TOWN OF PALM BEACH
PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON THURSDAY, DECEMBER 10, 2015

I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Architectural Commission was called to order on Thursday, December 10, 2015 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers.

II. ROLL CALL

Robert J. Vila, Chairman	PRESENT
Ann L. Vanneck, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Kenn Karakul, Member	PRESENT
Richard Sammons, Member	PRESENT
Peter I. C. Knowles II, Member	PRESENT
Martin D. Gruss, Member	PRESENT
Robert N. Garrison, Member	PRESENT
Alexander C. Ives, Alternate Member	PRESENT (arrived at 9:10 a.m.)
Michael B. Small, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Maisie Grace, Alternate Member	ABSENT (unexcused)

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Vila led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE NOVEMBER 16, 2015 MEETING

Motion was made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Karakul to approve the minutes of the November 16, 2015 meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

The following change was made to the agenda:

DEFERRED: Project No. A-053-2015, 100 El Bravo Way was deferred to the January 27, 2016 meeting.

Motion was made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Karakul to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried with all in favor.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Mrs. Roedel administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

Mr. Page addressed the issue of the Commissioner's Ethics Review Certification. He advised that an auditor from Palm Beach County reviewed the Town's ethics training records and we have been informed that several Commissioners' certifications have expired. It is now necessary for those with expired certifications to watch the ethics video, sign the acknowledgement form, and submit the form to the Town Managers Office, as quickly as possible.

VII. PROJECT REVIEW

A. MAJOR PROJECTS-OLD BUSINESS

B - 093 - 2015 Tunnel and Landscaping

Address: 1520 S. Ocean Blvd.
Applicant: Il Sogno LLC (Janet Vargas, Manager)
Architect: Peter Pennoyer Architects/Tim Kelly
Landscape: Paradelo, Burgess Design Group/Andres Paradelo
Attorney: Frank Lynch
Original Project Description: Construction of a tunnel beneath South Ocean Boulevard, tunnel stairs, and installation of landscaping east of South Ocean Boulevard. Revised Project Description: New tunnel beneath South Ocean Boulevard; East of South Ocean Boulevard: new seawall, new beach house, replacement of beach access stairs, new tunnel stairs, new landscaping and hardscaping; West of South Ocean Boulevard: new tunnel stairs, new front wall, new entry gates, piers and lights, new landscaping and hardscaping.

At the August meeting, this project was deferred pending submission of a proper application. At the September meeting a motion carried to defer to the October meeting, where the consideration for the beach house be moved to the north end of the property, so it doesn't impact the view when driving from the south and doing the stairs the same way they were done on the west side. At the October meeting, a motion carried to defer this project to the November meeting. At the November meeting, this project was deferred to the December meeting at the attorney's request.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Gruss and Mr. Small

Mr. Lynch stated the project has been scaled down based on previous Commissioner comments. The beach cabana, the sea wall and the relocation of the existing beach stairs have been removed. The variance approvals obtained from Town Council include a special exception for the tunnel, site plan review and variances related to the east side tunnel stairs, setback for the bulkhead line, the tunnel for the bulkhead line and west side stairs down to the tunnel.

Mr. Kelly presented the scaled down version of the project. He stated the impact is now minimal. Mr. Nugent said they presented the design in harmony with the historical character of the house and with a sense of continuity to the old and existing wall and gates.

Mr. Paradelo advised that the motor court on the west side of the property, where the main house is, has been redesigned. He then reviewed the landscape design and plan list.

Commissioner Comments: The Commissioners were very pleased with the scaled down version of the project. There was some concern with the Agave plants in the front of the property, which will be very close to the bike path. Mr. Paradelo stated that they could be changed out for another plant.

Motion was made by Mr. Karakul and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 096 - 2015 Demolition and New Residence
Address: 449 Australian Ave.
Applicant: Cushing Investments, LLC
Architect: Kevin Asbacher
Landscpe: Nievera Williams Design: Keith Williams
Project Description: Demolition of an existing 1 story, 6 unit, multi-family building. Construction of a 2 story, British Colonial, single family residence, with final landscape and hardscape. Building, Trim and Shutter Color - White; Roof - White concrete Tile.

A motion carried to defer the demolition until the October meeting. At the October meeting, a motion carried to defer the Architecture to the November meeting. At the November meeting a motion carried to approve the landscaping with the exception of the western boundary. A hedge agreement between the property owner and the western neighbor is to be reached and brought back to the Commission at the December meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: There were no ex parte communications declared by the Commission.

Mr. Williams stated that he, his client, the neighbors to the west, and Maura Ziska have been discussing how the west side of the property will be handled. It has been proposed that the hedge will be root pruned, in order to prepare for the installation of the wall. If the hedge does not survive, an agreement has been made with the neighbors, that the cost of replacement will be split 50/50. The hedge will not be replaced with Ficus, but rather Clusia hedges or Fishtail Palms.

Commissioner Comments: The Commissioners voiced some concern regarding the height of the house, and feel it's important to be sensitive to the neighbors.

Motion was made by Mr. Karakul and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 114 - 2015 New Residence
Address: 204 Via Del Mar
Applicant: Via Del Mar, LLC
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects/Peter Papadopoulos
Landscape: Nievera Williams Design/Keith Williams
Attorney: Maura Ziska
Project Description: new two story Mediterranean Revival residence with detached pool cabana on vacant lot. Final landscape and hardscape

At the October meeting this project was deferred to the December meeting at the architect's request.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commissioners.

Chairman Vila stated that it is his understanding, that the lot split has not been approved by Town Council and is pending approval of the removal of an air conditioning pad and equipment. Mr. Page advised that the Town Council approved the necessary action which led to the possibility of a new home being constructed, but there were some conditions imposed upon the property, which included the requirement to obtain a building permit and pass final inspection for the relocation of

the air conditioning units that were moved without a permit, and to obtain lot split approval prior to the issuance of a building permit for a new home at 204 Via Del Mar.
Mr. Page advised the Commission that any action taken should include these conditions.

Attorney Ziska, on behalf of the owner stated that the 210 Via Del Mar air conditioning unit is not on this property, but the property to the west, which is being taken care of by that property owner. The lot split application is a one page form and $1,000 fee that needs to be submitted to the Town before the permit can be issued, which is just administrative paper work. She does not see a problem getting that done before the building permit is issued.

Mr. Papadopoulos reviewed the proposed plan for this Volk inspired Mediterranean Revival style house. Ms. Kellogg reviewed the elevations and height. Mr. Papadopoulos said they received some very good suggestions through various ex parte communications. He stated they were not opposed to the suggested alternatives and reviewed those alternate plans.

Commissioner Comments: The Commissioners were concerned about the mass of the walls in a house this size. There was also some concern regarding the false window in the front of the house. Overall the Commissioners like the project, but said there are some missed opportunities.

Mrs. Summers, the owner said they would like to keep the window in the front. They like the symmetry the third window creates.

Mr. Williams reviewed the existing site plan, the proposed site plan and plant list. He stated the idea is to keep it clean and simple with a little whimsy.

Commissioner Comments: The Commissioner's felt that all the pillars in the wall were inconsistent. Mr. Williams said he agreed and will keep the walls clean. Also, the gates should be re-study and perhaps simplified. It was also suggested that the number of Canary Date Palms in the front be cut back.

Mr. Page pointed out that there are two driveways into the property and there is a concern from the Public Works department regarding the new driveway off South County Rd. Curb cuts off the Town major arterials are prohibited and will only be allowed by waiver of the Public Works Right of Way manual from the Town Council.

Motion was made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Sammons to defer this project to the January meeting for further study. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 115 - 2015 Addition/Modification
Address: 417 Seaview Ave.
Applicant: Mr. & Mrs. Todd Carlson
Architect: MP Design & Architecture/Michael Perry
Landscape: Adam Mills
Project Description: Raise existing floor to 7.5 ft. NGVD Elevation. Replace existing roof. New windows and doors. Replace existing siding with new stucco finish. new pool, new landscape and hardscape.

At the November meeting a motion carried to defer the architectural portion of this project to the December meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Vanneck and Mr. Small

Mr. Perry stated that this project was heard and approved in February. The same project came back last month but could not be approved because of an issue with the notices to the neighbors. The variances have now been approved by the Town Council.

Mr. Mills stated that most of the site has been cleared. He reviewed the hardscape and landscape plan as well as the plant list.

Motion was made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Sammons to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 116 - 2015 Addition/Modifications
Address: 425 & 431 Chilean Ave.
Applicant: Lorraine S. Charman
Architect: SKA Architects/Patrick Segraves
Landscape: Nievera Williams Design/Keith Williams
Project Description: On the south side, remove bedroom and 1 balcony (27 sq. ft.) and enlarge front balcony at bedroom #2 and exercise room (95 sq. ft.). On the west side, remove west garage gate and close with 6 ft. wall, remove driveway and garage door and reduce area 45 sq. ft. Driveway area to become patio and landscaping. Curb cuts will be eliminated. Change windows in breakfast area, demolish existing pool and replace with new pool, replace and relocate windows on second floor in proposed bedroom 1, closet and bath 3. On the north side, convert family rooms to open loggia (675 sq. ft.). On the east side, remove existing pool, remove all windows on east wall of first floor. Replace and relocate windows on proposed closet. On the east side, remove existing pool, and remove all windows on east wall of first floor. Replace and relocate windows on proposed closet and add 262 sq. ft. addition to northeast corner, to enlarge living room.

At the November meeting a motion carried to defer this project to the December meeting to accommodate the notification process.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commissioners

Mr. Seagraves stated that the project went to Town Council and received variance approvals. He said there were some changes made to the plan based on the Commissioner comments last month. He then reviewed the details of the proposed plan.

Commission Comments: There were several comments from the Commissioners regarding the details, including the roof. Mr. Seagraves said he would restudy all the suggestions made.

Mr. Williams stated that the landscape plan generally remained the same to what was presented last month. The front entry garden was adjusted to the South to work better with the new architectural plan.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners asked why the piers in the front were so irregular along the street. Mr. Williams stated that they will be modified and equally spaced.

Motion was made by Mr. Karakul and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve both the architecture and landscaping as presented with the exception of the detailing on the front

door and the piers in the front which are to be restudied and brought back to the Commission at the January meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

B. **MAJOR PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS**

B - 119 - 2015 Additions

Address: 200 Jungle Rd.
Applicant: Carl H. and Marsha A. Hewitt
Architect: Design Phase Architecture, LLC/Laura Wright
Project Description: Proposed new two story breakfast room/office addition (100 square ft. building coverage) to east side of existing two story house. All building materials, windows, doors and colors to match existing residence.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: There were no ex parte communications declared by the Commission.

Ms. Wright stated that their proposal is to do a 10' extension to the existing lower wing. This would be used as a breakfast garden space. Ms. Wright reviewed the proposed plan and street views.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners liked the plan and said it is a good addition to the house.

Motion was made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Sammons to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 120- 2015 Addition

Address: 710 South County Rd.
Applicant: Joan Granlund
Architect: Bridges, Marsh & Associates, Inc./Mark Marsh
Landscape: Lang Design Group/John Lang
Project Description: Final site plan, landscape, hardscape and landscape lighting with vehicular/pedestrian gates, and tennis pavilion structure.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Chairman Vila

Mr. Lang stated that this project was previously presented in the preliminary stage and there is very little change. The hardscape remains primarily the same. The landscape is also very similar to what was presented in the preliminary stage and is a fairly simply plan. He reviewed the lights, and the plant list.

Mr. Marsh reviewed the design of the front gate which is a Caribbean look. The wall will be cloud white in color and matches the house. He explained that the tennis pavilion is a garden structure. It's a very simple open lattice structure and will be adjacent to the tennis court.

Commission Comments: The Commission wanted to know if the tennis house would be screened. Mr. Marsh, referring to the casita, (which is what the tennis house will be called), and said the casita would be mitigated.

Motion was made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 121 - 2015 Alterations
Address: 1230 North Ocean Blvd.
Applicant: Christopher Cahill
Architect: Micheal J. Johnson and Daniel Menard
Project Description: Removal of precast balustrades, replace with painted metal railing, removal of excess columns, removal of precast trim over windows, new pecky cypress columns at southeast loggia, replace bowed metal railings, paint out lookers grey.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mrs. Vanneck and Mr. Small

Mr. Menard stated that the house has many columns, which they are trying to reduce in the proposed plan. The house has a developer look to it; there is a lot of brown and a lot of detail. They are proposing a fresh, white simple plan with some blue elements.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt that less is more on this project and liked the new changes. It was mentioned that the columns at the front door should be changed.

Motion was made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the archivolts above the front door are removed and columns at the front door are changed. Motion carried with all in favor.

B - 122 - 2015 New Residence
Address: 201 Debra Lane
Applicant: 201 Debra Lane, LLC
Architect: Dailey Janssen Architects/ Roger P. Janssen
Attorney: Tim Hanloln
Project Description: Construction of a new two story residence, pool, landscape and hardscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several Commission members.

Mr. Hanlon stated that they are seeking architectural review only, despite the variance issue associated with this project. The Commission is not tasked with making any recommendation for, or against on the variance issue. The project went before the Town Council and the variance has been deferred.

Mr. Janssen reviewed the streetscape, the plan and the elevations. He stated that they are proposing to locate the front of the property on North Ocean. The house is a very simple Island Colonial home with a simple material palette, clean volumes and clean lines.

Commission Comments: It was stated by the Commission that the scale and the whole order of the house is not attractive. The roofs are way too high and the gables are oddly positioned. The house doesn't have much cohesion and should be reworked. Mr. Janssen was questioned as to why there are two front doors. There is no access from North Ocean to the front door on North Ocean. There was also some concern regarding the outside shower on North Ocean. There was a question regarding the address change to North Ocean. Mr. Hanlon stated the Zoning Department approved the way the plan was drawn with the front yard being on North Ocean Blvd. If the plan doesn't get approved by the Commission then the address change will not be approved. Mr. Juan Diebold, (property owner), thanked the Commission for the opportunity to present the project. His intention is to build the best house possible. He felt the concerns from the neighbors have been very

reasonable and he looks forward to meeting with the Commission again and addressing any concerns.

Mr. Dotterer stated that he lives across the street from this house. He said that he will reserve his comments and return when resubmitted plans are reviewed.

Motion was made by Mr. Karakul and seconded by Mrs. Vanneck to defer the project for restudy to the January meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

C. **MINOR PROJECTS - OLD BUSINESS**

A - 053 - 2015 Addition/Modification

Address: 100 El Bravo Way
Applicant: Ken Tropin as Trustee of the Kenneth G. Tropin Trust
Architect: Brooks & Falotico Associates, Inc. Chuck Willette
Project Description: Addition of office and side entry along with driveway and landscape alterations on El Bravo Way. Modifications to doors, hardscape and landscape, alterations along South Ocean Boulevard. Various additions and modifications in the courtyard and rear of the house below existing roof lines.

At the October meeting, a motion carried to defer this project to the November meeting. At the November meeting, a motion carried to approve the landscaping as presented, with the exception of the gate design and the relocation of the Venetian well head; which were deferred to the December meeting.

Please note this project was deferred to the January meeting at the request of the attorney.

D. **MINOR PROJECTS-NEW BUSINESS**

A - 061 - 2015 Alterations

Address: 218 List Rd.
Applicant: Austin Willis
Architect: Micheal J. Johnson and Daniel Menard
Project Description: Paint white, replace concrete tile roof with clay barrel tile and remove shutters.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: There were no ex parte communications declared by the Commission.

Mr. Johnson stated that the owners of this house would like to make some changes to the exterior of the home. Mr. Menard reviewed the changes that are being proposed.

Commission Comments: The Commission was very positive about the project and stated that the Monterey barrel tile roof is a built up type of roof, which is done intermittently to convey the feeling that there were repairs done along the life of the building. The craftsman in California are able to attain this look, however, they do not have hurricane codes to deal with and they are not in Florida. Mr. Menard was questioned on how he was going to achieve the Monterey look. Mr. Menard answered, that perhaps by using a darker color or using four colors on the tile will give the roof that articulation.

Motion was made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the roof material is brought back to the Commission in January for approval. Motion carried with all in favor.

A - 062 - 2015 Modifications
Address: 320 Dunbar Rd.
Applicant: Mr. Peter May c/o Ferguson & Shamamian
Architect: Ferguson & Shamamian Architects/ Mark Ferguson
Project Description: Requesting approval of plan and elevation changes for the construction of a new two story residence; previously approved by ARCOM as project B-032-2015; a two story Mediterranean style house totaling 4987 sq. ft., including spa, and associated hardscape and landscaping. Building color - peach; trim color - limestone; terracotta barrel tile - no change

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: There were no ex parte communications declared by the Commission.

Mr. Ferguson stated that the project is currently under construction. He is here to propose some of the details that have been added. He then reviewed the plan.

Commission Comments: The Commission stated that they must have a manufacturer and number for the paint color. Mr. Ferguson responded that the paint color information was provided on the original approval.

Motion was made by Mr. Karakul and seconded by Mr. Sammons to approve the changes to the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

A - 063 - 2015 Modification
Address: 264 Country Club Rd.
Applicant: 264 Country Club Rd., LLC
Architect: SKA Architect + Planner/ Patrick W. Seagraves
Project Description: Modification of previously approved north elevation (B-042-2013). Deletion of transom window above entry door, modification of window in laundry room.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Small

Mr. Seagraves reviewed the elevation and stated that the window in the laundry room has been shortened and the transom on the front door has been removed, due to the height of the door.

Commission Comments: The Commission was not in favor of removing the transom. It was suggested that the height of the door be reduced to accommodate the transom. Mr. Seagraves was not in favor of putting a smaller door at the front of the house. The Commission said it would not be seen; the transom makes the front door.

Motion by Mr. Sammons and seconded by Mr. Garrion to approve as presented with the caveat that the transom remain and the door height be reduced to 7.0. Motion carried with all in favor.

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

The 2016 ARCOM Meeting Dates were discussed

Mr. Garrison suggested that the November meeting be moved. It is scheduled for the day before Thanksgiving. Mrs. Vanneck said that the December meeting date is also a problem. Mr. Lindgren asked the Commission which days in November and December would be best. It was decided to meet on Thursday, November 17, 2016 and Thursday, December 15, 2016. Mr. Lindgren said he would check on those dates and send everyone a confirmation.

IX. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)

Mrs. Anita Selzer, Cocoanut Row had some concern regarding the professional credentials of some of the people who are presenting projects. Mr. Vila thanked Mrs. Selzer and clarified that in many cases we have design professionals who are graduates of architectural schools, who are not licensed in this state.

X. COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

Mr. Knowles voiced some concern about the new lamps that are being required by the government, stating they are just too bright. He asked Mr. Lindgren how this was being monitored by the Town. Mr. Lindgren advised that the Town has exterior lighting requirements that must be adhered to. The Building Department's Chief Electrical Inspector is currently working on a standard. He, the Building Official and Mr. Page are coordinating this effort to get more specifics on our exterior lighting requirements to address that issue.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made by Mrs. Vanneck and seconded by Mr. Sammons to adjourn the meeting at 12:17 p.m. Motion carried with all in favor.

The next meeting of the Architectural Commission will be held on Wednesday, January 27, 2016 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert J. Vila, Chairman
ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

nar