend balconies on north, south and east elevations. Addition of service corridors and expansion of kitchen and laundry room which totals approximately 3,625 square feet. (#15 not under ARCOM jurisdiction) Shift location of approved Function Room 25 feet to the east and add back the 4 of the 6 parking spaces that are lost. The size of the spa facility is decreased from 7,325 square feet to 5,948 square feet which eliminates the need for 2 parking spaces that were lost. Net effect is zero loss of parking spaces. Replace solid concrete railing on stairway on south side of west wing fire escape with precast balustrade railing.

At the June meeting, there was a motion to defer and see each one of these individual requests come in with the approved plans, pictures of existing conditions, and requested changes with supporting information. At the July meeting, there were a series of motions for approval and/or deferral to the August meeting. Deferred items include: The front elevation (porte cochere) which is to be re-designed with piers or double columns and then brought back to ARCOM; the Landscape plan is to return to ARCOM after obtaining final site plan approval from the Town Council; and, detailing of the breezeway from the main lobby to the Function Room to return to ARCOM. At the August meeting, there was a motion to approve, as presented, the southern wall exposure boundary line with the addition of doubling up the number of 14 ft. Traveler Palms that are from the Function Room east, adding Confederate Jasmine of a minimum height of 12 ft. to that wall, and that immediately, the eastern hedge perimeter be treated, fertilized, at least once a week, and be allowed to grow to a height of 16-18 feet, and that all these Traveler Palms are under perpetual maintenance, and the whole property should be under perpetual maintenance, and that it is our recommendation that the Medjool Palms be replaced with Coconuts. There was a second motion relative to the front porte cochere to make these four columns square piers, and that the piers are to align with the wall above, and the applicant is to return next month (Sept.) with a drawing of the piers (effectively a deferral). There was a third motion relative to the south stairs on the west wing, to remain with the original design of the exits, i.e., to not replace the cement with aluminum. The applicant was also asked to address the issue of noise from the A/C equipment at the September meeting. At the September meeting, without hearing the project further, the project was deferred to the October meeting at the applicant's request. At the October meeting, without hearing the project further, the project was deferred to the November meeting at the applicant's request.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Tara Lordi, Owner's Representative and Rafael A. Rodriguez, Architect
ATTORNEY PRESENT: Maura Ziska for the applicant

Ms. Lordi presented plans which replace the front entry columns with piers. Under commission comments, the commission agreed that the piers need a base, and discussed the horizontal joints of the piers.

Commission members recalled that the applicant was also to address soundproofing with regard to the air conditioning equipment. Ms. Lordi indicated that this project will be reviewed in January regarding removing the air conditioning units from the top of the Function Room to an area closer to the hotel and away from the neighbors. The a/c equipment will still need to be soundproofed for hotel guests.

It was suggested that the addition of the suggested bases be handled as a staff approval by Mr. Lindgren in consultation with the Chairman or Vice Chairman.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL SUBJECT TO STAFF APPROVAL FOR BASES ON THE ARCHES AND THAT THE HORIZONTAL CUTS BE MINIMIZED. THE BASE DESIGN IS TO BE SUBMITTED THIS WEEK TO STAFF.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

(Also, see comments relative to this project under "X. Comments of the Architectural Commission and Director of Planning, Zoning and Building Department".

B - 072 - 2012 Park Garden
Address: 224, 226, 234 Seminole Avenue
Applicant: Temple Emanu El of Palm Beach, Inc.
Architect: Cotleur & Hearing, Inc.
Project Description: Passive park garden that includes a walking path with benches and a pergola

At the August meeting, without hearing the project, a motion carried for deferral to the October meeting. At the October meeting, a motion carried approving the landscape plans and deferring the pergola to the November meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Sammons

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Donaldson Hearing, Cotleur & Hearing, Inc.
ATTORNEY PRESENT: Maura Ziska for the applicant

Mr. Hearing noted that at the last meeting, the landscape was approved subject to the addition of a tree. Since that time, the landscape plan has been revised to add (3) additional Tabebuia trees. He presented a revised two-tiered pergola with a taller center piece (approximately 12 ft. overall height) and two lower flanking wings (approximately 10 ft. overall height). Side bracing was added along with detailed outriggers on the street side.

Under commission comments, most members were pleased with the revised landscape and pergola plans, but there was a concern expressed, in consideration of the neighbors, regarding making the pergola even taller than originally presented. Mr. Hearing responded that from the street, the height of the pergola will not be an issue. The pergola will really only be seen from neighboring second floor windows.

MOTION BY MR. HOMES FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KNOWLES.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MRS. VANNECK OPPOSED.

