MINUTES
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION
IN THE
TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS
2ND FLOOR, TOWN HALL
360 SOUTH COUNTY ROAD, PALM BEACH

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 16, 2013, 9:30 a.m.

> Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com or may obtain an audio recording (CD) of the meeting by contacting Cynthia M. Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission at (561) 227-6408. As a point of reference, you will find the recording times listed on these minutes at the beginning of each item.

I. CALL TO ORDER: (9:29:04 a.m.)

Chairman Cooney called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL: (9:29:15 a.m.)

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
William P. Feldkamp, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Dudley L. Moore, Jr., Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
William J. Strawbridge Jr., Member	PRESENT
Elizabeth S. Murphy, Member	PRESENT
Penelope D. Townsend, Member	PRESENT
Anne Fairfax, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Patrick Killian, Alternate Member	PRESENT

Let the record show that Ms. Fairfax was a voting member today due to Ms. Albarran's absence.

Staff members present: John S. Page, Director of Planning, Zoning & Building, John Lindgren, Planning Administrator, Janet Murphy and Emily Stillings, Staff Historic Preservation Consultants, and Cynthia Delp, Secretary to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. Town Attorney, John C. Randolph did not attend this meeting.

III. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 18, 2013 MEETING:(9:29:41 a.m.)
MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: (9:29:57 a.m.)

Chairman Cooney noted that there has been a request for deferral of Item A. for 347 Worth Avenue to the December meeting.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA AS MODIFIED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

V. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY: (9:30:24 a.m.)

Mrs. Delp administered the oath at this time and as necessary throughout the meeting.

VI. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS: (Please limit comments to 3 minutes): (9:31:44 a.m.)

In light of the Town Council's recent action relative to a very contemporary home on Coral Lane, Mr. Feldkamp brought up the subject of historic districts. Coral Lane is not currently included in an historic district which might have offered certain protections regarding new development. Mr. Feldkamp encouraged residents on streets, with particular architectural unity, to embrace the concept of historic districts as a means to preserve the architectural character of the street.

VII. PUBLIC HEARINGS: (9:33:40 a.m.)

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #046 - 2013
Awning
Owner/Applicant: The Everglades Club
Address: 347 Worth Avenue
Architect: Brasseur & Drobot Architects, P.A.
Project Description: Request approval for awning which is further described as: The project consists of a proposed 137 sq. ft. canvas awning to be added at the east side of the concrete covered drive-thru breezeway located north of Worth Avenue and east of Cocoanut Row below the existing dormitory structure, and other associated changes as presented.

Please be advised that the architect has submitted a request for deferral of this project to the December meeting. The deferral was granted under the motion for approval of the agenda.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #047 - 2013
Restoration/Addition/Demolition/Landscape/Hardscape
Owner/Applicant: 105 Clarendon Road Revocable Trust
Address: 105 Clarendon Avenue
Architect: Smith and Moore Architects Inc.
Project Description: Request approval for restoration, rehabilitation, addition to historic structure, interior and exterior demolition, and landscape/hardscape which is further described as: Restoration of building exterior stonework; replacement of all windows and exterior doors; foundation restoration; restoration of interior floors, walls and ceilings; kitchen and bath renovations; 2-story addition on west side of main block of house; enclosure of existing west loggia and second floor addition above; addition of a first floor loggia on the west side of the main block of house; loggia addition on east side of house; landscape and hardscape changes, and other associated changes as presented. ***Please be advised that this is a tax abatement project.***

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Harold Smith, Taylor Smith, and Kristin Kellogg, Smith and Moore Architects
LANDSCAPE PRESENTATION BY: Keith Williams, Nievera Williams Design
OTHERS WHO TESTIFIED: Lawrence Moens, Resident and Realtor

The Smith and Moore team presented this tax abatement project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. It should be noted that a model of the house was presented. Harold Smith explained that this property has recently been purchased and it is the intention of the new owner to restore the home and construct several additions to the home to facilitate modern living and to accommodate the family. The property has been poorly maintained and is in need of attention. Mr. Smith explained that the new owner, in purchasing this home, has dedicated his resources to a huge project, which will take considerable time and expense to restore the house back to its original beauty. Ms. Kellogg reviewed original floor plans and elevations, as well as historical photos. Current photos emphasize the existing deterioration and water damage present. Taylor Smith discussed areas scheduled for demolition: the 1970's additions to the second floor west terrace along the courtyard, the small playhouse, most of the existing courtyard wall to the west, and the existing pool. The staff wing will remain largely unchanged. Mr. Smith reviewed the proposed changes/additions in greater detail. Proposed exterior colors include a roof replacement in variegated red antique clay barrel tile; Mizner green on the doors and windows, off-white/cream for the body of the house, and cast stone to match existing.

As for landscape/hardscape, Mr. Williams stated that the landscape/hardscape scope of work is limited at this time to the east lawn, pool area and the courtyard area as it relates to the proposed new loggia. Most landscaping will be retained on the east side of the property, but exotics and invasives will be removed. Additional landscape material will be added as presented. A large Seagrape tree will be relocated. The pool and some terraces on the east side will be reconfigured, and the courtyard paving will be changed. The new pool and fountain, with cast stone coping, will run north/south and will be centered on the new loggia and library. To the west, the curved wall and fountain will be retained, but some other walls will be removed. Off the dining room, a garden and fountain are proposed. At the courtyard to the west, paving will be decreased, Date Palms will be added, and a fountain will be retained. Cast stone is the main hardscape material.

Under commission comments, the project was very well received and complimented for a thorough presentation, but there was significant concern regarding the new loggia (referred to as a portico) on the east elevation. Since the east elevation, where the loggia is proposed, is the principal facade, and the project is a tax abatement project which requires adherence to stricter standards, commission members voiced their serious concerns. This issue was discussed for a considerable length of time. Some additional concerns/comments: Issue with the tiny roof on the proposed west loggia; the need for paint color analysis on the house and trim work; concern regarding the proposed gallery and altering public rooms; there are other design opportunities for an outdoor loggia; the LPC has a duty to uphold certain standards for tax abatement projects; the owner has the option to abandon the tax abatement, and perhaps thereby change the review standard; recommend re-study, rather than ask the owner to abandon the tax abatement; and, we are trying to be of service to property owners, and do not want to be obstructionists, but we have to maintain our integrity.

Lawrence Moens testified that he is a resident, and was the realtor who sold the house to the new owners. He explained that it is challenging to sell "white elephant" large Mediterranean homes and then try to adapt them to today's living. In his opinion, the proposed loggia on the east facade is the best change being proposed because it will allow the owners to connect to the ocean on the first floor level, but more importantly, at the master bedroom level. He stated that the house was in major disrepair. As such, he was happy that this owner was willing to take on the project and enhance the neighborhood and the Town. Mr. Moens regarded the addition of the loggia as a correction to what he views as an original design mistake for the house not relating well to the ocean. He maintained that the LPC needs to be flexible to the needs of the people living in landmarks today, or it will be very difficult for him to sell landmarks in the future. Later in the meeting, Mr. Moens offered additional comments and invited members to the house (on an individual basis) to fully appreciate the conditions there. He stressed the importance of the benefit of the tax abatement to the new owners, especially since they are undertaking such a large project at this home.

Mr. Strawbridge stressed the role of the LPC to preserve the Town's iconic buildings.

MOTION BY MR. STRAWBRIDGE TO DEFER TO THE NEXT MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. MURPHY.
(THERE WAS NO VOTE ON THIS MOTION.)

Harold Smith asked for an approval, excepting the loggia on the east elevation, so the project can get started. The east elevation could be deferred, or could return as a separate project in the future.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE PROJECT AT 105 CLARENDON AVENUE, AS PRESENTED, WITH THE EXCEPTION THAT THAT EAST PORTICO (LOGGIA) WILL BE DEFERRED TO THE NOVEMBER MEETING.
CLARIFICATION BY MR. FELDKAMP THAT HIS MOTION IS FOR THE ARCHITECTURAL PORTION OF THE PROJECT, AS PRESENTED, WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE EAST PORTICO WHICH WILL COME BACK AT THE NOVEMBER MEETING.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. MURPHY.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The commission gave further consideration to the landscape/hardscape portion of the project.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF THE LANDSCAPE AT 105 CLARENDON AVENUE AS PRESENTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. FAIRFAX.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #048 - 2013
Restoration/Reconstruction
Owner/Applicant: Alan & Patricia Menkes
Address: 153 Clarke Avenue
Architect: Michael J. Johnson
Project Description: Request approval for restoration and reconstruction which is further described as: Main Residence: Reconfiguration of existing north courtyard roof; new window at north courtyard wall; Garage: Existing window to be replaced with door; Pool Cabana: Approved new fireplace to be deleted; and, other associated changes as presented.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mr. Feldkamp

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Michael Johnson, Architect, and Daniel Menard, La Berge and Menard, Associate Architect

Mr. Johnson briefly introduced the project and then turned the presentation over to Mr. Menard. Mr. Menard presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He explained that in the inner courtyard, a flat roof will be replaced with a sloping tile roof; an oval window will be added at the second floor level on the north elevation to bring in more light; window will be changed to door on east elevation to enable access to the gym; and, the pool house fireplace will be deleted.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP FOR APPROVAL OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS #048-2013 AS SUBMITTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

*****

Let the record show that there was a short recess from 11:18 a.m. to 11:26 a.m.

*****

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS: (11:17:25 a.m.)

A. Informal Review: 780 South Ocean Boulevard
LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

The project consists of a proposed 696.2 sq. ft. two story addition at the southwest corner of the landmarked structure. The first floor shall consist of an open loggia which will define an edge of the existing interior courtyard. An existing exterior stair at the west side of the new loggia shall be removed and a new stair will be added on center with the new loggia. The second floor addition shall consist of an extension of the existing master bathroom. Existing landscape and hardscape shall be removed in order to accommodate the new addition.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosures by several members

ARCHITECTURAL PRESENTATION BY: Jason Drobot, Brasseur & Drobot Architects

Mr. Drobot presented the project in accordance with the submitted plans and as described above. He noted that the project was originally approved in July of 2011, but now a change is contemplated to accommodate larger master bathrooms, larger closets and the elimination of a tripping hazard related to stepping down into a closet. The project will require a variance related to the building height and is specifically for a 30" increase to the maximum height in order to maintain a 9 ft. ceiling height on the second floor. Other elements of the project include removal of an existing curved stair and doorway to the solarium, and increasing the loggia by approximately 200 sq. ft.

Under commission comments, it was suggested that the requested height increase be reduced.

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP THAT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCE AT 780 SOUTH OCEAN BOULEVARD WILL NOT CAUSE NEGATIVE ARCHITECTURAL IMPACTS TO THE SUBJECT LANDMARKED PROPERTY, WITH A 1 FT. REDUCTION IN HEIGHT REQUESTED.
MOTION SECONDED BY MS. FAIRFAX.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

B. Discussion relative to Historic Districts

Emily Stillings provided a brief presentation in response to the comments made at last month's meeting relative to the previously proposed (1982) Worth Avenue historic district. She reviewed the boundaries of that previously proposed district which excluded properties east of South County, but included Golf Road properties and some properties on Peruvian Avenue. It has been suggested more recently that re-defined proposed boundaries might only include commercial properties. The Town's Consultants asked for direction from the LPC.

Under commission comments: Should we first identify the individual properties worthy of designation?; How would a district benefit the property owners?; Contributing buildings in an historic district are eligible for tax abatement for renovations; Since 1982, almost all of Golfview Road has been landmarked; Tread carefully in creating this as a district; It's really only the 200 block of Worth Avenue that is not landmarked; landmarking offers more protection; other areas of Town may be more benefitted by an historic district; look at the Worth Avenue Design Guidelines on the Town's website, which are quite good, and can be used by ARCOM during the review process; and, we may want to sit on this a while.

IX. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR: (11:54:52 a.m.)

Mr. Page reported that the Town Council has approved an ordinance change which would allow for the possibility of one of the two LPC's required architects to be an architect who is licensed out of state, if no in-state registered architects are available to serve at a time that a seat needs to be filled.

Mr. Page reported that the Town Council is seriously considering establishing a PUD-5 in the Royal Poinciana Way block. The required ordinances for this change are still pending at the Town Council level. One additional public hearing will be held on November 13, 2013. If the ordinances are approved by the Town Council, staff will arrange for a presentation by an urban designer at one of the future Planning and Zoning Commission meetings. Steven Mouzon is the author of the design guidelines which have been established for that area. If the ordinance is approved, it will be the responsibility of the Planning and Zoning Commission and the Landmarks Preservation Commission to review any future PUD-5 plans that might be submitted to the Town. Staff will advise the LPC as to the date of that presentation and will ask members to attend. Mr. Feldkamp encouraged other members to attend the November 13, 2013 Town Council meeting.

There was some discussion relative to the Del Frisco's screen wall which was heard last month.

There was some discussion relative to the plantings at the Memorial Fountain. Mr. Page stated that the Town Council is committed to the fountain improvements, and they are moving forward with "replacement" rather than "repair". Mr. Page will update the LPC relative to the scheduling of this work.

X. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>:

MOTION BY MR. FELDKAMP TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 12:13 P.M.
MOTION SECONDED BY MR. MOORE.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, November 20, 2013 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Road, Palm Beach, Florida.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward Austin Cooney

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

cmd