MINUTES
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
IN THE TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

WEDNESDAY, JULY 18, 2012, 9:30 a.m.

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording (CD) of the meeting by contacting Cynthia M. Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER:(9:32:45 a.m.)

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL:(9:33:16 a.m.)

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
William P. Feldkamp, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Dudley L. Moore, Jr., Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
William J. Strawbridge Jr., Member	PRESENT
Leslie Diver, Member	PRESENT
Elizabeth S. Murphy, Member	PRESENT
Jorge Sanchez, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Elizabeth Marshall, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Anne Fairfax, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Staff Members Present: John C. Randolph, Town Attorney (for part of meeting), John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, Dr. Jane S. Day, Ph. D., Staff Historic Preservation Consultant, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

III. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE JUNE 13, 2012 MEETING:

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:
MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY:
Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VI. **COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes): (9:34:22 a.m.)**
As is required, Mr. Page mentioned the Conflict of Interest filed by Mr. Sanchez at the previous meeting.

Chairman Cooney acknowledged the two Preservation Foundation interns who were present in the audience today, Matthew Cohen and Kristen Kellogg.

Mr. Feldkamp commented regarding the imminent retirement of Dr. Jane Day, our historic preservation consultant. Mr. Page explained the ongoing process to seek a replacement for Dr. Day. Chairman Cooney asked that the position be posted in the appropriate career periodicals and online sites.

VII. **PUBLIC HEARINGS:(9:35:40 a.m.)**

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #010 - 2012
Addition
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Owner/Applicant: Peter and Laurie Grauer
Address: 201 El Bravo Way
Architect: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, AIA, PA
Project Description: Request approval for addition to historic structure which is further described as new one story pavilion addition, and other associated changes as presented

This project had been deferred from the June meeting. Please be advised that the applicant's attorney has requested that this project be withdrawn.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP TO WITHDRAW APPLICATION #010-2012.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #012 - 2012
Revision to Construction Methods
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Owner/Applicant: 456 WA LLC (Manager is Larry Keller)
Address: 456 Worth Avenue
Architect: Michael J. Johnson-Architect, PA
Project Description: Request approval for revision to means and methods of construction which is further described as: Request approval to change the means and methods of restoring walls in the existing residence. Exploratory demolition has revealed very deteriorated walls which were

poorly constructed and/or reconstructed in the past. The foundations of these walls are bearing on unstable soils and are inadequate and failing. The engineers have recommended that these walls be taken down and rebuilt in the same location with materials that will be structurally sound and waterproof. Other associated changes as presented. *Variances requested to remove more than 50% of the cubic volume of the residence.*

At the June meeting, there was a motion that "based on the engineering report, we recommend to the Council that it be considered as an engineering item and brought back to us for approval from an appearance point of view, and perhaps, we could ask as part of that, that it come back with an accompanying time horizon so that we would know what's being done as progress is made."

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: No disclosures

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Michael Johnson, Architect

Staff noted that the requested variance was approved by the Town Council. Mr. Johnson provided a brief overview of the scope of the project, stating particularly that the historic tower will remain intact as constructed, but most other walls and foundations, up to the roof, will be demolished and reconstructed. He provided a construction schedule, as requested by the commission.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APROVAL OF COA-012-2012 AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #013 - 2012
Limited demolition and restoration
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Owner: Geraldine T. Nesbitt c/o Peter S. Broberg, Esq.
Applicant: Craig J. Omtvedt and Jane Omtvedt c/o Jaqcueline S. Miller, Esq.
Address: 79 Middle Road
Architect: Smith Architectural Group
Project Description: Request approval for limited demolition and major restoration which is further described as: Restoration of an existing 3-story residence with new hurricane resistant windows and doors, new central air-conditioning and new swimming pool. Removal of a non-conforming 202 sq. ft. mid-century storage shed at the east side. Removal of an 80 sq. ft. cabana at the east side. Removal of a 65 sq. ft. sun porch on the south side facade. Proposed one story addition of 540 sq. ft. at the east facade. Proposed one story addition to the south courtyard of 140 sq. ft. Proposed chimney on the south facade. Proposed one story addition of 70 sq. ft. at the west side of the garage. Extension of via at east side of courtyard. Other associated changes as presented. **Please be advised that this is a tax abatement project**. *Variances requested for street side yard setback, side yard setback and lot coverage.*