B - 073 - 2012 Demolition and New Residence
Address: 200 Eden Road
Applicant: Act II Properties, LLC
Architect: SKA Architect + Planner/Patrick W. Segraves, AIA
Project Description: Demolition of existing two-story home. Construction of new two-story British West Indies style home to be approximately 6,600 square feet. Home will consist of four bedrooms, 5.5 baths, living room, family room, dining room, kitchen library, loggia and a three-car garage. Final landscape will also be included. Roof: Patina green flat concrete tile; Building color: Cream; Trim color: White; Shutter color: Dark Green

At the September meeting, demolition was approved with the typical caveats for sodding and irrigating. A second motion approved the architecture, but the applicant was to return with the final landscape (effectively a deferral to October), with the comments that were made including a new location for the generator, and revisions to the landscape along North Ocean Boulevard. At the October meeting, without hearing the project further, the project was deferred to the November meeting at the request of the applicant.

There was no call for disclosure of ex parte communication.

As the landscape architect was not present at this time...
MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE END OF THE MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Later in the meeting, when the item was re-called...
MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR DEFERRAL TO THE DECEMBER MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

<u>B - 085 - 2012 Demolition</u>
Address: 8 Golfview Road
Applicant: Dana Landry and Bill Moody (Contract Purchasers)
Architect: James C. Paine Jr.
Project Description: Demolish existing residence

At the October meeting, the project was deferred for a better presentation.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: James C. Paine Jr.

Mr. Paine provided the demolition report with a sufficient photographic essay, as had been requested last month by the commission, for this 1922 Marion Sims Wyeth designed residence. He stated that the property was considered for landmarking in 1997 with owner objection and it was not approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission at that time.

ARCOM members clearly expressed their preference that this Wyeth home, on this unique private street, not be demolished, but since ARCOM has no legal criteria to deny a demolition request...

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.

Mr. Zukov strongly encouraged the architect to advise his client to design a new home in the style of the other homes on Golfview, respecting the established neighborhood. Mr. Sammons stated that the property should have been landmarked. He indicated that subject to his study of the property for a previous client, renovation of this home is not out of the question, and indeed, would be a wiser choice.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES, INCORPORATING MR. ZUKOV'S COMMENT THAT ANY NEW HOUSE DESIGN SHOULD MATCH THE STYLE OF THE OTHER HOMES ON GOLFVIEW.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. MAJOR PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS **(9:34:17 a.m.)**

B - 087 - 2012 New Pool Cabana
ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Address: 320 Polmer Park
Applicant: Fred Latsko
Architect: Robert L. Bell
Project Description: Construction of a 520 sq. ft. single story pool cabana including open porch
Variances requested for lot coverage and landscaped open space

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Robert L. Bell
ATTORNEY PRESENT: M. Timothy Hanlon for the applicant

Mr. Hanlon discussed the variances requested for the project, noting that the proposed new pool cabana will not be visible from the public right-of-way. Mr. Bell provided the presentation in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above.

Commission members had several concerns with the building design: Strange little building; problem with columns at corners; odd layout; questioning the height; perhaps lower the band; window is high and pinched in there; proportions are lacking; ARCOM is underwhelmed; improve the aesthetics; and, since variances are required, the project should enhance the property.

MOTION BY MR. SAMMONS FOR DEFERRAL TO DECEMBER.
MOTION SECONDED BY MRS. VANNECK.

Mr. Sammons provided several suggestions for improvement at the request of the architect.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

There was no motion made relative to the variances today.

B - 090 - 2012 Landscape/Hardscape
Address: 1480 North Lake Way
Applicant: 1480 N Lake Way LLC
Architect: John Lang, Lang Design Group
Project Description: Previously approved hardscape driveway material changes and final landscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: John Lang, Lang Design Group

Mr. Lang noted one hardscape change relative to the route of the driveway to avoid intrusion into Banyan trees. Secondly, the owner has elected to eliminate a set of stairs at the pool which led to the guest pavilion. Coconuts, which had been planted on the beach, were moved onto the property, behind the seawall. The landscape plan evidences a very tropical, casual landscape with "tons" of Coconuts now added to the property to soften the building elevations. Mr. Lang was asked to be sure to obscure the service area with landscaping.

MOTION BY MRS. VANNECK FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. KARAKUL.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. **<u>MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS</u>:** None

D. **<u>MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS</u>:** None

IX. <u>COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)</u>: None

X. <u>COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT:</u> (10:00:09 a.m.)

Mr. Zukov asked the members to opine relative to the material of choice for the piers at 160 Royal Palm Way. The consensus was that the piers should be done in cast stone, and that there should be some horizontal joints in the piers.

XI. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>:

MOTION BY MR. KARAKUL TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 10:04 A.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. HOMES.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on Friday, December 21, 2012 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach, Florida.

Respectfully submitted,

Nikita Zukov, Vice Chairman and Acting Chairman

cmd