



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 16, 2015.

I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission was called to order on Wednesday, December 16, 2015 at 9:30 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers.

II. ROLL CALL

Edward Austin Cooney, Chairman	PRESENT
John T. Gannon, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Albarran, Member	PRESENT
Page Lee Hufty, Member	PRESENT
Rachel Lorentzen, Member	PRESENT
William J. Strawbridge, Jr., Member	PRESENT
Richard Rene Silvin, Alternate Member	ABSENT (excused)
Carol N. Wyett, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Jacqueline Weld Drake, Alternate Member	PRESENT

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Cooney led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE NOVEMBER 18, 2015 MEETING

Motion was made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the minutes of the November 18, 2015 meeting. Motion carried with all in favor.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

The following change was made to the agenda:

DEFERRED: Certificate of Appropriateness #047-2015, 239, 251 & 255 South County Rd. & 151 Royal Palm Way was deferred to the January 20, 2016 meeting.

Motion made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried with all in favor.

VI. ADMINISTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY

Mrs. Roedel administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC AND COMMISSION MEMBERS (Please limit comments to 3 minutes):

VIII. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

A. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #026-2015

Address: 239, 251 & 255 South County Rd. & 151 Royal Palm Way

Owner/Applicant: Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. successor by merger to Wachovia Bank, N.A., successor by merger to First Union National Bank of Florida

Architect: Glidden Spina + Partners

Project Description: A portion of the property known as (255 South County Rd.) is landmarked as follows: 15' from the face of the building along South County Road towards the east, starting at the southernmost John Volk building that has finials on top, north to the corner of Seaview Ave. and that building's north facade. The project proposes to rehabilitate and preserve the existing buildings which include the landmarked portions of this property. The work will include replacing all windows and doors, repairing any cracks in the existing exterior stucco walls, replacement of all existing mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems throughout the building, repair of the existing parking lot to eliminate storm water drainage issues, new landscaping and re-painting of the entire property. In addition to this work, we will be demolishing and re-constructing portions of this property that are not part of the landmarked building. We also propose to remove existing First National Bank sign and replace it with Wells Fargo signage.

At the August meeting, this project was deferred to the December meeting at the architect's request. At the December meeting this project was deferred to the January meeting at the architect's request.

B. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #047-2015

Address: 1095 North Ocean Blvd.

Owner/Applicant: TGS Florida, LLC

Architect: Smith and Moore Architects, Inc/Peter Papadopoulos

Project Description: Reconfigure existing covered walkway as open air trellis structure. Other associated changes as presented.

Mr. Page confirmed that this project has received Town Council variance approval.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None

Mr. Papadopoulos stated that upon receiving the variance, they are proceeding with the covered walkway. The roof has been removed, which is unreinforced hollow clay. There is some concern that the structure will fall down, therefore, they are requesting to rebuild the structure in the exact configuration. The existing landmarked wall will not be touched and they will only be replacing what they need to, to make the structure sound. Mr. Papadopoulos reviewed the plans for the creation of some necessary mechanical space.

Commission Comments: The Commissioners questioned whether this project needs to come back next month. Mr. Page stated that this project has been to the Commission in the past for informal review. It has been to Town Council, where it has been reviewed and given variance approval. It is now back to the Landmarks Commission for formal approval. Mr. Page said that he feels all requirements have been met, if the Commission would like to take action today.

There was some concern that the Commission is quite frequently dealing with reconstruction versus preservation, and this is a very slippery slope. This is a historic walkway, and is being reconstructed. Mr. Papadopoulos said the intention has always been to restore the walkway. It can be left as is, but it is not

to current codes. Unfortunately, in this case it is not in the client or structure's best interest to maintain the walkway.

Motion was made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Gannon to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

C. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #048-2015

Address: 780 South Ocean Blvd.

Owner/Applicant: Terry Taylor

Architect: Brasseur & Drobot Architects, P.A.

Project Description: The project consists of an interior renovation of the first and second floor of an existing 1,631 sq. ft. guest house, removal and replacement of all existing exterior windows and doors, the addition of a new window and covered entry at the first floor on the south elevation, and removal and replacement of the existing pecky cypress soffit, brackets and clay barrel tile roof.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Albarran

Mr. Brasseur reviewed the plans and materials to be used in the project.

Motion was made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mrs. Lorentzen to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

D. Application for Certificate of Appropriateness #049-2015

Address: 360 Seaspray Ave.

Owner Applicant: Mary Frances Turner

Architect: The Pandula Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Structure - Remove and re-frame roof structure and structure at sleeping porch. Modify existing framing or provide new framing at portions of existing structure as required by current field conditions and building code requirements. Exterior - Remove existing composite shingle roof material and replace with new composite shingle roof material. Remove existing aluminum siding and replace with new Hardie Board siding, with white painted finish. Remove existing shutters and replace with new aluminum shutters, with black painted finish. Interior - Remove all finishes fixtures and trim damaged by fire and re-install. Site - Remove existing garden pavilion, remove north motor court and replace with new layout, remove west garage driveway and replace with new layout, remove existing pool and deck and replace with new layout. Provide new generator and new landscape plan. Note - All work is to be accomplished within the original (existing) building footprint and envelope of the building, no modifications are made to setback dimensions or building area, except for removal of garden pavilion. All horizontal and vertical dimensions of the existing structure are to be maintained while accomplishing reconstruction activities. All window and door units are to be replaced within their existing openings, unless otherwise specifically indicated.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by Mrs. Albarran, Mr. Cooney and Mrs. Drake.

Mr. Pandula stated the house is under consideration for land marking and there was a fire in the building several months ago. It has taken some time to work through some technical issues regarding the fire damage. The intent of the presentation today is to get approval for doing the repairs and reconstruction, necessary to react to the damage that was done by the fire. Mr. Pandula reviewed the plans for the building and stated that he would like to hold the landscape/hardscape in abeyance for the time being.

Commission Comments: Mr. Pandula was asked to show the sketch of the window off the kitchen that differs from the one in the mini set. He stated the sketch indicates that the pairs of windows will be duplicated. There was some concern about how structurally sound the building is and if a structural engineer has been consulted. Mr. Pandula said he is not involved in the construction phase of this project. He introduced Mr. Doug Newhouse, who represents the construction company through the insurance agency on this project. Mr. Pandula said he has been told that the building appears to be structurally sound. Mr. Cooney addressed Mr. Newhouse and asked that if there are situations or conditions that come up in construction, to please make his first phone call to Mr. Lindgren and let him know what is going on. The Commission felt that if one more vertical muntin were added to the big windows, it would make the verticality of the glazing more consistent. Mr. Pandula agreed.

Nancy Briggs, homeowner 360 Seaspray Ave. said she had a question regarding the placement of the hardscape and how it will impact her property. Mr. Cooney stated that those issues are going to get resolved when we get answers on the landscape/hardscape plan. Mr. Pandula said he would be happy to sit with Mrs. Briggs. Mr. Cooney asked Mrs. Briggs to exchange contact information with Mr. Newhouse in case she has questions regarding the construction. She stated she already had.

Motion was made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the project as presented with the addition of one vertical muntin on the 6 windows on the east elevation and on the 2 second floor windows on south elevation and that the site plan design, landscape and hardscape be deferred to the February meeting. Also, the sketch that was shown to the Commission, should be incorporated into the plan, correcting the two kitchen windows.
Motion carried with all in favor.

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

A. Informal Review: One South County Rd.

LPC TO MAKE RECOMMENDATION RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)

Owner/Applicant: The Breakers Palm Beach, Inc.

Architect: Peacock and Lewis

Project Description: Front Lawn Pavilions - Two accessory buildings will be constructed on the Front/Croquet Lawn. The south building will be utilized to plate food for events and the north building will have restrooms to serve the area. The lawn is located on the west side of the hotel.

At the October meeting, a motion carried to defer further consideration to the November meeting. At the November meeting, this project was deferred to the December meeting at the attorney's request.

Please note this project has been withdrawn at the applicant's request.

X. DESIGNATION HEARINGS:

Item 3: Parc Monceau Historic District

Owners: 145 Anchor Properties of Vero Beach, Inc. (115 Parc Monceau)

Hannah J. Kamin (116 Parc Monceau)

124 Parc Monceau, LLC (124 Parc Monceau)

Alfons and Enaam Schmitt (125 Parc Monceau)

Geoffrey S. Caraboolad (300 Parc Monceau)

Ocean Vills Holdings, LLC (1700 S Ocean Blvd.)

Ruby S. Rinker Trust (1720 S. Ocean Blvd.)

Town of Palm Beach (right of way known as Parc Monceau)

Please note that this designation hearing was postponed from the April 16, 2015 meeting to the November 18, 2015 meeting. At the November meeting, this hearing was deferred to the December meeting at the request of the attorney for the owner

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Mrs. Albarran, Mr. Cooney, and Ms. Hufty

Mr. Page confirmed that there is proof of publication and proper legal service for this designation on file.

Mr. James Green (attorney for several of the home owners at Parc Monceau), stated that there is some confusion as to whether the addendum, as it relates to the property at 1700 S. Ocean Blvd., which has been demolished, was actually sent to the property owner. Mr. Page stated that Town records show that a letter dated October 13, 2015 was sent to the property owner indicating that at the December 16, 2015 Landmarks Preservation Committee meeting, this designation hearing would be held.

Ms. Stillings presented the designation report, and stated that the Parc Monceau Historic District meets Criteria 1, 3, 4 and 5 of the Town of Palm Beach, Landmarks Preservation Ordinance.

Mr. Green stated that the owners he represents have a serious concern about the designation. The original designation report addresses all seven properties including 1700 S Ocean Blvd. which has since been demolished. An addendum was issued on November 18, 2015, which includes six properties. It seems to Mr. Green and his clients that because of the demolition of 1700 S. Ocean Blvd. that the cohesion of the district has been altered, and the addendum to the designation report narrowed the criteria from four to one. They have hired an expert witness to address criteria 3. His clients would like to object to the designation report.

Mr. Randolph stated that due process requires notice and a reasonable opportunity to be heard. The question is whether or not notice was received in regard to the full breadth of this hearing today. If the homeowners have not received notice, the Commission may want to consider postponing, until there is adequate notice given. Mr. Green responded that when the addendum was received it appeared that the Town's consultants had narrowed the criteria with the demolition of 1700 S. Ocean Blvd.

Ms. Stillings stated that the addendum was simply to clarify the situation, following the demolition of the house at 1700 S Ocean Blvd. Criteria 3 was affected because criteria 3, in the original designation report, referenced all seven properties. Mr. Page confirmed that all of the owners did received notice of today's meeting.

Mr. Zukov moved and motion seconded by Mrs. Lorentzen that the designation report become part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor.

The hearing proceeded with Mr. Green and his clients opposing the designation. Mr. Green entered 7 exhibits into the record which included a copy of the power point presentation given by Mr. C. Wesley Blackman, expert for the opposition. There was also testimony from Mr. Alfons Schmitt (125 Parc Monceau) and Mr. Brandon Rinker (1720 S. Ocean Blvd.), regarding the structural integrity of the homes in Parc Monceau and their opposition to land marking this district.

Commissioner Comments: There was a lengthy discussion among the Commissioners regarding the opposition of the homeowners, and if the loss of the home at 1700 S. Ocean Blvd. affects the integrity of the district, to the extent that it no longer merits designation. Some of the Commissioners felt that with land marking, the Commission can ensure that the replacement home at 1700 S. Ocean Blvd. conforms to the style of the district. It was also noted, that the poor quality of construction in these homes should also

be taken into consideration. One of the Commissioners stated that this Commission has a job to do and that is to preserve historical buildings in Palm Beach.

Motion by Mr. Gannon and seconded by Ms. Hufty that the Parc Monceau Historic District not be recommended to the Town Council for designation as a landmark of the Town of Palm Beach because the area has been changed with the demolition of 1700 S Ocean Blvd. and the other homes do not reflect the highest quality of Regency style that is prevalent throughout the Town of Palm Beach. Motion carried 4 -3 with Mr. Zukov, Mr. Strawbridge and Mr. Cooney opposed.

Item 1: 122 Kings Rd.

Owners: Austin and Stephen Smith

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None

Mr. Page confirmed that there is proof of publication and proper legal service for this designation on file.

Ms. Murphy presented the designation report, stating that the house meets Criteria 1, 3 and 4 of the Town of Palm Beach, Landmarks Preservation Ordinance.

Mrs. Lorentzen moved and motion seconded by Mr. Zukov that designation report become part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt this was an exciting result of Commission members actually going with our consultants and traveling road by road and seeing what has been landmarked and hasn't been landmarked. It's really exciting to find the properties that have fallen through the cracks.

Mrs. Albarran moved and motion seconded by Mr. Zukov that 122 Kings Rd. be recommended to the Town Council for designation as a landmark of the Town of Palm Beach, and that the criteria as presented, be made a part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor.

Item 2: 123 Kings Rd.

Owners: Robert and Carolyn Jackson

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: None

Mr. Page confirmed that there is proof of publication and proper legal service for this designation on file.

Ms. Murphy presented the designation report, stating that the house meets Criteria 1, 3 and 4 of the Town of Palm Beach, Landmarks Preservation Ordinance.

Mrs. Lorentzen moved and motion seconded by Ms. Hufty that designation report become part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor.

Commission Comments: The Commission felt that these two properties tell a very important story about the original house.

Mrs. Lorentzen moved and motion seconded by Ms. Hufty that 123 Kings Rd. be recommended to the Town Council for designation as a landmark of the Town of Palm Beach, and that the criteria as presented, be made a part of the record. Motion carried with all in favor

XI. COMMENTS OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION AND PLANNING ZONING & BUILDING DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR

Mr. Page announced that the Town Council conducted the first designation hearing of the season and did approve the landmark at 283 Royal Poinciana Way, as was recommended by the Commission.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion was made by Mrs. Albarran and seconded by Mr. Gannon to adjourn the meeting at 1:36 p.m. Motion carried with all in favor.

The next meeting of the Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held on Wednesday, January 20, 2015 at 9:30 a.m in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 South County Rd. Palm Beach.

Respectfully submitted,



Edward A. Cooney, Chairman
LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION

nar