At the June meeting, there was a motion that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject landmarked property.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Mr. Cooney and Ms. Marshall

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Jeffery W. Smith, Architect, Leslie Pearce and Bill Boyle, Smith Architectural Group

ATTORNEY PRESENT: Jacqueline Miller, Attorney for the property owner

Chairman Cooney stated that the variances requested for this project have been granted by the Town Council. Mr. Smith presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans, as described above, and as presented informally last month. He indicated that the applicant will return with a landscape plan. Mr. Smith discussed the interior since this is a tax abatement project.

Under commission comments, there was concern relative to the introduction of symmetry into the traditionally asymmetrical Fatio courtyard, and concern related to the pool. The commission members were, however, very complimentary relative to this project at large.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP THAT THE DESIGN FOR 79 MIDDLE ROAD SHOULD BE APPROVED AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #014 - 2012
New Accessory Structure
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)
Owner/Applicant: Roberta and Stanley Bogen
Address: 1560 South Ocean Boulevard
Architect: Nievera Williams Design
Project Description: Request approval for new accessory structure which is further described as: Applicant seeks approval to place statuary (4 pieces) by the artist, Menasha Kadishman, in the front yard of this landmarked residence. Other associated changes as presented. *Variance requested for height.*

At the June meeting, there was a motion that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject landmarked property.

Please be advised that there was no call for disclosure of ex parte communication related to this project this month.

PRESENTATION BY: Jacqueline Miller, Attorney for the Property Owner

Ms. Miller stated that the Town Council approved the variance for this project, and stated that there were no changes to the plans since last month's informal presentation.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED AND AS TOWN COUNCIL HAS AGREED ALSO.
MOTION SECONDED BY MESSRS. MOORE AND FELDKAMP.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #015 - 2012

Addition to historic structure

LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Owner/Applicant: 11 Vita Serena, LLC, Mr. and Mrs. Jeffery Perelman

Address: 181 Clarendon Avenue

Architect: The Pandula Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Request approval of addition to historic structure, which is further described as: Modification to previously approved loggia addition - In October 2011, a 358 sq. ft. loggia addition was approved for this property by Variance #25-2011 and LPC CoA#031-2011. Construction activities have not yet been initiated. This application is requesting approval to modify the previous approval by increasing the area by 112 sq. ft., for a total loggia area of 470 sq. ft. The loggia addition is at the west building elevation where canvas awnings had previously provided covered area. The new addition will match in detailing, material selection, color, texture, and scale related features of the existing residence. Other associated changes as presented. Please be advised that this is a tax abatement project. *Variances requested for rear yard setback and lot coverage.*

At the June meeting, there was a motion that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impacts to the subject landmarked property.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Albarran

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Eugene Pandula, The Pandula Architects

It was noted that the variances requested for this project were approved by the Town Council. Mr. Pandula reviewed the presentation which he had presented informally last month to add the additional bay to the proposed loggia.

Under commission comments, there were concerns relative to the articulation, mix of arches, setting precedent, and the cumulative changes to this property along with a fear that an owner in the future may want to enclose this space. The commission agreed, however, that this is a difficult property.

MOTION BY MS. DIVER FOR APPROVAL AS PRESENTED FOR PROJECT #015-2012, 181 CLARENDON AVENUE.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. MURPHY.
MOTION CARRIED 6-1, WITH MR. FELDKAMP OPPOSED.

Let the record show that there was a short recess at 10:43 a.m.

F. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #018 - 2012

Restoration and awning

Owner/Applicant: Marc P. Schappell and Thomas B. Anderson

Address: 234 El Brillo Way

Architect: John M. Foster, AIA

Project Description: Request approval for restoration and awning which is further described as: The home was built in 1940 by Howard Major and the new owners would like to maintain his original design aesthetic in their alterations of the garage/apartment. (Garage apartment was built in 1960's, and was not designed by Howard Major.) Original garage square footage or "footprint" to remain the same. Our goal is to create symmetry and balance between the two structures by incorporating the traditional, existing architectural elements found in the main house: 1) Stucco bands that would match the existing house; 2) French outswing casement windows, all with "period" wooden shutters; 3) 2nd floor French doors with balconies (matching main house) with "period" wooden shutters; 4) Move the existing exterior staircase directly to the inside wall, allowing for a canopy covered lounge area adjacent to the pool, and direct access to a cabana style interior bath; 5) French door at ground level to coincide with similar unit in dining room of the main house. Other associated changes as presented.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by Mr. Moore and Mrs. Albarran

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: John Foster, Architect
OTHERS WHO TESTIFIED: Marc Schappell, Property Owner

Mr. Foster provided the presentation in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above for this restoration project. He explained that while impact windows are proposed, they will also be protected by removable shutters.

Under commission comments, there was a recommendation to remove the proposed shutters flanking the French doors, a reminder that the proposed railing must meet building code, and a suggestion that the proposed shutters become impact shutters.

MOTION BY MRS. ALBARRAN FOR APPROVAL, BUT REMOVE THE SHUTTERS ON EITHER SIDE OF THE FIRST FLOOR DOORS; MAKE SHUTTERS AN EXACT ONE-HALF WIDTH OF THE CORRESPONDING DOORS AND WINDOWS AND MAKE THEM OPERABLE; COME BACK WITH A DETAIL OF THE RAILINGS AT 36" HEIGHT; AND DISCUSS THE FRENCH CASEMENT DILEMMA PRIOR TO COMING BACK. (The applicant noted that they will appear at the next meeting for landscape.)
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

G. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #019 - 2012
Driveway Gate
Owner/Applicant: Mrs. Danielle Hickox
Address: 277 Pendleton Avenue
Architect: Smith Architectural Group, Inc.
Project Description: Request approval for driveway gate which is further described as: New sliding driveway gates. Other associated changes as presented.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Sanchez

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Jeffery W. Smith, Smith Architectural Group
OTHERS WHO TESTIFIED: Danielle Hickox, Property Owner

Mr. Smith indicated that the Town Council has already granted a variance for these driveway gates. The gates will be black horizontal sliding gates which slide into a hedge. Their design will match existing pedestrian gates. The gates are needed for the security of children and dogs.

The commission took issue with the fact that the LPC was not asked for a recommendation relative to the variance needed for this project. Mr. Lindgren explained that this was not deemed a "combo" project where such an opinion would be required. The commission was concerned about setting a precedent for gates on this street, where there are typically no gates, but since the variance was already approved, the LPC felt they were being placed in a bad position.

Mr. Lindgren read that the Town's Engineer, Martin Gauthier, recommended denial of the gates. Mr. Page offered some information relative to "combo" project designation.

Mrs. Hickox explained the security issues on Pendleton Avenue, and noted that there are some gates in existence in the lake block of Pendleton.

Dr. Day testified that the commission should consider the security issues involved here, and noted that the gates will not negatively impact the landmarked house.

MOTION BY MR. MOORE FOR APPROVAL AS SUBMITTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. DIVER.

Under discussion, there were comments: Public safety is paramount; the gates will have no negative architectural impact on the house; the gates are not permanent; and, disagree with the public safety issue…the gates could be elsewhere.

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Let the record show that Chairman Cooney elected to hear Items H. & I. together.

H. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #020 - 2012
Storefront
Owner/Applicant: Power Love Associates
Address: 252 Worth Avenue
Architect: Glidden Spina & Partners
Project Description: Request approval for new storefront entry system, interior demolition and sign which is further described as: New storefront elevation for A. Lange & Sohne jewelry store, and other associated changes as presented

Please be advised that this matter will be heard informally at the July meeting, and formally at the August meeting subject to legal advertisement.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: (See below)

I. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #021 - 2012
Storefront
Owner/Applicant: Power Love Associates
Address: 254 Worth Avenue
Architect: Glidden Spina & Partners
Request approval for new storefront entry system, interior demolition, and sign which is further described as: New storefront elevation for future jewelry store tenant (tenant pending)

Please be advised that this matter will be heard informally at the July meeting, and formally at the August meeting subject to legal advertisement.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by all members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Keith Spina, Glidden Spina & Partners

Mr. Spina provided the presentation pursuant to the submitted plans and as described above for the Gucci building's two new tenant spaces. He indicated that the wood arches will be retained, but advocated for no wood horizontal member and stainless steel storefronts.

The proposed design caused a good deal of conversation as most members were in favor of the horizontal wood member in each of the arches. The stainless steel material choice was likewise in question. Most members felt that all of the six (6) arches should have the same treatment. Dr. Day recommended that the building should be viewed as a whole and recommended that the building be taken back to the original Fatio design. Members felt it was important to retain the existing Bougainvillea on the building's exterior. Others felt that since this is a multi-tenant building, additional consideration to the applicant is warranted. After much discussion, three material options were discussed: Mahogany, all matte black metal, or bronze aluminum. (Note: Mr. Spina thought that the landlord would agree to improve the third storefront on the east side of the building as well.) Mr. Lindgren also mentioned that signage is included in this project. In the end, there was consensus for wood arches, a wood or simulated wood horizontal member and all matte black metal storefront. The matter will be heard formally next month.

VIII. <u>OTHER BUSINESS:</u> (12:08:34 a.m.)

A. Review of Properties Categorized as "Potentially Eligible for the Local Register" [Edward Austin Cooney, LPC Chairman]

There was ample discussion as to whether to hear this item today or postpone it to the next meeting. Commission members asked that the information be sent to them in advance of the next meeting. Ultimately, the commission elected to begin the August meeting at 9:00 a.m. and to devote the time period from 9:00 a.m. to 10:30 a.m. to this discussion, and then begin review of Certificates of Appropriateness at 10:30 a.m.

IX. <u>COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR</u>:

Mr. Page reminded the members that the August LPC meeting will be held on THURSDAY, AUGUST 16, 2012. The meeting will begin at 9:00 a.m., as stated above.

Ms. Diver mentioned that the Mar-a-Lago main gates have been broken for weeks. Staff will check into this matter.

Eugene Pandula, architect and former LPC Chairman, stated that he now serves on the Board of Directors of the Florida Trust and the University of Florida College of Architecture Preservation program. He indicated that he would like to share some information with the commission as to the broader, world view of preservation.

Mr. Cooney reported that the Slope Trail Pump Station has become unkempt again. Staff will check into this issue.

Mr. Cooney commented relative to the change in palm trees within the 100 block of the Royal Palm Way Scenic Vista, recommending that the Coconut Palms be restored to that vista. Members agreed, and staff will pass on that recommendation.

Dr. Day thanked the Preservation Foundation for enacting the intern program which is very valuable to the Town and to preservation efforts at large. The current interns (identified earlier in these minutes) addressed the commission and expressed their appreciation to be allowed to participate in the Town's preservation program.

X. ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 12:40 p.m. without benefit of a motion.

THE NEXT MEETING OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION WILL BE HELD ON <u>THURSDAY, AUGUST 16, 2012 AT 9:00 A.M.</u>

Respectfully submitted,

Edward Austin Cooney

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd