



**LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
IN THE
TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH**

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 19, 2013, 9:30 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording (CD) of the meeting by contacting Cynthia M. Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER:

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL:

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
William P. Feldkamp, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Dudley L. Moore, Jr., Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
William J. Strawbridge Jr., Member	PRESENT
Elizabeth S. Murphy, Member	PRESENT (arrived at 9:36 a.m.)
Penelope D. Townsend, Member	PRESENT
Elizabeth "Libby" Marshall, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Anne Fairfax, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Patrick Killian, Alternate Member	ABSENT (unexcused)

Staff members present: John Page, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, Janet Murphy and Emily Stillings, Staff Historic Preservation Consultants, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. Town Attorney, John C. Randolph, was absent.

III. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MAY 13, 2013 MEETING:(9:31:55 a.m.)

MOTION BY MR. MOORE FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. FELDKAMP.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: (9:32:06 a.m.)**

Mr. Cooney noted one addition to the agenda which will be handled as Item B. under Other Business, an informal review for 330 Island Road, relative to matters which have come up during construction.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA AS AMENDED.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. TOWNSEND.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. **ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY: (9:32:35 a.m.)**

Mrs. Delp administered the oath to all those who wished to testify today.

VI. **COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes): (9:32:54 a.m.)**

Alexander Ives, Executive Director of the Preservation Foundation, stated that new Baker interns are in place and ready to work with the Town as needed. Secondly, he noted that there will be a re-application to secure grant monies for the restoration of the Memorial Fountain, and he solicited LPC support for this effort.

VII. **PUBLIC HEARINGS: (9:34:07 a.m.)**

A. **Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #016 - 2013**

Reconstruction/Exterior Demolition/Landscape/Hardscape/New Garage/Guest Suite

Owner/Applicant: The Palmerial Revocable Trust, Maura Ziska as Trustee

Address: 801 S. County Road

Architect: Michael J. Johnson, Architect

Original Project Description: Request approval for reconstruction, exterior demolition, landscape/hardscape, and new garage/guest suite to replace existing which is further described as: Existing garage and carport to be demolished; new two-story structure (garage at lower level and guest suite at upper level) to be built north of La Selva; and, final landscape plan. Other associated changes as presented. *Please note that this is a tax abatement project.*

Revised Project Description: Request approval for exterior demolition, new accessory structure, landscape and hardscape which is further described as: Existing garage and carport to be demolished; new one story 1430 sq. ft. garage (3 cars/1 golf car) with service powder room and arched breezeway to be built north of La Selva; CBS construction/white stucco finish, barrel tile roof, coquina details, metal gates and grates, hurricane impact windows and doors, pecky cypress finish at garage doors. Final landscape plan. Other associated changes as presented.

This project was deferred from the March meeting to the April meeting at the request of the applicant. At the April meeting, a motion carried for approval "with the proviso that you come back next month where you re-study the front sort-of tower entry to either narrow the opening or to beef up, which would mean you would have to enlarge the tower; maybe you could meet with us in the meantime so that we could maybe direct you; and then come back with the landscaping and the trash enclosure and the staircase and everything else; and the elliptical arches in the garages would be more like the colored rendering." At the May meeting, the project was deferred to the June meeting at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: All members received a letter from a neighbor

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Michael J. Johnson, Architect, Daniel Menard, Architect, and Don Skowron, Landscape Architect

Michael Johnson made some introductory remarks and introduced Mr. Menard who provided the presentation in accordance with the revised submitted plans. Revised plans show a trellis topping the garbage enclosure; an increase in the size of the pedestal for the arch at front tower entry; lowered elliptical arches at garage; new ceiling design for north loggia; and a final landscape plan. The presentation was enhanced with a video envisioning the entire composition and was narrated by Don Skowron, especially with regard to landscape/hardscape elements.

Mr. Lindgren read a letter from the Neidels (dated June 17, 2013), adjacent neighbors, into the record. The letter called to attention that the elevation of the garage floor had been raised by 2 ft. Mr. Menard responded that the floor was raised at the request of the civil engineer due to drainage concerns.

After thorough review and several commission comments/suggestions, the following motion was made: **MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AS PRESENTED WITH THREE PROVISOS: 1) A VERY SLIGHT MOVEMENT OF THE AXIS THROUGH THE GARAGE TO THE MAIN HOUSE SUCH THAT IT ALIGNS PROPERLY WITH THE DINING ROOM WINDOW; 2) THAT THE SIZE OF THE MADJUL PALM CONTAINERS ON THE MAIN PATIO BE STUDIED; AND 3) THAT THE DRAWINGS BE REVISED TO REFLECT THE ACCURATE HEIGHT OF THE NEW GARAGE BUILDING.**

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. MURPHY.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #026-2013

Landscape/Hardscape/Door Change

Owner/Applicant: Mrs. Virginia Mortara

Address: 319 El Vedado Road

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects Inc.

Project Description: Request approval for door change and landscape/hardscape changes which is further described as: Request approval for door change, driveway material, minor landscape adjustments and other associated changes as presented to a previously approved project. *Please note that this is a tax abatement project.*

At the May meeting, the project was heard and a motion carried for approval as presented, with the exception that the ground floor spear-type revision be extended to the two eastern windows on the ground floor, and that the architect come back with alternates for the entrance door on the main level. A second motion carried for approval of the landscape/hardscape changes as presented by Don Skowron with the exception that they come back with the revised drawings for the east and west garden gate doors.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Mrs. Albarran and Ms. Fairfax

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Don Skowron

Mr. Smith presented revised plans showing 1) detail of proposed front door to be clear glass with matching window guard at the bottom...allowing for views to the 6 panel door with transom; 2) at the basement level, replace single panel door with two-panel door for 4 ft. width; and 3) the owner's request that the LPC reconsider the requirement to add the gate detail to the two openings at the east end of the staff section.

The presentation inspired a discussion relative to the front door design as proposed.

**MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS #026-2013 AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. TOWNSEND.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #032-2013

Restoration, Exterior Color Change

Owner/Applicant: Marian Antonini

Address: 920 South Ocean Boulevard

Architect: Smith Architectural Group

Project Description: Request approval for restoration and exterior color change which is further described as: Replace windows and doors; new tile roof; addition of French doors and sidelites at North loggia; and reduce size of windows (three) at north elevation, and other associated changes as presented

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Ms. Townsend and Mr. Cooney

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Bill Boyle and William Nolen, Smith Architectural Group

Mr. Boyle presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. The project includes: New roof tiles (Redlands 4 color blend barrel tile); new paint on stucco areas (Benjamin Moore: Floral White); removal of some material at second floor terrace; enclosure of north loggia with bi-fold doors with mullions; new fireplace; minor fenestration changes - revert back to thinner stiles and rails; replace triple windows with double windows in several locations; new impact doors and windows; and, rooftop terrace-replace with coral tile.

Some comments, both pro and con, were made relative to the quality of this presentation.

**MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED, WITH THE PROVISIO "THAT YOU CAN SEE THERE ON PAGE A201.1 THAT THE STILTING BE CHANGED, AS DISCUSSED, OF THE LIVING ROOM WINDOW, AND THE BAR DOOR HAVE ONE LESS HORIZONTAL MULLION, AND ON PAGE A206, THAT THE SECOND FLOOR TERRACE DOOR AND THE DINING ROOM DOOR HAVE ONE LESS HORIZONTAL MULLION, AND ON SHEET A207, THAT THE SECOND FLOOR TERRACE DOOR HAVE ONE LESS HORIZONTAL MULLION."
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. TOWNSEND.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Let the record show that there was a short recess from 11:20 a.m. to 11:30 a.m.

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS: (11:22:52 a.m.)

A. Informal Review: 550 South Ocean Boulevard

LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE

Project Description: The project consists of a two-story garage/guest suite addition to the west side of the existing residence; the demolition of a one-story garage and two one-story shed structures; hardscape and landscape final changes; a pergola addition; the change of one existing casement window to a pair of French doors; addition of muntin bars to previously approved clear glass French door units on the west elevation. Other associated changes as presented.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith, Smith and Moore Architects

LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design

ATTORNEY PRESENT: Maura Ziska, Attorney for the property owner

Ms. Ziska discussed the variance request for street side yard setback on the north side of the house. Mr. Smith presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. Other than listed above, the project includes: Replace door on south side of tower wing replicating original doors; replace front door with cypress door in same configuration; relocate existing pergola to second floor and remove awning structure; and, other assorted fenestration changes.

Mr. Jackman presented the landscape/hardscape pursuant to the submitted plans. Design elements include: Demo existing fountain on east lawn and install new in same location; relocate coral benches; retain much of existing landscape material and add new; driveway in 2x2 cast stone pavers with grass joints; walkway around pool; refinish pool and courtyard fountain with darker finish; and other associated changes as presented.

Under commission comments: Many favorable comments; wish the addition recessed rather than come forward; and, problem with hip roof not attaching to rest of building. These comments spawned a discussion of some length relative to the addition and the tie in of the roof. Mr. Smith stated, after conferring with the owner, that the owner is willing to recess the addition one foot from the front line of the garage, and those plans were shown on the Elmo projector.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCE WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS TO THE SUBJECT LANDMARKED PROPERTY, AND ADDING THAT WE WOULD LOVE TO HAVE THOSE CHANGES PRESENTED NEXT MONTH SETTING THE ADDITION BACK AND DOING THE EXISTING METAL TRELLIS OR PERGOLA UP ON THE SECOND FLOOR, IF YOU COULD DRAW THAT IN, AND MAYBE HAVE PICTURES OF IT, AND TIE IN THE HIP, JUST AS THE DRAWING SHOWS... WHEN IT'S RECESSED, YOU SHOWED THE TIE IN EXACTLY AS WE WOULD LIKE IT, AND APPROVAL OF THE VARIANCE WITH THE PROVISIO THAT IT BE REDUCED BY 3 FEET, WHICH MEANS IT WOULD BE SETTING BACK A FOOT FROM THE EXISTING CORNER OF THE HOUSE.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. MURPHY.

MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. STRAWBRIDGE OPPOSED.

Comments regarding the landscape/hardscape: The existing front wall design is odd in the way it is popped up...screening needed at road; take another look at the new proposed fountain; concern with survivability of Zoysia grass on high-traffic driveway area; and, questioning ice pink in a predominantly hot color palette.

B. 330 Island Road: Field Issues

Eugene Pandula, Architect for this project, addressed certain structural issues which have been uncovered during construction at 330 Island Road (a tax abatement project). Problems have been encountered and need to be fixed at the fireplace chimney, a rotted area at the gable end facing west; the bay windows on the west and north ground floor; and, the cantilevered balcony at the northeast corner of the house. He outlined how each of the issues would be remedied.

Mr. Lindgren advised that it would be acceptable for the LPC to direct him to staff approve these items and not require the architect to return to the LPC formally.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN TO ALLOW STAFF, IF STAFF FEELS THAT WHAT HE PRESENTED IS CORRECT, TO STAFF APPROVE THESE ITEMS.

MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. 322 Seaspray Avenue: Discussion to determine whether to place "under consideration" for landmarking

Janet Murphy, Staff Historic Preservation Consultant, stated that the property owner of 322 Seaspray Avenue, who was present today, is requesting that his property be placed "under consideration" for landmark designation. She noted that the Bungalow, built in 1919, has had very few alterations and is part of the fabric of the Poinciana Park residential area.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP TO PLACE 322 SEASPRAY AVENUE "UNDER CONSIDERATION" FOR LANDMARKING.

MOTION SECONDED BY MS. MURPHY.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. Discussion relative to 2013/2014 Designation Season

Emily Stillings, Staff Historic Preservation Consultant, stated that she and Ms. Murphy are looking for some direction from the commission as to how to proceed for the next season. Last season, it had been suggested that perhaps letters might be sent to property owners who "might" be placed "under consideration" to make them aware of the benefits of landmarking and to solicit feedback from those property owners relative to a possible landmarking. The commission was divided in their opinions relative to the proposed letter campaign.

Alexander Ives, of the Preservation Foundation, stated that he is not in favor of adding another layer (i.e., "may possibly be placed "under consideration"). He felt this would only lead to confusion and would not be good for the landmark program. When properties are placed "under consideration," the property owner is notified and receives a copy of the Landmark Manual. He recommended that the process be allowed to continue to work the same way it has been working for many years, studying 5-10 properties each year, and not confuse the public with another status layer.

Discussion continued relative to how to proceed as the new designation season approaches. Ideas, comments and suggestions are as follows: Opinions pro and con regarding having a "pre-under consideration" letter and an "under consideration" letter; focusing only on the list of 90 may be too limiting; want the opinions of our new consultants; what types of fabric should we try to acquire?; commercial property is also important; and, the concept of districting.

Ms. Murphy and Ms. Stillings requested recommendations of properties from the members. This subject will be placed on the July agenda for further discussion.

IX. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR:

Mr. Page brought up the subject of the North County Road Canopy which had been discussed informally at the last meeting, noting that no decision was made at that time to keep it "under consideration" or not. A very informal vote today revealed that the majority of members support keeping the North County Road Canopy "under consideration" for landmarking. Mr. Page noted that he will ask the Director of Public Works and/or the Town's Arborist to return to the July meeting with answers to some of the questions raised last month.

Commission members asked for a Town map indicating the location of landmark properties. Mr. Page responded that such a map is near completion. The list of landmarked properties may also be changed/updated as a tool for LPC members.

Mr. Page announced that the issue of gates and sequencing of variances will be an agenda item at the July meeting and the Zoning Administrator, Paul Castro, will attend that meeting to discuss these issues.

Secondly, at the last Town Council meeting, an ordinance was approved on first reading which would increase the number of allowable voting conflicts to four, with a fifth conflict causing immediate removal from the commission. The second reading of this ordinance will occur at the July Town Council meeting.

Mr. Cooney made some comments regarding the amount of time spent on the agenda items today. He encouraged members to pick up the mini-sets from staff and review them prior to the meeting. Additional comments were made by other members as to how to best handle the review of the projects during commission meetings.

X. **ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting was adjourned at 1:19 p.m. without benefit of a motion.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, July 17, 2013 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, second floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,



Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd